		1
1	SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING	
2		
3		
4		
5	HELD:	
6		
7	Thursday, February 18, 2016	
8		
9	LOCATION:	
10	Council Chambers	
11	Scranton City Hall	
12	340 North Washington Avenue	
13	Scranton, Pennsylvania	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23	CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER	
24	CATHEME S. MANDOZZI, NEN - DIFICIAL COUNT REPURTER	
25		

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL: JOSEPH WECHSLER, PRESIDENT PATRICK ROGAN, VICE-PRESIDENT WAYNE EVANS WILLIAM GAUGHAN TIM PERRY LORI REED, CITY CLERK KATHY CARRERA, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK AMIL MINORA, SOLICITOR

1	MR. WECHSLER: Joining us this
2	evening is Boy Scout Troop 42 from All
3	Saint's Academy along with their scout
4	leader, Tom McBride. The troop will lead us
5	in the Pledge of Allegiance this evening.
6	(Pledge of Allegiance recited and
7	moment of reflection observed.)
8	MR. WECHSLER: Roll call, please.
9	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Perry.
10	MR. PERRY: Here.
11	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.
12	MR. ROGAN: Here.
13	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Evans.
14	MR. EVANS: Here.
15	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.
16	MR. GAUGHAN: Here.
17	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Wechsler.
18	MR. WECHSLER: Here. An executive
19	session was held this evening regarding a
20	matter of litigation. Dispense with the
21	reading of the minutes.
22	MS. REED: THIRD ORDER. 3-A.
23	MINUTES OF THE COMPOSITE PENSION BOARD
24	MEETING HELD JANUARY 13, 2016.
25	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any

1	comments? If not, received and filed.
2	MS. REED: 3-B. MINUTES OF THE
3	SCRANTON FIREFIGHTERS PENSION COMMISSION
4	MEETING HELD JANUARY 13, 2016.
5	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any
6	comments? If not, received and filed.
7	MS. REED: 3-C. MINUTES OF THE
8	NON-UNIFORM MUNICIPAL PENSION BOARD MEETING
9	HELD JANUARY 13, 2016.
10	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any
11	comments? If not, received and filed.
12	MS. REED: 3-D. MINUTES OF THE
13	SCRANTON POLICE PENSION COMMISSION MEETING
14	HELD JANUARY 13, 2016.
15	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any
16	comments? If not, received and filed.
17	MS. REED: 3-E. AGENDA FOR THE
18	NON-UNIFORM MUNICIPAL PENSION BOARD MEETING
19	HELD FEBRUARY 17, 2016.
20	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any
21	comments? If not, received and filed.
22	MS. REED: 3-F. CONTROLLER'S REPORT
23	FOR MONTH ENDING JANUARY 31, 2016.
24	MR. WECHSLER: Are there any
25	comments? If not, received and filed.
	II

MS. REED: 3-G. LACKAWANNA COUNTY 1 PLANNING COMMISSION SUBDIVISION AND LAND 2 DEVELOPMENT EVALUATION REPORT REVIEWED 3 4 JANUARY 22. 2016. 5 MR. WECHSLER: Are there any comments? If not, received and filed. 6 MS. REED: 3-H. TAX ASSESSOR'S 7 8 REPORT FOR HEARING DATE TO BE HELD MARCH 2, 9 2016. 10 MR. WECHSLER: Are there any 11 comments? If not, received and filed. Dο 12 any council members have announcements at 13 time? 14 MR. GAUGHAN: I would just like to thank the Boy Scout Troop 42 from All 15 16 Saint's Academy, you did a great job. Thank 17 you. 18 MS. REED: FOURTH ORDER. CITIZENS' PARTICIPATION. 19 20 MR. WECHSLER: Joan Hodowanitz. MS. HODOWANITZ: Joan Hodowanitz, 21 22 resident and taxpayer. I have been checking 23 this week various offices, the mayor's 24 office, the BA's Office, the Controller's 25 Office and the City Clerk's Office and nary

20

21

22

23

24

25

a 2014 audit to be found and, of course, no one could even tell me when it might surface so I took a look at dates of publication and the audits going back to 2002, that's the earliest one on the website, last year the audit came out on April 20, that was the publication date. The next latest audit was 2010, published on February 16, so this audit now has the honor of being at least the second latest, and even if it comes out before April 20 I would not consider that a success considering that we have now a new independent audit firm and the assistance of the firm of Rainey & Rainey, and I'd like to know just how successful Rainey & Rainey was in preparing -- teaching our people to prepare for an audit.

On the pension front, apparently there is good news and bad news, the good news first. Apparently, the Composite Pension Board will not be suing the city so that some of the double pensioners can receive their double pensions out of the general fund, and I celebrate that decision.

Now for the bad news, I happened to

22

23

24

25

throw a hissy fit yesterday at the Composite Pension Board meeting because I was unable to get a copy of the January Mellon Investment report. I attended the meeting in January and was told that I needed to submit a Right-to-Know -- request a Right to Information Act report, which I did, on January 15, and yesterday on February 17 I was still waiting for the report. What was particularly irritating was the fact that every month a copy is handed to the Times-Tribune reporter who does not make a Right-to-Know request, so because of my hissy fit they promptly at the meeting gave me a keep of the January and the February report, but I'm not happy with that because I don't want to be handed a private copy. want a copy made available to the public if that, in fact, is a public document.

So, Mr. Wechsler, I have a request of you, one of the three copies that are provided, one goes to the mayor's office, one goes to the Controller's and one goes to you. It's actually given to clerk as your proxy, but it's intended for you. If after

21

22

23

24

25

you have had a chance to peruse the monthly investments report, would you make that document available at the Clerk's desk in that outer office area where you have the operating budget so any member of the public can peruse it?

MR. WECHSLER: Yes.

MS. HODOWANITZ: I appreciate it. There was a lot of interesting Thank you. information for month of January. As you know, for the entire year of 2015 the return on the investments, the stock investments and the bonds, was a grand total of .39 Now, all three funds assume a rate of return on your investments of 8 percent. That fell far short and in January, well, they had some problems. For the month of January, the municipal employees contributed a total of \$31,823. The funds paid out \$1,069,456 to retirees. There were \$32,282 in fees and a stock market loss of \$1,757,826 for a net monthly loss of \$2,837,141. That's not very good.

To make matters even worse, as you have seen in the paper the Public Employee

Retirement Commission lost its funding from the state and so we may very well lose what we anticipated in 2016 as part of our amortization reduction for Act 44 of \$4,295,941. That's going to create a whole in your budget, so people need to be very aware and start attending these Pension Board meetings.

And, finally, I'm still waiting to see the December Controller's report on the website and also the January one. I think that those documents need to be made public information and available to the general public. Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you. Doug

MR. MILLER: Good evening, Council.

Doug Miller, Scranton. You know, it's refreshing to listen to people like Joan and Marie and Andy and a lot of other smart people that come up here every week who often times have more of their facts straight than our elected officials do which is certainly alarming, but then it's also refreshing at the same time because it shows

24

25

we do have concerned, dedicated people in this city. You know, what kind of brought me here tonight was a little bit of what's been transpiring the last few weeks and just the overall atmosphere in these chambers. You know, last time I checked, you know, our city government wasn't run as a dictatorship and do I really just totally am just embarrassed and ashamed of the disrespect by the council president. You know, I understand you have your rules of council, each council has their own duties to enact their own rules if they wish to do that, but at the same time you have to realize one thing, that we put you people here, as scary as that might sound in some instances, but you were elected, nevertheless, and you represent us whether you like it or not. You don't represent yourself, even though some of you have big egos, but you represent us, and if you don't appreciate the things that some people say because you might find it to be personal, or more importantly just something you don't want to hear because it's the truth, well, that's too bad.

2

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ran, you knew the consequences, you knew hat the position entailed and now you are here, and if you don't like it then leave because we don't need you. We have had enough ignorance and belligerence in this community for decades and we' don't it anymore because it has lead us to where we are today.

You know, it's really frustrating because I don't come up here disgusted because, you know, while the administration and certain people on this council want to pinpoint and talk about progress in the community there is no progress here so let's not even fool ourselves. It's all make believe. We talk about audits that don't exist, we are beyond audits at this point. We've been waiting on audits for the last 12 You mean to tell me we need an audit at this point to tell us what we should already know? We are bankrupt. What more do you need? You need an audit to tell you that? You haven't figured that out yet. I mean, I know of you probably haven't because a lot of you haven't attended public meetings for a long time like a lot of us

have here and so that might be the case as well, you're not as informed, but we don't need rubber stampers and that's when we have here. We have rubber stampers for this administration. We need rubber stampers for the residents of this city and we haven't had that.

You know, a few weeks ago I think it was Lee who brought up a campaign finance report and, you know, everybody up here looked at him like he had six heads, you know, the nerve of him to bring that up, but it's reality. It just goes to prove the corruption in this community, and it's not just here it's everywhere that you are all in together, it's all in the network.

You know, last week you sure as heck made sure that you had your meeting early so you could go get your picture taken over at the Goodwill. I mean, that's the problem here. You are all good at your photo ops and dressing up for the camera, we need leadership, we don't need photo ops. That's just upper silliness. If you want to get your picture taken you're in the wrong

24

25

profession. You were elected to represent the residents of this city. We have a failed recovery plan, we brought in consultant after consultant to tell us things we already knew, we have pumped hundreds of thousands of dollars of federal and state money into the downtown while the neighborhoods continued to get neglected, blight everywhere. We want to blame landlords and quality of life issues and we blame all of wrong people but the politicians who caused the problem because the thing is here really simple, gentlemen, when you overtax people to the point where they can't just sustain them anymore how do you expect them to thrive in the neighborhood? How did you expect them to be able to maintain their property? people, seniors who have lived their entire lives, 50, 60 years in the same home, did you really think they are proud of the fact that their property is in deplorable condition? It's not something they wanted to happen, but when you elect incompetent people who have no respect for anyone but

themselves and allow these things to happen it's where you are.

You know, I had a senior tell me one day that she just can't understand how politicians in this town have let such a beautiful city become a cesspool and she is just heartbroken over it. She has lived their her whole life, and to just see the condition and the waste and the mismanagement and where we are today.

And then we want to talk about the youth in this city. There's nothing left. There is no opportunity here because you are all good at talking, you are all good at -- you know, Mr. Ellman last week, I believe, talked about, you know, getting campaign letters in the mail, you are all good at promises, the problem is you don't have any answers. You say what you have to do to get elected and when you get here you have no clue and that's what's scary. Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you. Ron Ellman.

MR. ELLMAN: It was a pleasure to see those little gentlemen here and two

20

21

22

23

24

25

people asked me to congratulate Fay on her short talk last week. I should have throwed the hat in here tonight to see if it would come flying out before I came in. I got one welcome anyway. We live in a city that is changing, has changed and will change. There is always hope conditions that are bad that could be removed and future bad conditions can be prevented. These are my words and every time I get up here I don't -- I don't finish what I'm saying so I am going to try to read what I wrote. city can only be what we make it. have so many people thought they would live to see this city deteriorate so badly because of such complete total indifference and incompetence of one inept administration after another. I blame Doherty, too, besides our present mayor.

People, this mayor and council share the shame of losing what so many of us aspire for years, home ownership, and you know how many people I talk to that have lost homes. It just breaks my heart. As you know, in January there will 750 on that

The light at the end of the tunnel is dim forever for these people and their pets. I have people that have lost their home and they are worried about a cat or a dog what's going to happen. These are such good people. They are people we are losing. For whatever reason they lost their homes. Yes, this council, these very gentlemen before you are instrumental in the decline of our city. You pay too much attention to downtown and not our neighborhoods as far as I'm concerned.

big sheet for the sheriff's sale, I guess.

Now, my favorite subject Mr.

Bulzoni. Here I just find his -- you just allowing him another term is unacceptable.

It's just not appropriate for someone that has a voice in government not to pay taxes, I don't care what you think about the man's ability he doesn't pay taxes. Look who is running the city, we've got Gerald Cross telling us what to do for 20 years, he doesn't live here or care what goes on here. It's a good thing he works for the government because I don't think he would

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

last ten minutes working for Mr. Trump.

Amoroso just sell everything, raise taxes, that's all that man knows, but he is not here to pay taxes. Three houses from you, you probably haven't seen it, there is a tractor trailer parked in a yard. looks like garbage what they have done to that house. 2430. Go down there and look. There is a 40,000 pound tractor trailer every night running over sewer pipes, water The yard doesn't have a blade of pipes. grass in it, it's a mud hole. That's what you people have allowed to happen to our city. I have been complaining two years about that garbage next door to me and the Nobody lifted a finger. truck. somebody with a computer they found six or seven violations that truck was doing in the city codes, but I decided to wait and ask for a tax reduction and that's why I haven't pushed it.

Well, the good news is I'm leaving here, but I want to recommend someone on council read Carl Sandburg's, "The Poor." I know you probably never heard of it, I just

come across this. It states, "No matter how hard we try we cannot give you sight."

What that means is these people out here week after week come and talk to you and get no where, they just can't make you understand what's happening in this city with the population. They try, but they don't get to give you sight. Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you,

Mr. Ellman. Is there anyone else who would

like to address council?

MS. SCHUMACHER: Good evening.

Marie Schumacher. Mr. Wechsler, were you

able during this past week to get the

percent of peep who paid their trash taxes?

MR. WECHSLER: Not exactly, but I did receive some information so if you want me to do it during motions?

MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, fifth, yeah, that would be fine. Thank you. I would like to read a quote from the Federal Communications Commissioner who recently said, "I think that poses a special danger to a country that cherishes First Amendment speech, freedom of expression, even freedom

of association. I think it's dangerous, frankly, that we don't see more often people espousing the First Amendment view that we should have a robust marketplace of ideas where everybody should be willing and able to participate."

And so I would like to thank

publically Fay Franus both for standing her

ground last week and for defending my right

to express how an action made me feel.

The Muni services contract that is for financial presentation will that provide actuals for each line item of the budget on a monthly basis?

MR. WECHSLER: I'm not sure.

MS. SCHUMACHER: You know, that would really be helpful in such things and take away a lot of the questions we have.

For instance, if we had that -- well, what I would recommend, first of all, on the waste I would add a line item for those to put in those who pay by May 30, they have to pay at least 150 so we would then know how many paid at that point, and then another account for those collections that are made up to

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and up through September 30, which is the end of the second period. We would have more information and if I have time at the end I'll tell you a trash story that's sad.

Also, we went round and around and another question I had is will the turnkey contract be brought back from the table and killed now that we have found out that, in fact, the mercantile and business privilege taxes are being collected. The first time we would have had any inclination to know that \$2 million had been collected was when we received the budget in November because then you have the -- otherwise, it's, you know, the line item is Act 511 or whatever it is, 511 taxes. It's all in and you don't know what is what, so if we were to get those exact line items of the budget on a monthly basis, the actuals, we might know where we are and we would have known we have collected \$2 million, which was obviously more than the couple of hundred that PEL told us we are paying so I would like to know if we are going to kill that -- bring that back and kill it.

Did anyone -- has anyone been able to provide answers to even one of my storm water questions I asked last week? Did anyone even try? I certainly hope somebody gets on that. The clock is ticking and I don't really believe you people are convinced of the size of this problem that we have, storm water. Next time it rains come up and ring my doorbell --

MR. WECHSLER: Speaking for myself,
I do have an appreciation for how big the
problem is.

MS. SCHUMACHER: And I will take you around some storm water places that are not addressed, so I hope somebody will take that on. And then I'd like to read from an article that was published August 11, 2014, and it said, "During a council caucus on July 24 Council President Bob McGoff said developments are moving quickly.

Discussions focus on a possible monetization of or sale of or lease or something dealing with the garages so we might be seeing something really as early as September."

It is well over a year. Does

2

3

4 5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

anybody have a status report on what is happening on that?

MR. ROGAN: I do know there have been some delays since the sale of the mall, it changed some issues with the parking in the downtown so I know that is one of the delays, but I'm also interested in seeing that get done as soon as possible.

MS. SCHUMACHER: I would hope so because -- okay. I'd just like to show you one other thing, and while I'm getting this out I'll tell you my story. I left to take the little guy to school this morning, I wasn't gone -- I wasn't gone 15 minutes, couldn't have been gone. When I left I had one small white bag of trash out for collection and when I returned I had one small white bag and two large black bags waiting for collection. I mean, people drop off -- from other places drop off so we are really -- and I would conclude with this because I hope this is a quick off to my what is going to become my plea for reassessment. I have here two pages -- two pages, okay? On one of these there are 16

red banners, nine are new, one is lakefront and six are new prices, five of which are in Scranton, and they are all downward. The other page has four of new price, all Scranton, all downward, and as an example of the values we are losing in our houses, there is a property down the road from me that was on the market for some time, which I thought was a rather fair price, \$133,950 that sold last December for \$83,500, down \$51,400. A 40 percent drop.

MR. WECHSLER: That house also had the water pipes freeze in the house. There was problems with that property. I know it well.

MS. SCHUMACHER: Thank you. I'll be back next week, good Lord willing.

MR. DOBRZYN: Good evening. Dave

Dobrzyn. That recent statement by Ma

Schumacher on trash being deposited in front
of her house is good evidence that what I'm
saying or have about saying for a long time
might just be a bell of what could go wrong,
so I'm also, once again, this week I
recommend that instead of bags if we reduce

22

23

24

25

the rate for low volume people we could possibly get a limited size barrel for them and distribute them in that way, we wouldn't have a situation where we are paying for possibly up in Moscow area or something because I have even heard firemen complain that people were coming down for Moscow area and leaving off stuff at the fire station up there such behavior. So, once again, I'd like to remind anybody out there in TV land that thinks that bankruptcy is a good idea I'd like to once again cite Flint where an irresponsible state appointed manager opted to use corrosive river water and destroy the whole pipe system in the town and the lead levels are double and triple above and quadruple above toxic waste levels. So, in other words, if I had water like that with that much lead in it I would have to pay to have it a removed and be contaminated as toxic waste and it's like 400 and 500 percent more lead in that water than the minimum for toxic waste.

And pensions, once again, it was decided that we are losing money and if they

25

could shift that over really quickly almost on an overnight basis I don't think that Mellon Bank's recommendations are worth listening to, and last week we mentioned about cigarettes in the parks and I would recommend that we have a zone and possibly a receptacle and, yeah, it's not too nice of a thing to see even young mother's smoking with their kids in the playground or something like that, however, when you start to exclude certain people or certain groups of people you start to -- the support for these institutions wanes, being guilty of a cigarette myself I went out to the stadium and watched a baseball game, nothing happened for seven rounds so I went out to buy drinks for the girls, and I drink coca-cola and figure I'd grab a quick smoke out in front and a home run was hit and that was the top of the seventh inning so that was the end of the game and I haven't been there since. So the point being that when you kick the old foggy and his stogie out I often suspected that that's when the Red Baron's started -- their attendance started

2

4

5

7

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

tapering off so you are going to lose support in some areas so I would recommend that you have a receptacle and a restricted area.

And on nonprofits and tax exempts, the thought occurred to me, you know, a few weeks ago we had some serious terrorists incidents and these institutions probably are assisting tax exempts. We have institutions that photo shopped -- photo shopped interviews, and we've had institutions where people have radicalized, and I don't think they really deserve a disseminated propaganda. I don't think they deserve a tax exempt if that is what they are up to. If they are strictly for public welfare and whatever that's fine, but personally I think we should look into a regulation that bans that in Scranton and it would be interesting to see that the taxes fall due for many years back if that's what they are up to, including the racketeering and corrupt organizations act. Thank you and have a good night.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you,

2

3

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Mr. Dobrzyn. Is there anyone else?

MR. SBARAGLIA: Andy Sbaraglia, citizen of Scranton. Fellow Scrantonians, on you're B under motions, did the bidding trades have any input into that before you changed the licensing requirements?

MR. WECHSLER: They were are all provided copies of the proposed ordinance.

MR. SBARAGLIA: Yes, because they are more interested in it than probably anybody. Now, I got poor Scranton residents who is making \$22,000 a year paying house tax, wage tax, sewer assessment, if you want to put it that way, garbage tax. You are taking almost 1/5 of his income, probably closer a little less than 1/5 of his income out of his pocket. People can't live on \$18,000 a year, plus they're not even saying the poor man may be handicapped and have to pay a \$50 fee to have a sign put up there and maybe he wants to walk -- his wife wants to walk a dog and needs a dog license and she got to do that. You have really nickeled and dimed this city, plus you have the black and tan going out there giving

22

23

24

25

citations. I don't know how you figure you are actually running this city. You are not running the city. You are running almost a concentration camp. People are being oppressed beyond what they can pay. They are losing their homes. Not only are they losing their homes, they can't even sell the homes to avoid losing them. Nobody want to come in here, and I don't blame them. wholeheartedly believe Mr. Bulzoni has the right idea, stay out of the city. The schools ain't the best, I don't know how his safety up there is, but his safety up there is maybe a little better than ours, he has the right idea. In fact, I'm surprised you don't all have second homes ready to leave this city when your term expires because you can see what is happening and you know what's going to happen and we are not going to avoid going into receivership. Somewhere along the line we will end up that way, but everything will be looted.

And you are still advertising in the Times, the Scranton Times for your legals, which you were supposed to put on the

4

5

1

6

8

9

7

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

website after you changed the amount of money they have to give out before they go to a legal department. In other words, they get anything under the limit they can give out without putting out a legal notice, but you knew that anyway. You had no intention of taking the legals out of the Times, but yet you said that to the people like as if they would believe you, but anybody with common sense realized not to believe you.

And I'm just sorry how you let the Democratic party destroy the city. That is the bad part about it. All of the Democratic people that were good left, now we are only left with a click. That's how We should have never changed the way we voted for councilmen. It should have been by district and not at large because one big block of votes is the reason you are all up there. You belong to the click. click is one hand washes the other and you belong to that click, you donate to each other, which is legal. I didn't say there is something wrong with it, it just doesn't work out good for the people of Scranton.

2

3

6

5

7

9

8

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you. Is there anyone else who would like to address council?

MS. REED: FIFTH ORDER. 5-A. MOTIONS.

MR. WECHSLER: Mr. Perry, do you have any motions or comments?

MR. PERRY: Just two. A comment on reassessment, I know that has been a hot topic in the past and that's something that I am for, but it does have its issues and that's with people on fixed income or retired homeowners in the city and that's something we have to be cautious when we are going forward with seeking reassessment and we have to remember reassessment isn't going to bring in any extra dollars into the city as far as tax revenue, all it does is level the playing field. And when we go ahead and level that playing field, which I think is a really it's overdue, it's well overdue, we are going to have to take care and incorporate some kind of natural guard against our retirees and people on fixed

incomes to protect them because the last thing we want to do is reassess and then increase someone's taxes that they are just capable of paying and that's going to be that's a sticking point.

But, you know, when the County reassesses, and they will reassess, you know, if this body has to pressure on them to do so then I think that's our obligation to the city to do that, you know, that's something to keep in the back of our mind that we have to incorporate something to protect the retirees and people on fixed income.

Secondly, with 5-B and 5-C, two things that we are going to introduce today, I'm happy to see these come through and sit on these and talk on those for a couple of weeks, I know one thing that I discussed with a lot of, you know, workers out there that want to do business in the City of Scranton it is just very, very, very difficult for them to get in and get to have the ability to get in and do work in the city. Being in the restaurant business, I

21

22

23

24

25

manage restaurants, you know, all over Northeast Pennsylvania, and they just said it's so much easier everywhere else to work, but it's not easy in Scranton, and while we still want to make it safe, we don't want just anybody in here doing any type of work. We need restrictions. We need to protect -we need to protect ourselves, but I do feel that this is a step in the right direction that is going to remove some of those hoops to jump through and make it easier for more vendors, not necessarily vendors, but more contractors to come and do work which eventually is going to drive costs down not only for us, but for contractors. The more contractors there are, the better rates there is going to be for us and homeowners and business owners, so I think it's a step in the right direction. That's all I have.

MR. WECHSLER: Mr. Rogan?

MR. ROGAN: Yes, thank you. First,
I would like to thank our Boy Scout Troop
for leading us in the Pledge of Allegiance
today. It's great to have you here. You
are part of a great organization and it's

2

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

organizations, community based organizations like the Boy Scouts, like our little leagues that really help shape the young minds in our community and they are part of what makes Scranton great that we do have neighborhood groups, neighborhood organizations for children and for adults as well so we thank you for coming today.

A few items. First, I want to echo with what Mr. Perry said, he is exactly right on both counts that he brought up. Regarding the contract ordinances, there are many changes that are being made in the legislation, and I know we talked about them a little bit a few weeks ago, I'm not going to go though them all because obviously there is quite a number of sections on our sheet we received from Pat Hinton with the breakdown of the changes and the average citizen watching who is not a contractor, although this does not effect them initially, by allowing more contractors to work in the city that increased competition should result in lower prices for home improvement items throughout the city as far

3

4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

as electrical work goes, general home improvement work, and as Mr. Perry mentioned there are a number of contractors that won't do business in the city because these licenses are difficult to obtain and there is a lot of hoops to jump through, but that on top of other issues with the bureaucracy in the city it make it very hard to do work and I think this is a step in the right direction to, one make it easier for entrepreneurs, people who want to start a small construction business get into that business and at the same time it still provides protections that somebody like myself isn't running around doing electrical work in the city.

So I think it is a very good piece of legislation to make it easier for contractors to do business but still keep those protections in place, and by increasing that number the end result should be cheaper rates from contractors in the City of Scranton when they are all competing against one another so I'm looking forward to voting "yes" on those two items.

2

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Next, last week I brought up the double pension scandal and we did talk about this with Attorney Minora and I brought up the idea a few times of subpoenas and there were questions as to whether council does have that authority or doesn't have that authority, we still have questions, but I do want to turn it over to Attorney Minora to report on those finding.

MR. MINORA: Well, thank you. do some research into this issue. There is a superior case involving the City of Erie where the Court found that city council did not have the right to issue subpoenas. was a strict construction of language in the charter and in the enabling statute of the City of Erie classification. I would say that that would be a blanket prohibition, expect that there were facts in there that might be somewhat different from the City of Scranton, which would give an argument for the city to have the city council to have the ability to issue subpoenas.

The enabling statute, however, also limits who those should be -- who those

people are that would be subject to subpoenas, so I know that sounds like a lot of legal mumbo jumbo, but there are essentially arguments going in both directions and it might very well depend on who it is who receives the subpoenas as to whether it could be quashed. The old law school saying is it's as clear as mud and this is as clear as mud.

MR. ROGAN: Thank you, Attorney
Minora, for looking into that for us.
Unfortunately, we probably won't know
whether we have that authority unless we try
it.

Regarding the pensions and the double pension issue, as mentioned by some speakers, the pension fund is obviously having a -- the markets are in rough shape and I caution anyone to use one month or one week as a benchmark, but if you look over the past 20 years you will see that the funds are declining. Even when we had a good stock market there were issues. We are drawing out more money than is going in and that can't be sustained. With all of these

issues with the pension, the one thing that is even more scary is if that fund runs dry the city taxpayers are on the hook. Not only the people who have pensions concerned that they may not receive their pension that they were promised, but what would be even worse if that fund dry is average Scrantonians and many of them senior citizens who did not have pensions would then be forced to pay through higher taxes for those who do have the pensions.

I believe it's in the city code that the pensions, and there has been litigation that pensions if that fund runs dry the pensions have to be paid before the city spends a nickle on any other obligations, along with snow picking up, garbage, police protection, fire protection, that those pensions have to be paid so it's a very dangerous road and something needs to be done. I know my colleagues have talked, particularly Mr. Evans, about pension reform and changes need to be made.

Going back to the issue of double pensions, I did want to do a little bit more

20

21

22

23

24

25

investigation last week, I did mention in our lawsuit that was brought by Attorney Cullen, there is another lawsuit pending that was brought by Attorney Price, and I did reach out to her this week just to ask for the other side, obviously, we are not -city council doesn't make a decision on any of these lawsuits, but there is so little information on how we got to where we are that's out there. We know that there was a buyout program initiated by Mayor Doherty. We know there was legislation by city council at that time. It went to the Pension Board. Some people were entitled to this increased benefit, others were not, but they received it anyways, and how that happened is still a mystery and that's a mystery I think that needs to be solved. Whether it was something criminal or something accidental, I think the public has a right to know.

I will continue to look into it throughout other sources. I do want to reach out to Attorney Cullen to hear his take on it. I will continue to listen to

21

22

23

24

25

Attorney price and her take on it, and I did ask during our caucus to have them as well as Attorney Durkin from the Pension Board to come in to give us an update, and my colleagues agreed on having Attorney Durkin come in is a good first step for an update on where we stand with these matters, and it may be -- we are already a year into it and it's a very long road to get any answers on this issue, but as has been mentioned for years at these council meetings and through reporting the pension issue is the largest problem the City of Scranton is facing. Ιf that fund is not shored up, the City is going to be in very, very bad shape. lead to bankruptcy, which is not a solution, but it needs -- this issue needs to be addressed and we do need to find out what mistakes were made in the past.

But I thank Attorney Minora for his research on the subpoena issue, unfortunately, when it comes to legal matters it seems like there is never a clear answer so I will continue to research on my end and thank you very much.

2

4

5 6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. MINORA: If I may just add, the only case interpreting the enabling statute is a case from Common Pleas Court in Pittsburgh from 1923 and it's so old I can't even get it on West Law, just to give you an idea of the difficulties there is with this.

MR. ROGAN: And it is the City Home Rule Charter that city council has subpoena power, it's a question of whether that is legal, you know, would it stand in a Court If it would not, and I know there are a number of the things in the Home Rule Charter that need to be addressed, not to open a whole other can of worms, but there are changes that need to be made to the Home Rule Charter and that is a very long and I know it was tried I drawn out process. believe in 2005, it made it all the way to a voter referendum and it was shot down. something possibly to consider for the future. Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you. Mr. Evans?

MS. EVANS: Thank you. First of all, I'd like to welcome our guests as well.

Belive it or not I was a Boy Scout, as you can tell, my formative years, but I was going to talk about the rental registration tonight, but I'm going to wait until after Monday until after the hearing on that and see where that goes, but we are very much on track to going along if he have to so we should have a draft ready for introduction the next few weeks.

As far as the reassessment is concerned, the reality is that the inequities in real estate assessments are driving property values down in the city and it's stifling growth in the city. All the while the county sits on a \$11 million surplus so there really is no excuse for lack of reassessment and we will continue to push for that from this dais.

I would like to thank Licensing and Inspections Director Hinton for his very comprehensive synopsis of the legislation for the contractor's unanimous. He met with us a couple of the weeks ago and as a follow-up to that meeting I think Councilman Gaughan requested this and he did a great

job of putting this together and this is something I would like to see happen more often.

In addition to that, what I would like to see, and I mentioned this in caucus a couple of weeks ago, once this legislation, if it is passed, I would like to see the city put on their website the list of all of the licensed contractors in the City of Scranton, number one, as a way to promote those contractors, but also as a consumer benefit as well. I think that would be a positive for -- I mean, they are paying for the registration, they are part of our community, they are licensed in the city, we should at least put their names and their contact information on our website.

Finally, I received a letter from
the Friends of Connors Park Association.
"Councilmen Wayne Evans, the friends of
Connor's Park Association is requesting from
the City of Scranton the naming of a gazebo
located in Connors Park after the late
Robert E. McGoff, Junior. Connors Park is
located at 515 Orchard Street in South

Scranton. The park was built in 2007. park has become a source of pride in the community. Mr. McGoff was instrumental in the development of the park. He was involved as a teacher, basketball coach, neighbor and friend. He was dedicated to the city as a public servant as well as a leader. We feel that this is a small way to thank Mr. McGoff and his family for their dedication to the community as well as the City of Scranton. The Friends of Connors Park Association will incur any and all costs related to this project. Please take this request info into consideration and help us honor Mr. McGoff. Thank you. Friends of Connors Park Association. Signed Robert Gattens, Gerald Smurl and John Chivott, Jr."

So, Mrs. Reed, if you could, if you could forward this to the Law Department so they can get it processed. Thank you very much. That's all I have for tonight.

MR. WECHSLER: Mr. Gaughan.

MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, thank you. Just a few things. Last night I attended the

2425

22

23

Weston Field Bulls Head neighborhood meeting. As Mr. Wechsler mentioned, one of their members passed away so I'd like to send my condolences out to his family, Mr. Pipsho, who was a loyal member of the Bulls Head Neighborhood meeting -- or the group, rather.

Several requests from the neighborhood group that we are sending along to the proper departments. Neighborhood Watch signs and there is a couple of streetlights that are out in Bulls head and Weston Field so we will see if we can get that taken care of.

I did request this week from the Scranton Police Department that they revisit permit parking on Myrtle Street. The residents are very disappointed that they were denied and would like the study to be performed in the afternoon and in the evening rather than in the morning. The afternoon and the evening is when the situation is at it's worse so hopefully the police department will reconsider that request.

2

4

3

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Also, I've gotten a lot of complaints about Colliery Avenue and pavecuts so I'll be asking Mrs. Reed to send a letter to our DPW director and our pavecut inspector to see if that can be put on the paving list in the future. It's really atrocious in that area.

Last week I mentioned the Young Lungs Program. I believe that we need to institute an outdoor tobacco free ordinance at parks throughout the city. I spoke to a representative from the American Lung Association, and they have a great program, the young lungs program, where they would put up free signage across the city parks notifying people that secondhand smoke is one of the number one killers for our children through the United States so I think that this can be a great thing. have noticed myself throughout our city parks there are cigarette butts that litter all over the place so hopefully we will work with the administration to get this legislation drafted, work with the American Lung Association to get the signage up that

will be free and no cost to the city.

I received a complaint from a gentleman about speeding on Division Street so I will be sending that along to Chief Graziano.

I received the minutes from the Land Bank Committee. There was a Land Bank meeting in January and one in February, it looks like everything is moving along and progressing very nicely with the county and the city and hopefully very soon we will receive an intergovernmental cooperation agreement and we can start to get that program up and running and I think that will help very much with vacant and abandoned properties throughout the city.

I would like to ask my colleagues, if there is no objection, that we send a letter to the mayor's office asking for a complete update on the parking monetization, the sewer monetization and what savings we saw in 2015 from the renegotiated police and fire contracts. I have been asking for this for at least seven or eight months and I have not received any response.

Also, along with that, I would like to again send a letter, if there is no objection, with my colleagues asking for an update on the foreclosure registration program. My request is going on two weeks, still have not received a response to that. We are waiting on legislation from the administration and I am not sure what the hold up is. We passed an ordinance in 2015 and it's been almost four months.

So, Mrs. Reed, if there is no objection from my colleagues if you can send that out tomorrow I would appreciate it, and that's all I have for this week. Thank you.

MR. ROGAN: Mr. Wechsler, one item I forgot to mention, last Thursday myself and a number of my colleagues had the pleasure of attending the open house at Goodwill at North Scranton Junior High School. For somebody who has never been in that building before it is a very beautiful building and it's a treasure that that building was preserved within our city, and anyone who drives up Greenridge Street what a difference that building is now at the top

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

of the hill versus a year ago and the last 20 years sitting up there vacant and delipidated, and I know the neighbors in that neighborhood are very pleased how that project came out and I know we all had a great time taking a look at the building. Thank you.

MR. WECHSLER: Thank you, Mr. Rogan. Just a few comments tonight, I did contact Treasurer Wayne Beck in regards to some of the questions that were asked about the garbage fee. Mr. Beck has responded that there were 20,468 garbage fees mailed. resulted in \$5.5 million collected. regards to the liens, there is \$2,610 potential liens for 2011 through 2013, which represents about \$1.6 million. To date, no liens have been issued to date because there has been some positive response to the threat of lien letters that were mailed out so we will be doing an update on when the actual liens will be filed.

Today I did receive a call from the South Side Neighborhood Watch, they are collecting data regarding defective or

unreadable stop signs in the South Side area. They are using their Facebook page to collect the data so if anyone is on Facebook and would like to report a stop sign please visit the South Side neighborhood Watch web page.

In regards to comments that were made about Mr. Bulzoni, Mr. Bulzoni is paying the city wage tax. That is part of the waiver that he received so he is paying city wage tax.

Also, in regard to the early meeting that we had last week, I have been involved in the neighborhood associations since I think around 1990, I believe. The Goodwill project has been on that list almost all that time. It was a great pleasure that we went to become part of that celebration of a community working together. Federal, state, local, nonprofits to save that huge and tremendous building in North Scranton and, by the way, I didn't have my picture taken. I didn't see yours either.

MR. ROGAN: Neither did I.

MS. EVANS: Me either.

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. WECHSLER: They were smart enough not to take our pictures, but there were no pictures taken. Only Mr. Gaughan's picture was in from the groundbreaking, but Bill got his picture.

MR. GAUGHAN: Yes

MR. WECHSLER: In regards to the proposed legislation this evening, we did --I am very happy with the way that this whole new contractor registration has proceeded through council and through the administration. Mr. Hinton has been very upfront with us from the beginning offering us the proposed legislation and we were able to share with contractors and developers and we are getting feedback from each of those and also Mr. Gaughan had requested Mr. Hinton to summarize the new contractor registration and Mr. Hinton did a fabulous job in getting the information to us, so I believe that in this particular case we have done our due diligence in preparing this legislation to come out to the public.

As part of that, I did meet with representatives from the IBW yesterday and

1	they do have some concerns regarding safety
2	issues with potential electrical contractors
3	so we are waiting for them to offer some
4	opinions on the new legislation to see where
5	it can be approved or made better. I think
6	that's all I have. Thank you.
7	MS. REED: 5-B. FOR INTRODUCTION -AN
8	ORDINANCE - REPEALING FILE OF COUNCIL NO.
9	52, 2006, AN ORDINANCE ENTITLED "AMENDING
10	FILE OF THE COUNCIL NO. 155, 1999 TO CHANGE
11	THE REQUIREMENTS FOR TAKING THE MASTER
12	ELECTRICAL CONTRACTOR'S LICENSE EXAM AND TO
13	CHANGE THE REQUIREMENTS FOR TAKING THE
14	MASTER PLUMBERS LICENSE EXAM."
15	MR. WECHSLER: At this time, I'll
16	entertain a motion that Item 5-B be
17	introduced into its proper committee.
18	MR. ROGAN: So moved.
19	MR. EVANS: Second.
20	MR. WECHSLER: On the question? All
21	those in favor of introduction signify by
22	saying aye.
23	MR. PERRY: Aye.
24	MR. ROGAN: Aye.
25	MR. EVANS: Aye.

ı

2

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

MR. WECHSLER: Aye. Opposed? The ayes have it and so moved.

MS. REED: 5-C. FOR INTRODUCTION -AN ORDINANCE - AMENDING FILE OF THE COUNCIL NO. 155, 1999 AN ORDINANCE ENTITLED "PROVIDING FOR THE LICENSING AND REGULATING OF CONTRACTORS DOING BUSINESS IN THE CITY OF SCRANTON INCLUDING REQUIREMENTS FOR THE GRANTING OF PERMITS AND FEES FOR SAME; PROVIDING PENALTIES AND RIGHTS OF APPEAL" BY ADDING AND DELETING DEFINITIONS, UPDATING THE DEPARTMENT NAME AND DIRECTOR'S TITLE. UPDATING APPLICATION FORMS. THE REQUIREMENTS FOR CONTRACTORS LICENSE, LICENSE FEES, ISSUANCE OF PERMITS, CONFORMANCE TO CODE, REVOCATION, SUSPENSION, DENIAL, PROHIBITED ACTS, STOP WORK, CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY AND TEMPORARY CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY, PERMIT FEES, INSPECTIONS, FINES FOR VIOLATIONS AND APPEALS PROCEDURE AND DELETION OF SECTIONS 17, 19, AND 22 IN THEIR ENTIRETY.

MR. WECHSLER: At this time, I'll entertain a motion that Item 5-C be

1	introduced into its proper committee.
2	MR. ROGAN: So moved.
3	MR. EVANS: Second.
4	MR. WECHSLER: On the question?
5	MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, on the question.
6	I'm still reviewing this legislation, but my
7	first assessment is that it will make it
8	easier to do business in Scranton, which is
9	a good thing. There were several sections
10	of this ordinance that were overly
11	burdensome and unnecessary which were taken
12	out, so I think that's a great thing, and
13	I'll review continue to review this, but
14	I'd like to thank Mr. Hinton for his help
15	with this legislation. Thank you.
16	MR. WECHSLER: Anyone else? All
17	those in favor of introduction signify by
18	saying aye.
19	MR. PERRY: Aye.
20	MR. ROGAN: Aye.
21	MR. EVANS: Aye.
22	MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.
23	MR. WECHSLER: Aye. Opposed? The
24	ayes have it and so moved.
25	MS. REED: SIXTH ORDER. 6-A. NO
	II

BUSINESS AT THIS TIME. 1 SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A. FOR 2 CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR 3 ADOPTION RESOLUTION NO. 9, 2016 -4 APPOINTMENT OF KATHRYN A. BORER, 3222 DOUD 5 AVENUE, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA, 18505, AS A 6 7 MEMBER OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE 8 CITY OF SCRANTON EFFECTIVE FEBRUARY 4, 2016. 9 MRS. BORER WILL BE REPLACING MARTIN KENEHAN 10 WHOSE TERM EXPIRED DECEMBER 31, 2015 AND WHO HELD OVER UNTIL JANUARY 21, 2016 WHEN HE 11 SUBMITTED HIS LETTER OF RESIGNATION. 12 13 BORER'S TERM WILL EXPIRE ON DECEMBER 31, 14 2020. MR. WECHSLER: As Chairperson for 15 the Committee on Rules, I recommend final 16 17 passage of Item 7-A. 18 MR. ROGAN: Second. 19 MR. WECHSLER: On the question? Roll call, please? 20 21 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Perry. MR. PERRY: Yes. 22 23 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan. 24 MR. ROGAN: Yes. 25 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Evans.

1	MR. EVANS: Yes.
2	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.
3	MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.
4	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Wechsler.
5	MR. WECHSLER: Yes. I hereby
6	declare Item 7-A legally and lawfully
7	adopted.
8	MS. REED: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION
9	BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR ADOPTION
10	RESOLUTION NO. 10, 2016 - APPOINTMENT OF
11	MARTIN J. TURI, 25 FOREST GLEN DRIVE,
12	SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA, 18504 AS A MEMBER OF
13	THE PLANNING COMMISSION FOR THE CITY OF
14	SCRANTON EFFECTIVE FEBRUARY 4, 2016. MR.
15	TURI WILL BE REPLACING THOMAS SCHUSTER WHO
16	RESIGNED EFFECTIVE DECEMBER 1, 2015 AND
17	WHOSE TERM IS SCHEDULED TO EXPIRE DECEMBER
18	31, 2018. MR. TURI'S TERM WILL EXPIRE ON
19	DECEMBER 31, 2018.
20	MR. WECHSLER: As Chairperson for
21	the Committee on Rules, I recommend final
22	passage of Item 7-B.
23	MR. ROGAN: Second.
24	MR. WECHSLER: On the question?
25	Roll call, please?
	II

		56
1	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Perry.	
2	MR. PERRY: Yes.	
3	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.	
4	MR. ROGAN: Yes.	
5	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Evans.	
6	MR. EVANS: Yes.	
7	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.	
8	MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.	
9	MS. CARRERA: Mr. Wechsler.	
10	MR. WECHSLER: Yes. I hereby	
11	declare Item 7-B legally and lawfully	
12	adopted.	
13	If there is no further business,	
14	I'll entertain a motion to adjourn.	
15	MR. ROGAN: Motion to adjourn.	
16	MR. WECHSLER: Meeting adjourned.	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER