

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING

HELD:

Thursday, December 12, 2013

LOCATION:

Council Chambers

Scranton City Hall

340 North Washington Avenue

Scranton, Pennsylvania

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL:

JANET EVANS, PRESIDENT

FRANK JOYCE, VICE-PRESIDENT

ROBERT MCGOFF

PAT ROGAN

JOHN LOSCOMBE

NANCY KRAKE, CITY CLERK

JAMIE MARCIANO, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK

BOYD HUGHES, SOLICITOR

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and
2 moment of reflection observed.)

3 MS. EVANS: Roll call, please.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Here.

6 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

7 MR. ROGAN: Here.

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Here.

10 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

11 Mrs. Evans.

12 MS. EVANS: Here. Dispense with the
13 reading of the minutes, please.

14 MS. KRAKE: 3-A. MINUTES OF THE
15 SCRANTON HOUSING AUTHORITY'S REGULAR MEETING
16 HELD NOVEMBER 4, 2013.

17 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
18 If not, received and filed.

19 MS. KRAKE: 3-B. TAX ASSESSOR'S
20 REPORT HEARING DATE HELD NOVEMBER 20, 2013.

21 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
22 If not, received and filed.

23 MS. KRAKE: 3-C. MINUTES OF THE
24 SCRANTON FIREFIGHTERS PENSION COMMISSION
25 MEETING HELD NOVEMBER 13, 2013.

1 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
2 If not, received and filed.

3 MS. KRAKE: 3-D. MINUTES OF THE
4 COMPOSITE PENSION BOARD'S REGULAR MEETING
5 HELD NOVEMBER 13, 2013.

6 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
7 If not, received and filed.

8 Do we have any council Clerk's notes
9 tonight, Mrs. Krake?

10 MS. KRAKE: No, Mrs. Evans.

11 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Do you any
12 council members have announcements at this
13 time?

14 MR. MCGOFF: I was trying to get one
15 here for the Sunday for Matthew's Mission,
16 breakfast with Santa, but I don't have all
17 of the information so I'll wait, but the
18 other thing I do want to mention, I don't
19 know if some people in the audience and
20 television audience may know Father Reverend
21 Joseph Kopacz, who was the pastor at
22 Nativity Church and served in the Scranton
23 Diocese for many years at a variety of
24 parishes in Scranton itself. He is going to
25 be installed as the new bishop in Jackson,

1 Mississippi, so congratulations to Father
2 Kopacz, a very good man.

3 MR. ROGAN: I just have one
4 announcement on Saturday, December 21, at
5 Buona Pizza from 10 to 12 p.m. there will a
6 free kids Christmas party sponsored by
7 Giovanni Piccolino and Buona Pizza.

8 MS. EVANS: Mr. Loscombe, any
9 announcements?

10 MR. LOSCOMBE: None this evening,
11 thank you.

12 (Mr. Joyce takes the dais and joins
13 the meeting.)

14 MS. EVANS: Solicitor Hughes is
15 unable to attend tonight's meeting because
16 he underwent surgery earlier today in
17 Philadelphia.

18 No budgetary meeting with
19 mayor-elect Courtright and his transition
20 and financial teams was conducted publically
21 or broadcast on ECTV this week. Neither
22 Mr. Courtright for Mr. Hickey responded to
23 council's letter. However, Councilman-elect
24 Joe Weschler did respond to Scranton City
25 Council's other invitation to attend

1 tonight's meeting and stated he was unable
2 to participate since he was training for his
3 new job this week.

4 Also, Councilman-elect Bill Gaughan
5 contacted council's office late yesterday to
6 say that he had a prior commitment and
7 wasn't able to attend tonight's meeting.

8 Mayor Doherty did not respond.

9 The City of Scranton was able to
10 secure a TAN not to exceed \$17 million for a
11 budget year 2014 thanks to the tireless work
12 of our financial advisor, Mr. Mike Judge, of
13 CaseCon and City Council Solicitor Hughes
14 who drafted all of the pertinent
15 legislation.

16 Consequently, earlier today Mayor
17 Doherty submitted an emergency certificate
18 to the Office of City Council in order that
19 this TAN could be passed during this
20 evening's council meeting by suspension of
21 Council's rules.

22 It is imperative that the city
23 government act immediately to secure the TAN
24 in order to provide for the financial needs
25 of early 2014. Further, Council Solicitor

1 Hughes recommended the suspension of the
2 rules and the passing of the TAN legislation
3 tonight so that the agreement can be
4 completed prior to the forthcoming holiday.

5 In attendance at tonight's meeting
6 is Mr. Michael Judge, financial advisor to
7 the city. I requested his attendance in
8 order to provide city council and the public
9 with an explanation and terms of the 2014
10 tax revenue anticipation note. Therefore, I
11 will call on Mr. Judge first during
12 citizens' participation and I'll ask him to
13 please remain in chambers as long as
14 possible during Fourth Order to respond to
15 questions that may be raised by members of
16 the public.

17 Finally, Scranton City Council's
18 regularly scheduled meetings for 2013
19 conclude this evening. In the event that
20 Mayor Doherty vetoes the 2014 operating
21 budget, a special meeting can be scheduled
22 and advertised in the local newspaper for
23 the sole purpose of entertaining a veto
24 override, and that's it.

25 MS. KRAKE: FOURTH ORDER. CITIZENS'

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PARTICIPATION.

MS. EVANS: Mr. Judge, thank you so much for attending this meeting, and the floor is yours.

MR. JUDGE: My pleasure, thank you. In your packets you all should have a document called "Proposed Term Sheet", a letterhead from the firm of IFS Securities out of Atlanta, Georgia. I have been working with IFS to conclude up with a proceeds for a tax anticipation note, and I'll just go down the terms and conditions that they have set forth. This is very similar to the bond transactions you had done over prior two years or for an investment firm came in with a bond purchase proposal with various terms and conditions on that and upon your acceptance then you work towards a settlement. The attorneys get together, get all of the paperwork done, and you close on a certain day in the future.

This has an estimated closing date of January 3, and there is no reason we can't beat that deadline, all things being

1 equal.

2 I'll just run down these terms and
3 conditions, if you have any questions stop
4 and me and ask. Obviously, the borrower is
5 the City of Scranton, the placement agent is
6 IFS Securities, Inc., it's a TAN. The
7 amount, we have not to exceed \$17 million,
8 the actual amount will be somewhat under
9 that. We have over the past two days done
10 some homework on the cash flow.

11 This transaction will be a tax
12 exempt transaction. The last two TANS were
13 taxable transactions. You did not have to
14 do this calculation in a taxable mode and a
15 tax exempt scenario and the bond counsel
16 opinion to get his opinion you have to do a
17 calculation. The calculation we did
18 yesterday has a TAN size of approximately 13
19 million, but we didn't know that when we did
20 this so we did a not to exceed amount in the
21 term sheet.

22 We received an estimated settlement
23 date of January 3. The final notoriety
24 being December 15th of 2014. We have a not
25 to exceed interest rate of 4 1/2 percent.

1 Again, that's not to exceed -- right now the
2 indication is we should be around 4 percent.
3 They did give themselves a little bit of
4 leeway in case the market goes south from
5 this time until the year end.

6 The collateral, the collateral is
7 very similar to the last two TANS, whereby
8 your complete revenue stream, taxes, et.
9 al, is UCC and is liened for the payment of
10 the TAN. That is a normal for TANS.

11 We anticipate the same structure as
12 we did the last two deals. We will need a
13 singing fund depository paying agent. We've
14 had Community Bank, i.e, First Liberty,
15 doing the passthroughs. That may change,
16 you know, when I get down to who the note
17 buyer is, but right now they are comfortable
18 with the way it happened before and they
19 have said that should be sufficient.

20 The lockbox revenue is little bit
21 different than the last one, the lockbox all
22 your earned income tax, these people want
23 earned income tax and current real estate
24 tax. That was the first lockbox you did way
25 back when, Fidelity was real estate, if you

1 recall, and it is since then to get them on
2 board real quickly they wanted to a capture
3 all of that. From a cash flow perspective
4 it really shouldn't matter, it's just a
5 larger pot of the money going to the
6 community and he turns around he gives you
7 the net anyway.

8 So if I could explain the math, the
9 EIT was 55 percent and then 70 percent going
10 to pay the TAN last year -- or this year,
11 and the rest going to the city. This will
12 be a larger pot of money so the spread
13 should be like 35 percent going to the TAN
14 and 65 percent coming to the city. That's
15 still an open question, that's one of the
16 things we have to work towards closing and
17 make sure everybody is comfortable from
18 their side, the note buyers that they are
19 going to be paid, and from the city's side
20 that you can fund operations and not have
21 issues with cash flow that you did three
22 years ago, so that's still ongoing.

23 The lockbox distribution, I just
24 kind of referenced, that would be in the
25 second paragraph there where you see the

1 35/65 split and the third paragraph there is
2 kind of the out that we are still working on
3 it. The big one to work on is March since
4 that's the big real estate tax collection
5 and how we can divvy that up going forward.

6 The draw down is a little bit
7 different than Amalgamated. You did it in
8 two draws. They are going to give you all
9 of the money upfront, which to me is better,
10 you'll have all of your money upfront.

11 The note buyer, this is unusual, in
12 the last two bonds deals that you did when
13 they came in with a purchase proposal they
14 didn't tell you who was buying the note. I
15 needed that for your reference that this is
16 for real and that you have a significant pot
17 of money buying this note from you and it's
18 Wells Fargo Capital Management out of
19 Wisconsin. Very sophisticated investors and
20 I have spoken to them, they are on board.

21 The fees, these again are not to
22 exceed 2 1/2 percent, and that is all
23 inclusive of everybody's fee. I'll give you
24 a comparable, the last Amalgamated deals the
25 fee was 3 percent and it did not include

1 everybody's fees, so we are doing much
2 better in that perspective.

3 The conditions going forward,
4 fairly, fairly standard. You need a budget
5 before they can close. We need a detailed
6 monthly draw down based upon that budget
7 when it's enacted. The 100 percent blanket
8 intercept I just alluded to that's the
9 revenue distribution.

10 There will be a provision where they
11 want to see a monthly positive end cash
12 balance. They initially had \$750,000 in
13 there, I was uncomfortable with that since I
14 don't know what the budget is yet, so we
15 have to negotiate some monthly cash balance
16 monthly and then kind of negotiate, well, if
17 you don't meet that what happens so that's
18 an open issue.

19 The debt ordinance and the
20 documents, obviously. Monthly reporting is
21 obvious. No litigation and so on. Fairly
22 simple comparable to the Amalgamated RFP
23 and. It doesn't have a precondition of
24 closing award Court bond deal. It doesn't
25 have the condition of many of the other

1 conditions in that other one. It's pretty
2 straight forward. That's basically it. I
3 mean, there is some work to be done, but
4 that's the guts of it and I can answer any
5 questions.

6 MR. MCGOFF: I have one, if this
7 were to be voted on this evening and
8 approved what would the timeline be for
9 closing on this proposal?

10 MR. JUDGE: We are shooting for
11 January 3.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

13 MR. JUDGE: The last two
14 transactions I believe were closed on
15 January 3.

16 MS. EVANS: Is it possible that
17 could occur sooner?

18 MR. JUDGE: Everybody asks me that.
19 Certainly, it can close sooner. I don't
20 know what the -- I haven't talked to bond
21 counsel on whether you can close a 2014 TAN
22 in 2013. I don't know. Yes, certainly. It
23 doesn't give us a lot of time. The biggest
24 item that needs to be accomplished we have
25 to do an AKWE (phonetic) document. This

1 thing LIKE the last two bond deals. Most of
2 it is done, you know, we just have to update
3 it, but that's the biggest weight we have to
4 lift so far and that just take times.

5 Other than, hell, I could close in a
6 week if we get it done, but we just have to
7 put things together. Yeah, if you want to
8 close this year, I'll make an effort and if
9 we can close legally I'm going away on
10 vacation on January 2, I would love to close
11 early.

12 MR. ROGAN: Can you compare, I know
13 you did this a little bit, but can you
14 compare the major items as far as I know you
15 mentioned on the fees, but could you also
16 compare this year's TAN, the 2014 TAN versus
17 the 2013 just for comparison sake.

18 MR. JUDGE: Sure. In fact, I have a
19 comparison sheet here. This is actually a
20 comparison to the Amalgamated RFP they
21 submitted to you this year, which is very
22 similar to what they did over the prior two
23 years, nothing really had changed in that.

24 And I'll go down, you can see the
25 middle column is the IFS Wells Capital

1 Management versus Amalgamated. The first
2 big real differential is the rate. We
3 should be around 4 percent. At a tax exempt
4 rate Amalgamated really didn't care if it
5 was taxable or tax exempt and they came in
6 at an estimated 395 rate so we are a little
7 bit higher in that instance. The terms are
8 the same, the collateral is the same.

9 The only other difference would be
10 the lockbox revenue. You will see that we
11 are doing real estate and they are very
12 comfortable with the EIT alone.

13 The splits, I didn't put the split
14 in there, but the last splits were 55
15 percent through -- going to the TAN through
16 April and then I believe it jumped up to 70
17 percent to year end and you paid off this
18 year's TAN in mid-October. That's a little
19 bit different. We are going with a smaller
20 percentage of a bigger pot of money. At the
21 end of the day, it should be about the same
22 if we do our homework correctly.

23 The drawdowns, again, we are giving
24 you one pot of money upfront. The fees, you
25 can see where the fees are, the last box

1 drawn from the proceeds of the loan?

2 MR. JUDGE: That's what we are
3 anticipating, yes. The fees, the language
4 in payment of the fees is payable out of the
5 finance proceeds or other city sources. So
6 we assume it's coming out of the TAN
7 proceeds.

8 MR. MCGOFF: So it would require an
9 additional budget item?

10 MR. JUDGE: No, or it can. We put
11 it in the cash flow to calculate the size of
12 the TAN. We put the fees in there. We are
13 obviously trying to borrow, I shouldn't say
14 as much as we can, but borrow what is
15 allowed under the tax law and what is needed
16 to fund your operations and we are still
17 talking about exactly what that amount is,
18 but it looks like it's around \$13 million,
19 which is a little bit under 16 with an RFP
20 for and, frankly, if you collect this year
21 you were committed to \$14 million of the
22 TAN, but you only drew down 12, so we are in
23 the ballpark.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

25 MR. ROGAN: So to sum up the fees

1 and the rate, the interest rate may be up to
2 about a half a percent more, but the fees
3 will be a half a percent less all inclusive.

4 MR. JUDGE: Half a percent or more,
5 yeah.

6 MR. ROGAN: Or more.

7 MR. JUDGE: Since we are all
8 inclusive of all of those and the
9 Amalgamated is not, and they tacked on
10 lawyer's fees on top of theirs, so you are
11 probably going to be in the 3 1/2 percent
12 range on their side.

13 MR. ROGAN: Okay. Great. Thank
14 you.

15 MR. JUDGE: It's similar, as well it
16 at the end of the day it's a little better.
17 Not by a lot, but it is a little better for
18 sure, especially there is no condition to do
19 other things not related to the TAN, which
20 makes it a hell of a lot easier. Don't type
21 hell of a lot.

22 MS. EVANS: It makes a lot more
23 sense, too, because it's such a short-term
24 borrowing, and to place such conditions, you
25 know, really extensive conditions on the TAN

1 I think is highly irregular. Is there
2 anyone else who has question?

3 MR. LOSCOMBE: Again, the big factor
4 is, again, not tying it into the police and
5 fire arbitration award financing, too, so as
6 we said, there are a lot of conditions that
7 are much better here. I think you did a
8 good job.

9 MR. JUDGE: Thank you.

10 MR. JOYCE: And I would just like to
11 say, as you know, I was in the meeting with
12 you, our city clerk, Nancy Krake, solicitor
13 Kelly and Business Administrator Gina Mc
14 Andrew the other afternoon going into the
15 late evening a little bit, and I just wanted
16 to thank you for your hard work at getting
17 this together so quickly.

18 MR. JUDGE: Thank you. I appreciate
19 it.

20 MS. EVANS: And if you would please
21 remain, if you can.

22 MR. JUDGE: Sure.

23 MS. EVANS: So that in the event
24 that any of our speakers may have questions
25 about the TAN you can respond to them.

1 MR. JUDGE: I just had a basketball
2 game and my nephew doesn't want me there
3 anyway.

4 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Judge.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Before we move to
6 citizens' participation, Mrs. Evans, could I
7 just -- the announcement for the breakfast
8 with Santa?

9 MS. EVANS: Oh, sure.

10 MR. MCGOFF: I got the information,
11 I believe this may be the third annual
12 breakfast with Santa sponsored by Matthew's
13 Mission in honor of Matthew -- I'm sorry, I
14 didn't have the microphone on. Matthew's
15 Mission has sponsored a breakfast with Santa
16 for three years to honor Mathew Newell who
17 passed away. It will be held this Saturday,
18 December 14, at Scranton High School. There
19 are two seatings, one at 9:00 and one at
20 11:00. The cost is \$9 for children, \$12 for
21 adults. If you attended in the past it's a
22 great event. They have a number of raffles.
23 I think this year they have two 39-inch TV
24 that's are being raffled off, they have
25 sittings with Santa for the children and the

1 adults and, you know, numerous other
2 entertainments. The one caveat to this is
3 that it does require a reservation and you
4 can contact Kelly Ann Davis at 570-961-0818.
5 It's a great cause and a great event and I
6 would encourage people to try and attend,
7 especially bringing the children and they
8 will have a great time, and that number
9 again is 570-961-0818. Thank you.

10 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Mrs. Krake,
11 we can go into the citizens now; correct?

12 MS. KRAKE: Yes.

13 MS. EVANS: Our first speaker
14 tonight is Ron Ellman.

15 MR. ELLMAN: I'm slow, but I'm
16 southern, I got the excuse. Thank you for
17 letting me speak the next 15 or 20 minutes
18 up here. That got your attention, didn't
19 it? The unbelievable arrogant statement by
20 Mr. Doherty for us to sacrifice now for
21 people ten years down the road just shows
22 his indifference to what's going on in this
23 city. Thousands of us won't be here ten
24 years from now. These taxes and cuts and
25 everything are effecting us right now.

1 People just don't care about ten years from
2 now. You know, you can put a fourth grader
3 at this table with a pen and a pencil and in
4 a couple of minutes they can show you there
5 is no way on God's green earth you could
6 have a budget. There is just no way the
7 populous of this city can keep up this
8 tremendous -- the amount of finances needed
9 over the years. It's not there. You can
10 just anybody out there could just take a
11 pencil and paper and divide what we owe and
12 in the, what 35, 36 thousand properties that
13 are taxable? It will never work.

14 You know, right a couple of weeks
15 ago while you people and the mayor were
16 working on your budget so hard Keystone
17 Resources in Clarks Summit bought a house
18 for \$265,000, it's off forever, it's gone.
19 They have 59 or 60 houses like that, one
20 company in town. The University bought a
21 house for a couple of hundred thousand a
22 couple of weeks ago. How could you even
23 intend to make a budget with this going on?
24 It's got to be stopped.

25 It just -- it just -- you are

1 building budgets year after year on
2 quicksand. It's just senseless unless
3 something positive is done about all of
4 these phony nonprofits. This city is
5 hurting so bad and all I -- about once a
6 week or so you see in the paper and under
7 the transactions for houses a big piece of
8 the property like that sucked up.

9 You know, I'll just make this short
10 and sweet lastly, I'm tired of hearing every
11 time somebody talks to me they blame all of
12 this problems on the fire and the police. I
13 have read not once, not twice, but three
14 times Gerald from PEL and Mr. Doherty could
15 have settled this. The lawyers just kept
16 going and going and going more than three
17 times. Do I have he facts right, Jack? You
18 lived through this? It was senseless. And
19 every time somebody talked to me the first
20 thing I hear the fire and the police, the
21 fire and the police. It's not their fault,
22 it's the incompetent way the city has been
23 run year after year after year that have
24 caused everything that's happening now and
25 sometimes I know I get -- I really get --

1 MS. EVANS: Frustrated.

2 MR. ELLMAN: I'm trying not to
3 offend council. I just get mad at council
4 for some of the things they do, but council
5 it seems to be our only friend that the
6 people of this city have and I certainly
7 appreciate it. Thank you.

8 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Jay Walsh.

9 MR. WALSH: Can I wait until the
10 end?

11 MS. EVANS: Yes.

12 MR. WALSH: Thank you.

13 MS. EVANS: Andrew Porter.

14 MR. PORTER: Andrew Porter,
15 Scranton.

16 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

17 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

18 MR. PORTER: Quick as the word.
19 Quick is the word. Let the children have
20 their Christmas, let them have Santa Clause
21 and their toys. What are we doing? What
22 are we going as a city? It took more than a
23 decade to bring forth what has taken place
24 and there has been no apologies to the
25 people. There has been no apologies to God.

1 This is the arrogance of power. The most
2 powerful in the world is the law of our God.
3 These are signs of government that is out of
4 control, but quick is the word, because we
5 still have time and the opportunity to do
6 it.

7 A gentlemen just got up and talked
8 about the police department and the fire
9 department and the people we are looking at
10 it as if, you know, you are going the wrong
11 route. Maybe so. The police department and
12 the fire department are essential services
13 and these people that have taken the oath
14 just like you to city council and mayor to
15 represent the people and to do the right
16 thing according to God, and so you have an
17 obligation and not to other people so much
18 as you do to God, and this has to be done
19 and it has to be done and it has to be done
20 quick.

21 Now, people have voted and they have
22 made a statement that they want to change.
23 We cannot change government. We can't
24 change the way we do things unless we change
25 ourselves and so we have to have a

1 conscience and we have to know where we come
2 from at this time of the year, the most
3 holiest, the most religious time of the year
4 we cannot mask what is being done to the
5 citizens of this great city. This is God's
6 city. We have an obligation to change this
7 and it can be changed. You can't do this by
8 staying at home because this is what you
9 have on been doing for more than ten years,
10 for almost going into two decades now.
11 There has to be a change and there has to be
12 change, you just can't continue to do what
13 you have done from one administration and
14 then run it into a new administration.

15 You voted for William Courtright and
16 you would like that William Courtright has
17 the opportunity to and the chance to be able
18 to represent you and serve God by
19 representing the people the way God would
20 want this city to be represented. We have
21 to great kids in this city. They had the
22 opportunity to raise funds, to be able to
23 bail out what has been misconstrued from a
24 past administration. When a past
25 administration can say that this is a

1 flourishing town, a town of progression, a
2 town that has no faults, give you that
3 impression. That isn't a false impression,
4 we would like to enjoy this season, but we
5 appear to be going into a foreclosure. We
6 appear to be a city that's up for sale and
7 we do not -- we should not look to fault
8 because the fault is there, but we should
9 look to fix, and the only way to fix this is
10 for people to come out, for people to come
11 out in prayer.

12 I don't know how much money it would
13 take, if a billion dollars would fix this
14 city. What needs to be fixed and what is
15 broken in this city is the way government is
16 run. We have taken an oath to do the right
17 thing and we have to do the right thing.
18 And, see, the problem that you will have as
19 a politician is that God knows what's in our
20 hearts, you see, so we have to do what's
21 right according to God, and there is a
22 solution and we have to -- we have to look
23 for that solution, and that solution is
24 through God. No one will know or predict
25 how God will react to what it is that we do,

1 in this time of the season, in this season.
2 No weather man will be able to predict this.
3 We need to come together and we need to work
4 and we need to be in commune, black, white,
5 yellow, green, it doesn't make any
6 difference what your nationality is we are
7 all God's children and we, as the senior
8 children of God, have the responsibility to
9 do what's right. We have the most wonderful
10 kids in the world in this city and we have
11 to look into our hearts and we have to
12 figure out a way quickly, quickly, how we
13 can make amends to God and how we can make
14 amends without allowing our city to go into
15 foreclosure for those who are just sitting
16 in the wings and to make a profit of this.

17 You can have my house because my
18 house does not belong to me, my house
19 belongs to God. But whoever picks up that
20 foreclosure, and I'm not just talking about
21 a property, I'm talking about taking
22 advantage of the people. We have to come
23 together, we are a good people. We are
24 proud people, but we are people in need and
25 we need to be able to help each other, and

1 the only way to do that is to come in.

2 Those who are at home, all of the
3 churches in this city, this is God's time
4 right now. We need to come and we need to
5 ask God for help. We need to do the things
6 that we need to do and, yes, you have
7 numbers involved and so on and so forth, but
8 no amount of numbers is going to fix this
9 city unless we fix ourselves.

10 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Porter.

11 MR. JOYCE: Thank you.

12 MS. EVANS: Les Spindler.

13 MR. SPINDLER: Good evening,
14 Council. Les Spindler, city resident and
15 homeowner and taxpayer.

16 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

17 MR. SPINDLER: First of all, best
18 wishes and a speedy recovery to Bill
19 Jackowitz and Attorney Hughes. I hope that
20 we see them back here fairly soon. Well,
21 that was a bit of good news today finally
22 that we received that TAN. It's about time
23 we finally received some good news, and I
24 think that's just the beginning of something
25 good that's going to happen. I think the

1 city is going to turn the right direction,
2 but the next thing hopefully that will
3 happen is that the banks see we are doing
4 the right thing and we get that money to pay
5 off the firefighters and the police unions.

6 I think it was Mr. McGoff that said
7 it two weeks ago once we get that paid off I
8 think we could get headed in the right
9 direction. That's a big thing weighing us
10 down, and I think once that is done, I mean,
11 it's going to take a long time for the city
12 to get straight, but I think we will be
13 headed in the right direction once that
14 happens.

15 Now onto the budget. I know,
16 Mrs. Evans and Mr. Joyce, you said you are
17 not making amendments that you won't be here
18 next year, but I hope someone has amendments
19 to this budget. I understand there has to
20 be a tax hike, the banks want to see a tax
21 hike or we won't get that court award from
22 any banks, so I understand that.

23 I'm more upset with this garbage fee
24 hike than I am with the tax hike. As I said
25 in the past, I don't think that's legal. We

1 pay our property tax and have our garbage
2 picked up, I think that tax hike -- I think
3 the garbage fee is illegal. To raise it to
4 \$300 is going to cripple some people. The
5 senior citizens cannot handle it. I have a
6 neighbor in back of me she is in her 80's
7 puts out one bag a week, another woman was
8 here last week said the same thing. It's
9 just impossible for these people.

10 With the garbage fee and the tax
11 hike we are talking over 100 percent hike.
12 These people don't get 100 percent hike in
13 their social security, so how could they
14 manage to pay these taxes and fees? It's
15 just impossible. So I'm urging council to
16 make some amendments. Hopefully make this
17 budget real, more realistic than it is now,
18 and as I said, I understand with the tax
19 hike, but the garbage fee is unrealistic. I
20 would be in favor of a per bag.

21 I just hope there are some
22 amendments. That's about all I have to say
23 tonight, but lastly, I know this is Mrs.
24 Evans and, Councilman Joyce, this is your
25 last meeting, hopefully you are moving onto

1 bigger and better things. I know Mrs. Evans
2 you will be enjoying your family.

3 MS. EVANS: Yes.

4 MR. SPINDLER: I wish you all of the
5 luck in the world.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

7 MR. SPINDLER: It was a pleasure
8 coming here every week speaking in front of
9 you.

10 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

11 MR. SPINDLER: And good luck in your
12 future.

13 MS. EVANS: Thank you. I appreciate
14 it.

15 MR. SPINDLER: Same thing with you,
16 Mr. Joyce. You have done a heck of a job in
17 your four years.

18 MR. JOYCE: Thank you.

19 MR. SPINDLER: You will be missed.
20 I just hope the person taking your place is
21 just as qualified as you were.

22 MR. JOYCE: Thank you.

23 MR. SPINDLER: So best of luck and
24 happy holidays to everybody.

25 MS. EVANS: And to you, also.

1 MR. SPINDLER: See you next year.

2 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

3 MS. EVANS: Doug Miller.

4 MR. MILLER: Good evening, Council.
5 Doug Miller, Scranton. Before I get into
6 the issue of the budget I just once again,
7 you know, in the event that we do not meet
8 next week, once again I'd like to remind
9 everyone that the Bolus Christmas dinner
10 will once again take place, it's 19th year
11 on Christmas Day from noon to six at St.
12 Pat's Church on 1403 Jackson Street and
13 Mr. Bolus couldn't be here tonight, but
14 obviously he extends his invitation to
15 everyone across the city, and we hope to see
16 everyone there.

17 Moving onto the budget, I first want
18 to thank Mr. Judge for coming in this
19 evening and addressing the public. You
20 know, thankfully you were able to secure
21 that TAN that we were certainly counting on
22 moving forward. Obviously, you know, we
23 always appreciate the work of attorney
24 Hughes and, you know, he certainly has gone
25 above and beyond many instances and things

1 that he has been able to assist this council
2 and a lot of different things through the
3 years and so that's obviously one of the
4 positives that we would like to see.

5 But, you know, as I stand here
6 tonight I can honestly say that I'm very
7 disappointed with the budget that's in front
8 of us at this time and I understand some
9 amendments are most likely going to make
10 place later on in the meeting. But, you
11 know, the reality is we understand what a
12 difficult situation and we talked an awful
13 lot earlier this evening and lot of speakers
14 who have addressed council before me tonight
15 have talked about, you know, the necessity
16 of a tax increase, and I think anyone that,
17 you know is a knowledgeable of city
18 government and understands the situation we
19 are in, a lot of us knew a tax increase was
20 inevitable. We planned for this to happen,
21 but I don't think we planned for it to be,
22 you know, this level of magnitude, and what
23 just really infuriates me, and I'm just
24 really disgusted at this point is a lot of
25 this could have been avoided had this

1 administration followed this thing. They
2 spent all of that time last summer going
3 back and forth, we had employees making
4 minimum wage, we were a laughing stock of
5 the nation, we were on national TV in the
6 City of Scranton for what was going on here,
7 and we went back and forth for months. Many
8 didn't think that this council and the
9 administration could come together, but you
10 did, and you took all this time and put all
11 of these revenue enhancements in here and we
12 haven't realized half of it.

13 And I think had we followed through
14 on the recovery plan this tax increase
15 wouldn't be nearly the amount that the mayor
16 is calling for and it's yet again time and
17 time again the arrogance and the fiscal
18 mismanagement by this administration.
19 That's the legacy that they are leaving
20 behind.

21 You know, and it really upset me,
22 the other thing that upsets me is tonight,
23 and I appreciate, it's nice to see Mr. Judge
24 here, but council sent an open invitation to
25 the mayor-elect and his so-called transition

1 team. Where are they? Mr. Joyce, you're
2 the Finance Chair --

3 MR. MCGOFF: Can I answer your
4 question?

5 MR. MILLER: No, you can't.
6 Mr. Joyce, you are our Finance Chair.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Okay. Fine.

8 MR. MILLER: You handled this
9 budget, you know, have done a lot of good
10 things, has anyone throughout this process
11 in the transition team, including the
12 mayor-elect, reached out to you?

13 MR. JOYCE: No, but they have
14 reached out to other council members from
15 what I understand.

16 MR. MILLER: Okay. So you, as the
17 Finance Chair, didn't have any contact with
18 them?

19 MR. JOYCE: No.

20 MR. MILLER: Okay. I think that's a
21 very troubling thing. I really do, that
22 there has been no dialogue between the
23 incoming administration and this council to
24 take part in the budget proces. This is
25 going to be their baby in another three

1 weeks and we haven't heard anything and that
2 upsets me.

3 The other thing that upsets me is
4 the lack of creativity, as I said. You
5 know, a comment was made last week by a
6 member of council that, you know, we talk an
7 awful lot about revenue, but we have an
8 expenditure problem. You are damn right we
9 have an expenditure problem, but common
10 sense tells you when you have an expenditure
11 problem you need revenue to pay your bills
12 and, unfortunately, you know, this council
13 and the majority of council, Mr. Joyce, you
14 know, Mrs. Evans and Mr. Loscombe, you gave
15 us a lot of revenue here, but unfortunately,
16 you know, as the old saying, you know, you
17 can lead a horse to water but you can't make
18 them drink. I mean, if we'd followed
19 through on these things, as I said, we
20 wouldn't be looking at a 56 percent tax
21 increase, okay? People across this city
22 wouldn't have to see a \$300 garbage bill
23 next year. Tenants wouldn't have to see
24 their rent jacked up another two or three
25 hundred dollars because of rental

1 registration.

2 But because we had administration
3 that has failed to cooperate and follow
4 through on revenue enhancements we are in
5 this position, and I'm not here to listen to
6 excuses as to why certain people haven't
7 come forward, that's not what we are here
8 for, there is too much at stake. I'm not
9 concerned about prior commitments and
10 engagements. I do appreciate Mr. Weschler
11 reaching out, Mr. Gaughan reaching out, at
12 least they had the decency and the courtesy
13 to respond that, I can give them credit for
14 that.

15 But, you know, to not follow through
16 on a recovery plan I just believe is just
17 totally inexcusable and I can only hope that
18 moving forward, you know, things change
19 because I hate to see that the hard work of
20 this council basically follow the wayside
21 and that's what's happening here because now
22 what's happening is you are being asked to
23 do the dirty work and roll up your sleeves
24 once again, and that's not right, because
25 certain people don't want to make the tough

1 decisions in moving forward, I say make the
2 necessary amendments to save the residents
3 of this city but don't continue to be
4 bullied and pushed around by people that
5 don't want to do the work themselves because
6 that's what's gotten us in this situation to
7 begin with.

8 And I only hope that we can continue
9 to take these issues seriously, we follow
10 through on things that are implemented and
11 only better the city and with that said if
12 we don't meet next week I'd like to wish
13 everyone a Merry Christmas and certainly
14 going to be a happy new year. Thank you.

15 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And Merry
16 Christmas to you.

17 MR. MILLER: Thank you.

18 MS. EVANS: David Dobrzyn.

19 MR. DOBRZYN: Good evening, Council.

20 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

21 MR. DOBRZYN: Dave Dobrzyn, resident
22 and taxes paid, fees paid. Okay, unpaid
23 taxes and fees in the city are considerable
24 and I would like to see council endorse
25 reverse mortgages for elderly people that

1 are unable to pay them because it's a
2 considerable amount of money not coming in
3 and it's not coming in year after year after
4 year and eventually the chickens are going
5 to come to roost on it some time and then it
6 may be too late.

7 Now, the DPW I would regard it as
8 important as fire and police. I'd like to
9 see in the new year an accounting of the
10 DPW, what it costs for trash recycle costs,
11 trucks, labor, maintenance and so forth so
12 that we could sort out this fee business as
13 opposed to rise in property taxes, and also
14 I would point out that some people with a
15 higher value of a home would be
16 disproportionately effected also if you are
17 home is assessed at a much higher value than
18 guy down the road, well, then you might wind
19 up paying \$500 extra in property taxes
20 instead of the \$300 trash fee, and I'd like
21 to see a conversion to cans and enforcement
22 of recycling.

23 The mayor has an ad on and,
24 unfortunately, the one thing that the ad
25 lacks is what is recyclable. There is a

1 broad expansion of recycling so if we plan
2 to save money in the future on trash fees
3 then by recycling then certainly they need
4 to be -- it's terrible the amount of the
5 recyclables I see when I walk Mr. Pooch
6 through the courts and it's just ungodly
7 amount of recyclable material that wind up
8 in the trash.

9 And, well, I'm not going to dwell on
10 the negatives, but we need an association of
11 tax exempts for property tax loss
12 replacement and it's been a longstanding
13 idea of mine and they have to go to the
14 state and get compensation because -- at 33
15 percent tax exempt it's getting to be
16 impossible.

17 For instance, you know, everybody
18 dwells on the "U", well, a few years back
19 there Senator Santorum was over there
20 talking about the great idea of privatizing
21 social security and I saw a lot of 50
22 somethings that were concerned about it and
23 Mr. Santorum had his cheerleading section
24 and, fortunately, he is no longer a senator
25 because that would have been a disaster. It

1 would have been one big disaster, but the
2 point being as a tax exempt you are supposed
3 to provide both sides of the story, have a
4 debate, not a selling -- a selling seminar
5 to con people into something. You should
6 have an opposing point of view, so that's
7 how a lot of the tax exempts operate in a
8 negative fashion towards the public at
9 large.

10 And, well, a lot has been said on
11 the unions and so forth. Another thing that
12 has been offensive from the tax exempts is
13 somebody came up with, I don't know if it
14 was the Scranton Times I read it, but it's
15 money down the much rat hole for PILOTS and
16 if that's all you think of a PILOT as in the
17 city, is a rat hole, what are you doing
18 here? That's all there is to it, basic
19 question? What are you doing here if it's
20 money down the rat hole. They want to have
21 some kind of a say as to the how the money
22 gets spent or whatever, well, we need too
23 much money to spend right now.

24 And I'd like to issue a warning with
25 public unions, we had the Transpacific trade

1 pack, call your senators, call your
2 congressmen, call the president, call
3 whoever you can and tell them to can it.
4 More jobs lost, 33 years of job losses of
5 working class and, by the way, the
6 unemployment compensation is probably not
7 going to be extended by our Federal
8 Congress, it's under vote right now, the
9 Ryan Murphy plan has no solution for it.
10 How do you people pay the bills if there is
11 no money coming in? It's just years back
12 you used to get fired from one job and go
13 right into the next job and you probably got
14 a quarter raise or a 50 cent raise, now,
15 it's forget about it. We have three
16 qualified job applicants for every job, so I
17 often wondered how many income taxes were
18 lost just by these trade packs to cities
19 like ours and the federal government. Thank
20 you and have a good night.

21 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Dobrzyn.
22 Ozzie Quinn.

23 MR. QUINN: Ozzie Quinn. Good
24 evening.

25 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

1 MR. QUINN: And happy holidays.

2 MS. EVANS: Happy holidays.

3 MR. JOYCE: Merry Christmas to you,
4 too.

5 MR. QUINN: Thank you. I'm Ozzie
6 Quinn, homeowner in the City of Scranton and
7 also the president of the
8 Scranton/Lackawanna County Taxpayers'
9 Association. We all know there is no holy
10 grail for the City of Scranton, you know?
11 We are in a hell of fix in the City of
12 Scranton. No one wants to have a tax
13 increase or garbage collection increase.
14 You know, the silent majority out there, the
15 white collar, the blue collar and the pink
16 collar they are scared and they are afraid
17 of losing their homes and they have a right
18 to be because of the fact that we have seen
19 in the last six months the number of homes
20 went up on the chopping block either for
21 delinquent taxes or for not unable to pay
22 the bank loan.

23 Mrs. Evans, you know, nobody
24 listened to you since 2003 when you kept on
25 saying and you coined it the Doherty debt,

1 and as some previous speaker said previous
2 weeks, kicking the can down the street and
3 that's what the Doherty administration did
4 and you stood out there and I want to thank
5 you as really for being as brave as you were
6 and trying to stop this here stupid debt
7 that the City of Scranton has gotten because
8 of the Doherty administration. Year after
9 year after year with the idea of look for a
10 lower interest loan, you will get a bigger
11 loan and pay the bill and that's stupid. We
12 all know stupid. Frank Joyce knows it's
13 stupid, right, Frank?

14 And, you know, but yet it was
15 allowed to go on and on and on and on and
16 here we are today December 12, 2014. And we
17 don't know where the heck we are going. You
18 know, it scares me because of the fact that,
19 you know, there is a new administration
20 coming in and I would be totally remiss if I
21 come up here and just said to myself, you
22 know, I want to bang the hell out of the
23 Doherty administration and say we have to
24 have a tax increase and whatnot.

25 But, you know, from the Taxpayers'

1 Association standpoint view, you know, we
2 reached out to Representatives Flynn,
3 Kavulich and Mr. Haggerty in regards to
4 House Bill 76 and we are reaching out to
5 Senator Blake on House Bill -- Senate Bill
6 76 which is if approved will eliminate
7 school property taxes. It's called the
8 Property Tax Independence Act, okay? And if
9 approved next year within two years school
10 property taxes will be eliminated throughout
11 the state. Each one of us who own property
12 in the City of Scranton that is the highest
13 majority of the three taxing bodies. I pay
14 56 percent of my taxes goes to the school
15 tax. Just think if we eliminate that school
16 property tax. It will give the new
17 administration and the people of Scranton a
18 breather to be able to -- we have to pay off
19 this debt. We have to pay off the fire and
20 police because Mr. Doherty didn't negotiate,
21 you know, and it finally came. If I was in
22 the same position I wouldn't give it up, I
23 would want my money. You know, if I was an
24 individual and I was killed or in a coma I
25 want my wife to go after that money just as

1 the fire and police are. They have. You
2 know, that's why they are binding together
3 to become a union.

4 And, you know, just can't say, well,
5 the hell with the unions, you know? We owe
6 them money. The Court came down and says we
7 owe them money and the only way we can pay
8 that money is if we get behind the new
9 administration and look at a positive thing
10 as we are tonight with the tax anticipation
11 note which you people were able to negotiate
12 and get it passed, and if the new
13 administration, and hopefully they will,
14 will get behind this new property tax
15 elimination act and get rid of the school
16 property taxes, get rid of them. People
17 senior citizens don't even know why they are
18 paying such an amount. If we get rid of
19 them then we can possibly start to pay of
20 the debt and pay off the unions and get back
21 into a position where we are solvent again.

22 And I appreciate if the new
23 administration and those who are on council
24 will meet with the state representatives
25 when you meet with them and discuss this

1 because we discussed it here at the
2 meetings, we have the man and we reached our
3 hands out and they accepted what we are
4 trying to do and they all -- those three
5 sponsors are sponsors of this Bill. We had
6 David Baldinger, their 76 taxpayers'
7 association across the state, we are one of
8 them. Dave Baldinger is the coordinator and
9 he works very closely with the state house
10 and senate and he has got us to a position
11 we are going to pass it, okay? We got to
12 pass it. Get behind it. It's our only
13 salvation. We got to look for tax relief
14 through eliminating the school property
15 taxes.

16 Lastly, Mr. Rogan, last month I
17 asked about the federal audit where there
18 was \$11 million finding and if it wasn't
19 resolved that would become non-federal funds
20 which would be Scranton taxpayers' money to
21 pay whatever it is, can you give me a status
22 report on that?

23 MR. ROGAN: There was no indication
24 from PEL or from the administration that
25 that needed to be included in this year's

1 budget thankfully. I know that OECD is
2 still working on those issues so I'm hopeful
3 that in the next administration they will
4 all be resolved.

5 MR. QUINN: I hope so, too, because
6 we couldn't pay that another \$11 million for
7 mismanagement thank you very much.

8 MS. ROGAN: Thank you.

9 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.

10 MS. EVANS: Mr. Walsh, would you
11 like to speak now?

12 MR. WALSH: I see the winds of
13 change are upon us. Going forward I pray
14 and hope we can do the right thing for the
15 future is here and we are it. All politics
16 are local for the most part and so is
17 corruption, in Harrisburg and Washington
18 it's a little bit more sophisticated. It
19 seems like the information last week and the
20 \$21 million that the union is looking for
21 are we \$28 million dollars in the hole
22 starting off and they want their money now
23 so do we have the locust at the door?

24 The testimony here from the elderly
25 people last week, that's attempted to plead

1 to pleas, I think that the bag fee for the
2 garbage is the appropriate way to go because
3 there is no incentive for people to recycle.
4 If they have to pay a bag fee, because I
5 walk the streets all the time, I take lots
6 of walks, and on garbage night the stuff
7 that's going in the garbage is just
8 unbelievable. Is there a way to get the
9 amount of tonnage that we have been putting
10 over the last five or "X" amount of years up
11 in the landfill or is that propitiatory
12 information or is it something that you can
13 actually find or put your hand on, is that
14 possible? Does anybody know the answer to
15 that question?

16 I'm a numbers man, okay, being in
17 the market for 30 years it's all about the
18 numbers, so are we going down in what we are
19 depositing up at the landfill and now we are
20 going up in price? It doesn't make sense to
21 me. I mean, it's -- you know, people are
22 looking for value.

23 We are a Clas 2A city, as I
24 understand it, and the Harrisburg
25 administration did not put -- handcuff us

1 into actually filing Chapter 9 as I
2 understand it. Last week Mr. McGoff said to
3 me -- or said, not to me, he said something
4 about going into a receivership cost more
5 money. I tried to find that information.
6 If you can give me an idea where I can find
7 that information, I know there is 50 cities
8 that have applied for bankruptcy, but I
9 can't see where the cost is actually more,
10 so if you could help me out there. I like
11 researching things. As a matter of fact, I
12 pretty much spend every day researching and
13 I find some interesting nuggets.

14 We can roll up our sleeves and be
15 the train that can or continue on our off
16 trackness and who knows where we might land
17 up. If you don't stand for something, you
18 will fall for anything, and I think that we
19 are at a crossroads and we have a great
20 opportunity to go forward.

21 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

22 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

23 MS. EVANS: That concludes our
24 sign-in sheet, is there anyone else who to
25 cares to address council?

1 MR. SBARAGLIA: Andy Sbaraglia,
2 citizen of Scranton. Fellow Scrantonians,
3 does anybody have a ballpark figure on this
4 TAN? In other words, how much in excess are
5 we going to be paying over the TAN? In
6 other words, if we borrow \$13 million do we
7 have to pay back \$16 million? What is the
8 cost to the -- final cost to the taxpayer?

9 MR. JUDGE: Four percent.
10 Approximately 4 percent.

11 MR. SBARAGLIA: Yeah, but that's a
12 number. It doesn't give me a cost. The
13 cost number you must know exactly what the
14 cost will be to the taxpayer. I don't have
15 an amortization sheet. If I had one I could
16 look at it and I would know, but it's not in
17 front of me, but somewhere along the line 4
18 percent is nothing. It's the cost -- that's
19 a variable, too, right? Plus the cost of
20 the borrowing and the money, too?

21 MR. JUDGE: You will pay back at 4
22 percent \$13,520,000.

23 MR. SBARAGLIA: If we borrow \$13
24 million.

25 MR. JUDGE: That is correct. And

1 you hold that --

2 MR. SBARAGLIA: In the course of the
3 borrowing money --

4 MR. JUDGE: And you hold it for the
5 entire year, which you won't, so it's going
6 to be something under that.

7 MR. SBARAGLIA: Okay, so we know
8 exactly a ballpark figure what it's going to
9 cost us. That's the only way you can
10 compare the final cost of the TAN to the
11 taxpayers. Given something like 4 percent
12 doesn't mean a darn thing until you know
13 exactly what you are borrowing, and the
14 duration and the closing costs and all of
15 that other stuff that goes with it. That's
16 why I like amortization sheets, but they
17 don't usually give them on TANS.

18 Okay, now, Mr. McGoff mentioned last
19 time the cost of the real estate tax as
20 being one of the lowest, but that ain't the
21 true cost of living in Scranton. We got a
22 wage tax that's really high. We also got
23 the refuse fee that's high. We got a \$52
24 fee that's high and God knows what our sewer
25 cost is going to be because that's going

1 higher and higher and higher. This is all
2 costs of living in Scranton and if you would
3 add them altogether we are not highest.
4 Living in Scranton you are paying the
5 highest other than any around this
6 community. They are probably getting --
7 they might have higher taxes on some things,
8 but if you add in all our costs we are
9 higher.

10 Now, the administration wants to go
11 higher. I don't see how we are going to be
12 able to do it and these things should have
13 been done long ago. I'd like amortization
14 sheets. I like adding one and one and
15 getting two. Ozzie talks about this house
16 bill, Mr. Joyce, you said you rent?

17 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

18 MR. SBARAGLIA: That's correct?

19 MR. JOYCE: That's correct.

20 MR. SBARAGLIA: You want to pay for
21 Mr. Ozzie's home because that's what you are
22 going to be doing if this bill passes.
23 Every renter will have to pay for people who
24 don't rent. In other words, the haves and
25 the have nots is what it amounts to.

1 Now, if they wanted to really do
2 something for the people that were aging
3 they could have passed the bill long ago.
4 As I explained it when we were explaining
5 here that time, the only people get anything
6 out of it will be the community and
7 businesses.

8 As far as the average person, you
9 may get it for a year or two before they
10 said the school tax has to go up sky high
11 because the money ain't coming in or this
12 and that. This is something that you have
13 to look at. That's why Blake is against it
14 and I'm going to be against it, too. Why
15 should somebody have to pay for your house
16 what it amounts to. It's not right. Of
17 course, living in this city isn't quite
18 right anyway.

19 I'm going to miss you, Janet, I
20 really am. I miss them night sessions when
21 we used to go there and go over the budgets
22 that you at least printed out and people
23 keep throwing away, but it was fun. At
24 least you were trying.

25 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

1 MR. SBARAGLIA: And what is going to
2 happen now, I have no idea. I don't know if
3 there will be a taxpayer strike, which can
4 happen. If people decide to put their taxes
5 into escrow instead of putting it into
6 treasure, the city will collapse. Let's
7 hope it don't go that far, but people are
8 mad and they are getting madder and I can
9 understand it. They keep saying you said
10 this was going to happen years ago. I said,
11 sure, I said, it was going to happen years
12 ago. It wasn't hard to figure out. You
13 just can't do what we are doing.

14 I don't know what's going to happen.
15 Maybe when we get out of these two-year
16 contracts we could finally get in and do
17 something with our workers in the city,
18 maybe retirement age will be close to 55
19 like they are in private industry. I could
20 never retire before I hit 55, why should
21 somebody have to retire at 23 or something
22 like that. Thank you.

23 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

24 MR. UNGVARSKY: Good evening, city
25 council. I'm Tom Ungvarsky. Mrs. Evans,

1 Mr. Joyce, I haven't always agreed with you,
2 but I know you have done the best that you
3 can for the city and thank you for your
4 service.

5 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much for
6 your comments.

7 MS. EVANS: Thank you very much.

8 MR. UNGVARSKY: I hope someone on
9 city council will amend the budget to keep
10 the meters as they are now. It is probably
11 the only thing that is really making us any
12 kind of revenue. I hope someone will amend
13 the budget to include them.

14 It seems that somewhere along the
15 way the leaders of Scranton forgot what the
16 city is. Scranton was always a city of
17 hardworking people. Somewhere you got the
18 idea that we could bring in people from New
19 York and become a 24-hour city, a college
20 town. Scranton was never meant to be that.
21 We had a Chamber of Commerce that never
22 brought anything into this city and always
23 took from the city. I believe when they
24 sold the old Chamber of Commerce building
25 they owed taxes on it and they never paved

1 it off.

2 I hope the new administration would
3 realize that it is the people in this town
4 that need the help and they devote their
5 time to paving the streets, putting
6 sidewalks, new curbing and helping people
7 who can't afford to fix their house to give
8 them some kind of relief instead of just
9 giving it to the developers. Good luck,
10 city council, you will be needing it. Thank
11 you.

12 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

13 MS. SCHUMACHER: Good evening.
14 Marie Schumacher.

15 ALL OF COUNCIL: Good evening.

16 MS. SCHUMACHER: And before I use up
17 all of my five minutes, I would like to echo
18 Mr. Ungvarsky's comments and thank Mrs.
19 Evans and Mr. Joyce for your service and, as
20 I say we always did -- the same thing,
21 didn't always agree but --

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

23 MS. SCHUMACHER: I think we always
24 had --

25 MR. JOYCE: Thank you. Could I stop

1 you and hold your time for a little bit?

2 MS. SCHUMACHER: Sure.

3 MR. JOYCE: Because I do have
4 answers to your --

5 MS. SCHUMACHER: Yes. That was my
6 next question. Thank you.

7 MR. JOYCE: So if you could please
8 pause the stopwatch so I could answer some
9 of the questions. I attempted to reach out
10 to all of the department heads as well as
11 PEL with your questions that you had. I did
12 obtain the answers to many of them,
13 unfortunately, I couldn't get the answers to
14 all of them, but let me start.

15 The first question you asked was to
16 please provide the assumed percent property
17 tax owners will pay and garbage fee in 2014
18 as well as the rate assumed in the 2013
19 budget for this tax and fee.

20 Basically the collection rate that
21 was assumed for the real estate tax was 88
22 percent in both budgets, both 2013 and 2014.
23 For the garbage collection fee, it's 76
24 percent.

25 MS. SCHUMACHER: Both years?

1 MR. JOYCE: Yes. Please provide a
2 breakdown of the cost of the total garbage
3 fee by category and the number of fee payers
4 to whom the invoice will be sent? How much,
5 if any, is included in this line item for
6 the repayment of the 2013 landfill
7 forbearance?

8 I didn't get a concrete answer for
9 this question. Basically, the response that
10 I received back from PEL was that we could
11 try to isolate costs further, but what I
12 actually sent them was correct in the things
13 that I listed as expenses of refuse
14 collection and, of course, those are the
15 cost of the labor for refuse/recycling
16 workers as well as their health care
17 benefits, workers' compensation, pension, as
18 well as cost of fuel for the vehicles
19 responsible for the collection of refuse and
20 recyclables as well as the cost of vehicle
21 repair and also the tipping fee. I don't
22 have the exact figure on that number.

23 The next question that you asked,
24 what additional service will be provided in
25 2014 that wasn't provided in 2013 that

1 accounts for the increase in the rental
2 registration fees -- or the rental
3 registration fee of \$50? Basically I said
4 to PEL, you know, are there any other
5 services -- and the department heads, are
6 there any other services that will be
7 provided for the increase in the rental
8 registration fee and personally I'm assuming
9 that they are not. However, I know that the
10 increase in the rental registration fee is
11 similar to some other cities in the United
12 States and in Pennsylvania.

13 Basically PEL stated that as long as
14 the fee covers the cost of the inspection
15 plus administration/record keeping and is
16 not a tax in disguise then the fee amount is
17 probably okay. The city would have to
18 determine the true cost of the providing the
19 service. So interesting enough, if the city
20 says, well, the inspection would cost \$300
21 that's the number that they could use to
22 justify an increase.

23 MS. SCHUMACHER: If they --

24 MR. JOYCE: Even though maybe the
25 city could think in the year before that an

1 inspection was only costing \$100, so it's
2 very vague the rule on that.

3 MS. SCHUMACHER: And I think the
4 property owners could testify as to how long
5 they spend at their place so that would be
6 an hourly rate, so that's something that
7 could be verified as to whether it's a tax
8 or a fee, but, thank you. Yeah.

9 MR. JOYCE: You also asked what's
10 the intergovernmental reimbursement split
11 between CDBG, demolitions and the state
12 contribution to pension obligations.
13 Essentially for 2013 the city received
14 approximately \$3 million in state aid and
15 that was applied to the 2013 MMO. That's
16 the amount assumed for 2014 as well.

17 Interesting enough, and I did not
18 know this, in regard to OECD, is that they
19 can charge retirement costs to -- they can
20 take them out of CDBG funds and actually PEL
21 did state that they would be surprised if
22 the city is not doing this, but PEL doesn't
23 monitor that fund so they didn't know.

24 As far as PILOTS, you asked from
25 what entities and in what amount for each

1 PILOTS will be received. For the University
2 of Scranton, as we know, it's \$175,000.
3 Lutherwood is \$6,000. Harrison House is
4 500. And, additionally, the city does
5 receive some PILOT contributions from the
6 Scranton Housing Authority. I asked if I
7 was missing anything and I really wasn't.
8 That's all that we are getting.

9 MS. SCHUMACHER: But isn't the
10 amount in the 2014 considerably more than
11 that amount which would be \$181,500. I
12 think it's more than that in the budget, so
13 where is -- what makes up the difference?

14 MR. JOYCE: Interesting enough, I
15 would assume that the city is somehow
16 optimistic that they will obtain more
17 PILOTS.

18 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay.

19 MR. JOYCE: The next question you
20 had posed was the miscellaneous
21 revenue/cable TV revenue includes \$28
22 million to be borrowed in 2014 for the
23 public safety employee payback award -- or
24 back pay award. It's my understanding that
25 there will be a \$100,000 penalty per month

1 for non-payment of this back pay. When is
2 the \$28 million expected to be received and
3 when will and will it suffice to cover the
4 interest?

5 Well, PEL's response to this, and
6 then I have my own response to it and I
7 asked them to provide some more input,
8 basically said -- they said the award
9 borrowing should be \$22 million for the
10 award, in parentheses, award plus costs of
11 issuing the bonds which, of course, well,
12 Mr. Judge would probably know more about
13 that than I would, and the pension is for
14 \$6.1 million unpaid balance plus the
15 interest penalty unless, of course, that TAN
16 does come in before the end of the year and
17 that pension payment is made, but I know
18 that is asking a lot.

19 Interest is included on the pension
20 payments, they weren't sure on the monthly
21 interest charges for the union, only half a
22 year of debt payments in 2014 for the award
23 financing. They have really no idea as to
24 the unions willingness to a timetable for
25 the borrowing under the mayor, so as far as

1 the interest on that award is concerned I
2 hope that mayor-elect Courtright would try
3 to negotiate something with the unions to
4 hopefully come to an agreeable term on the
5 interest because --

6 MS. SCHUMACHER: So then there is no
7 interest in the 2014 budget for that then;
8 right?

9 MR. JOYCE: Basically, yes.
10 Is there a lender for the tax
11 anticipation note, and if so, what will be
12 the fee and interest charged? Well, I think
13 Mr. Judge took care of that one.

14 MS. SCHUMACHER: I think we covered
15 that. I think so.

16 MR. JOYCE: Will the local tax
17 budgeted for the 2013 be achieved and, if
18 not, how much will the budgeted revenue be
19 short? I said from my review I was assuming
20 that there should be no problems with this
21 and PEL did confirm. They said that we
22 don't -- or we don't see any local service
23 tax problem and they also confirmed that
24 much of the amount for the earned income tax
25 in the 2014 operating budget is obtained.

1 That was PEL's opinion.

2 The next question that you had
3 related to a revenue amount for the TAN of
4 \$16 million and then on the expense side it
5 was \$17 million, that was put in there to
6 cover the cost of the fees and interest, but
7 as Mr. Judge did explain on the \$13 million
8 TAN the cost of it would be about 13.5. So,
9 for instance, on a \$16 million TAN I'm
10 assuming the cost would probably be
11 somewhere in the, oh, I'd say 650 to
12 \$700,000 range. Mr. Judge, am I correct in
13 my assumption?

14 MR. JUDGE: You are. In fact, I
15 just got a tax back, you cannot close a 2014
16 TAN in 2013.

17 MR. JOYCE: Okay. So I guess we now
18 know the answers that we will be paying the
19 interest on the amendment only.

20 Okay, next you asked what is the Tax
21 Collection Committee, who are the members
22 and why do they expect to incur expenses of
23 almost half a million dollars?

24 This is the countywide Tax
25 Collection Commission, that collect the

1 earned income tax, and basically that's what
2 I was able to obtain.

3 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay. That's --
4 okay --

5 MR. JOYCE: I know I didn't get all
6 of your questions, but I did get as much as
7 I possibly could.

8 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, yeah, there
9 are certainly more unanswered than answers,
10 but I appreciate what you did, but, you
11 know, I feel, and two of the members up
12 there, but everybody should want to know the
13 answers to these questions before they vote
14 on the budget and if they don't, if I were
15 sitting up there I would have to recuse
16 myself because if I didn't know that this
17 was an actual workable budget I couldn't
18 vote one way or the other on that, so I'm
19 disappointed that the answers aren't fully
20 available because I think they are all
21 legitimate, especially nothing on that \$7
22 million jump over the unpaid bill or the
23 court awards? Is the unpaid bills going to
24 be the deficit that we are going to have at
25 the end of 2013?

1 MR. JOYCE: Well, we are holding
2 back bills plus there is, of course, the MMO
3 payment that's going to be missed. That's
4 going to be made up for in 2014, so your
5 assumption is very logical and correct.

6 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay. Thank you.
7 And you already said nothing in the budget
8 either for that all of the interest that is
9 going out.

10 Mr. Rogan, I had two questions for
11 him, but I guess he wasn't interested in the
12 answers to my questions either.

13 MR. JOYCE: I could take a crack at
14 them if they are OECD related.

15 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, yeah, I would
16 like to know where the delinquent loan
17 status of all of the delinquent loans is,
18 that's been weeks.

19 MR. JOYCE: That's something that
20 Mr. Rogan has been involved in so --

21 MS. SCHUMACHER: And then the other
22 one he has been advocating going to a per
23 bag fee for the trash and I wanted to know
24 from him how much per bag he thought we
25 would -- or calculated, I would hope, would

1 have to be charged to raise the \$7 million
2 that's in the budget for trash removal.

3 MR. JOYCE: Yeah, to be honest with
4 you, I don't know if there has ever been a
5 garbage study done in the City of Scranton
6 or any other city that determines the amount
7 of the number of bags of trash that the
8 average household puts out every week, but
9 just from looking at -- there is one city in
10 Pennsylvania I know that does a per bag fee,
11 and that's Wilkes-Barre, and I know that
12 theirs is \$2 per bag.

13 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay.

14 MR. JOYCE: But I don't think \$2 per
15 bag would give us \$7 million.

16 MS. SCHUMACHER: Yeah, I don't think
17 so either. Will we be collecting the trash
18 at the homes with the 24 percent that are
19 not planned -- will not be paying according
20 to the collections percentage that they are
21 using for the budget?

22 MR. JOYCE: Well, it's -- I'm
23 assuming that will happen. I don't see the
24 DPW being able to or even knowing who pays
25 their trash bill and who gets behind, you

1 know. I think at least NRS has done a very
2 good job going after those with delinquent
3 trash bills and I hope they could continue
4 their good work and hopefully there is some
5 way that in the next administration that
6 they will be able to collect refuse fees
7 effectively because that is very problematic
8 when you think --

9 MS. SCHUMACHER: It is, because our
10 \$300 rate is going to pay for a quarter of
11 the people who do not.

12 MR. JOYCE: Right. You are
13 absolutely right.

14 MS. SCHUMACHER: Who don't bother to
15 pay, and it is in the ordinance that was
16 originally drafted back I believe in '89
17 that that is something that the DPW is
18 allowed to do, so I would certainly hope
19 that was looked at.

20 And I just want to verify, if there
21 are amendments to the budget tonight. There
22 will be a second round of questions since we
23 have not been made privy to any amendments?

24 MR. JOYCE: I would definitely
25 advocate for that. I think that the public

1 should have the chance to speak about any
2 amendments, and I have a page here from my
3 colleagues that was provided that describes
4 the amendments that they will make tonight
5 and I think that the public should
6 definitely have a chance to comment on them.

7 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay, and I do hope
8 that the -- if there is a since there are
9 going to be amendments that one of them
10 would be that any person who doesn't pay
11 their real estate tax or city real estate
12 tax and is 62 or over will be provided
13 materials on reverse mortgage and referred
14 to a financial person that can help them or
15 persons, because I think there a lot of
16 people, as I said, I think this could end up
17 being the great real estate robbery because,
18 you know, within two years they could be
19 sold and all of the equity, assuming there
20 at that age of life and stage, I would
21 certainly think that a lot of people are
22 going to be walking away with a lot of
23 people's hard earned equity, so I do hope
24 that's one of the them, so some I will see
25 next year and some I won't, but probably

1 later if there are amendments. Thank you.

2 MR. JOYCE: Yes. I'm sure I'll
3 speak to you again in less than an hour.

4 MR. MORGAN: Good evening, Council.

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

6 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

7 MR. MORGAN: I think it's really
8 important for this council to send a very
9 strong signal to the community and let the
10 mayor's budget be implemented the way it
11 sits. And when the council does this they
12 need to be vocal, very vocal, all five
13 council members, not just some, but all
14 five. And say that this city cannot pay the
15 this rate of taxation because the tax base
16 just happen.

17 And, you know, you read in the paper
18 today where the city unions want their money
19 and, look it, I'm not against that, but we
20 can't pay that either, and when we take a
21 look at the amount of these taxes that are
22 coming and, Mr. Rogan, I appreciate what you
23 said because I think it supports some of
24 what I'm saying today when you ask that they
25 extend the deadline to pay your taxes, but I

1 think it's time to be very honest and very
2 truthful and admit one thing, people can't
3 pay this tax, they don't have the money, and
4 to implement and borrow and pretend. Look
5 it, it's nothing personal against the
6 council, but it's like watching a comedy
7 show. We have taxed this community in every
8 way you can imagine.

9 Now, Mr. Courtright is going to take
10 office soon. I read in the paper that he is
11 bringing some of Mr. Doherty's on board to
12 steer this ship financially. That's the
13 silliest thing I've heard in my life,
14 because when you take a look at where this
15 city is financially and you are going to
16 bring a failed team in to implement another
17 failed plan to turn this failed city around
18 it's ridiculous.

19 And, you know, when you take a look
20 at the amount of people who voted if that
21 isn't a very strong indicator that the
22 residents of this city have no faith in its
23 elected government, that should be an eye
24 opener.

25 You know, I was in the state capital

1 today listening to them and the radio
2 station's report on the state's financial
3 condition and to be honest with you, that's
4 as much of a comedy show as this. I mean,
5 we take a look at where the federal
6 government and the state government, cities
7 like Scranton and the community, and I think
8 that the people we elect have a failure to
9 understand reality, because we have come to
10 the conclusion that we can enact things and
11 all of a sudden a miracle will happen and
12 the revenue will appear. We have done that
13 for a very long time and I just think we
14 need to take a new stance. We need the
15 residents of this city to put off all of
16 their tax money in escrow and force this
17 city to do what needs to be done, and not
18 only the city, but the state government to
19 recognize that the residents of this city
20 have no more money to give and let it be the
21 beginning of a tax regrowth across this
22 Commonwealth and maybe across this nation
23 because we elect people that have no sense
24 of reality who spend a lot of money getting
25 elected and all they do is deceive the

1 people that are voting for them, and the few
2 people come out because they always vote,
3 but most people have stayed home.

4 And when you watch the elective
5 process that just took place in this city we
6 have elected people that have determined
7 there is no need for a tax increase and they
8 have a plan. And my point is that we need
9 to vote "no", let the mayor's budget take
10 place and, let all of these things take
11 place and then let Mr. Courtright and the
12 new council members come in and do the
13 things they told this tax base that they
14 could do. That's the problem here. We have
15 to deal with reality and not make believe.

16 And the other thing I think is, look
17 at, I don't know what's going to happen to
18 this council after the election -- after the
19 new council takes place. I don't know if
20 the solicitor is staying, I don't know if
21 the city clerk is staying, I don't know how
22 many of the people in the mayor's, although,
23 Mr. Courtright has made a lot of suggestions
24 to the Scranton Times on what he is going to
25 do, but I'd like to say something that in

1 this council chamber whether I agree with
2 what's going on here for a long time I think
3 that Mrs. Krake has been a major asset to
4 this council and I have watched a lot -- an
5 awful lot of councils and a lot of clerks
6 and a lot of solicitors and I'd just like to
7 say that in my own opinion and, like I said,
8 I don't pick sides here, I just try to be
9 factual, at every instance when this council
10 had a question about what had occurred in
11 the past in this city Mrs. Krake had a
12 pretty good handle on what had occurred, and
13 I just think that whether I agree with what
14 the unions have done or whether I agree with
15 where this city has gone that's the kind of
16 people that we need to put in place who know
17 the history of this city, know what's
18 occurred, know where the information is, how
19 to retrieve it, how to present it to
20 council.

21 And, you know, I know that a couple
22 of times other councils have taken their
23 positions and have kept the clerk and a
24 couple of times they have kept the attorney,
25 and I just think that in some instances we

1 need to bring and keep capable people, but
2 if we are going to allow -- if Mr.
3 Courtright is going to build and rebuild
4 this city with the failed team that the
5 mayor had then I disagree with that. You
6 can't mix apples with oranges.

7 MR. JOYCE: Thank you.

8 MS. FRANUS: Fay Franus, Scranton.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Good evening.

10 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

11 MS. FRANUS: Good evening. First
12 I'd like to thank you, Mrs. Evans, and you,
13 Mr. Joyce, for the excellence work that you
14 have done over the years and God bless you
15 for all you put up. You didn't deserve any
16 of the crap that you got, but you did it
17 with grace, you really did. You took it
18 with grace. And I'd like to thank Nancy for
19 all of the hard work she has done. She has
20 been great as well.

21 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

22 MS. FRANUS: There aren't words to
23 describe how great you've been. Mr. Rogan,
24 Ms. Schumacher didn't get a chance to get
25 your response because you weren't here,

1 what's the status on the OECD loans?

2 MR. ROGAN: Regarding the list that
3 was requested from Ms. Aebli?

4 MS. FRANUS: Marie? Yes.
5 Delinquent.

6 MR. ROGAN: We still haven't
7 received that from OECD.

8 MS. FRANUS: How long you have been
9 asking for this and every week you come in
10 and say the same thing?

11 MR. ROGAN: Years.

12 MS. FRANUS: Well, how come you
13 don't get on top of this and ask, keep
14 asking her? I mean, how is that you can't
15 get a response from her?

16 MR. ROGAN: City council has had
17 this problem with many department heads,
18 it's not just OECD.

19 MS. FRANUS: Well, I'm not talking
20 about that, I'm talking about OECD, you are
21 the head of it. How come you can't get a
22 response from her?

23 MR. ROGAN: Ultimately, she answers
24 to the mayor, not to city council and that
25 shouldn't be --

1 MS. FRANUS: Are you trying to
2 answer you, the head of OECD?

3 MR. ROGAN: No, she doesn't.

4 MS. FRANUS: She doesn't have to.

5 MR. ROGAN: No.

6 MS. FRANUS: I understand that she
7 is supposed to be working in that department
8 under Billy Courtright, is that possible? I
9 mean, if that's the case how dumb is he?
10 Well, then again, also, he is also keeping
11 the same people. Here is woman that can't
12 keep track of \$11 million, but she is going
13 to be rewarded by keeping her job?

14 I wrote you letters and I didn't get
15 a response from any of you, Mr. Rogan and
16 Mr. McGoff and Mr. Loscombe regarding the
17 questions that Marie asked. Frank, I really
18 appreciate all of the time, and you didn't
19 even have to because you are not going to be
20 here next year, but you took the time to
21 call all of these people and get the
22 answers, which is very much appreciated.
23 And like Ms. Schumacher said, how could you
24 pass the budget if you don't know the
25 answers to these questions regarding the

1 budget?

2 Mr. Rogan, did you call anybody to
3 get any answers to any of the questions?

4 MR. ROGAN: No questions regarding
5 the budget were directed to me --

6 MS. FRANUS: Yes, they were.

7 MR. ROGAN: -- on Ms. Schumacher's
8 list. They were only provided to Mr. Joyce
9 and Mrs. Evans, I believe.

10 MS. FRANUS: No, last week when she
11 was here she wanted all of you, and I even
12 said, and I wrote you a letter, which I got
13 no response to, and I said, "Ms. Schumacher
14 asked all these questions, I hope you can go
15 to the departments heads and get the
16 answers," not just Mr. Joyce.

17 You and Mr. McGoff, I can't believe
18 that you would sit there and say you didn't
19 know what the questions were directed.

20 MR. ROGAN: I didn't receive a
21 letter Ms. Schumacher.

22 MS. FRANUS: I don't think you have.
23 She was here last week and asked you
24 questions. You could have asked it up here
25 to get a copy of the questions, and I stood

1 here last week and said you should get the
2 answers and make sure that you do. Did you
3 not hear me?

4 MR. ROGAN: I'm not going to argue
5 with you.

6 MS. FRANUS: Well, I mean, that's
7 your job, like I told you in your letter
8 that I wrote you, like, make it like I
9 didn't even write it. You also said last
10 week that you're going to make amendments,
11 but are you not going to raise any salaries
12 to the current level, does that mean that
13 since it's the current level are you going
14 to make amendments to raise the salary back
15 -- Mr. Doherty wants to decrease the fire
16 chief, are you going to put an amendment to
17 raise that?

18 MR. ROGAN: Would you like me to
19 address the amendments?

20 MS. FRANUS: I'd like you to address
21 the questions that I asked, specific
22 question I asked, are you going to make an
23 amendment to raise the fire chief's salary
24 back up?

25 MR. ROGAN: The amendment package

1 contains sustained funding for the fire
2 chief's salary.

3 MS. FRANUS: That means put it back
4 where it was?

5 MR. ROGAN: The same salary as it
6 was, yes.

7 MS. FRANUS: Where are you going to
8 get that money from?

9 MR. ROGAN: DPW overtime.

10 MS. FRANUS: Oh, you can guarantee
11 that there is not go to be overtime?

12 MR. ROGAN: No, there is still
13 funding for DPW overtime.

14 MS. FRANUS: But here's my point, if
15 you could take money out of the budget to
16 pay for something else, why don't you just
17 take that money out of the budget and leave
18 it out? Don't put it towards anything else.
19 We are so far in the hole, why don't we take
20 money out something, why don't you just take
21 it out and subtract it and make it less for
22 us taxpayers instead of playing around to
23 take care of Billy Courtright? Bill
24 Courtright, the only thing he asked council
25 that he wanted to do is put the fire chief's

1 salary back up. Isn't it amazing how he
2 wants to take care of the unions?

3 But it's the one thing he wanted
4 council to do, nothing else you heard from
5 him because he is no where to be found
6 because he is afraid to answer questions
7 from the council because he is going to
8 appear less than knowledgeable, let's put it
9 that way. I find it amazing that he took
10 care of that.

11 Another thing, why didn't you, now,
12 this isn't too hard to figure out, you can
13 get a driver's license or a birth
14 certificate, why can't you give senior
15 citizens over 65 pay the same amount they
16 are now or even less for garbage? Why can't
17 senior citizens 65 and older or maybe 62 and
18 older pay a low amount for their garbage?
19 It's not right. I have one bag of garbage,
20 if that today, for tomorrow's pickup. My
21 neighbor has six cans, okay? So how come
22 senior citizens can't pay? That shouldn't
23 be hard to figure out. Wouldn't that be
24 fair?

25 I mean, you were saying -- somebody

1 was saying earlier that you can't keep track
2 of who paid and who didn't pay, but that's
3 why you have people that do that, but it
4 should be easy and find out who the senior
5 citizens are and they should be allowed to
6 pay less, this isn't fair at all. Like I
7 said --

8 MR. JOYCE: I agree.

9 MS. FRANUS: Again, I want to thank
10 you and Mrs. Evans and Nancy for a great job
11 and Mr. Hughes as well, so thank you very
12 much.

13 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Is there
14 anyone else.

15 MR. SLEDENZSKI: Jack, I missed you
16 last week.

17 MR. LOSCOMBE: Chrissy.

18 MR. SLEDENZSKI: Hi, Janet.

19 MS. EVANS: Hi, Chris.

20 MR. SLEDENZSKI: Well, tomorrow is
21 the big game for Old Forge tomorrow, Frank.
22 If we win tomorrow, Frank, it's going to be
23 a good game tomorrow. Old Forge, good luck
24 tomorrow. Thank you.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: Chris, you need your

1 hat.

2 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who
3 cares to address council? Mrs. Krake?

4 Oh, yes, we did have quite a number
5 of Boy Scouts present for tonight's meeting.
6 I'm assuming that they were doing so in
7 fulfillment of earning a badge, so we thank
8 them for their attendance.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: What was the troop
10 number? 16? Troop 16.

11 MS. EVANS: Troop No. 16 out of
12 Scranton.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: And this young lady
14 was going to make a speech, did you still
15 want to speak? She is a little shy.

16 MS. KRAKE: 5-A. MOTIONS.

17 MS. EVANS: Councilman McGoff, do
18 you have any comments or motions?

19 MR. MCGOFF: Yes, thank you. First
20 of all, to answer a question that was posed
21 earlier in speaking with Mr. Courtright
22 earlier today he did indicate that he and
23 the Finance team were going to be out of
24 town, that they were meeting with some
25 potential investors, some potential people

1 that -- or banking interest and investment
2 interest that may be interested in looking
3 at borrowing for the arbitration award and
4 that they felt it important to go to that
5 meeting to deal with that situation.

6 Secondly, I'm going to save most of
7 the comments that I have for the business
8 part of the meeting. I do want to say that
9 amendments are being proposed or will be
10 proposed, these are amendments that have had
11 input from a number of sources and we have
12 been in contact or we have spoken with PEL,
13 with DCED, with the Courtright Finance team.
14 I know all of us have probably spoken with
15 other people from the investment
16 communities, from the banking community to
17 get input on the budget and I believe that
18 with the amendments that will be proposed we
19 have -- that if adopted would give us a
20 budget that is sustainable for 2014 and can
21 help us move forward and solve some of the
22 problems that we do have.

23 It may be premature to say, but the
24 amendments to the budget do not provide for
25 a tax increase beyond what is in the initial

1 proposal, and last week when I spoke I did
2 say that I felt that there may be a need to
3 do that. As we went through the budget and
4 talked with different people, it became
5 apparent that perhaps we could keep it at
6 the level that was proposed by Mayor Doherty
7 and hopefully that will solve our -- help
8 solve some of the revenue problems that we
9 have and I will speak more about that as we
10 get to the amendments, but hopefully we can
11 arrive at an amicable and a sustainable
12 budget this evening and hopefully it allows
13 the future administration to work with it
14 and to move forward, and thank you. That is
15 all.

16 MS. EVANS: Mr. McGoff, when will
17 you present the amendments for the public?

18 MR. MCGOFF: It was my belief from
19 just a couple of weeks ago that we need to
20 introduce the legislation that's before us
21 before we can --

22 MS. EVANS: Vote to amend, right,
23 but I know that in previous years I think
24 Mr. Joyce always began the meeting with his
25 amendments so that the public was aware of

1 them and would have the opportunity to
2 speak.

3 MR. MCGOFF: If it's agreeable to
4 everyone we obviously could do that now.

5 MS. EVANS: That would be fine,
6 sure.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Do you want to present
8 them since I'm here?

9 MR. ROGAN: You have them in front
10 you.

11 MR. JOYCE: I'm not sure exactly
12 whose amendments belong to whom, so --

13 MR. MCGOFF: And that's the other
14 thing if I'm going to do this now, these are
15 not amendments that were provided by I would
16 say any one person. This has been an effort
17 from a variety of people, as I said. I know
18 Mr. Rogan has worked quite a bit on them. I
19 have had some input, I know Mr. Loscombe has
20 had some input with Mr. Rogan, and again, we
21 have had input from the Courtright finance
22 team and others and to identify a specific,
23 like, whose this was --

24 MR. JOYCE: Yeah.

25 MR. MCGOFF: I don't know that's a

1 possibility. There are things that we
2 discussed at length in many cases, some
3 things that we took from others, some that,
4 you know, we may have disagreed with and
5 were not put into the amendments, so I would
6 like to say that this is truly an
7 amalgamation of ideas and hopefully ones
8 that can be supported.

9 The amendments as presented. Number
10 one, on page 33, Office of the mayor,
11 increase standard salary from \$91,085 to
12 \$96,085 and make the same change to total
13 employee compensation.

14 MS. EVANS: You mean 91,000?

15 MR. MCGOFF: I'm sorry, 91,000. I
16 got the decimal point instead of -- 91,000
17 to 96,085.

18 On page three, increase confidential
19 secretary salary from \$31,085 to \$36.085 and
20 change the department of the mayor total
21 from \$91.085 to \$96,085.

22 On page 42, decrease the standard
23 salary for the Office of City Council, city
24 clerk, from \$219,298.96 to \$214,290.96. On
25 the same page, decrease the total for the

1 Department of City Council, city clerk, from
2 \$300,942.29 to \$295,942.29.

3 On page 43, in the Office of City
4 Council, city clerk, decrease the salary of
5 the legislative legal advisor from \$45,000
6 to \$40,000, and decrease the total on page
7 43 to \$214m290.96.

8 That's all kind of a package, first
9 amendment or first --

10 MS. EVANS: So that is all voted on
11 together rather than individually?

12 MR. MCGOFF: Well, I think we would
13 probably have to do them as an individual
14 item I would assume.

15 MS. EVANS: One, two, three or 1-A,
16 B, C.

17 MR. MCGOFF: That was 1-A, B, C, I'm
18 sorry.

19 MR. ROGAN: I don't want to prolong
20 this, but if 1-A were to fail, 1-B would be
21 unnecessary, so I guess it would be up to
22 us.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Each one of these is
24 going to have to be an individual vote.

25 MS. EVANS: Whatever you are prefer.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Like I said, like Pat
2 said, Mr. Rogan said that, you know, if one
3 is not passed then the others become moot,
4 so I think we just have to do them in order
5 and move.

6 Number two, on page 39 in the
7 Department of Public Safety, Bureau of Fire,
8 increase the standard salary from
9 \$9,240,578.50 to \$9,257,806.61, and change
10 the total employee compensation from
11 \$21,605,238.99 to \$21,622,367.10.

12 On the same page make the same
13 changes to the Bureau of fire total, and
14 change the public safety total in the
15 appropriate amount.

16 On page 40, and this is "A", on page
17 40, Department of Public Safety, Bureau of
18 Fire, increase the salary of the chief from
19 \$50,000 to \$67,228.11 and increase the
20 Bureau of Fire total from \$9,240,578.50 to
21 \$9,257,806.61.

22 On page, and this would be "B", on
23 page 82, Department of Public Works, Bureau
24 of Refuse, decrease overtime salary from
25 \$100,000 to \$82,771.89, \$82,771.89, and that

1 would be -- those items were to be,
2 obviously, to increase the salary of the
3 fire chief.

4 Anything? Moving on. Number three,
5 on page 83, the Department of Public Works,
6 Bureau of Refuse, reduce the number of
7 collectors from 27 to 26, and the
8 collector's salaries from \$1,106,065.06 to
9 \$1,076,654.06 and add a DPW refuse
10 supervisor for a salary of \$30,000.

11 Number four, on page 62, in the
12 Office of Economic and Community
13 Development, eliminate the position of
14 support service specialist part-time and
15 decrease the funding of that position from
16 \$23,824.00 to zero and decrease the Bureau
17 of Administration total at an appropriate
18 amount.

19 Also, on page 62, this would be
20 would be "A" in the Office of Economic and
21 Community Development, increase the funding
22 for neighborhood police officers from
23 \$184,417.58 to \$207,241.58

24 MR. JOYCE: I have one question
25 about this one, if you don't mind me asking.

1 MR. MCGOFF: No.

2 MR. JOYCE: I know many of the
3 amendments so far have been adjustments in
4 pay, whether it be an increase or a
5 decrease, but one thing I did have a
6 question about, the increase in funding for
7 neighborhood police officers, will this
8 provide for a part-time officer, for
9 instance, or is it just going to be used for
10 extra funding in the future if it's not used
11 up?

12 MR. ROGAN: It's going to be used
13 for overtime and neighborhood police
14 patrols.

15 MR. JOYCE: Okay.

16 MR. ROGAN: Instead of using the
17 overtime from the general budget it would be
18 neighborhood police patrols, OECD funded.

19 MR. JOYCE: Okay. That's all.

20 MS. EVANS: This officer though will
21 have to stay in--

22 MR. ROGAN: Within -- yes.

23 MS. EVANS: Low to moderate income
24 areas.

25 MR. JOYCE: Low to moderate income,

1 correct.

2 MS. EVANS: Because they are
3 supposed to be paid by CDBG funds.

4 MR. ROGAN: Correct.

5 MR. MCGOFF: On page 50, this will
6 be No. 5. On Page 50 in the Department of
7 Business Administration, Bureau of
8 Administration, increase the salary of the
9 business administrator from \$53,550 to
10 \$85,000. "A", also, in the Department of
11 Business Administration, Borough of
12 Administration, increase the salary of the
13 finance manager from \$37,400 to \$50,000.

14 "B". Also, in the Department of
15 Business Administrator, Bureau of
16 Administration, add the position staff
17 assistant at a salary of \$35,000.

18 On page 49, in the Department of
19 Business Administrator, business
20 administrator, increase the standard salary
21 from \$238,904.21 to \$317,954.21.

22 On page 49, in the Department of
23 Business Administration, Bureau of
24 Administration, change the total for
25 business administration from \$8,163,921.62

1 to \$8,242,971.62.

2 MR. ROGAN: I would just like to
3 comment on those, those are being funded
4 through DCED in the form of a grant. All of
5 the changes on Item No. 5.

6 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else? Number 6,
7 on page 31, decrease unpaid bills court
8 awards from \$29,098,756.45 to
9 \$29,019,706.45.

10 MR. JOYCE: Yeah, I have a question
11 on that one, if you don't mind. Was there a
12 specific award that won't have to be paid
13 out or was something calculated differently
14 or --

15 MR. ROGAN: I believe, and I believe
16 we discussed this briefly this morning, I
17 believe that was regarding because the city
18 has been holding some bills I believe that
19 the penalty to the MMO would be decreased
20 because some payment will be made.

21 MR. JOYCE: Because some payment
22 will be made, okay.

23 MR. MCGOFF: And finally, number
24 seven on page 24, under rents and
25 concessions, insert "account for cell phone

1 tower leases for \$18,000." The total for
2 rents and concessions shall remain at
3 \$25,000.

4 MR. ROGAN: And on that one instead
5 of increasing the totals my initial idea was
6 to put that \$18,000 into contingency because
7 it's not something that is guaranteed. I
8 did want to put it in the budget and a
9 company that I have been working with also
10 wanted to see that in the budget, so by not
11 increasing the revenue or using that money
12 anywhere if it doesn't -- if it isn't
13 realized there would be no harm on that
14 additional line item in the budget, and if
15 it comes in then we would be over budget on
16 that item or we can makeup for another
17 deficiency in rents and concessions.

18 MS. EVANS: If we could jump back to
19 number three, you are reducing the number of
20 trash collectors from 27 to 26, is that due
21 to a retirement or just --

22 MR. ROGAN: It was the -- mayor in
23 his budget created two new positions in DPW
24 refuse, both of them are unfilled, so this
25 isn't --

1 MS. EVANS: So you are just cutting
2 one?

3 MR. ROGAN: We are cutting one of
4 the new positions the mayor included.

5 MS. EVANS: And the refuse
6 supervisor that's a new position.

7 MR. ROGAN: That's funded by
8 removing the funding for the collector and
9 that's also I believe the DPW overtime can
10 be reduced by having a supervisor to monitor
11 the refuse collections.

12 MS. EVANS: Okay. Thank you.

13 MR. MCGOFF: Anything else? I'm
14 done.

15 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. McGoff.
16 And, Councilman Rogan, do you have any
17 comments or motions?

18 MR. ROGAN: Yes. Actually a
19 question before that, should I continue with
20 my normal Fifth Order or should we allow the
21 public to comment on --

22 MS. EVANS: Well, I think we'll go
23 through our Fifth Order and then before we
24 vote on the amendments to the budget we can
25 ask for citizens' participation once again.

1 MR. ROGAN: Great. I will be very
2 brief. Most of my comments I will make in
3 the voting portion of the meeting. Just one
4 thing I wanted to mention and I wanted to
5 read, this is a letter that I received from
6 Commissioner Patrick O'Malley.

7 It says, "Dear Pat, as a Lackawanna
8 County Commissioner, Scranton resident and
9 taxpayer, I am very happy that we are able
10 to extend the discount period for the City
11 of Scranton. Scranton is the heart of
12 Lackawanna County and it is my belief that
13 this extension will strive to help reduce
14 the financial hardships being placed on
15 taxpayers. It will assist our city on the
16 road to recovery. Should you need my,
17 assistance please contact my office."

18 And I would like to thank
19 Commissioner O'Malley, and I also phoned
20 Commissioners -- the Commissioner's Office
21 to leave a message for all three of them
22 last week and Commissioner O'Brien returned
23 the call saying that he was glad to help out
24 the city this year with the extension of the
25 discount period. That's all for now. I'll

1 address our two big agenda items when it's
2 time for a vote.

3 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And,
4 Councilman Loscombe, do you have any
5 comments or motions?

6 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes, thank you. I
7 didn't realize coming in this evening it was
8 our last meeting of the year, so I really
9 didn't have a speech ready, but I do want
10 to --

11 MS. EVANS: Well, we'll meet again
12 in January where the Sine Die meeting and we
13 have a reorganization meeting and maybe
14 Mr. McGoff can give us the time of those
15 meetings.

16 MR. MCGOFF: I believe in the past
17 that, if I'm not mistaken, that the Sine Die
18 is at 10:00? 11:00? Jamie has said --
19 thank you, 11:00 and then the installation
20 or whatever swearing in would be an hour
21 later or half an hour, whatever at the end
22 of that meeting.

23 MS. EVANS: Okay. Thank you.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Is that -- we probably
25 should -- is that an acceptable time --

1 MS. EVANS: Yes.

2 MR. MCGOFF: -- for people or do we
3 want it at 10:00 or --

4 MR. ROGAN: I would just hope that
5 council's swearing in ceremony is complete
6 prior to the mayor's swearing in ceremony,
7 which I believe would be at city hall this
8 year, not only for logistical purposes but
9 so council members can attend the mayor's
10 swearing in as well.

11 MS. EVANS: And what time is that?

12 MR. ROGAN: I believe that's at
13 noon.

14 MS. EVANS: Well --

15 MR. MCGOFF: Could we have the *Sine*
16 *Die* at 10:00?

17 MS. EVANS: Um-hum.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Would that be
19 acceptable.

20 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And there yo
21 have it, Mr. Loscombe, ten.

22 MR. LOSCOMBE: I do want to thank
23 you for all you have done so I will have a
24 little more to elaborate on that at that
25 meeting.

1 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

2 MR. LOSCOMBE: I guess I'll just
3 briefly address the budget at this point
4 because I don't know when we are voting and
5 how much I feel about that, but we had a few
6 speakers tonight that had some valid points.
7 Mr. Miller he summed up the opportunity of
8 missed revenue through our revenue sources
9 that we developed over the past few years,
10 which could have put you us in a much better
11 position at this point.

12 Mr. Ellman, he hit a nerve, too,
13 that it's close to me in that whenever
14 something like this comes up, and it's
15 showing again in the news media,
16 particularly the printed media, that the
17 blame falls back on the police and fire
18 departments for this. This was a Supreme
19 Court award and we forget that we negotiated
20 with the police and firefighters after that
21 award and they were able to reduce it by \$15
22 million. That goes forgotten, but all we
23 want to do is look at the hard end of it,
24 but the realistic part of it is that there
25 could have been -- there were agreements

1 made many times through the past several
2 years that would have been far less than
3 what we are going to be paying out now, but
4 the blame continues to go that way because
5 it's easy. That's the easiest way to do it,
6 but I think there is enough smart people
7 here, as Mr. Ellman mentioned tonight, to
8 realize where the blame goes to, so I just
9 wanted to clarify that.

10 I mean, I have been pretty much
11 anguished over the past several weeks trying
12 to work on the budget and I have had a lot
13 of situations in the past few weeks that
14 have kept me away from a lot of this. I
15 haven't been able to get into it as much as
16 my colleagues, and I do appreciate the time
17 that they have put into it and the meetings,
18 there was a couple of meetings I was invited
19 to I was unable to attend, but I did meet a
20 few -- I met -- I have met mayor-elect
21 Courtright, I have also met Mayor Doherty.

22 A lot of our conversations with my
23 fellow colleagues have been through
24 telephone conversations keeping me
25 up-to-date, asking me my opinions, and the

1 tough thing is, you know, at the end of the
2 day we have to come up with something that's
3 going to work or everybody and it may not be
4 palatable for everybody and it may not
5 palatable in certain areas for each of us
6 individually.

7 You know, this council, as it was
8 stated before, I think it was Mr. Quinn
9 stated how much Mrs. Evans has stated over
10 the years where we are headed with this
11 runaway spending and stuff. And again, I
12 know that we have all tried hard over the
13 past two years to limit any increases in
14 taxes and so forth.

15 But the fact is we are at the edge
16 of the cliff right now, looking over the
17 cliff and I personally don't see any other
18 alternative at this point other than the tax
19 increase to get us back in position. I know
20 it hurts a lot of people and I would hope
21 everybody can make it through this. We have
22 to make it through together. We missed the
23 opportunity on a commuter tax. Again, there
24 is lot of missed opportunities. We missed
25 opportunities on pursuing PILOTS, so all of

1 this goes into effect, not for lack of our
2 trying, but we have to pass a budget that's
3 going to work and the biggest obstacle we
4 have are the court awards at this point, and
5 the obstacle placed in our way with those
6 court awards and as we saw with our TAN is
7 that the banks won't even speak to us unless
8 we could show that that borrowing is
9 covered.

10 What are we going to do? It's not
11 an easy solution. I know people get scared
12 when they hear 56 percent or whatever on
13 their property taxes, it is a scary number.
14 The fact is that 56 percent is a portion of
15 your tax bill, and I have explained this
16 before, you know, for anyone that's
17 interested. Just say your taxes are \$1,000
18 a year, your combined taxes, that doesn't
19 mean you're going to pay another \$600.
20 Probably 21 percent of that is your city
21 tax, the smallest portion right now of your
22 tax bill of the three taxing bodies is your
23 city tax. That's the portion that would be
24 increased under this budget, not the \$1,000
25 but roughly the 21 percent. It varies 20,

1 25 percent on most properties, but that's
2 what we are looking at.

3 Yep, we are looking at a several
4 hundred dollars a year on that. But, you
5 know, it's still cheaper than your cable
6 bills. It's still cheaper than cigarettes.
7 Your cable bills are \$100 a month. There is
8 not a lot of people paying \$100 a month in
9 city taxes on their property, city portion.
10 That's correct. You can go on the
11 Lackawanna County site and you will see
12 there is people paying three, four hundred
13 dollars a year. We have no other -- no
14 other alternative at this point. Nobody
15 came with a magic wand and said, "We are
16 giving to give you \$5 million, \$20 million."

17 And if you don't believe how
18 anguished I've been, and I know my
19 colleagues, we'd love to be able to reduce
20 your taxes. Hopefully if we get through
21 this year and get this resolved we will be
22 able to with a new administration that I had
23 specifically personally asked to go after
24 revenue sources that we have put together,
25 to go after the PILOTS, to go after the back

1 taxes and the garbage fees, all of this has
2 been left on the table for these past few
3 years. If we get aggressive with that stuff
4 it's going to be a benefit to all of us.

5 But to tell you I'm not sick to my
6 stomach I would be lying. My family has
7 seen me, and I'm sure the rest of my
8 colleagues, to give a 5 percent tax increase
9 is sickening, but to have to go where we
10 have to go in order to meet our obligations
11 we'll get the blame, but we didn't create
12 it, and we are paving the way for whoever
13 comes in next, these decisions aren't easy,
14 they are hard, but I want to see this city
15 succeed.

16 And, you know, unfortunately, other
17 avenues weren't pursued. We have to keep --
18 we have to keep going, we have to provide
19 the services that you deserve, we can't even
20 cut any of the department or services
21 anymore, but my take is, you know, not that
22 I want to, but at this point in time it's
23 our only option.

24 I have listened to a lot of angles.
25 Spoke, like said, I have spoke back and

1 forth and I have seen the numbers and I just
2 saw how hard it was to finally get a TAN. I
3 mean, the company that actually bid on the
4 original TAN backed out, so we were
5 fortunate enough that Mr. Judge was able to
6 get a company like that, but one of the big
7 factors like that is the company see that we
8 are starting, you know, we are probably
9 under new administration and maybe a little
10 bit better to them that there will be -- or
11 hoping that there will be more cooperation,
12 and I'm hoping, too. I'm going to keep the
13 mayor's feet to the fire no matter who is in
14 there, and I did personally request that he
15 do everything to continue to go after
16 revenue sources that were provided by this
17 body here over the past few years that were
18 neglected.

19 But, you know, at this point the
20 only option I have is to vote in favor of
21 the budget. Thank you.

22 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Loscombe.

23 MR. LOSCOMBE: Oh, first, in spite
24 of this, I might sound like a scrooge by
25 what I just had to say and I apologize, but

1 I have to do what I believe is in best
2 interest of the taxpayers even though they
3 don't all believe that, but I do want to
4 wish everyone a happy and healthy holiday
5 season. Thank you.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you. And,
7 Councilman Joyce, do you have any comments
8 or motions tonight?

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I do. First of
10 all, since this maybe the final meeting
11 before the Sine Die meeting, I just wanted
12 to thank all of the people that have come
13 here and voiced their opinions throughout
14 the years. Whether they have agreed with me
15 or disagreed with me, I have always worked
16 hard, always tried to do my best, I've
17 always tried to do the people's business.

18 About the budget, you know, you sit
19 there and you look at what the budget is,
20 and while I admit there were definitely some
21 missed opportunities, there were definitely
22 revenue streams that we could have gone
23 after -- or the city could have gone after,
24 but they didn't or they chose not to or they
25 didn't want to head in that avenue, and

1 that's their position and that's not
2 something council could have controlled.

3 Now, I want to give credit to my
4 colleagues, Mr. Loscombe, Mr. Rogan and
5 Mr. McGoff for putting the amendments
6 together. I'm sure that they have -- and
7 they have said had they have spoke to
8 different members of DCED, PEL,
9 Mr. Courtright's finance team, and that's
10 admirable. You know, that's putting in due
11 diligence, but, you know, when I look over
12 most of the amendments a lot of them are
13 raises, and when I first became a member of
14 the council we came in here and we lowered
15 the salaries of a lot of Mayor Doherty's
16 employees. Some people thought, oh, they
17 are just doing that to be vindictive. I
18 wasn't doing it to be vindictive, I was
19 doing it to save the people money, and to go
20 back and say, well, you know what, there is
21 a new mayor, a new administration, and some
22 of these people deserve to make more than
23 what Mayor Doherty's people in those same
24 positions made, I think is wrong. I think
25 we can't do it.

1 Now, there is some amendments that I
2 do agree with it, and I'll discuss those
3 later, but that's where I stand on the
4 budget, and if these -- and if the majority
5 of these amendments pass, first, the
6 taxpayers in the City of Scranton can't
7 afford the budget as it is, though it may be
8 the last option, that would be viable to
9 some of the banking communities, so I'll be
10 honest with you, there should have been more
11 done to get that tax increase lower or to
12 eliminate part of that garbage fee increase,
13 but I can't sit there and justify raising
14 taxes 56 percent and raising the garbage fee
15 69 percent and raising the meter rates 25
16 cents per hour, and jacking up rental
17 registration fees when we could possibly be
18 giving out raises to the next
19 administration's cabinet or department
20 heads.

21 I did speak to a number of people.
22 I spoke to PEL, I communicated with them. I
23 communicated with some departments head. I
24 communicated with the mayor as well. I also
25 did place a phone call into Mr. Courtright

1 after the election to congratulate him and
2 to have him contact me about the budget, and
3 I will say that Mr. Courtright never
4 contacted me nor did anyone from his finance
5 team except for coming to council.

6 Now, I'm just telling you the honest
7 truth. I would have expected a little bit
8 more courtesy as a voting council member
9 because I may not be here next year, that's
10 why I didn't propose any amendments, but I
11 still have a voice now, and if
12 Mr. Courtright should want some of his
13 people to make a little bit more money and
14 if he thinks that they should be making more
15 than Mayor Doherty's employees do in the
16 equivalent positions, then all he has to do
17 after he takes office is open up the budget,
18 transfer some funds from contingency and
19 raise salaries, and if he wants to do that,
20 that's his choice, but one thing is I will
21 not do it for him. And that's all I have to
22 say.

23 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Good
24 evening. The final votes on the 2014
25 operating budget will be cast shortly. As

1 you know, some of my colleagues had
2 discussed adding a 25 percent increase to
3 the mayor's proposed 56 percent tax
4 increase, despite the facts that the \$2
5 million liquid fuels budgetary hole has
6 shrunk, and the 2014 tax anticipation note
7 had been secured.

8 In addition, the newspaper reported
9 this week that the Sewer Authority is
10 proceeding with the process of a potential
11 sale or a public private partnership which
12 could generate revenue for the city next
13 year.

14 Further, Mayor Doherty spoke with
15 Gerald Cross of the Pennsylvania Economy
16 League again today to ensure that his 2014
17 proposed budget remained acceptable to PEL
18 and he was assured that, yes, the proposed
19 budget is agreeable. Now, would PEL like
20 more money? Yes. Would it refuse an
21 additional tax increase? Never. However,
22 the proposed budget meets the expenses of
23 the city government and for PEL's
24 requirements according to Mr. Cross.

25 So it appears, and I'm very glad

1 that my colleagues are not proposing this
2 among their amendments tonight. It appeared
3 that the mayor-elect and his league of
4 mercenaries from the Doherty administration
5 who wanted to burn the people of the
6 Scranton with an extra 25 percent tax
7 increase in addition to the 56 percent
8 increase proposed by the mayor are not going
9 to get their way.

10 Now, during last week's meeting I
11 mentioned to Mr. Hickey, former Doherty
12 administration solicitor and now advisor to
13 Mr. Courtright, who was looking for money
14 from the -- more money from the taxpayers
15 last week, that the mayor is granted the
16 power to open the budget by the Home Rule
17 Charter. The tax formulas have not been set
18 by ordinance for 2014. That legislation
19 will not be drafted and submitted to city
20 council until January 2014.

21 Consequently, the new mayor can open
22 the budget at that time if his advisors
23 counsel him that there is any financial
24 emergency and propose an additional 25
25 percent tax increase or anything else that

1 he is seeking in the tax formula that he
2 will submit to the new council for its
3 approval.

4 In addition, if the mayor-elect
5 wanted more money from the taxpayers he
6 could have and should have participated in
7 the proposed budget process with Mayor
8 Doherty, as he was invited to do, yet he
9 chose not to do so, and I choose to stand
10 with people of this city for whom I have
11 worked and fought so hard for the last ten
12 years.

13 Not only would I never approve an
14 additional 25 percent tax hike, I wouldn't
15 approve an override vote of the mayor's vote
16 of an additional 25 percent so, Mr. McGoff,
17 you know me well.

18 The financial problems of our city
19 have multiple causes, too numerous to
20 discuss in one evening. The proposed 2014
21 operating budget is a reflection, or more
22 appropriately, a consequence of those
23 problems. If I had to reduce the issues to
24 a bottom line, however, I would say that
25 excessive borrowing and wasteful spending

1 through 2008 gave birth to the crises that
2 occurred in 2012 and beyond. I warned
3 against these actions and voted against each
4 of them.

5 When the crises occurred I didn't
6 respond with inaction or the phrase "I told
7 you so," rather, I rolled up my sleeves and
8 partnered with Mayor Doherty to face the
9 problems head on and solve them through a
10 revised recovery plan and procurement of
11 TANS in order to prevent bankruptcy and to
12 maintain the level of public safety and
13 services for which the people of Scranton
14 pay their taxes.

15 Councilman Joyce, Mayor Doherty and
16 I worked together on the 2013 budget and the
17 city government had no crises, surprises or
18 delinquent bills this year. However, the
19 2013 budget also charged the administration
20 to pursue a commuter tax, PILOTS from large
21 nonprofits and \$600,000 owed by the Ice Box
22 and the sale of the Sewer Authority among
23 other revenue generators, and these were to
24 provide for the 2014 budget and beyond. For
25 whatever his reasons, the mayor chose not no

1 follow through.

2 At the same time, the state
3 government turned its back on Scranton and
4 its people after leading the mayor to the
5 Supreme Court to fight the states own war
6 against municipal unions. It left the
7 mayor, this city council, and all of the
8 city taxpayers with the bag of bills. The
9 state refused to contribute to payment of
10 the Supreme Court award while state elected
11 officials said they could not help us with
12 nonprofit PILOTS, countywide tax
13 reassessments or payroll tax, among other
14 requests I made.

15 So, ladies and gentlemen, it's
16 simply this, the mayor didn't do his work
17 and the state gave us excuses, apologies,
18 but no real financial assistance. That's
19 why the mayor's proposed budget contains tax
20 and fee increases.

21 Now, I worked tirelessly to prevent
22 a 56 percent tax hike and garbage fee
23 increase from occurring. Others,
24 unfortunately, did not. I know the problem
25 of our city, I know that most senior

1 citizens, blue collar working families, the
2 unemployed, the sick and the poor cannot
3 afford the taxes contained in this budget.

4 The people first elected me in 2003
5 to fight for them. They reelected me in
6 2005 and again in 2009 trusting me so
7 greatly as to elect my team of council
8 candidates to represent them always, fight
9 for them when necessary, solve their
10 problems and protect the little guys. That
11 I have always done and often times against
12 all odds, and that I will continue to do
13 tonight. Merry Christmas to all of you, my
14 friends. That's it.

15 MS. KRAKE: 5-B. AUTHORIZING THE
16 ISSUANCE AND SALE NOT TO EXCEED SEVENTEEN
17 MILLION (\$17,000,000.00) DOLLAR PRINCIPAL
18 AMOUNT, TAX ANTICIPATION NOTE OF THE CITY OF
19 SCRANTON KNOWN AS TAN SERIES 2014-A AWARDED
20 TO IFS SECURITIES; DETERMINING THE FORM AND
21 TERM OF SAID NOTE; AWARDING SAID NOTE;
22 AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE FILING OF
23 CERTAIN DOCUMENTS; AND DIRECTING THE PROPER
24 OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE
25 ANY AND ALL OTHER ACTIONS AS MAY BE REQUIRED

1 IN CONNECTION WITH THE ISSUANCE OF SAID
2 NOTE. (EMERGENCY CERTIFICATE ATTACHED)

3 MS. EVANS: At this time I'll
4 entertain a motion that Item 5-B be
5 introduced into its proper committee.

6 MR. ROGAN: So moved.

7 MR. JOYCE: Second.

8 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
9 those in favor of introduction signify by
10 saying aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

12 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

14 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
16 have it and so moved.

17 MR. JOYCE: I would like to make a
18 motion to suspend the rules to move 5-B to
19 Sixth and Seventh Order to be considered for
20 final passage based on the attached
21 emergency certificate.

22 MR. ROGAN: Second.

23 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
24 those in favor of introduction signify by
25 saying aye.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

2 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

3 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

4 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

5 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
6 have it and so moved.

7 At this time, if anyone would like
8 it address council on the emergency TAN
9 legislation you may do so.

10 (No speakers come forward.)

11 MS. EVANS: Mrs. Krake?

12 MS. KRAKE: 6-A, FORMERLY 5-B -
13 READING BY TITLE - FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 56,
14 2013 AN ORDINANCE 2013 - AUTHORIZING THE
15 ISSUANCE AND SALE NOT TO EXCEED SEVENTEEN
16 MILLION (\$17,000,000.00) DOLLAR PRINCIPAL
17 AMOUNT, TAX ANTICIPATION NOTE OF THE CITY OF
18 SCRANTON KNOWN AS TAN SERIES 2014-A AWARDED
19 TO IFS SECURITIES; DETERMINING THE FORM AND
20 TERM OF SAID NOTE; AWARDING SAID NOTE;
21 AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE FILING OF
22 CERTAIN DOCUMENTS; AND DIRECTING THE PROPER
23 OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE
24 ANY AND ALL OTHER ACTIONS AS MAY BE REQUIRED
25 IN CONNECTION WITH THE ISSUANCE OF SAID

1 NOTE. (EMERGENCY CERTIFICATE ATTACHED)

2 MS. EVANS: You've heard reading by
3 title of Item 6-A, what is your pleasure?

4 MR. ROGAN: I move that Item 6-A
5 pass reading by title.

6 MR. JOYCE: Second.

7 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
8 those in favor signify by saying aye.

9 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

10 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

11 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

12 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

13 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
14 have it and so moved.

15 MS. KRAKE: SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A.

16 FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON
17 FINANCE -

18 FOR ADOPTION-FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 55, 2013 -
19 APPROPRIATING FUNDS FOR THE EXPENSES OF THE
20 CITY GOVERNMENT FOR THE PERIOD COMMENCING ON
21 THE FIRST DAY OF JANUARY, 2014 TO AND
22 INCLUDING DECEMBER 31, 2014 BY THE ADOPTION
23 OF THE GENERAL CITY OPERATING BUDGET FOR THE
24 YEAR 2014.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans --

1 MS. EVANS: Before we take a final
2 vote on this, I would ask the amendments to
3 be presented.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Well, I was just going
5 to make a motion, I would like to make a
6 motion to amend File of Council No. 55,
7 2013.

8 MR. ROGAN: Second.

9 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
10 those in favor signify by saying aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

12 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

14 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
16 have it and so moved.

17 MR. MCGOFF: As said before, I
18 believe that it will be necessary to make
19 these as individual motions and so for each
20 of the items that was mentioned before I
21 will make a motion for each one, and we will
22 vote, if that's to your approval.

23 MR. JOYCE: I would prefer that,
24 too.

25 MS. EVANS: Unless, I think what you

1 are saying before is that some were not
2 approved you would be --

3 MR. MCGOFF: It would be negative.

4 MS. EVANS: That's fine.

5 MR. ROGAN: Will we take the public
6 comment prior to voting on the motion?

7 MS. EVANS: Yes, I think that would
8 be a good idea.

9 MR. JOYCE: I think that would be.

10 MS. EVANS: If there is anyone who
11 wishes to address council on concerning the
12 budget amendments, please do so now.

13 MR. MILLER: Good evening, again.
14 Doug Miller, Scranton. Obviously, I want to
15 comment on the budget. You know, I don't
16 know what to say anymore, I really don't.
17 After coming down here for all of these
18 years I'm just totally baffled by, you know,
19 what I heard this evening that we want to,
20 in, fact call these amendments. I think
21 this is the lowest form that we could
22 possible do to the residents of this city.

23 What we did here this evening or are
24 attempting to do here this evening is very
25 simple, it's not complex, there is nothing

1 complex about it whatsoever, nothing was
2 done to protect the residents of this city.
3 All we did was increase salaries and create
4 jobs, something that Mrs. Evans and her
5 majority had been fighting against for the
6 last four years. Particularly Mrs. Evans
7 fighting against it for the past ten years
8 as a councilwoman.

9 And I think it's a total insult and
10 lack of regard to the residents of this
11 city, and I say that we -- you have failed
12 those that have created these amendments.
13 You have failed in your obligation to look
14 out for the residents of this city. You did
15 not propose one thing that benefited the
16 taxpayers. We didn't do anything to lower
17 the tax increase. We did absolutely nothing
18 to reduce the garbage fee. We did
19 absolutely nothing to reduce the rental
20 registration fee. We did absolutely nothing
21 to reduce the meter rates. All we did was
22 yet again look out for our political
23 friends.

24 I guess this is what we call back on
25 track. You know, that's what we heard all

1 summer long that we were going to go back on
2 track. Well, if this back on track the next
3 four years look pretty darn bleak, let me
4 tell you, and I totally lost any faith I had
5 in the next administration, and if this is a
6 sign of what's to come with the next council
7 we are going back to another remember stamp
8 council and I'm losing faith in that.

9 You have an obligation and a
10 responsibility to look out for what's best
11 for the residents. You know, looking at
12 these amendments here, there seems to be all
13 of this money where we have the ability to
14 increase salaries and create jobs, well, if
15 that's the case why wasn't anything done to
16 decrease the tax increase? Why wasn't
17 anything done to lower the garbage fee? And
18 why wasn't anything done to lower the rental
19 registration and everything else that was
20 proposed in the mayor's budget? Don't you
21 care?

22 You know, I come up here and I think
23 about the senior citizens, okay, the
24 elderly, the hardworking blue collar people
25 of this town, okay? The people that

1 struggle to get by day-to-day, okay? That's
2 who we need to be looking out for, not who
3 do we owe a favor to, who could we create a
4 job for, whose salary can we increase. It's
5 what got us into this position that we are
6 in today.

7 But, evidently, we don't comprehend
8 that. We keep going down the same tired
9 path of politics and nothing is going to
10 change, obviously, we are just going to
11 continue to go down this road because you
12 know what? With these amendments you are
13 showing that you do not care, and if this
14 budget passes tonight you are sending a
15 message, a signal across this city that you
16 have a complete disregard for the
17 hardworking people of this city and I just
18 wish they were here this evening to, you
19 know, staunchly oppose what you are trying
20 to do them tonight because it's not fair.

21 And, Mrs. Evans, Mr. Joyce, I ask
22 you to stand by what you have always done
23 the right thing and vote "no" to this
24 budget. You, too, Mr. Loscombe, and vote
25 "no" to this budget and vote "no" to the

1 people, but when you said the one thing I
2 couldn't believe it, you said this budget is
3 for the best interest of the people. It's
4 hardly at all. It's not for the best
5 interest at all of the people. It's a knife
6 right in the back, and it's like Mr. Miller
7 said. Well, if anybody knows Victor Newman
8 he called his son-in-law who he doesn't like
9 at all, Billy Boy, and that's how I refer to
10 Bill Courtright, Billy Boy.

11 So Mr. Rogan and Mr. McGoff are
12 carrying Billy Boy's water. I'm sure Billy
13 Boy doesn't want to have to open the budget
14 and do this because it would make him look
15 bad, so he is having you do it and I can't
16 believe you'd do it. You're supposed to be
17 for the people, not for Bill. I can't
18 believe that you put -- but you are doing
19 it. It's typical. Mr. McGoff, you take
20 care of your majority, now you are going to
21 take care of Bill Courtright. God knows
22 what you are getting in return, I don't
23 know, we'll never know.

24 But I'd love to connect the dots and
25 find out who are all these people are in the

1 administration and say, "Oh, this is Bill's
2 good friend. This is Bill's cousin. This
3 is Bill's sister-in-law's brother."

4 Something is happening here. You
5 are raising salaries in the administration
6 and you care about the people? There should
7 be decreases in almost everything and I
8 hope-- here is my question, if you vote, are
9 you going to vote on each amendment so if
10 you vote "no" to one thing that means it's
11 no and if you vote "yes" it means it's yes?

12 MS. EVANS: Well --

13 MS. FRANUS: It's not going to be a
14 package deal?

15 MS. EVANS: Oh, no, it's not a
16 package.

17 MS. FRANUS: Each amendment is going
18 to be separate? It's not going to be A, B,
19 C as one?

20 MS. EVANS: Mr. McGoff has already
21 clarified that, yes.

22 MS. FRANUS: That is going to make
23 one?

24 MS. EVANS: No, that they will be
25 voted on individually.

1 MS. FRANUS: Okay, so here's the
2 thing, so if you vote hypothetically three,
3 four and two against, does that mean it's
4 the mayor budget that goes through or is
5 it--

6 MR. MCGOFF: The amendments would
7 pass.

8 MS. FRANUS: -- and then he has to
9 veto that?

10 MS. EVANS: If you have three yes
11 votes an amendment passes, the motion
12 carries, and then it would be included in
13 the operating budget. That budget, the
14 final budget then as amended will be
15 submitted to Mayor Doherty tomorrow, I would
16 assume, for his signature or his veto.

17 MS. FRANUS: I see. Well, I hope he
18 vetoes it.

19 MR. MCGOFF: May I? I think it
20 was-- not to correct you, but the second
21 step would be would have a vote on -- we
22 would have to vote on on the budget, as
23 amended, after all of the amendments were
24 approved.

25 MS. FRANUS: Right, or not approved.

1 You would have to vote on the budget as you
2 voted through all of them at the end of it.

3 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

4 MS. FRANUS: I just hope the mayor
5 vetoes this budget according to your
6 amendments. Another thing, Mr. Rogan, you
7 said you are going to put a supervisor into
8 the DPW so he can control the overtime.
9 Wasn't there a supervisor in the DPW
10 already? Isn't that what Mark Dougher does
11 and somebody will probably take his place,
12 but isn't that their job?

13 MR. ROGAN: DPW refuse specifically
14 doesn't have a supervisor.

15 MS. FRANUS: What is Mark Dougher?

16 MR. ROGAN: Not doing his job.

17 MS. FRANUS: What is his position?

18 MR. ROGAN: He is the DPW
19 supervisor.

20 MS. FRANUS: Okay, so now you're
21 creating another -- so isn't somebody going
22 to take his place?

23 MR. JOYCE: He is the director.

24 MS. FRANUS: Well, if he's the
25 director, aside from the point he is not

1 doing his job, so somebody is going to take
2 his place as director plus another
3 supervisor that you are going to put in?

4 MR. ROGAN: Minus one collector.

5 MS. FRANUS: No, a director plus a
6 supervisor.

7 MR. ROGAN: The director -- there is
8 always a director of DPW, there is no
9 change.

10 MS. FRANUS: Okay.

11 MR. ROGAN: The supervisor will be
12 supervising DPW. That funding is coming
13 from the elimination of a collector.

14 MS. FRANUS: I know that, but why do
15 you have a supervisor if you have a
16 director? Why would you need a supervisor?
17 It's like having two bosses.

18 MR. ROGAN: Well, this one for me is
19 something I that have seen a lot of problems
20 with in the DPW.

21 MS. FRANUS: Well, then maybe you
22 should just a good director then that will
23 take care it. Why have two people do the
24 same job? If the director is not doing a
25 good job then you get someone that is. You

1 don't create a position just because the
2 director is not, make another position.

3 MR. ROGAN: Well, the director is in
4 charge of the entire DPW.

5 MS. FRANUS: Well, then the director
6 should take care of the overtime. We
7 shouldn't have to have another supervisor
8 doing the work that he should be doing.
9 You're certainly taking care of somebody, I
10 don't know who that person is yet, but when
11 all of these names are brought up we are
12 going to know who knows who and why they got
13 this job, and you caught salaries of people
14 you apparently didn't like and raise the
15 persons the ones you wanted to get in there.
16 What you wanted to do is a disgrace and I
17 hope, I hope that Mayor Doherty vetoes this
18 budget. And thank you Mrs. Evans and thank
19 Mr. Joyce and, Mr. Loscombe, I hope you
20 stick up for the people like you always do.
21 Thank you.

22 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

23 MR. WALSH: Good evening again, my
24 name is Jay Walsh. Mr. Loscombe, let me
25 give you a heads up, the ship is at the

1 bottom. Let me make that particularly
2 clear.

3 MR. LOSCOMBE: I'm sorry, I didn't
4 hear that.

5 MR. WALSH: I said the ship is at
6 the bottom, okay, let me make that perfectly
7 clear, okay? It's a slow train wreck. One
8 thing I found with the city, as I found all
9 over the County, as that it's 2013 and the
10 Scranton Inspection Office is handwriting
11 receipts. Why that is, I have no clue, and
12 that's why Danielle Ross was able to be
13 nabbed.

14 And far as cable, get Chrome Cast
15 it's \$35 a month and you get 5,000 channels.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

17 MS. SCHUMACHER: First I'd like to
18 ask Mr. McGoff, what are the total increases
19 in the budget?

20 MR. MCGOFF: I did not add all of
21 the increases together, but the dollar
22 amount of the total budget does not change
23 from what it is.

24 MS. SCHUMACHER: I understand you
25 are switching money back and forth, but if

1 you -- if those -- if the things that you
2 are taking money from are not really
3 required then that could -- that money could
4 have gone -- been taken out of the budget
5 and been used to reduce the principal amount
6 of our debt and start working on our debt
7 service and getting that down or could have
8 taken some of the tax burden away. Granted
9 not a lot, I would prefer that it would
10 reduce some of the debt, but --

11 MR. ROGAN: If I could answer on a
12 couple of those points.

13 MS. SCHUMACHER: I only made one.

14 MR. ROGAN: Regarding the salary
15 increases, these funds are being provided
16 from the state. We, unfortunately, can't
17 use those for anything else other than the
18 business administrator's salary, the
19 addition of a position in the business
20 administrator's office.

21 MS. SCHUMACHER: Now, wait a minute,
22 we pay state taxes, too, and it's not coming
23 out of some pot of money that fell out of
24 the sky.

25 MR. ROGAN: No, you are absolutely

1 right.

2 MS. SCHUMACHER: It's coming from
3 the taxpayers. DCED wouldn't have to send
4 it to us if we didn't have to do this. I'll
5 tell you, this is the difference, and I know
6 most of you have worked in government over
7 your life, this is the biggest difference
8 between government and private industry.
9 Only in government does government stand on
10 the brink of bankruptcy and proceed to
11 increase positions and give people salary
12 increases and just in general act as though
13 there is a bottomless pit. When you are in
14 private industry, if you keep raising the
15 cost of your doing business it goes into
16 your product, it's got to and people stop
17 buying and you go out of business. When you
18 are in government all you do is this is poor
19 shmuck called the taxpayer and all you do is
20 say, "Oh, yeah, we'll spend whatever we want
21 and then when we get to the bottom line and
22 it doesn't balance we'll do whatever the
23 heck we want and put it on the backs of the
24 taxpayers."

25 This is -- this is very, very

1 disappointing. Now, I understand that the,
2 the new mayor will have discretion to
3 appoint his administrators, but that does
4 not extend to all of these positions I
5 wouldn't think that you people are intent on
6 adding, so would you please tell me which of
7 these will be advertised for vacancies?

8 MR. ROGAN: City council doesn't
9 hire or fire.

10 MS. SCHUMACHER: You have been
11 working with the mayor-elect you said.

12 MR. ROGAN: Well, that's what you
13 would have to ask him would they be
14 advertised. Council didn't --

15 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, it's too
16 late. I mean, I can't imagine that a refuse
17 collector or a refuse supervisor would not
18 be an advertised position and I would
19 certainly hope that Mr. Courtright would do
20 that.

21 And when did we get this grant from
22 DCED, I don't remember council voting on it?

23 MR. ROGAN: This is actually the
24 exact same process that the city followed
25 last year. We received a commitment from

1 DCED to fund I believe last year it was two
2 positions in the Business Administrator's
3 Office. The city had to budget the money
4 and then as when the grant comes in the
5 positions are filled. If the grant was not
6 materialized, if DCED broke their word, then
7 the positions would be paid.

8 MS. SCHUMACHER: When did the city
9 apply for this grant?

10 MR. ROGAN: I'm not sure. I wasn't
11 involved in the application process. I'm
12 not sure when the application was put in,
13 but it was the same process that the city
14 went through last year.

15 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, I certainly
16 will be -- what is the name of that grant?

17 MR. ROGAN: I don't have the grant
18 name. I could get more information for you
19 on it, but it is -- this isn't anything new.
20 It's the same thing that we did last year.

21 MS. SCHUMACHER: And? I don't know
22 why making it --

23 MR. ROGAN: If you want I can read
24 the memorandum we received from PEL now
25 about the current situation.

1 MS. SCHUMACHER: Yes, I would like a
2 copy of that, if you please. Yes, I would
3 like that, and I would also finally like to
4 repeat my concern about the folks who have a
5 lot of equity in their homes and stand to
6 lose it and there is just something the
7 matter with a budget that passes, you made
8 all kinds of amendments and you were willing
9 to accept the fact that you were going to
10 give the same collection rate this year as
11 you got the last year with a 56 percent
12 increase that's ludicrous. You are not
13 going to get it. A lot of people are going
14 to suffer and a lot of people are going to
15 suffer needlessly because they are elderly
16 and they have nobody to help them and they
17 are going to have the entire equity, the
18 thing they worked for, the American dream,
19 ripped out from under them and I can just --
20 if we didn't have a ceiling I could see the
21 vultures circling. I'm very disappointed,
22 thank you.

23 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Mr. Rogan,
24 you just mentioned a letter from PEL about a
25 grant or something?

1 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

2 MS. EVANS: I don't think the rest
3 of council received it.

4 MR. ROGAN: I believe I received
5 this at a meeting with PEL that was a couple
6 of weeks ago. To sum it up, basically what
7 their recommendations are: "Based on our
8 analysis we make the following
9 recommendations to the staffing and
10 structure of the Office of Business
11 Administrator."

12 Establish the salary level of the
13 business administrator at a level that will
14 attract a qualified candidate.

15 Raise the salary level of the
16 Finance Manager in order to recruit a
17 qualified candidate.

18 Add a staff assistant position is
19 the Business Administrator's Office.

20 Continue to use college level
21 interns to assist in audit documentation
22 prep."

23 Further, it goes on to say, "During
24 2011 and 2012 the Business Administrator's
25 Office was unable to accomplish the required

1 Home Rule Charter core functions of its
2 financial management. The 2010 audit was
3 not completed until early 2012. The 2011
4 audit was completed by the end of October of
5 2012.

6 Several areas of responsibility have
7 been performed by other organizations. For
8 example, the Act 47 coordinator has worked
9 closely with the city throughout 2012 and
10 '13 regarding the city's monthly cash flows
11 and the city's financial advisor had to
12 prepare some city documents related to the
13 2012 borrowing.

14 Meanwhile, the business
15 administrator has had to function as the
16 accounts payable contact in the financial
17 analysis while still overseeing the city's
18 financial role in the Act 47 Recovery Plan
19 process.

20 The BA's current duties leave little
21 time for proactive management as the BA has
22 been reactive to the significant financial
23 issues that have confronted the city in the
24 last quarter of 2011 and throughout 2012 and
25 '13. As part of the deliberations and

1 negotiations that proceeded the adoption of
2 the 2012 revised recovery plan, the mayor
3 and city council agreed to restore the
4 senior accountant and financial analyst
5 position to the Business Administrator's
6 Office. Both positions are now full."

7 These are the two that are I was
8 referring to that were placed in last year's
9 budget.

10 "The finance manager recently
11 announced that she would be leaving the city
12 for a position in the private sector. The
13 vacancy created by this resignation
14 represents the immediate loss of
15 institutional knowledge and expertise in the
16 preparations of the city's annual budget and
17 ongoing financial reporting requirements.

18 The current compensation for the
19 Business Administrator financial manage and
20 remaining professional staff in the BA's
21 office was reduced significantly by city
22 council in the 2011 and 2012 budget. The
23 BA's salary was reduced from \$85,000 to the
24 current \$53,000 and other salaries received
25 similar reductions. The city will have

1 considerable difficulty attracting qualified
2 candidates for the business administrator
3 and financial management positions at
4 current levels.

5 The BA in particular has excessive
6 responsibilities as the city's contact
7 person with the financial institutions and
8 capital markets. Attracting a qualified BA
9 candidate is crucial to reestablishing the
10 city's creditworthiness in the financial
11 community.

12 PEL recommends that the city apply
13 for an Act 47 grant to provide temporary
14 funding that would be used to increase the
15 compensation levels for the business
16 administrator and finance manager and to pay
17 for the additional staff position. The
18 grant funding would pay for salary and
19 increases of the existing portions for two
20 years.

21 In conclusion, the business
22 administrator's time and efforts should be
23 dedicated to the many initiatives on the
24 2012 revised recovery plan rather than
25 performing county functions. Completion of

1 the RRP tasks with a short timetable is
2 necessary and requires the full attention
3 and leadership of the business
4 administration."

5 MS. SCHUMACHER: If I may, that
6 doesn't say anything about the other
7 positions that you are adding.

8 MR. ROGAN: There were only two
9 positions being added, the one in the
10 Business Administrator's Office, and the one
11 in the DPW that is really not an addition,
12 it's an addition and subtraction.

13 MS. EVANS: When is that letter
14 dated?

15 MR. ROGAN: November 27, 2013.

16 MS. EVANS: Well, it was -- I'm glad
17 you shared that with us because it was
18 certainly right in keeping with PEL's
19 policies to selectively disseminate
20 information. Mr. Dobrzyn, di you want to
21 speak?

22 MR. DOBRZYN: First of all, that PEL
23 always decides did wish to express that --
24 and even when you disagree I'll still miss
25 you, you know. So, thank you, Frank, and

1 thank you, Janet. And a suggestion on the
2 refuse coordinator, I certainly hope that
3 things turn around because years ago we had
4 people in foreman's spot at the DPW and it
5 was my understanding, it was only hearsay
6 from somebody I worked with, but they were
7 supposed to coordinate recycling and so
8 forth, and basically I don't know what their
9 job was, counting paperclips or whatever,
10 but certainly we have no coordination, we
11 have no discipline as far as the way people
12 toss out their garbage, I had Mr. Loscombe
13 -- Councilman Loscombe up to see somebody
14 several times and the person still throws
15 the trash out the same way, which is a total
16 mess. You get it straightened out and two
17 weeks later it's the same old thing, and
18 with somebody that would supervise something
19 like that if they would do their job it
20 would be asset. If they don't do their job,
21 then it's a waste of money. And thank you
22 for your service and have everybody a Merry
23 Christmas.

24 MS. EVANS: Thank you, and Merry
25 Christmas to you as well.

1 MR. JOYCE: Merry Christmas to you
2 as well.

3 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else?

4 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
5 motion tot amend the proposed budget on page
6 33, Office of the mayor, increase standard
7 salary from \$91,085 to \$96,085 and make the
8 same change to total employee compensation.

9 MR. ROGAN: Second.

10 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
11 those in favor signify by saying aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

13 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

14 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

16 MR. JOYCE: No.

17 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
18 so moved.

19 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
20 motion to amend the budget on the page 34,
21 proposed budget, on page 34, increase
22 confidential secretary's salary from \$31,085
23 to \$36,085 and change the Department of the
24 Mayor total from \$91,085 to \$96,085.

25 MR. ROGAN: Second.

1 MS. EVANS: On the question?

2 MR. JOYCE: Yes. I will say that I
3 have been privy to know the person that is
4 going to assume this position, and I will
5 say the person that's going into this
6 position is a very hard worker. Do I think
7 they are worth \$36,085? Yeah, I do. But,
8 you know what, there is other confidential
9 secretaries that are going to be in the
10 administration and I can't support saying
11 the mayor's secretary is worth more than the
12 secretary in the law office who will make
13 \$5,000 less.

14 MS. EVANS: And, you know, I
15 probably would just add, I feel very
16 similarly to the Finance Chair. I, too,
17 know the individual who will assume this
18 position and she is a wonderful person and
19 very capable, highly qualified, but this
20 council cut that salary and some of us were
21 more aggressive about, you know, these cuts
22 to salaries than others and, you know, I
23 don't see what has changed.

24 And most of all, I don't see that
25 this is something that we can do when

1 people's taxes are being increased so much.
2 You know, we are just adding insult to
3 injury.

4 Is there anyone else on the
5 question? All those in favor signify by
6 saying aye.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

8 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

10 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

11 MR. JOYCE: No.

12 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
13 so moved.

14 MS. KRAKE: Mrs. Evans --

15 MS. EVANS: Oh, the ayes have it and
16 so moved. Thank you.

17 MR. MCGOFF: I make a motion to
18 amend the proposed budget on page 42,
19 decrease standard salary for the Office of
20 the City Council, City Clerk, from
21 \$219,290.96 to \$214,290.96. On the same
22 page decrease the total for the Department
23 of City Council, City Clerk, from
24 \$300,942.29 to \$295,942,29.

25 MR. ROGAN: Second.

1 MS. EVANS: On the question?

2 MR. ROGAN: Yes. This is the
3 corresponding, this item and the next one,
4 is the corresponding \$5,000 cut in the
5 salary to balance item number one in the
6 four parts.

7 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Is there
8 anyone else?

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I will say this,
10 Solicitor Hughes earned \$45,000 per year for
11 his work here on council, and I will say
12 this, he did one hell of a job for that
13 money. He broke his back doing legal work,
14 doing research, he has done more than any
15 other council solicitor I think has ever
16 done.

17 MS. EVANS: More than city
18 solicitors do.

19 MR. JOYCE: But I will say this, I
20 know that there are three people returning
21 to city council and, you know, I would be
22 hypocritical if I didn't say what is
23 appropriate for Boyd Hughes wouldn't be
24 appropriate for whom they shall choose as
25 well, so I just want to ask each of the

1 returning council members if this salary
2 adjustment is okay with you?

3 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Is okay with --

5 MR. JOYCE: Yes, with whom you may
6 want as your solicitor in the future.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Oh, the proposed
8 solicitor we're agreeing?

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I feel if Mr.
10 Hughes earned \$45,000 then I think that's
11 what the incoming council solicitor should
12 earn as well unless they feel it should be a
13 little bit less.

14 MS. EVANS: Well, in addition to
15 that, Mr. Rogan mentioned, and quite
16 correctly, that these changes are occurring
17 in order to provide for the increase in the
18 mayor's office, and since I didn't approve
19 of the increase in the mayor's office I
20 won't be approving of finding funding to
21 provide for that increase.

22 Is there anyone else? All those in
23 favor signify by saying aye.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

25 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

1 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

2 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

3 MS. EVANS: Opposed? No. The ayes
4 have it and so moved.

5 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
6 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
7 43 in the Office of City Council, City
8 Clerk, decrease the salary of the
9 legislative legal advisor from \$45,000 to
10 \$40,000, and decrease the total amount on p
11 age 43 to \$214,290.96.

12 MR. ROGAN: Second.

13 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
14 those in favor signify by saying aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

16 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

17 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

18 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

19 MS. EVANS: Opposed? No. The ayes
20 have it and so moved.

21 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make
22 amotion to amend the proposed budget on page
23 39 in the Department of Public Safety,
24 Bureau of Fire, increase the standard salary
25 from \$9,240,578.50 to \$9,257,00 -- or

1 257,806.61 and change the total employee
2 compensation from \$21,605,138.99 to
3 \$21,622,367.10.

4 On the same page, change Bureau of
5 Fire total from \$21,737,233.99 to \$21,754 --
6 or 754,462.10 and change the Department of
7 Public Safety total from \$44,115,646.12 to
8 \$44,132,874.23.

9 MR. ROGAN: Second.

10 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
11 those in favor signify by saying aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

13 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

14 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

16 MR. JOYCE: No.

17 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
18 so moved.

19 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
20 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
21 40, Department of Public Safety Bureau of
22 Fire, increase the salary of the chief from
23 \$50,000 to \$67,228.11, and increase the
24 Bureau of Fire total from \$9,240,578.50 to
25 \$9,257,806.61.

1 MR. ROGAN: Second.

2 MS. EVANS: On the question?

3 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

4 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

5 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

6 MR. JOYCE: I will say that this is
7 one of the amendments that I will support
8 because technically it's not a cut from
9 what -- or technically it's not a raise from
10 what the previous fire chief earned.

11 MR. ROGAN: And I just wanted to
12 add, I appreciate Mr. Joyce for that
13 comment, and that's pretty much what I was
14 going to say, and the fear of many of the
15 fire department and the incoming
16 administration is even with the fire chief's
17 salary at six -- at the former level that
18 Chief Davis made, Chief Davis makes less
19 than the men under him, which is fine. And,
20 you know, the next chief is going to have to
21 work for the same pay that our current chief
22 made, but by reducing that further where it
23 would come to, you know, where the point,
24 where a senior man in the fire department
25 would be taking a 20, 30 thousand dollar pay

1 cut, it would make it almost impossible for
2 anyone on the Scranton Fire Department to
3 accept that position, and at that point it
4 may be somebody from outside of Scranton
5 that would be needed that didn't know the
6 procedures, and I know Mr. Loscombe wanted
7 to speak on it, he knows this a lot better
8 than I do.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: I think you guys have
10 covered it pretty well.

11 MS. EVANS: Well, I agree with what
12 you are saying, but my one question is this,
13 why didn't Mr. Courtright work on the budget
14 and make these changes, this change in
15 particular, does anyone know?

16 MR. MCGOFF: I would say that in
17 speaking with Mr. Courtright and also
18 speaking with people in the administration
19 that there had some attempts by
20 Mr. Courtright and by members of the finance
21 team to be involved, I don't know the level
22 of the cooperation that existed.

23 MS. EVANS: Well, that was after
24 the proposed budget was submitted, I mean --

25 MR. MCGOFF: And even subsequent to

1 that -- or before and subsequent to the
2 proposal I'm not sure, you know, what the
3 level of cooperation was.

4 MS. EVANS: Well, I have heard that
5 afterwards both sides were trying, but
6 beforehand no.

7 MR. ROGAN: I would just like to
8 add, I believe the election was November 5,
9 and the budget was sent down was it November
10 10?

11 MS. EVANS: No, the 15th.

12 MR. ROGAN: The 15th, so that was a
13 ten-day period in-between. That's not a lot
14 of time to work on -- I would hope the
15 budget, the administration had a pretty good
16 idea of what they were planning on doing
17 three weeks to ten days out, but that being
18 said, I know last year Mayor Doherty wanted
19 to increase the fire chief's salary. Why
20 one year he wants to put it in I believe it
21 was a \$20,000 increase, and council rightly
22 took it out, and then the next year he wants
23 a \$17,000 decrease. I believed last year
24 the funding should remain the same for this
25 position and I believe this year the funding

1 should remain the same for this position.

2 MS. EVANS: I do as well, but I
3 think it was the responsibility of the
4 mayor-elect to take a look at these things
5 and do some work and his financial team as
6 well. They certainly have become busy
7 thereafter, but I will approve this because
8 I believe that it should be increased, and I
9 don't mean beyond what it was, but to the
10 salary that it had previously been, but I
11 believe none of this was really council's
12 job to be doing.

13 MS. EVANS: All those in favor
14 signify by saying aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

16 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

17 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

18 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

19 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
20 have it and so moved.

21 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
22 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
23 82, Department of Public Works, Bureau of
24 Refuse, decrease overtime salary from
25 \$100,000 to \$82,771.89.

1 MR. ROGAN: Second.

2 MS. EVANS: On the question?

3 MR. ROGAN: This is the
4 corresponding cut in regards to restoring
5 the fire chief's salary to its previous
6 level.

7 MR. JOYCE: Just out of curiosity,
8 why is it the Bureau of Refuse? I know, and
9 believe me, I know, Councilman Rogan, that
10 you are very critical of DPW overtime.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Should I answer? Maybe
12 I would be not as biased.

13 MR. ROGAN: I think I have a very
14 good answer for it, and it's that we are
15 adding a DPW refuse supervisor with the hope
16 that that will cut down on DPW refuse
17 overtime.

18 MR. JOYCE: Okay.

19 MS. EVANS: Anyone else on the
20 question? All those in favor signify by
21 saying aye.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

23 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

24 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

25 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

1 MR. JOYCE: No.

2 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
3 so moved.

4 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
5 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
6 83 in the Department of Public Works, Bureau
7 of Refuse, reduce the number of collectors
8 from 27 to 26 and the collector's salaries
9 from \$1,106,065.06 to \$1,076,065.06.

10 MR. ROGAN: Second.

11 MR. MCGOFF: And add --

12 MR. ROGAN: My apologies.

13 MR. MCGOFF: And add a DPW refuse
14 supervisor for a salary of \$30,000.

15 MR. ROGAN: Second.

16 MS. EVANS: On the question?

17 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I just have one
18 question about this. Now, interesting
19 enough I'm not an expert about refuse
20 collection or recycling collection, but from
21 I do know there is usually three men on a
22 truck; correct? There is a driver and a two
23 men or women who collect the garbage and,
24 you know, when they drive by house to get
25 the garbage, you know, one goes on one side

1 of the street and the other one goes on the
2 other side of the street. Now, if we go
3 to -- now, if you divide 27 by three it
4 would make sense that there is nine garbage
5 trucks or refuse trucks running on the city.

6 MR. MCGOFF: There is.

7 MR. JOYCE: Would this create an
8 uneven balance? I mean, would there be a
9 short staff refuse truck with just a driver
10 and one collector, you know, running from
11 one side of the street to the other side of
12 the street? That's my only question I had.

13 MR. ROGAN: It wouldn't be any
14 different than if somebody called off sick
15 or somebody was on leave.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: Basically that's what
17 happens now.

18 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: There's a couple of
20 fill-ins.

21 MR. JOYCE: Believe me, I'm not an
22 expert on DPW operations so I was just
23 asking if someone happens to know what
24 exactly happens, you know, if we have one
25 less guy on one truck, how would they

1 replace them? Is there a -- would it come
2 out of other salary in the DPW account or a
3 temporary person be used or how exactly is
4 that handled?

5 MR. ROGAN: I believe that the
6 current compliment in the budget that passed
7 last year was 25, which is also not
8 divisible by three.

9 MR. JOYCE: Right, so that's it.

10 MS. EVANS: Costs and positions are
11 growing everywhere. Anyone else on the
12 question? All those in favor signify by
13 saying aye.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

15 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

18 MR. JOYCE: No.

19 MS. EVANS: No. Oh, the ayes have it
20 and so moved. I'm very sorry.

21 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
22 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
23 62 in the Office of Economic and Community
24 Development, eliminate the position of
25 support service specialist part-time and

1 decrease the funding of that position from
2 \$23,824 to zero dollars, and decrease the
3 Bureau of Administration total from
4 \$457,507.44 to \$430,683.44.

5 MR. ROGAN: Second.

6 MS. EVANS: On the question?

7 MR. JOYCE: Yes, just a quick
8 question, I'm sorry for being so
9 inquisitive, but is this position, is this
10 someone that's retiring or is this a
11 position that Ms. Aebli suggested that is no
12 longer needed or --

13 MR. ROGAN: I believe this position
14 is currently filled, but there are two
15 full-time positions in OECD that are
16 unfilled, so the hope would be to have --
17 fill the full-time positions and eliminate
18 the part-time position.

19 MR. JOYCE: Okay. Then I could
20 support that.

21 MS. EVANS: Anyone else on the
22 question? All those in favor signify by
23 saying aye.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

25 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

1 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

2 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

3 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
4 have it and so moved.

5 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
6 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
7 62, in the Office of Economic and Community
8 Development, increase the funding for
9 neighborhood police officers from
10 \$184,417.58 to \$207,241.58.

11 MR. ROGAN: Second.

12 MS. EVANS: Anyone else on the
13 question? All those in favor signify by
14 saying aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

16 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

17 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

18 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

19 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
20 have it and so moved.

21 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
22 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
23 50, in the Department of Business
24 Administrator, Bureau of Administration,
25 increase the salary of the business

1 administrator from \$53,550 to \$85,000.

2 MR. ROGAN: Second.

3 MS. EVANS: On the question?

4 MR. ROGAN: On the question, the
5 next five amendments will all be paid for by
6 grants from DCED.

7 MS. EVANS: All those in favor
8 signify by saying aye.

9 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

10 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

11 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

12 MS. EVANS: Opposed? No.

13 MR. JOYCE: No.

14 MS. EVANS: The ayes have it and so
15 moved.

16 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
17 motion to amend the proposed budget, also in
18 the Department of Business Administrator,
19 Bureau of Administration, increase the
20 salary of the finance manager from \$37,400
21 to \$50,000.

22 MR. ROGAN: Second.

23 MS. EVANS: On the question? You
24 know, I was just thinking it's a good thing
25 the mayor's salary was increased to \$60,000

1 next year or you wouldn't be able to vote
2 for any of this. Since, you know, Mr. Rogan
3 had said no one should earn more than the
4 mayor, so it's a very good thing we
5 increased the mayor's salary.

6 Anyone else on the question? All
7 those in favor signify by saying aye.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

9 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

10 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

11 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

12 MR. JOYCE: No.

13 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
14 so moved.

15 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
16 motion to amend the proposed budget in the
17 Department of Business Administrator, Bureau
18 of Administration, add the position staff
19 assistant at a salary of \$35,000.

20 MR. ROGAN: Second.

21 MS. EVANS: On the question?

22 MR. JOYCE: This position I will
23 support. The Business Administrator's
24 Office, I'll be honest with you we have made
25 cuts there in the past, and I know they

1 are --

2 MS. EVANS: Short staffed.

3 MR. JOYCE: Very late on audits and
4 short staffed and I do believe that there
5 will be a lot of work that needs to be done
6 in this office and hopefully our future
7 mayor will find the right person to fill
8 that position.

9 MS. EVANS: Anyone else? All those
10 in favor signify by saying aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

12 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

14 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
16 have it and so moved.

17 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
18 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
19 49, in the Department of Business
20 Administration, Bureau of Administration,
21 increase standard salary from \$238,904.21 to
22 \$317,954.21.

23 MR. ROGAN: Second.

24 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
25 those in favor signify by saying aye.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

2 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

3 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

4 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

5 MR. JOYCE: No.

6 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
7 so moved.

8 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
9 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
10 49, in the Department of Business
11 Administration, Bureau of Administration,
12 change the total for business administrator
13 from \$8,163,921.62 to \$8,242,971.62.

14 MR. ROGAN: Second.

15 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
16 those in favor signify by saying aye.

17 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

18 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

20 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

21 MR. JOYCE: No.

22 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
23 so moved.

24 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
25 motion to amend the proposed budget on page

1 31, decrease unpaid bills, court awards from
2 \$20,098,756.45 to \$29,019,706.45.

3 MR. ROGAN: Second.

4 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
5 those in favor signify by saying aye.

6 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

7 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

8 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

9 MS. EVANS: Opposed?

10 MR. JOYCE: No.

11 MS. EVANS: No. The ayes have it and
12 so moved.

13 MR. MCGOFF: I'd like to make a
14 motion to amend the proposed budget on page
15 24, under rents and concessions insert, "An
16 account for cell phone tower leases for
17 \$18,000." The total for rents and
18 concessions shall remain at \$25,000.

19 MR. ROGAN: Second.

20 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
21 those in favor signify by saying aye.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

23 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

24 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

25 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

1 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
2 have it and so moved.

3 What the recommendation of the Chair
4 for the Committee on Finance?

5 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the
6 Committee on Finance, I do not recommend
7 final passage of Item 7-A.

8 MS. EVANS: Second. On the
9 question?

10 MR. JOYCE: Yes. I'll just say the
11 same thing, I think I made my point clear
12 before, I do not support a budget with the
13 55 percent tax or 56 percent tax increase,
14 69 percent garbage fee increase, 25 cent
15 raise in your meter rates and a jack or
16 large spike in rental registration fees that
17 also includes raises.

18 MS. EVANS: I just want to add, this
19 is what is called the lazy man's budget.
20 It, I'm sure, is a great delight to the
21 Pennsylvania Economy League who believes
22 that tax increases are the one and only
23 solution to the financial ills of every
24 municipality. I think it's far easier to
25 just say, "I'll increase your taxes. Heck,

1 the way you are going, why not increase them
2 200 percent? Boy, the city won't have a
3 problem in the world then, would it?"

4 But the point is you don't want to
5 take that route, you have to find other
6 roads and you've got to work hard. You've
7 got to make those things happen with these
8 new revenue generators, but nobody has got
9 the inclination to do so evidently. Not the
10 previous administration, not the new
11 administration. So, as I said, I agree with
12 Mr. Joyce, I will be saying "no" to the lazy
13 man's budget.

14 MR. LOSCOMBE: If I may just add,
15 and again, this has been anguishing me, and
16 you can see, as I mentioned before, it could
17 be called a lazy man's budget, last year we
18 proposed a budget that had all of these
19 revenues, had the been watched and done we
20 wouldn't be in this position. The problem
21 is now the banks aren't going to take those
22 ideas and run with them, I'm sorry. I'm
23 going to be here for the next two years and,
24 you know, believe it or not I doubt I would
25 ever be voted in again, but hopefully in two

1 years the people are going to see the turn
2 around and say, you know, you had to do what
3 you had to do.

4 The easy way for me to do it is to
5 vote "no" and then where are we going to go?
6 Bankruptcy? I don't know. Would you prefer
7 that? 130 percent increase in taxes and no
8 say.

9 MS. EVANS: You know, Jack, we were
10 just about at that tonight. If you take 56
11 and then you add 25 and then as Mr. Lockwood
12 would tell us, that 25 increases, so it
13 would have been more like 32, and then you
14 add the, what was it, 69 percent increase
15 for the garbage fee, you are there.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Could I -- I'm sorry,
17 were you finished, Mr. Loscombe?

18 MR. LOSCOMBE: No, but you can go
19 on.

20 MR. MCGOFF: I would just like to
21 add, I know Mr. Loscombe mentioned during
22 motions starting to go through some of the
23 numbers, if this were to pass the average
24 taxpayer would see an increase, this would
25 be including the tax and the garbage fee

1 increase, would see an increase of about
2 \$390. That's a little over a dollar a day,
3 okay?

4 The total tax bill increase that
5 they would realize would be somewhere around
6 20 percent of their total bill, so that
7 somebody that was paying \$1,000 in 2013 in
8 total taxes, that's city, county, school
9 district, would now instead of paying \$1,000
10 would be paying \$1,200, okay?

11 And it would still leave us as the
12 lowest taxing body of all three taxing
13 bodies. I believe, and the other thing that
14 I think should be mentioned, if we vote no
15 to these amendments and to the budget this
16 evening with the proposals, that would
17 automatically revert to -- we would then
18 automatically revert to the mayor's proposed
19 budget, which would be the same dollar
20 amount. It would not change anything. The
21 tax increase would be the same, the garbage
22 fee increase would be the same, and rental
23 registration would be the same, all of those
24 things would be the same.

25 So by voting to not approve the

1 amended budget really doesn't accomplish, I
2 don't think it accomplishes anything, and
3 while it may be seen as a lazy man's budget,
4 I think it's a lazy person's vote to vote
5 against because all we do is revert to the
6 same thing that we had before us before.

7 MS. EVANS: And that may be --

8 MR. JOYCE: Let me ask this for a
9 second, if you are saying no is a lazy man's
10 vote, I wanted to ask you, why did you vote
11 no last year on the budget?

12 MR. MCGOFF: Mr. Joyce, I'm not
13 going to argue over how I voted that --

14 MR. JOYCE: I'm not saying that, I'm
15 just saying it like it is.

16 MR. MCGOFF: I guess I'm just being
17 somebody used to called, you know -- said a
18 lazy man's budget, I just turned it around
19 and, you know, if I'm going to be called
20 lazy maybe I'm just being reactive.

21 MR. JOYCE: I'm just saying -- I
22 wanted you to take into consideration I
23 wasn't the person that said that that was a
24 lazy man's budget.

25 MS. EVANS: No, I'll take credit for

1 that.

2 MR. MCGOFF: I apologize.

3 MR. JOYCE: That's okay.

4 MS. EVANS: I'll take credit for the
5 statement, and I when I said the statement I
6 was referring to the current administration
7 and the new administration. However, I had
8 not thought it applied to council members.
9 However, on further reflection I guess it
10 does, because as has been pointed out so
11 well, none of the amendments are anything
12 that help this situation or help the people
13 of this city. Not a crumb. Not by a
14 dollar.

15 MR. ROGAN: Why did you support some
16 of them then?

17 MS. EVANS: Why did I support some
18 of them?

19 MR. ROGAN: Because you believe some
20 of them were worthy?

21 MS. EVANS: I believe that the fire
22 chief's salary needs to be restored, but I
23 said I also believed Mr. Courtright should
24 have done that. I am supporting something
25 in the BA's Office because I had believed

1 that they have been understaffed. Do I
2 think they all need to make more money? No,
3 I don't. Do I think they need more people.
4 Yes, I do. And as you said, that money is
5 coming through a grant.

6 MR. ROGAN: So it does do a little
7 bit to help.

8 MS. EVANS: Well, it gave somebody a
9 job, but did it help -- did it help the
10 people of this city? No. And when you look
11 -- when you look at these amendments and you
12 compare them to the amendments made over the
13 last three years, there is no -- there is no
14 comparison. None.

15 MR. ROGAN: I would just like to
16 comment a little bit on some of what was
17 mentioned by other council members and some
18 of what Mr. McGoff said, and I want to
19 elaborate on a point where, as Mr. McGoff
20 said, if this budget were voted down whether
21 it be 3-2 or 0-5, however, it was voted
22 down, the mayor's budget would revert into
23 law.

24 As far as the total dollar amount in
25 the budget and the increases in line items,

1 they are all identical. The other only
2 differences are, and many of these
3 differences to some people may seem small,
4 but I believe some of them to be certainly
5 worthwhile.

6 Attracting a competent fire chief
7 from within the City of Scranton is
8 certainly something that is worthwhile. I
9 have talked to many men of on the fire
10 department that believe their supervisor
11 should be somebody that came from the ranks,
12 not somebody from outside.

13 Regarding the Business

14 Administrator's Office, and as we stated
15 before, these positions are coming as from a
16 grant from the state and it was just two
17 years ago that our current Business
18 Administrator lost over \$1 million of
19 taxpayer funds, and I would be the first to
20 say if this happens under our next mayor
21 and, our next administration, I will be
22 first one here calling on that person to be
23 fired just as I did with Ryan McGowan.

24 A couple of the other items in here,
25 regarding the changes in the public works, I

1 have been -- this is something I have
2 probably said at every single council
3 meeting for the last two years that I have
4 problems with how our refuse division is
5 currently run. I believe putting a
6 supervisor in there can save the taxpayers
7 money on overtime without costing additional
8 money, because we are eliminating another
9 position. By having one less union position
10 in the DPW union and one more supervisor we
11 could get more out of our workers, and
12 that's something that I believe we have to
13 do in any every single department in this
14 city.

15 As far as the tax increases go, it's
16 not a pleasurable thing to do, to vote for.
17 I work three jobs to pay my bills. I know
18 many of you out there do. Many of you can't
19 because you are on fixed incomes. I
20 completely understand that and I think we
21 all do, and I think the common thread
22 between the three of us that are voting to
23 pass the amended budget tonight, and I may
24 be wrong, but I believe this the first time
25 Mr. Loscombe, Mr. McGoff and myself voted as

1 a block to past a piece of legislation, and
2 we are going to remain in the city's
3 government going into next year, and it's
4 important that the financial -- although the
5 local banks and the larger banks are willing
6 to do business with the City of Scranton,
7 that they are willing to provide the TAN,
8 which luckily we passed tonight, and that's
9 thanks to the good work of Boyd Hughes.

10 Even more important, and this is, as
11 I have said and many of us have said, the
12 biggest monkey on the city's back is finding
13 a lending institution who will lend us money
14 to pay the arbitration awards. We are
15 currently spending nearly \$3,000 a day in
16 interest on that award. Every day that goes
17 by the city is paying more in interest than
18 most of us up here make in over a month.
19 This bill has to be paid or this interest is
20 going to continue to grow.

21 The budget needs to be seen as sound
22 by the financial community, we need a
23 Business Administrator's Office that is
24 going to be able to get these items done.
25 Do I like the entire package of this budget?

1 Of course I don't. I don't think there is
2 one single person in this city that does.

3 But as Mr. Loscombe said, Mayor
4 Doherty has not pursued many of the other
5 items that I know Mrs. Evans and myself
6 agreed on, which are sale of the Sewer
7 Authority, hasn't happened, something that
8 really could bail out the city. Other
9 revenue ideas, I know Mr. Loscombe and I
10 talked about this today StreetSmart, another
11 item that didn't happen, and pursuing of the
12 commuter tax prior to a budget being
13 proposed, but the administration didn't
14 pursue any of these items, so the choice is
15 either to vote "yes" or vote "no."

16 Whether you council approves this
17 budget tonight or shoots it down tonight the
18 tax increase will be the same, the garbage
19 fee increase will be the same, the rental
20 registration increase will be the same, and
21 the meter increase will be the same, and the
22 total dollar amount of the budget will be
23 the same.

24 That being said, I would rather get
25 a few items that I believe can help the city

1 and the vast majority of them being paid for
2 by the state, which are still your tax
3 dollars, but we should be using and bringing
4 our state dollars home to Scranton to help
5 where we can so our Business Administrator's
6 Office doesn't lose a million dollars again
7 in two years. So that is why I will vote
8 for this. And that is all I have.

9 MS. EVANS: I just wanted to say
10 something finally. It's the same way either
11 way, as has been said, but it's the same way
12 either way because clearly, you know, there
13 haven't been amendments made to make any
14 remarkable changes. But beyond that, it was
15 as important, even more important in 2012
16 when the city was really on the verge of the
17 bankruptcy, when the city was down to \$5,000
18 and people were being paid minimum wages,
19 and the only way to maintain safety and
20 services and to attract any bank that would
21 assist the city was to pass a recovery plan
22 and you voted against that.

23 MR. ROGAN: Because those revenues
24 wouldn't materialize and they haven't.

25 MS. EVANS: And then, you know, we

1 went forward and we had to get a TAN, we had
2 to do borrowing to take care of that year's
3 bills, we produced a budget. You voted no
4 to all of that, but you didn't have any
5 alternatives to all of that, just that I
6 don't like that. So here we are now, and I
7 guess what I'm asking you is what's changed
8 about you?

9 MR. ROGAN: I could ask the same
10 thing back.

11 MS. EVANS: No, nothing has changed
12 with me. In fact, I --

13 MR. ROGAN: Well, last year you
14 criticized me for voting against it and not
15 proposing a package of amendments, this year
16 you are voting against it and not proposing
17 a package of amendments. The shoe is just
18 on the other foot.

19 MS. EVANS: No.

20 MR. ROGAN: Yes --

21 MS. EVANS: Not at all --

22 MR. ROGAN: -- it absolutely is.

23 MS. EVANS: I had offered
24 solutions--

25 MR. ROGAN: Not this year.

1 MS. EVANS: -- they did not come to
2 pass. I had done it in this budget and all
3 year long, unlike you. So, you know, I
4 think there has got to be ownership, at
5 least I hope there will be, you know, with
6 going into -- going into the future, but I
7 guess I'll just end it, we can vote, and
8 I'll say God help the people.

9 MR. MCGOFF: Might I just remind
10 council members that --

11 MR. JOYCE: Yeah, it's been awhile,
12 so a "yes" vote is that you're agreeing with
13 me and --

14 MR. MCGOFF: A "no" vote would be to
15 approve the amended budget, a "yes" vote
16 would be to defeat the amended budget.

17 MR. JOYCE: Correct. And I see our
18 newspaper reporter looking at me like we
19 have --

20 MS. EVANS: Just reverse --

21 MR. JOYCE: We'll explain it after
22 the meeting.

23 MS. EVANS: -- the traditional
24 process. Roll call, please?

25 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

1 MR. MCGOFF: No.

2 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

3 MR. ROGAN: No.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: No.

6 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

7 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

9 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
10 Item 7-A, as amended, passes.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Is approved.

12 MS. EVANS: Is approved.

13 MS. KRAKE: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION
14 BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR ADOPTION-
15 RESOLUTION NO. 48, 2013 - AMENDING
16 RESOLUTION NO. 43, 2013 ENTITLED "RATIFYING
17 AND APPROVING OF THE EXECUTION AND
18 SUBMISSION OF THE GRANT APPLICATION BY THE
19 CITY OF SCRANTON, ON BEHALF OF THE SCRANTON
20 SEWER AUTHORITY, TO THE COMMONWEALTH OF
21 PENNSYLVANIA ACTING THROUGH THE COMMONWEALTH
22 FINANCING AUTHORITY FOR A LOCAL SHARE
23 ACCOUNT GRANT, PURSUANT TO THE PA RACE HORSE
24 DEVELOPMENT AND GAMING ACT IN THE AMOUNT OF
25 \$415,695.00 FOR THE PROJECT TO BE KNOWN AS

1 "STREET SWEEPER PROJECT" LOCATED IN
2 SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA. THIS RESOLUTION
3 SHALL ALSO AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR AND OTHER
4 APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF
5 SCRANTON TO ACCEPT THE GRANT IF APPROVED,
6 AND EXECUTE AND ENTER INTO A LOCAL SHARE
7 ACCOUNT GRANT CONTRACT AND COMMITMENT LETTER
8 WITH THE COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA TO
9 ACCEPT AND UTILIZE THE GRANT AWARDED BY THE
10 COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA FOR SUCH
11 PROJECT" BY CORRECTING THE TYPOGRAPHICAL
12 ERROR IN THE PROJECT NAME IN THE FIRST
13 WHEREAS CLAUSE TO STREET SWEEPER PROJECT AND
14 REDUCING THE GRANT AMOUNT TO \$410,211.00.

15 MS. EVANS: As Chair for the
16 Committee on Rules, I recommend final
17 passage of Item 7-B.

18 MR. ROGAN: Second.

19 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll
20 call, please?

21 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

23 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

24 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

25 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

1 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

2 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

3 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

5 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
6 Item 7-B legally and lawfully adopted.

7 MR. JOYCE: I would like to make a
8 motion to take Resolution No. 47, 2013, from
9 the table.

10 MR. ROGAN: Second.

11 MS. EVANS: On the question? We had
12 tabled this piece of legislation during last
13 week's meeting because council had not
14 reached out to Mr. Deantona to request a
15 resume. Since then, council's office did
16 contact him and he did provide a wonderful
17 letter and resume.

18 MR. JOYCE: Yes, and I would also
19 like to thank him for doing so and I wish
20 him very well.

21 MS. EVANS: All those in favor
22 signify by saying aye.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

24 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

1 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

2 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
3 have it and so moved.

4 MS. KRAKE: 7-C. FOR CONSIDERATION
5 BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR ADOPTION-
6 RESOLUTION NO. 47, 2013 (PREVIOUSLY
7 TABLED) – APPOINTMENT OF PAUL DEANTONA, 333
8 NORTH SUMNER AVENUE, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA,
9 18504 AS A MEMBER OF THE SCRANTON MUNICIPAL
10 RECREATION AUTHORITY TO FILL THE UNEXPIRED
11 TERM OF THOMAS SMITH WHOSE TERM IS SCHEDULED
12 TO EXPIRE JUNE 17, 2016.

13 MS. EVANS: As Chairperson for the
14 Committee on Rules, I recommend final
15 passage of Item 7-C.

16 MR. ROGAN: Second.

17 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll
18 call, please?

19 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

20 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

21 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

22 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

23 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

24 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

25 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

1 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

2 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

3 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
4 Item 7-C legally and lawfully adopted.

5 MS. KRAKE: 7-D - FORMERLY 6-A - FOR
6 CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE -
7 FOR ADOPTION - FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 56 - 2013
8 - AUTHORIZING THE ISSUANCE AND SALE NOT TO
9 EXCEED SEVENTEEN MILLION (\$17,000,000.00)
10 DOLLAR PRINCIPAL AMOUNT, TAX ANTICIPATION
11 NOTE OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON KNOWN AS TAN
12 SERIES 2014-A AWARDED TO IFS SECURITIES;
13 DETERMINING THE FORM AND TERM OF SAID NOTE;
14 AWARDED SAID NOTE; AUTHORIZING AND
15 DIRECTING THE FILING OF CERTAIN DOCUMENTS;
16 AND DIRECTING THE PROPER OFFICIALS OF THE
17 CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE ANY AND ALL OTHER
18 ACTIONS AS MAY BE REQUIRED IN CONNECTION
19 WITH THE ISSUANCE OF SAID NOTE.(EMERGENCY
20 CERTIFICATE ATTACHED)

21 MS. EVANS: What is the
22 recommendation of the Chair for the
23 Committee on Finance?

24 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the
25 Committee on Finance, I recommend final

1 passage of Item 7-D.

2 MR. ROGAN: Second.

3 MS. EVANS: On the question? Again,
4 I think it's very important to acknowledge
5 and thank the great efforts Mr. Michael
6 Judge and Council Solicitor Hughes who never
7 gave up on the attainment of a TAN. When
8 others thought it was not going to happen,
9 when Mr. Hickey of the League of Mercenaries
10 came in last week to say it would not happen
11 and something else that needed to be covered
12 we never gave up, and I thank those
13 gentlemen immensely. Roll call, please.

14 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

16 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

17 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

18 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

20 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

21 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

22 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

23 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
24 Item 7-D legally and lawfully adopted.

25 On behalf of city council, I'd like

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to wish everyone a very happy and blessed
Christmas and a healthy and happy new year.
This meeting is adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR
OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER