

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING

HELD:

Tuesday, November 9, 2010

LOCATION:

Council Chambers
Scranton City Hall
340 North Washington Avenue
Scranton, Pennsylvania

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL:

JANET EVANS, PRESIDENT

PAT ROGAN, VICE-PRESIDENT

ROBERT MCGOFF

FRANK JOYCE

JOHN LOSCOMBE

NANCY KRAKE, CITY CLERK

JAMIE MARCIANO, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK

BOYD HUGHES, SOLICITOR

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and
2 moment of reflection observed.)

3 MS. EVANS: Roll call, please.

4 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Here.

6 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

7 MR. ROGAN: Here.

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

9 MR. LOSCOMBE: Here.

10 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce. Mrs.

11 Evans.

12 MS. EVANS: Here. Dispense with the
13 reading of the minutes.

14 MS. KRAKE: 3-A. MINUTES OF THE
15 NON-UNIFORM MUNICIPAL PENSION MEETING HELD
16 ON SEPTEMBER 22, 2010.

17 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
18 If not, so received and filed.

19 MS. KRAKE: 3-B. MINUTES OF THE
20 COMPOSITE PENSION BOARD MEETING HELD ON
21 SEPTEMBER 22, 2010.

22 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?
23 If not, received and filed.

24 MS. KRAKE: 3-C. MINUTES OF THE
25 FIREMEN'S PENSION BOARD HELD ON SEPTEMBER

1 22, 2010.

2 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

3 If not, received and filed.

4 MS. KRAKE: 3-C. Minutes -- excuse
5 me. 3-D. MINUTES OF THE SCRANTON POLICE
6 PENSION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON SEPTEMBER
7 22, 2010.

8 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

9 If not, received and filed.

10 MS. KRAKE: 3-E. AGENDA FOR THE
11 CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING TO BE HELD
12 OCTOBER 20, 2010.

13 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

14 If not, received and filed.

15 MS. KRAKE: 3-F. AGENDA FOR THE
16 NONUNIFORM MUNICIPAL PENSION MEETING TO BE
17 HELD ON OCTOBER 27, 2010.

18 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

19 If not, received and filed.

20 MS. KRAKE: 3-G. AGENDA FOR THE
21 ZONING HEARING BOARD TO BE HELD NOVEMBER 20,
22 2010.

23 MS. EVANS: Are there any comments?

24 If not, received and filed. Clerk's notes,
25 please.

1 MS. KRAKE: We have some responses
2 this week. The first is a response to a
3 Right-to-Know request from Stu Renda and
4 this was concerning our request where the
5 whereabouts of two aerial proximity warning
6 devices purchased by the city to be used by
7 the traffic maintenance department.

8 Now, Stu Renda tells us that due to
9 the extensive nature of our request it is
10 under review and the city will respond in 30
11 days. However, we also sent the same letter
12 to Jeff Brazil who tells us this, that the
13 traffic maintenance is in possession of an
14 aerial proximity warning device and the tree
15 crew has the other aerial proximity warning
16 device.

17 There is even more to this story.
18 An aerial proximity warning device if I have
19 it correct, and maybe Mr. Loscombe would
20 know better than I, is a device that's
21 placed on the truck. It's an expensive item
22 and it would tell whoever was in the truck
23 that they were getting close to a power
24 line.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: Active power lines.

1 MS. KRAKE: What I think the -- or
2 what this office was referring to were
3 commonly called sticks where they can reach
4 out and touch the power line to see if it's
5 hot. So we, in fact, were calling something
6 by the wrong title, and apparently
7 Department of Public Works responded to that
8 wrong title, maybe they were under the
9 impression that's what it was called also,
10 which is fine, so it sounds like there is
11 two.

12 MS. EVANS: I do have a question
13 though and perhaps we could easily get this
14 rectified with DPW. As we know, the traffic
15 maintenance department was disbanded in the
16 2010 budget and so it obviously would be
17 impossible for that department to retain the
18 device. I don't know what the name of --
19 the correct terminology is for the device,
20 so can he be a bit more specific and tell
21 us, please, who then has the device.
22 Perhaps it would be the company that was
23 contracted to do the work in place of the
24 traffic maintenance department, but if we
25 can find that out, please.

1 MS. KRAKE: Thank you. This is in
2 response to a request from Marie Schumacher.
3 The Controller's Office tells us that there
4 is no capital budget report at this time.
5 There were no capital improvement projects
6 for the Year 2010 and, therefore, no need to
7 produce a report, so the Controller's Office
8 does not have the report.

9 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

10 MS. KRAKE: We received a response
11 from Liz Renda at the Scranton Parking
12 Authority concerning our request for copies
13 of the any and all parking agreements. She
14 tells us due to the extensive nature of our
15 request she was wondering if we would like
16 to narrow our scope.

17 MS. EVANS: I think we can narrow it
18 down in terms of a timeline, perhaps 2002
19 through present. Thank you.

20 MS. KRAKE: We also received a
21 response from Roseanne Novembrino, city
22 controller. We asked for copies of all
23 vouchers for 2009 and 2010 in the UDAG
24 repayment checking account commonly referred
25 to as the Webly account. We do have those

1 in our office.

2 MS. EVANS: Yes. Thank you, I have
3 seen them.

4 MS. KRAKE: We received a response
5 from Linda Aebli concerning the UDAG
6 checkbook. We had asked if the dollar
7 amount -- this is how we worded the request:
8 Please provide city council with the dollar
9 amount of any of the UDAG funds which have
10 been utilized since the last reports have
11 submitted to counsel. Also include
12 information regarding their use.

13 Mrs. Aebli tells us that the only
14 changes in the account was the bank charge
15 as a result of the nonuse of the funds, and
16 the balance has been \$4,155.62.

17 (Mr. Joyce enters council chambers
18 for the meeting.)

19 MS. EVANS: Perhaps we will have to
20 rephrase our request because it seems clear
21 that money is drawn down from some account
22 there using UDAG funds according to the
23 invoices that I have reviewed and so maybe
24 tomorrow we can work on that, making the
25 request maybe more specific in a new

1 direction. Thank you.

2 MS. KRAKE: From Bill Shane of the
3 Scranton Redevelopment Authority, we had
4 requested an itemized breakdown of all
5 services and fees paid to Attorney Carl
6 Greco from 2002 to the present. He is
7 telling us in the course of the ongoing
8 review of the request he is going to request
9 the 30-day extension.

10 MS. EVANS: Very good.

11 MS. KRAKE: You had requested last
12 week or council had requested last week I
13 should say that we contact the mayor's
14 office concerning a tentative caucus tonight
15 with Jeff Brazil and Brian Swanson. We did
16 call the mayor's office and spoke with the
17 secretary, left that message with her and
18 that call was never returned as to say
19 whether one way or the other that the mayor
20 would allow Jeff Brazil to attend. And the
21 same with Brian Swanson, we called and left
22 a message concerning the caucus and there
23 was no response from him either.

24 MS. EVANS: Well, I know that work
25 has been ongoing in the Keyser Valley

1 section where all of these flooding problems
2 are being experienced and I know that
3 Mr. Loscombe is really on top of that
4 situation and has been taking care of that
5 on behalf of council, so maybe he can fill
6 us in more and if you feel, Mr. Loscombe,
7 that a meeting would be essential for the
8 benefit of the neighborhood, you know, if
9 you are incurring any problems then we can
10 certainly try to reschedule this and perhaps
11 get Mr. Tell in from Representative Murphy's
12 Office, we could try for Mr. Swanson again
13 and I think basically you are the man for
14 this job. You have been on it and I'm going
15 to leave that in your hands.

16 MR. LOSCOMBE: I appreciate it. I
17 will address some of the issues under my
18 comments.

19 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

20 MR. ROGAN: I would just like to add
21 I spoke today on the phone with the resident
22 who initially requested the caucus and his
23 block and the block next to it is a part of
24 the ongoing project and that's what his
25 concern was and he was very upset that the

1 mayor would not allow Mr. Brazil and
2 Mr. Swanson to come to council for a caucus,
3 so I will be talking to him again, and
4 again, hopefully the mayor will change his
5 mind, but judging by his track record that's
6 not to likely.

7 MS. KRAKE: We had no response from
8 the mayor concerning our request to know
9 when the Civil Service Test for the hiring
10 of new police officers would be
11 administered. We had no response from Chief
12 Duffy concerning illegal vehicle parked in
13 the rear of 2801 Pittston Avenue in Hamm
14 Court.

15 Next, we had sent several citizen's
16 requests to Bob Kearns from MEM concerning
17 lights, streetlights that have not been
18 working properly. For the 700 block of
19 Orchard Street and Grimes Court I spoke to
20 Mr. Kearns today and he assured me that that
21 light will be fixed in 24 hours.

22 The 300 block of Ferdinand Street,
23 this light has a couple of issues going on.
24 The first is we cannot get into the cabinet
25 yet. He needs an as-built spec from

1 PennDOT. He told me that Jeff Brazil had
2 told him he was working on that, so he does
3 believe that that would happen. He also
4 wanted to let us know that there is an old
5 light that is still there that has not been
6 removed, so there is some light in that
7 area.

8 837 Quincy Avenue will be fixed in
9 24 hours, also. The original issue of a
10 photocell was not the correct fix, so they
11 are going back.

12 Dale and Vision Street, they were
13 just notified of that today by our office
14 and he also told us that will be fixed in 24
15 hours, also.

16 MS. EVANS: Mrs. Krake, can we just
17 then keep our eye on the 300 of Ferdinand
18 because it sounds as if the other locations
19 are going to be repaired in a timely manner,
20 but because we are involving the city in
21 that particular issue if we can just, you
22 know, keep a close watch on that and make
23 sure that that's taken care of in a timely
24 manner as well because I know that's been
25 ongoing for over a month and the residents

1 of that neighborhood had contacted MEN and
2 the mayor's office, they have taken every
3 route possible, and council has been their
4 last resort, so again, we have to be sure we
5 follow-up on that.

6 MR. ROGAN: Mrs. Krake, could we
7 please let -- the one on Parallel Drive, I
8 know me sent a request previously. I'll
9 give you the whole number after the meeting.

10 MS. KRAKE: Thank you.

11 MR. LOSCOMBE: Actually, just to add
12 to that, there are probably three on
13 Parallel Drive. It is wooden so it's hard
14 to get the pole numbers, but I'll get the
15 information on the additional ones. And
16 while we are speaking of it, 700 block of
17 Birch there is few lights out there so it's
18 really a dark -- really dark area around the
19 Webster Avenue corner and up, so if we can
20 add that.

21 MS. KRAKE: Speaking to Mr. Kearns
22 apparently when they send the people out to
23 fix them it's during the day because I made
24 the remark it would be the light that's out
25 because I know it's difficult for somebody

1 to get the numbers, but if at all possible
2 he said a direct address or number does help
3 speed up the process.

4 We did not get a response from Mr.
5 Swanson concerning the traffic signal at the
6 corner of Lackawanna and Seventh. We did
7 not get a response from Mr. Brazil on the
8 stop sign at Price and North Cameron. Also
9 no response from Mr. Brazil concerning
10 directional arrows in line painting at the
11 400 block of Lackawanna or directional
12 arrows and line paint for the traffic signal
13 at Moosic Street and Meadow. And that's it.

14 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mrs. Krake,
15 and we'll retain all of that information and
16 I think we will continue to try to contact
17 Mr. Swanson, however.

18 MS. KRAKE: Yes.

19 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Do any
20 council members have announcements at this
21 time?

22 MR. MCGOFF: Please. If you would
23 bear with me, as we get to the winter season
24 as it quickly comes upon us there are a
25 number of charity drives that are taking

1 place looking for various items that would
2 help needy people during the winter season
3 and I would just like to make mention of a
4 few. The Family to Family Program is
5 sponsoring a coat drive. As it says gently
6 used or new coats, gloves, any type of
7 winter apparel would be greatly appreciated.

8 Also, the Voluntary Action Center
9 was conducting a sock drive. It came to an
10 end supposedly last week, but I'm sure that
11 if items were donated they would be greatly
12 appreciated, even at this time.

13 And also, Catholic Social Services
14 is sponsoring a gently used blanket and
15 quilt drive, again, for the needy. Any of
16 these items that you may wish to donate or
17 you can donate can be dropped off at -- for
18 all of these programs can be dropped off at
19 Marian Catholic Elementary School. That's
20 on 638 Hemlock Street. If you have any
21 questions you can call the school. The
22 number is 346-9922. My wife should answer
23 and you can get any answers from her
24 concerning these drives.

25 Also, we did receive another notice

1 here from Elm Park United Methodist Church
2 who are also conducting a coat drive.
3 Again, coats and jackets, gloves, mittens,
4 scarves can be brought to Elm Park United
5 Methodist Church from nine to noon
6 Wednesdays or from ten to noon and 5 to 7
7 p.m. beginning October 27. If you need to
8 have items picked up you can call the church
9 office 342-8263. And that's from Elm Park
10 United Methodist Church as well.

11 Two other things not related to
12 those, but dealing with those, I know that
13 those organizations would be appreciative of
14 any items that could be donated. They are
15 greatly needed and I think it's something
16 like 20,000 people were helped last year,
17 something like that, with coats and so on,
18 so please be generous if you can.

19 I'd also like to announce once again
20 the Deutsch Institute Celebrity brunch which
21 will be held this Sunday at St. Mary's
22 Center from 9 to 1 p.m., 9 a.m. to 1 p.m.
23 It's conducted to benefit persons with
24 disabilities. Tickets can be purchased I'm
25 sure at the door or if you can see

1 Mrs. Novembrino in the Controller's Office
2 the tickets are available there as well.

3 And last, again, the Commonwealth
4 Medical College is conducting a turkey trot
5 5-K race this Saturday. Proceeds will
6 benefit Friends of the Poor. Donations of
7 clothing and nonperishable food items can be
8 brought there as well for the Thanksgiving
9 season. The registration is being conducted
10 at Lackawanna College and the start of the
11 race is 9:00. I'm sure they are doing
12 registrations probably an hour before, and
13 that's all. Thank you.

14 MS. EVANS: Mr. Rogan?

15 MR. ROGAN: Yes, just two
16 announcements, and this one is a little
17 outdated because we didn't have a meeting
18 last week, but it was from Mr. Wolff at
19 Scranton High School, and he mentioned that
20 the Friday night football game was a pink
21 out game for cancer awareness. The
22 cheerleaders all wore pink shirts, the
23 football team pink shoelaces, and the
24 student organized the pink out section.
25 They have sold to date \$1,925 worth of

1 shirts for this fundraiser and the student
2 body would be allowed to enter the stadium
3 wearing a pink out shirt for \$1. If you add
4 the pink out funds with the LUW drive the
5 Scranton High School students and faculty
6 have raised over \$5,000 in the past few
7 weeks, so that's very good news.

8 This one was just put in our mailbox
9 so I figured I would announce it, it's from
10 Bill Courtright from the tax collector's
11 office and it says, "Fast, easy, secure, pay
12 electronically at www.Scrantontaxoffice.org.
13 You could do your real estate payment,
14 individual earning payment, local services
15 payment, employer holder service payment and
16 employer earned income and business
17 privilege and mercantile payment, so that
18 could be convenient for some residents and I
19 will ask that they put this on the scroll so
20 everyone can pay their taxes. And that's
21 all.

22 MS. EVANS: Mr. Loscombe?

23 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes. Just one, thank
24 you. The Dante Literary Society will serve
25 tripe or pasta on Saturday, November 13,

1 from 4 to 7 p.m. The menu will include tripe
2 or pasta with meat sauce, salad, Italian
3 sausage, bread and cake. Cost of the dinner
4 is \$9.50 for tripe and \$8 for pasta with
5 meat sauce. \$5 for children under ten. The
6 Dante Literary Society is located at 1916
7 Prospect Avenue in Scranton, and to make
8 your reservations please call 342-1770, and
9 I'm sure walk-ins are also welcome. And
10 that again is Saturday from 4 to 7. And
11 that's all I have. Thank you.

12 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Mr. Joyce?

13 MR. JOYCE: Yes, I have two as well.
14 On Saturday, November 13, there will be a
15 fundraiser to benefit pancreatic cancer
16 research at Whistle's Pub and Eatery from 6
17 to 9 p.m. There will be live entertainment,
18 drinks and appetizers. The cost is \$25 and
19 can be paid at the door.

20 Also, the Pinebrook Neighborhood
21 Association is hosting a basket raffle to
22 raise funds. Chairperson Kathleen O'Malley
23 Cunningham is searching for a location for
24 this fundraiser, but in the mean time if you
25 would like to donate a basket you could

1 contact her at 614-4342, and that's all.

2 MS. EVANS: Thank you. According to
3 Attorney Hayes, solicitor, the Civil Service
4 Commission has not authorized an entry level
5 examination for patrol officers in the
6 Scranton Police Department, however, a
7 promotional written exam for the rank of
8 corporal will be administered on Friday,
9 December 10, 2010, at Marywood University.

10 Mrs. Krake, counsel would like to
11 send a letter to Solicitor Hayes and Mayor
12 Doherty requesting an explanation for the
13 lack of authorization for an entry level
14 examination, particularly since CDBG funds
15 will be available for the hiring of
16 approximately ten officers. Does the mayor
17 intend to continue to understaff a police
18 presence in low to moderate income areas or
19 might he intend to transfer current police
20 officers to COM-D positions and service?
21 Please request a response on or before
22 November 24.

23 The Albright Memorial Library
24 presents the Little Red School House, an
25 American icon, with author Jonathan

1 Zimmerman on Thursday, November 18, from
2 6:30 to 8:30 p.m. in the periodicals room
3 located in the reference department of the
4 library. Jonathan Zimmerman is a professor
5 of education and history at NYU Steinhert
6 School, a former high school teacher and
7 author of four books. He is also the
8 recipient of NYU's distinguished teaching
9 award and a frequent contributor to national
10 newspapers and journals. For reservations
11 please call 348-3000 or register on-line at
12 www.Albright.org/events.

13 Finally, this Thursday, November 11,
14 Americans will celebrate Veteran's Day, a
15 time for remembrance and Thanksgiving for
16 all our servicemen and women, past and
17 present, living and deceased. We praise and
18 thank them and their families for their
19 tremendous sacrifices and we keep them close
20 in our thoughts, prayers and actions not
21 only on this solemn Veteran's Day, but every
22 day that we each enjoy the comforts of home
23 and the freedoms of this great nation. And
24 that's it.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: If I might add,

1 excuse me, Mrs. Evans, I mean, it would only
2 make economic sense to combine the testing
3 together since they have an arrangement with
4 Marywood University, that's how they used to
5 run the test, they would run several at the
6 same time.

7 MS. EVANS: And again, we were
8 informed by Mr. Martin, the President of the
9 FOP, that Chief Duffy had also requested the
10 administration of that examination and it --
11 it's just very curious as to why when we
12 have a shortage of police officers, when we
13 have a spike in crime, particularly juvenile
14 violent crime, when we have the funding set
15 aside we are not doing anything about it.
16 So again, you know, we would like an answer
17 to that. I gave you the date earlier, we
18 need that in November.

19 MS. KRAKE: FOURTH ORDER. CITIZENS'
20 PARTICIPATION.

21 MS. EVANS: Our first speaker this
22 evening is Mr. Bob Martin.

23 MR. MARTIN: Good evening, Council.
24 Bob Martin.

25 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

1 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

2 MR. MARTIN: I'm here, of course,
3 I'm sure everyone knows I'm here in light of
4 the Commonwealth Court decision and I'd like
5 to begin with some of the inaccuracies that
6 are represented in the media in terms of the
7 numbers. I know the numbers seem extremely
8 astonishing and outrageous to maybe some,
9 but the numbers of 44 percent is an
10 inaccurate representation. It's not 44
11 percent. The Commonwealth Court provided
12 provisions for those numbers. There is
13 significantly less, 36 percent. I know that
14 that still sounds like a very large number
15 to most everyone, and particularly to the
16 citizens of the Scranton because those
17 numbers, you know, those numbers represent
18 12 years. They don't represent just
19 something that happened on October 29. It
20 was a culmination of 12 years and I'm here
21 to make everyone understands that our
22 officers need not drop their heads at all.
23 Each officer, men and women in the Scranton
24 Police Department not only earned these wage
25 increases, but they deserve them.

1 About six or seven weeks ago I sat
2 in the courtroom and listened to the final
3 hours of a trial from probably one of the
4 most heinous crimes committed in the history
5 of this city. Randal Rushing received three
6 life sentences plus 42 to 84 sentence for
7 the murder that he committed, and what
8 brought that to swift and complete justice
9 was your Scranton Police Department. Your
10 police officers from the very beginning when
11 they walked in that first call came in the
12 morning, I received a call about quarter to
13 7:00 and started to respond, patrol officers
14 were already on scene and met at the door by
15 a woman that was in handcuffs that had been
16 bound by Mr. Rushing, and those first
17 initial officers, three officers, had to
18 enter the building, enter the home, go
19 through the carnage to ensure that the
20 survivors were -- remaining survivors were
21 safe.

22 People don't realize what the police
23 officers do, and it's all behind the scenes,
24 and we realize that and we accept that
25 responsibility and we don't want any

1 sympathy, we don't want anybody feeling
2 sorry for us, that's what we do and we know
3 that.

4 It continued and took hours upon
5 hours upon hours of investigative work to
6 bring that to the culmination that happened
7 about seven weeks ago. Diligent, dedicated,
8 hardworking police officers day in and day
9 out did not rest until they brought Randal
10 Rushing to justice for whatever -- I sat in
11 the courtroom and watched the faces, of the
12 victims, the families, the survivors, and
13 it's terrible.

14 And even more most recent about
15 three weeks ago I sat in the courtroom and
16 listened to the courtroom testimony under
17 oath of the officers and the firemen that
18 responded to Hyde Park Avenue, and another
19 heinous crime and I sat there and listened
20 to Firemen Cox choke back tears as he
21 described what he did when he arrived on
22 scene, and I listened to Patrolman Pat
23 Gilman choke back tears as he described to
24 the judge what he did when he arrived,
25 climbed the ladder, got on the roof, and

1 coaxed and coaxed, choking on bellows of
2 smoke coming out the window to grab Nigel
3 off that roof, and Mrs. Leary wouldn't
4 relent. She stayed in the window screaming
5 for two children left in that house.

6 If you sat and listened and
7 understood what these people do for a living
8 there wouldn't be this conflict. I just
9 can't stand aside and have people pick on
10 our police officers and firemen and say,
11 "This is a terrible, these pay raises are
12 atrocious."

13 They are not atrocious. What these
14 pay raises represent will receive and we
15 will only be catching up to what every other
16 police department, York, Wilkes-Barre,
17 Reading, Allentown, Bethlehem, we are now
18 where they were in 2008, and I just wanted
19 everybody to understand that we have done
20 all we could to negotiate a reasonable
21 settlement, and to that I have to explain to
22 my members that we are going to take an 8
23 percent, the Commonwealth Court struck our
24 first pay raise, you know why? Because we
25 spent three months in 2008 trying to

1 negotiate a settlement with the city and we
2 are going to lose that, and we know that and
3 we recognize that, but we tried and it's
4 going to cost us a pay raise, a very
5 substantial pay raise.

6 And I just -- I just hope everyone
7 understands and just going forward some of
8 the comments that you made, President Evans,
9 is that we on the cusp, we are right on the
10 brink. Mayor Doherty has made a decision to
11 hire a very highly capable, highly
12 motivated, highly mission oriented
13 individual Chief Duffy. And I can only
14 think in the back of my mind he's a little
15 Dutch boy standing there with the finger in
16 the dike.

17 To hobble him by not giving him the
18 proper tools to move this department forward
19 and to protect the citizens, and he is truly
20 one of the first individuals that really,
21 really in his heart has the safety and
22 well-being of the citizens of this city in
23 mind. I don't see any of the other style, I
24 don't see any off the other rustling behind
25 the scenes from him. I see true dedication,

1 but without the proper tools, without enough
2 officers to put on the street that comment
3 that he made, the request that he sent, that
4 came from a meeting, we sat in a staff
5 meeting and we argued, shift commanders
6 argued over who was going to get the most
7 personnel.

8 The afternoon shift, they get no
9 rest at all. It's relentless. Call after
10 call after call. They're backed up by the
11 time they sit down in roll call. This
12 afternoon before I walked out of the
13 building an officer walked in and probably
14 ten minutes ahead of his shift he never got
15 to sit for roll call. Boom, he is out on
16 the road, and that happens every day and it
17 never ends. And in light of even the wage
18 increases, I liken our job to shoveling
19 water out of the ocean. It just never
20 stops.

21 But to be continually under this
22 labor pressure, I mean, we are thankful and
23 we're hopeful that the city -- we understand
24 the city is going to appeal, we are going to
25 cross appeal, the litigation is going to go

1 on, however, the stay has expired. The stay
2 for the wage increases expired the day the
3 Commonwealth Court handed down the decision.

4 So at least we can move forward from
5 there and we'll live with that, whatever
6 else comes down the road if they continue --
7 but again, the interest is going to continue
8 to compile, and I guess the one statement --
9 the one statement that I want to make, and I
10 don't know if everybody understands, and you
11 are free to ask questions is that without a
12 negotiated settlement, without a negotiated
13 settlement this distressed status being Act
14 37, the super brains in DCED and PEL, it's
15 only a temporary fix. It's only a temporary
16 fix without a negotiated settlement. The
17 only way we can make a permanent financial
18 stable situation in terms of our labor
19 contracts, the public safety employees, is
20 with a negotiated settlement because it's
21 just going to come back later. I don't know
22 if anybody knows that, but that's the --

23 MS. EVANS: I agree.

24 MR. MARTIN: That's the way it's
25 going to be.

1 MR. LOSCOMBE: Mr. Martin, can I
2 just ask you a quick question? Would you be
3 able to address a statement that was made in
4 "Go Lackawanna" which stated "They were
5 offered many raises over the years and they
6 turned them down, Doherty said."

7 I know you explained this prior on
8 handshake deals and stuff, but we you see
9 something like this in the newspaper they
10 are not getting the whole --

11 MR. MARTIN: We had three negotiated
12 settlements, at the very least three. The
13 very last was at the University of Scranton
14 and there was one at the University of
15 Scranton just prior to that, the year -- the
16 summer before that, actually went and ran
17 into the fall and into November 2008. That
18 was a negotiated settlement and the numbers
19 there with 30 percent. We were just Court
20 awarded 36 percent.

21 And also, as they said at the table,
22 as Attorney Jennings said at the table that
23 we agreed in that handshake we agreed to a 2
24 1/2 percent employee contribution to a
25 second year patrolman. Now, to explain that

1 we would pay and make contribution to our
2 health care at the rate of 2 1/2 percent
3 that of a second year patrolman, just what
4 they proposed about five or of weeks ago.

5 We made that same offer, we shook
6 hands on that same offer at the University
7 of Scranton, and then they come back now a
8 year and a half later and say, oh, let's
9 take a percentage, and those numbers were
10 significant and there was other negotiations
11 where their numbers were down as low as 27
12 or 28 percent, and I know that -- I know
13 that the members that I represent would have
14 accepted that. We didn't turn them down,
15 they are the ones that turned them down.

16 Those are -- they speak of the
17 management rights in the newspaper, I mean,
18 and the numbers that are being kicked
19 around, and I don't know how accurate they
20 are, but they are probably relatively close
21 to 10 million dollars. That's a lot of
22 money to pay for some management rights that
23 they already have. They don't really -- the
24 management rights that they are discussing
25 and talking about don't have any real

1 fiduciary credibility to them. I mean,
2 there is just -- some of them are senseless.
3 I could pick out a half a dozen things in
4 our contract that could probably save double
5 what they are asking for, but they have a
6 different agenda and the agenda is being
7 driven by DCED and PEL. They are leading
8 us, this city down the path of financial
9 disaster because they are the ones that
10 refuse to take those -- accept those offers
11 that we have. Those two -- those three
12 settlements. Those are the ones that they
13 came in at the end and they said, "No. No
14 deal. We got to have this."

15 I don't know what else to say. All
16 I'm going to say is that I don't want my
17 members that I represent they don't have to
18 apologize for this. We have made every
19 possibly effort and they earned and they
20 deserve these pay raises. They work hard
21 and they work hard every day and we won't
22 apologize for any of this at least in this
23 for the Court award. It could have been
24 fixed.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: I believe if the

1 public watched the caucus two meetings ago
2 they would definitely understand. I agree
3 with you 100 percent. They were made aware,
4 they were made aware over several years by
5 the police and fire departments what was
6 going on and what's going to happen and
7 that's all I can say. I mean, they saw it
8 here, if they listened to Attorney Jennings
9 that was black and white, that was reality
10 and that's what we have to deal with.

11 MR. MARTIN: Well, I just hope that
12 we -- the rumors were abound the other night
13 just before our union meeting we got rumors
14 that there were going to be layoffs in the
15 police department, I don't know, I hope that
16 they were just -- they were just
17 intimidation tactics because in a practical
18 sense it doesn't even make sense. We can't
19 even begin to just barely do what we are
20 doing now. We need those additional
21 officers now, not a cut, not even for a
22 short period of time.

23 Again, we are right on the cusp, and
24 I tell you just wake up tomorrow morning and
25 listen to your TV, listen to what's going on

1 in Wilkes-Barre, shootings, stabbings. We
2 have our share, but pay attention, pay close
3 attention to what's going on Williamsport.
4 About ten -- a little better than ten years
5 ago Wilkes-Barre cut their police department
6 down to less than 60 men and then once that
7 criminal element gets in and puts a root in
8 it's almost impossible to get rid of it, and
9 that's a very much eminent threat is the
10 drug culture that we work against every day
11 and Chief Duffy that's his primary -- that's
12 his forte and he works hard at that and he
13 knows and he understands that once that's
14 rooted and it's established in this city
15 they run. They are running from us now, but
16 I'm here to tell you without the proper
17 tools it's not going to happen. We have
18 these threats every day.

19 Again, I don't think that only
20 applies to New York City. I hope you don't
21 think that only applies to Philadelphia.
22 That applies here. Last Friday night I was
23 called to Tobyhanna on a bomb call.
24 Packages that tested positive for TNT.
25 These things are going to happen and the

1 last thing you want to do is send an
2 advertisement to the world and to Al Qaeda
3 and to the drug culture and say, "We are
4 going to lay off officers. We are going to
5 cut our police force," because all you're
6 doing is putting up a neon sign pointing an
7 arrow right to Scranton.

8 The mayor of Trenton yesterday he
9 got state sanctioned cuts to cut 111
10 officers and he stepped up to the podium and
11 he said, "It's not going to happen."

12 They had a whole program all worked
13 out, there was 111 policemen going to go, I
14 think 100 and some firemen were going to go,
15 and he stepped up and he said, "Policemen
16 are not going to go because all we are doing
17 is we're opening the flood gates that we
18 will never be able to shut."

19 MR. JOYCE: Mr. Martin, I just want
20 to say that I agree with you that even in
21 the toughest of financial times that the
22 city is facing now the last thing that
23 people can afford to lose is public safety
24 because once the crime starts going up, once
25 the drugs start coming in, what happens?

1 People leave and they go somewhere else and
2 then they leave the city.

3 MR. MARTIN: And we lose that --

4 MR. JOYCE: And that brings down our
5 revenue base in time, so I do want to say
6 that I agree with you.

7 MR. MARTIN: I know that it's public
8 safety and I know it's tough, it's hard,
9 it's hard all over the country. I hear it
10 all over the country, the public safety
11 issue. I mean, think Hyde Park Avenue two
12 minute response, two minute fire response
13 and Firemen Koch got on the roof. Patrolman
14 Gilman was done. He didn't have the proper
15 equipment, couldn't work, couldn't work in
16 it and he felt terrible.

17 Those things they're so critical
18 they can't be sacrificed.

19 MR. LOSCOMBE: When I was appointed
20 one of my promises was the commitment to
21 provide the proper tools to all of the
22 departments in the city and I stand by that
23 and I know just what you are saying, and I
24 have had several meeting with Chief Duffy
25 and I agree 1,000 percent with your

1 perception of Chief Duffy, too. I mentioned
2 that he is focused, he is looking at -- but
3 he needs the tools.

4 MR. MARTIN: Yes, he does.

5 MR. LOSCOMBE: Just like you, you
6 need the manpower and the tools. You know,
7 this is what people in this town are paying
8 their taxes for, the services that are
9 provided. Unfortunately, you know, through
10 the years negotiations could have been
11 handled better, they could have been --
12 there could have been better negotiations,
13 but it just seems like this administration
14 just thumbs it's nose and appeals everything
15 and they are just prolonging the inevitable
16 and it's costing us, the taxpayers.

17 And you can -- you will see in the
18 media as time goes on it will be blamed
19 again our problems where they blame them all
20 of these years, yet for nine years the
21 police and fire department specifically
22 haven't had a penny increase in the budget.
23 Where has all of the money gone? How could
24 they blame them?

25 I might be a little biased because I

1 was a firefighter at one time, but I do have
2 the sense of public safety and I live in the
3 neighborhood that requires more public
4 safety than anything, it's a little more
5 excluded and, you know, fire response is
6 very important, but I do believe that the
7 people in this city have read enough stories
8 in the newspaper to know what the truth is
9 now, they have seen it live here, they have
10 heard the gentleman from the different
11 departments come here over the past several
12 years and I know Mr. Martin doesn't want to
13 say, you know, "I told you so," but that's
14 exactly what's happened.

15 We have a heavy task ahead of us to
16 try and work on a budget that's going to
17 provide all of this and, trust me, we are
18 going to provide you with the public safety
19 that you deserve. That's our utmost goal.
20 It's going to be a heavy task, but we have
21 been looking forward to it from day one.
22 You remember we fought in Court last year to
23 try and save a little money to put aside
24 because we knew these awards were going to
25 be coming down the pike, but we are defeated

1 in that, so we are that much farther behind.

2 But we have a lot of good people out
3 there, a lot of good city employees, and I
4 just hear to tell you I'm standing with you
5 I will do what I can to provide you with the
6 tools.

7 MR. ROGAN: I would just like to
8 echo on Councilman Loscombe and Councilman
9 Joyce and Councilwoman Evans said, I firmly
10 believe that if government is only going to
11 do one thing and one thing only that is the
12 government has to keep people safe, and
13 that's the most important thing. And while
14 campaigning and going through the
15 neighborhoods people said exactly what you
16 mentioned about Wilkes-Barre. They said
17 they do not want Scranton to become like
18 Wilkes-Barre because every day when you turn
19 on the news a shooting, a stabbing and it's
20 all drug related.

21 And when I met with Chief Duffy a
22 few weeks ago he really did seem committed
23 to cracking down on the drugs in Scranton
24 and, you know, I had a list of requests from
25 myself and other members of the council and,

1 you know, as soon as I mentioned it to him
2 he said, "Oh, I'm already working on it."

3 He really seems on the ball and we
4 need more officers on the streets and when
5 you go to -- I go to the neighborhood
6 organizations that's what they ask for, they
7 ask for more police officers on the streets
8 because it's just the presence alone. When
9 criminals see police everywhere they go they
10 are not going to stay here, they will go
11 somewhere else, and that's -- we don't want
12 them in Scranton. We need our neighborhoods
13 to stay safe, and they are relatively safe,
14 but you can see where -- which way the trend
15 is going and crime is moving up from
16 Philadelphia, Allentown, Hazelton up to
17 Wilkes-Barre and, you know the next stop in
18 line is Scranton.

19 MR. MARTIN: Right.

20 MR. ROGAN: And we have to stop them
21 from coming here.

22 MR. MARTIN: They look for the
23 weakest, and we have interrogated prisoners
24 that told us they actually waited for Chief
25 Duffy to take a day off before they came to

1 Scranton. I can tell you he is mission
2 oriented and he is not going to let us down,
3 but he still have has to have the proper
4 tools to be able to function properly and
5 carry that job off.

6 MS. EVANS: Well, thank you, Mr.
7 Martin.

8 MR. MARTIN: Thank you. I'm sorry I
9 ran over my time.

10 MS. EVANS: In the interest of time
11 I'll hold my comments -- in the interest of
12 time I'm going to hold my comments until
13 motions. Our next speaker is Andy
14 Sbaraglia.

15 MR. SBARAGLIA: Andy Sbaraglia,
16 citizen of Scranton. Fellow Scrantonians, I
17 have been hearing this problem for the last
18 eight years -- no, probably nine years. You
19 mentioned -- you mentioned 10 million, I can
20 understand that, that the firemen and
21 policemen haven't got a raise, haven't got
22 raise on the budget, but they all had gotten
23 longevity pay. That was pointed out by
24 Mrs. Fanucci that you did get your longevity
25 pay, but that's beside the point.

1 The point is we have lawsuits coming
2 down, 10 million. How are we going to come
3 up with 10 million? Not only that, that's
4 only one. He was talking about the stream
5 Court, another millions and millions. Now
6 we are talking about almost a quarter of the
7 budget just going out on these things. I
8 don't know if we can prorate them out over a
9 period of time or we have to come up with
10 the money all at once. If we do, we are in
11 trouble. Deep, deep trouble.

12 You never mentioned how much the two
13 policewomen got from the city from that deal
14 with our old police chief. I don't know why
15 nobody ever mentioned the dollar amount.
16 That should have been of interest to the
17 people, not that they are against it, I
18 probably would have sued, too.

19 MR. ROGAN: Mr. Sbaraglia, I
20 actually have that on my sheet, it was a
21 request to Mr. Renda asking how much that
22 cost the city.

23 MR. SBARAGLIA: Because that's
24 interesting, too, because that really didn't
25 have to happen. I mean, certain things

1 happen because of stubbornness, you all know
2 the reason for all of the shenanigans was
3 they wanted control over the fire department
4 and the police department, the manning they
5 could do whatever they want with that
6 department. We all know that. We all know
7 that a lot of these arbitrations were that
8 the firemen and the policemen didn't want
9 that.

10 So we are here today with something
11 I don't know what we are going to do because
12 we will never come up with that kind of
13 money without raising taxes. Where else are
14 we going to get it? You can only borrow so
15 much more and we are pretty much up in debt
16 on the borrowing. I don't envy you. I
17 really don't because people are going to
18 blame you for whatever taxes go up because
19 that's all they got to blame is you, and you
20 are going to take it on the chin for what
21 you had no fault in doing.

22 It was a dictatorship, I told you a
23 long time ago. He wanted a dictatorship in
24 Scranton. He wanted everything what he
25 wanted and that's what he tried to do. He

1 tried to ram what he wanted down everyone
2 else's throat and here we are going to pay
3 for this.

4 Like I said, I don't quite
5 understand the people of Scranton really how
6 they can look at what was happening and
7 close their eyes at election time. I don't
8 understand it, I never will. I support the
9 people of Scranton and I always did, but I
10 still don't understand how they can do that
11 and they knew what was happening.

12 And the same thing when they come
13 out with that they are going to pass, you
14 know, we voted on it, the Recovery Plan.
15 That Recovery Plan was passed because he
16 said if you don't pass the Recovery Plan
17 they would have to raise taxes. That's what
18 was said, and the truth is where he did
19 raise taxes, but now we are at a point where
20 we are going to have to raise taxes whether
21 we want to or not. There is only so much
22 you can do with that budget.

23 And as far as the audit goes, I have
24 been sitting here for a long, long time and
25 that audit was never made and the reason why

1 it was this department, that department,
2 this authority, that authority, and there
3 was a whole bunch of things where you said
4 they never got the information. In fact, I
5 think one time they said we guessed at some
6 of the stuff when you got the audit because
7 the information never came by the time it
8 come in.

9 So this is where we stand today our
10 audit is not going be up-to-date, the
11 revenue sources are not going to be up to
12 where they should be, and I tell you one
13 thing the people are very dissatisfied with
14 the parking fees. They are. They are not
15 happy with spending a dollar for an hour
16 parking at our meters and then turn around
17 and know that the Connell bidding and the
18 hotel got cart blanche parking, and they are
19 paying for it and that's a sad thing.

20 People have nothing to do with the
21 Connell building or the hotel, but yet we
22 have to pay a higher parking fee because of
23 them, and you also know our parking revenue
24 is mortgaged to the bank. That was done,
25 oh, maybe two councils ago when they passed

1 it for all of these streets, so where are we
2 going? Really. We are like lost children
3 in the world today. I'm sorry this
4 happened. Thank you.

5 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Ozzie Quinn.

6 MR. QUINN: Ozzie Quinn, Taxpayers'
7 Association. Good evening.

8 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

9 MR. QUINN: I want to pick up where
10 we were talking about the budget, in the
11 proposed PEL budget they have a deficit of
12 7.1 million for 2011, if you recall when
13 Mr. Doherty took over it was a 2.9 surplus
14 and now we are going into a 7.1 deficit.
15 That's on page two of the Recovery Plan as
16 proposed by PEL.

17 On page eight they have the interest
18 and debt service, that's without the TANS
19 and coincidentally it's the same thing, 7.1
20 million dollars, so that is indicative of
21 the debt that Mr. Doherty has placed upon
22 the taxpayers of the City of Scranton. If
23 we didn't have that debt, \$7.1 million that
24 we have to pay back we probably would have a
25 balanced budget, it's as simple as that.

1 But now he is spending and spending and
2 spending and the way the situation now, as
3 you know the economy, the real estate and
4 the real estate revenue that you are going
5 to be coming in in 2011 I would anticipate
6 that a lot of people are not going to be
7 able to pay their real estate taxes, and I
8 don't know if that revenue is going to be
9 there as projected, so with that in mind the
10 Taxpayers' Association, as the president, I
11 would like to recommend something, if we
12 could possibly, and I would be remiss if I
13 just sat here and moaned about what's going
14 on if I didn't have a remedy, and the remedy
15 is this here, I researched this, all right,
16 and I researched it with infrastructure
17 groups throughout the United States, all
18 right, and as Andy said the Parking
19 Authority, you know, had to make loans to
20 pay off the debt service, you know? They
21 are an albatross around our neck, you know?

22 So what I researched, and I would
23 like to have a caucus with a group of our
24 Taxpayers' Association with the council and
25 if we could bring in an infrastructure group

1 personnel to possibly lease the three
2 parking garages. The City of Harrisburg is
3 now in a situation where they are having a
4 study done to see how much money they could
5 bring in. I know Pittsburgh is now
6 compromising, the mayor wanted it and the
7 council didn't, and now they are
8 compromising as of today to bring that in,
9 also.

10 But I was told today that literally
11 there is thousands of municipalities that --
12 ways of looking at revenue is through
13 leasing their parking garages, and I can't
14 see any other way. We haven't got anything
15 from the nonprofits that puts a dent into
16 what we are doing and we will not put a dent
17 in that debt, okay, or the deficit. The
18 only way is to find more revenue and cut the
19 fat, no doubt about it, you know?

20 And you know, like I said, I would
21 be remiss if I didn't bring this up in
22 regards to possibly finding a solution. I
23 would like to possibly if we can consider
24 meeting with a couple of us from the
25 Taxpayers' group and discuss this and I

1 would like to have someone come in and
2 explain the process of what is done to
3 actually lease these parking garages. All
4 they are doing now is perpetrating salaries,
5 that's all they are doing, and I think it's
6 a good source of way of gaining revenue.

7 Harrisburg, of course, they have
8 nine garages and they are looking at \$215
9 million as revenue to lease these garages.
10 So I would appreciate it, Mrs. Evans, if you
11 would consider that?

12 MS. EVANS: Yes. In fact, I'm sure
13 you are aware, I brought the idea before PEL
14 quite awhile back of leasing Scranton
15 parking garages and though they seem to
16 agree that it can be a solution they didn't
17 feel that it was something that could occur
18 very quickly, that it would take a number of
19 years, and I do understand that in
20 Pittsburgh it was a multi-year process that
21 the mayor of Pittsburgh initiated, and I
22 understand what you are saying, yes, council
23 had turned it down, but now council is faced
24 with a state takeover of their pension fund
25 and now they are willing to do something

1 with those garages and that is something
2 that we should be doing, so we will make
3 arrangements for that.

4 MR. QUINN: Fine. Fine. Appreciate
5 that very much. As a matter of fact, the
6 person from Harrisburg, Victor Hughes, I was
7 talking to today on the status of the
8 Harrisburg garages and he told me that right
9 now the new study to see how much income and
10 how much, you know -- the pluses and minus
11 of it and he told me that PEL is in there
12 now trying to negotiate them to go to a
13 distressed city, and I says, "My, God," and
14 I says, "Please call someone in Scranton
15 fast before you get yourself into a bind."

16 And when I told him that we were in
17 distress since 1992, he says, "What?"

18 He couldn't believe it. But he is
19 going to get back us, I think on that one.

20 The second thing is you were talking
21 about the UDAG, Mrs. Krake, and you said how
22 much is in the -- Mr. Doherty's stash on
23 UDAG repayments, do you know?

24 MS. KRAKE: The amount that Ms.
25 Aebli told us was in the account was just

1 over \$4,000.

2 MR. QUINN: On repayments for
3 millions of dollars?

4 MS. KRAKE: Unfortunately, her
5 answer is very vague.

6 MR. QUINN: Well, I recall last year
7 or the year before the former majority of
8 city council voted to give Mr. Doherty a
9 cart blanch ticket to use that stash, that
10 UDAG repayment money, for whatever projects
11 he wanted to without coming back to council
12 and I was hoping to come to council tonight
13 and I was hoping to look at -- hopefully I
14 was going to find a higher figure because I
15 thought that, you know, maybe we could be a
16 little bit ultraistic here and use some of
17 that UDAG money for some home repairs for
18 low income people or for some food pantries,
19 you know, but \$4,000 that doesn't seem
20 realistic, you know? Okay.

21 MS. EVANS: I agree. We are going
22 to be looking into that much more closely.

23 MR. QUINN: Thank you very much.

24 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Bill
25 Jackowitz.

1 MR. JACKOWITZ: Good evening, city
2 council. Bill Jackowitz, South Scranton
3 resident, member of the Taxpayers'
4 Association.

5 MS. EVANS: Good evening.

6 MR. JACKOWITZ: First of all, the
7 primary function of any elected official is
8 for the safety and the protection of their
9 citizens, and I don't think that's happening
10 here in Scranton.

11 Okay, Scranton Times' article 9
12 August and 10 August. January to August of
13 2009, the parking meter revenues
14 \$476,610.23. By comparison, 2010 parking
15 meter revenues January to August 2010,
16 \$608,944.00 for an increase of \$132,334.23.

17 January 2010 the parking rates were
18 increased from 25 cents per half hour to 50
19 cents per half hour for a 100 percent
20 increase in parking rates. Also, parking
21 fines were increased 100 percent from \$10 to
22 \$20. Just using the parking meters as an
23 example, the revenue should have doubled
24 because the meters rates doubled, which they
25 did not. So the revenue that should have

1 been generated should have been \$853,220.46.
2 So as you can see by these figures less
3 people are parking downtown and not more.

4 Furthermore, how much taxpayer money
5 was spent to install the parking meters
6 adjacent to the Chamberlain plant? To my
7 knowledge the parking meters have generated
8 a grand total of \$1 in revenue. Again,
9 another example of poor decision making by
10 Scranton elected and appointed officials.

11 Now they want to talk about parking
12 permits in the neighborhoods to park in
13 front of your home own. I would like to
14 suggest that we place parking meters in
15 every restaurant parking lot within the city
16 limits considering that the number one
17 business within city limits are restaurants.
18 Substantial revenue could be generated by
19 putting parking meters in restaurant parking
20 lots.

21 Latest unemployment figures,
22 Scranton/Wilkes-Barre/Hazleton again has the
23 highest unemployment in the state, 9.9
24 percent. When will it end? We know that
25 this is not an accurate -- we know this is

1 not inaccurate. There are more unemployed
2 workers in the area than 9.9 percent they
3 just no longer are counted.

4 What is the latest news on the 500
5 block of Lackawanna Avenue? I see where
6 they are still are no tenants and Molly
7 Brannigan's is still vacant. I see where
8 the Coney Island building is currently
9 occupied by a church. Funny, did the City
10 of Scranton try not to take over Coney
11 Island eminent domain? Although the tenant
12 probably will not be paying taxes as a
13 church, at least somebody moved into the 500
14 block of Lackawanna Avenue. When can the
15 taxpayers expect the remaining buildings to
16 be occupied? This year I hope.

17 Where is the developer, Mr. Rinaldi?
18 When will he be invited to attend a caucus
19 again? He been a no-show. I would like to
20 hear his answers and I'm sure other citizens
21 would also like to hear.

22 Forbe's magazines rates worst cities
23 for jobs this fall. A real nice picture of
24 the vacant 500 block of Lackawanna Avenue is
25 featured in the article. "Extreme

1 uncertainty in state government may result
2 in thousand of city and municipal jobs and
3 the city and state are both seeking federal
4 aid."

5 What city are they speaking about?

6 A manpower and employment service firm asked
7 more than 18,000 employers in 50 states and
8 100 metropolitan areas how you anticipate
9 total employment at your location to change
10 in the three months to the end of December
11 2010 as compared to the current quarter.

12 Using the data that resulted

13 Manpower conducted a quarterly assessment of
14 employment outlook across the United States,
15 whereas in 2009 employers expressed
16 pessimistic hiring across the board, 2010
17 has brought four straight quarters of a
18 generally positive outlook.

19 Here are the cities that have the
20 worst hiring outlook of all: Scranton,
21 Pennsylvania, minus two. Not a very good
22 outlook. Right from the top ten worst
23 cities to find a job. Now you have the
24 answers. They were talking about Scranton,
25 Pennsylvania. You can find this information

1 at Comcast.net/finance.

2 Scranton audit nearly six months
3 past due charter date. Where is the story?
4 This happens every year in Scranton. Again,
5 taxpayers never get a break, but then again
6 we pay high wages to political appointees
7 because we only hire the best, although
8 qualifications do not matter, a quote from a
9 past city council president.

10 Finally, how much will it cost
11 Scranton taxpayers in the latest lawsuit
12 brought against the city and police athletic
13 league for the skateboard park in West
14 Scranton for failure to pay contractors?
15 Again, citizens loss.

16 And finally, I would like to remind
17 everyone that Thursday is Veteran's Day.
18 There will be a Veteran's ceremony, the
19 annual Veteran's Day ceremony starts at
20 10:30 a.m. at Lackawanna County Courthouse
21 for the flag raising ceremony, at 11:00 the
22 ceremony itself actually starts. I would
23 like to see as many people attend this
24 Veteran's Day ceremony on Thursday,
25 especially those of you who get the day off

1 because of the veterans who gave their lives
2 and their freedoms to go out and protect
3 your lives and your freedom. So, please,
4 attend the ceremony at 10:30 a.m. or at
5 least 11:00 on Thursday. Thank you.

6 MS. EVANS: Thank you,
7 Mr. Jackowitz.

8 MR. JOYCE: Mr. Jackowitz, I just
9 wanted to explain, unfortunately, I cannot
10 attend the ceremony this Thursday, I will be
11 working at that time, but if I did have the
12 day off I would be there.

13 To comment on some of the issues you
14 raised about jobs I just wanted to bring up
15 a fact. Recently council received
16 information from PEL and in 2007 the United
17 States Economic Census identified 1,482
18 businesses establishments within the City of
19 Scranton. These companies employed 29,700
20 employees. In the 2000 census it was
21 identified that \$41,764 individuals worked
22 inside of the City of Scranton, so we could
23 obviously see that there has been a job loss
24 here over the duration of time.

25 MR. JACKOWITZ: Well, we made the

1 top ten.

2 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Ron Ellman.

3 MR. ELLMAN: Council, Ronnie Ellman,
4 member of the Taxpayers' Association. I'd
5 like to make a comment or two about that
6 election. I think Mr. Kanjorski's speech,
7 his statement when he lost was very good.
8 It made me think a little more highly of him
9 because I didn't vote for him and this Mike
10 LaPolla that ran I met several times, he's a
11 very good man and I hope a young person like
12 him stays in politics.

13 That brings me down to Mr. Blake.
14 To me, Mr. Blake has just no credibility and
15 no integrity taking that belated bribe,
16 that's all it was. It was a thank you from
17 Mr. Boscov. It was shameful. And I knew
18 about it the day before or two weeks ago at
19 the meeting, it's time to Mr. Boscov paid
20 the city and the taxpayers of the state some
21 money back and quit -- he makes Paul Sorvino
22 look like an amateur with 500,000. Both of
23 these men to me they are just a show of
24 blatant -- just arrogance and just
25 deliberate indifference to the people of the

1 city or the state that supported them.

2 Oh, my. You know, I voted for Frank
3 Savvo. I think he can run circles around
4 Mr. Blake and he is an honest man besides.
5 I can't understand Mr. Blake is the kind of
6 person going back to Harrisburg that
7 Mr. Corbett and the FBI is trying to rid the
8 place of. Now, I hope he answers me.
9 Somebody told me he might that I was talking
10 to.

11 And I have heard a bunch of people
12 whining about Mr. Marino and Mr. Carney
13 losing, it's going to come out sooner or
14 later Mr. Marino didn't use nearly the
15 ammunition he had on Mr. Carney, and I would
16 have personally.

17 And, Mr. Hughes, I wanted to say
18 this last time, I was told by a member that
19 they loss their nonprofit status, but if
20 they didn't I'm certainly appreciative of
21 them paying taxes when they don't have to,
22 but the last couple of years they haven't
23 paid them, you can check yourself, that's
24 what I was -- I know that, but I think
25 it's -- I wish we could get -- squeeze some

1 money out of everybody like that.

2 You know, in today's paper, the
3 university -- the medical school bought
4 nine -- well, eight properties, isn't it?
5 Eight properties for \$425,000. They don't
6 have any plans to build right now, but that
7 property nobody else can buy it, it's gone
8 forever. This is going to be a ghost town
9 and they are going to start fulfilling their
10 promise of taking an acre of houses away.
11 It's senseless to allow them. It's just
12 like Mr. Mansour sitting there for 13 years
13 not paying any taxes on any of that property
14 he got.

15 There's no way the city can survive.
16 It's just impossible. I don't know. Nobody
17 seems to listen or care anyway anymore. I
18 think that people in this city are just
19 getting beaten down like the political
20 people want. You know that in just less
21 than a year the University, the medical
22 school and Marywood have taken millions of
23 dollars in property off that would pay the
24 mayor's salary and all five of your salaries
25 in less than a year. That means that

1 taxpayers had to make this up somehow or are
2 going to. Where is -- you know, I said this
3 20 times where are we supposed to get the
4 money? It just -- it's just terrible. A
5 bunch of greedy parasites in these schools.
6 They are a bunch of phoney nonprofits.

7 And I'd like to say one thing before
8 I go, I'm ready to go. I see on the news
9 these people in Haiti living in makeshift
10 tents, we collected I heard \$800 million,
11 where is this money? This is terrible for
12 the -- the American people are just chumps.
13 I gave some money, not a whole lot, but I
14 didn't give it for the Red Cross to keep in
15 a bank account. I gave it for those people
16 to have something, and that's what American
17 people and people all over the world did and
18 all you see is continuously nothing has been
19 done over there. There is big pieces of
20 concrete and crushed cars and diseases, you
21 know, it just makes you -- next time
22 somebody needs something you won't help
23 them.

24 You know, like I said, the Red Cross
25 says their money is in the bank they are

1 waiting for something. I heard that on one
2 of the news programs. Well, I don't know
3 what they are waiting for when people are
4 just over there, there is 400 of them dying
5 a day from Cholera, it's just terrible.
6 Anyway, thank you.

7 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. Anyone else
8 who would like address council?
9 Mr. Dobrzyn.

10 MR. DOBRZYN: Good evening, Council.
11 Dave Dobrzyn, member of the Taxpayers',
12 resident of Scranton.

13 MR. JOYCE: Good evening.

14 MR. DOBRZYN: Okay, I'm also
15 concerned about these audits and it's only
16 my personal opinion as a citizen, but I
17 think if somebody can't turn in an audit
18 within 30 days late they have no business
19 being a department head, and I don't care
20 what the reason is. They have to be able to
21 run their department and supervise and they
22 have to know how the money is being spent
23 and where it's going and they should start
24 right now preparing the audit for next year
25 because every year it's like this and it's

1 not council's fault, it's only your fault
2 when you say, "Well, that's okay."

3 So if you don't do anything about it
4 some day it will be your fault. This is
5 your first year, so -- but personally I
6 think if I -- I worked all my life in the
7 private sector and if I didn't get a job
8 done on time I heard about it and if I
9 didn't get enough jobs done on time I got
10 told I was no longer a necessary fixture.

11 And it's really ashame, these
12 parking fees are a real problem for downtown
13 people, I have -- like I mentioned buy
14 clothes and stuff downtown and they are not
15 happy with it. You have to have too many
16 quarters, it's not even the money, you have
17 to have too many quarters. In the case of
18 down there on Mattes Avenue, yeah, maybe we
19 should sell them a permit and charge them a
20 seriously reduced fee because nobody is
21 parking down there. They are parking in all
22 of the neighborhoods.

23 And Ozzie also mentioned something
24 these buildings that are being torn down for
25 the developers, it would be interesting to

1 know whether -- who is paying for that, is
2 it the city or is it the developer, and it
3 would be very interesting. It's almost like
4 handing somebody free money if they
5 are owning these properties and having them
6 torn down at city's expense.

7 And okay, before the election we did
8 several interviews and forums with
9 candidates and I'd like to at least thank
10 ECTV, too, for listing the times. I put the
11 television on and the times were on that
12 they were to be played and I feel that they
13 deserve a little bit of thanks there, it's a
14 considerable advantage for somebody that
15 turned the television on and know they can
16 watch something or opt out, whatever, but
17 they don't have to watch it all day to see
18 what times something is on.

19 And now, we had our second rock --
20 or music concert for WFT at the Irish Wolf.
21 I would like to thank those people on Linden
22 Street for providing the place, we provide
23 the music, we get volunteers and the next
24 one will be at Magnotta's -- or Heil's. I'm
25 still thinking 40 years ago, that shows how

1 senile I'm getting, Heil's Place in the
2 Sunday after this Sunday, next Sunday.

3 And then the golden parrot goes to
4 Antonio Scalia and Justice Thomas for
5 attending junkets thrown by the US Chamber
6 of Commerce we complained about no jobs,
7 well, they are actually providing --
8 providing seminars on how to outsource your
9 employment to other countries, so please
10 consider retirement. Thank you and have a
11 good night.

12 MR. LOSCOMBE: Thank you.

13 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. You, too.

14 MR. LOSCOMBE: Chrissy.

15 MR. SLEDENZSKI: Jackie. Well,
16 Jack, what do you think this week, Buddy?
17 The playoffs start this week. We got to win
18 this one, Jack, you know, we're done, Buddy,
19 you know that?

20 MR. LOSCOMBE: Should we call McGoin
21 back in?

22 MR. SLEDENZSKI: You know something,
23 Jack, he is the best quarterback in the
24 league. Everybody remembers that, too.

25 MR. LOSCOMBE: Definitely.

1 MR. SLEDENZSKI: And he is a good
2 kid. I wish him luck at Penn State and good
3 career. Guys, let's win this game and bring
4 it back to Scranton where it belongs. Thank
5 you.

6 MR. LOSCOMBE: Keep your spikes.

7 MR. SLEDENZSKI: I will, Jack.

8 MS. HUMPHRIES: I want to put this
9 by Mr. Loscombe because he worked in the
10 fire department, I don't know, you have to
11 bring it down here. This the hard and it's
12 emotional for me. You know, President
13 Kennedy says don't ask what your country can
14 do for you, but what you can do for your
15 country. A lot of times I came here
16 frazzled, I spoke my truth.

17 I want to Honor and send my
18 condolences out to the boy who died on
19 Sunday. My heart is with him and I'm going
20 to read some names, if I could see, my sugar
21 gets a little high. Marina Ambrosia, the
22 Air Force; Leanne Matisko, the Navy; Michael
23 I, the Army; Michael II and III, the Air
24 Force; James Matisko, the Army; Gale, she is
25 deceased she died three weeks before her

1 marriage, the Air Force; Joseph Vadella, I,
2 he fought December 7, and his son and Gail
3 and Joseph, they served in the Air Force,
4 Vaddellas. Patrick Vadella, Carmen served at
5 the battle of the bulge. Anthony, they were
6 all double purple hearts. Dominic Paul
7 Vadella, Angelo, Ronnie Matisko, of the Air
8 Force, Henry Matisko, George Matisko, Father
9 McDonnelly and all of the chaplains. I send
10 my thank you, my heartfelt for serving the
11 country. James Rasalovitch he died, he
12 asked me to marry him again, by helicopter.

13 Three nurses were killed and they
14 are honoring one of the them of the many at
15 Melrose. I forgot what day it is, I am
16 going to have to check so we could bring
17 together a beautiful honorable statute for
18 them. The nurses and all, the people, did
19 they forget that served at our command?
20 Please try to support and I want to thank
21 the Lackawanna Ambulance, and the police
22 department we really to get straightened
23 out. And I am indebted to the fire
24 department here and in Syracuse.

25 When we look at everything and we

1 look at the world today I heard a program,
2 Corbett, and he was speaking and soldiers
3 were calling in asking why are they in
4 Afghanistan and Iraq. They says when they
5 come out with is kill and survive. So sad.
6 I want to uplift them and just tell them one
7 thing, when they look at their children they
8 leave their children and yet they have these
9 other children in other countries they are
10 really trying to protect. I give thanks to
11 you. I'm sorry for the loss and I ask Obama
12 to please now it's time start bringing our
13 soldiers back because what I know and was
14 told to me would be incomprehensible to give
15 normally human being was has happened to me
16 and so I ask everybody to be brave, to have
17 faith in God, and try to the best to protect
18 your country and to bring us back so we
19 could protect our own country because this
20 truly we need a lot of firemen, we need a
21 lot of policemen and we need a lot of money
22 and we don't need to be sending it to places
23 where they are killing us and turning
24 against us. We don't need to teach people
25 how to shoot or they are going to turn them

1 onto us and this is wrong.

2 God bless you alls, I hope you all
3 have happy Thanksgiving and God will
4 prevail. It lights up into dark. I want to
5 take it from Philadelphia to New York to
6 Washington. If somebody would donate a
7 trailer and we need a driver I'm still
8 working and I have a statute representing
9 the United States and I wish would somebody
10 would come and try to help me with this
11 because I am doing it with the help of God.
12 God bless yous and thank you for assisting
13 us with everything. God bless you. I'll
14 leave it there for now and get it later.

15 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else?

16 MS. SCHUMACHER: Good evening,
17 Council, Marie Schumacher, taxpayer, citizen
18 and member of the Taxpayers' organization.
19 First, I would like to thank our vets and
20 special tribute to two of my first cousins,
21 both of whom served in World War II that
22 passed away during this last year, Ralph
23 Scott and Fred Volce.

24 In the caucuses of the last several
25 weeks and at least one of the articles that

1 appeared in the newspaper, Attorney Jennings
2 has been strongly hinting that the City of
3 Scranton be held harmless in what's going on
4 because of DCED and PEL's intervention in
5 the Scranton business. I would like to know
6 if there is any way you can answer during
7 motions if that is -- if there is any
8 possibility at all in that happening and if
9 you all are doing anything to pursue that
10 and get an answer, particularly in light of
11 the fact that the mayor's budget will be out
12 next Monday.

13 Also, I'm a little bit concerned, I
14 did hear a few of the questions that I had
15 asked on the street paving or marking of the
16 streets, but I did not hear answers to two
17 questions that I submitted in writing two
18 weeks ago, one dealing with what it would
19 take to achieve the 50 percent level
20 required for pensions for nondistressed
21 municipalities, I'm still interested in that
22 figure, and I still would like to know if we
23 have a liability cap similar to Madison
24 Township, and if we do what that cap is and
25 I think every taxpayer should be interested

1 in that.

2 MS. EVANS: Mrs. Schumacher, the
3 letters were sent out, we didn't receive an
4 answer yet.

5 MS. SCHUMACHER: Okay, I didn't hear
6 that when Mrs. Krake read the -- she may
7 have --

8 MS. EVANS: Well, it's probably
9 because we didn't get the response.

10 MS. SCHUMACHER: But there were a
11 number -- but anyway, yeah, okay, but I
12 just want you to know I'm still interested
13 in those certainly.

14 And also, Mrs. Evans, two weeks ago
15 you noted that part of your opposition to
16 the Scranton Abington Planning Association
17 plan was that the capital budget was
18 contingent upon SAPA, and that is not true.
19 I went back and checked and there were --
20 that was changed in November of '09 and
21 there were addendums in the front of the
22 binders, so again, there is no other cost
23 unless council decides to spend and, of
24 course, I do believe there will be costs for
25 a consolidated plan if SAPA is not -- if a

1 separate comprehensive plan is not voted on,
2 and just a reminder, my check is still here,
3 I bring it with me every week and I'm ready
4 to turn it over at any time.

5 I also have -- I had requested that
6 you all on the capital budget go to
7 Mrs. Novembrino for a copy of her capital
8 budget, and I received word from Mr. Joyce
9 that that was -- that there wasn't anything
10 to provide because there are no capital
11 improvement projects for the Year 2010.

12 With due respect to Mrs. Novembrino,
13 the Home Rule Charter calls for a five-year
14 budget and we are in I don't know, I didn't
15 take the time to pull them, but we are
16 either in year three or four of a current
17 five-year budget. And just sitting I came
18 up with these we have this year, Nay Aug
19 pavilion was let out, a contract was let for
20 that; purchase of three aerial proximity
21 warning devices for the fire department;
22 acceptance of \$300,000 Weinberg grant for
23 Weston Field; the Crisp Avenue bridge.
24 Today's paper had the Police Athletic
25 Association, there have been several

1 articles in the paper stating that that was
2 a \$135,000 project. All of these are this
3 year I might add.

4 Also, I'd like to know where the
5 money is the city has to put in to buy the
6 Colfax Reserve Center, and HUD requirements
7 for that were that there have to be
8 matching-- the city had to come up with
9 matching money and I would like -- that
10 would be a capital budget item. I know
11 Howard Gardner School was very interested in
12 this facility but they couldn't get it
13 because they didn't have -- they weren't
14 able to come with the matching funds, and I
15 would like to know where our matching funds
16 are, if I may just continue this list. The
17 DPW trucks even though they were paid for by
18 the landfill they still should be in the
19 capital budget; 15-foot high recycling
20 waterfall in Hanlon's Grove and plus grills,
21 tables, landings and 250 pound concrete
22 turtles. Those were all capital projects
23 and I believe they should be in a budget.

24 MS. EVANS: I agree with you.

25 MS. SCHUMACHER: That might be a

1 good start if you don't have it and I have
2 many things, but I guess they'll have to
3 hold until next week.

4 MS. EVANS: The only thing I want to
5 add, Mrs. Schumacher, is the fact that the
6 business administrator still has not sent to
7 council the adjusted capital budget.

8 MS. SCHUMACHER: Well, I understand
9 that. That's why I suggested you go to Mrs.
10 Novembrino because she is typically kept a
11 five-year, but to say there is -- there are
12 no 2010 capital budgets expenditures when --

13 MS. EVANS: Oh, I agree with you.

14 MS. SCHUMACHER: -- just sitting and
15 going through a few of my files I came up
16 with what, that's close to a dozen.

17 MS. EVANS: Well, that validates
18 what we were saying regarding the capital
19 budget and why we could not approve it
20 because it is in violation of the Home Rule
21 Charter, nevertheless, the administration
22 has ignored that and apparently is content
23 to remain in violation while the city has no
24 capital budget.

25 MS. SCHUMACHER: But you all have

1 the opportunity, it's a new budget, I mean,
2 it's part of the new budget for the year so
3 you all have the opportunity to develop your
4 own. Otherwise, we are going to -- it's
5 going to be December 15 before we know it
6 and no budget is going to be approved and
7 it's just plain not right. So lots more,
8 but no time, so maybe next week. Thank you.

9 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

10 MR. JOYCE: Thank you.

11 MR. LANGAN: I'm Dan Langan, you'll
12 have to excuse me, I'm a city council virgin
13 so if I stray just let me know and I'll get
14 back on-line. There is really only two
15 things that I'm concerned about, one even
16 though I'm fat I'm a runner, I like to run
17 on the sidewalks of Scranton. There is cars
18 parked all over the streets -- all over the
19 sidewalks. I don't know what -- how much
20 money was spent on Moosic Street all of the
21 way up, you guys made a wheelchair
22 accessible, the only problem is they are not
23 wheelchair accessible because there is cars
24 parked right in the middle of the sidewalks.
25 I know it's illegal, I know there's an alley

1 behind it, I know half of those cars that
2 are parked on Moosic Street have driveways,
3 still they choose to park on the sidewalk.

4 Down here straight down five blocks
5 at Sharon's Place, it's a little diner, all
6 of the cops go there at lunch, everybody
7 parks on the sidewalk. Every time I stop a
8 police officer and I say I know it's
9 illegal, nine times out of ten they say,
10 "What do you want me to do about it?"

11 I want them to write up a ticket. I
12 want the cars off the sidewalks for me, who
13 is old and fat, for the wheelchairs, for the
14 strollers. If you go down Wyoming Avenue
15 around Prep all of the car dealers they all
16 park right on the sidewalk. The one, a
17 block and a half from Prep not only parks on
18 the sidewalk he parks up against a fire
19 hydrant. I know that the law does not say
20 20 feet from the fire hydrant unless you are
21 on the sidewalk, you know? That's my big
22 complaint.

23 My other complaint is coming up as
24 we go into the winter season, it's going to
25 be shoveling the sidewalks, you know. If

1 you go up on Meadow Avenue, Gerrity's, the
2 Dollar Store, none of those people not only
3 don't they plow, don't they shovel their
4 sidewalk but they plow their driveway, their
5 parking lot onto the sidewalk. I know it's
6 illegal.

7 If I don't shovel my sidewalk in the
8 winter, you know, I could get a ticket, I
9 could get fined. I think it should hold
10 true for everybody.

11 MS. EVANS: Yes.

12 MR. LANGAN: Like I say, that's my
13 only complaints is the sidewalks. You know,
14 we had 2000 people just do a marathon here,
15 Scranton could be a healthy, fit city or it
16 do be where everybody parks on the sidewalk
17 and nobody can get from one block to the
18 next. I appreciate your time. Have a good
19 day.

20 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

21 MR. JOYCE: Thank you very much.

22 MS. EVANS: Is there anyone else who
23 cares to address council? Mr. McGoff, do
24 you have any comments or motions?

25 MR. MCGOFF: Please. Just a couple

1 of comments on some things that were said
2 this evening. Certainly looking at the
3 lease of the parking garages and the lease
4 of the parking meters throughout the city is
5 something that I am glad that Mrs. Evans had
6 looked into and now we see some information
7 from I guess it's from PEL that we got that
8 report?

9 MS. EVANS: Yes.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Dealing with or how
11 other cities have dealt with the situation.
12 I realize again, as Mrs. Evans said, that
13 it's not something that we can do overnight,
14 but certainly it's something to look into
15 and something to seriously consider for the
16 immediate future, although, it may not be
17 beneficial in the long-term, certainly we
18 need to look at some -- some things that can
19 be beneficial in a short term.

20 Secondly, for those of us in the
21 South Side area in the East Mountain area
22 the River Street bridge is finally
23 completed, traffic lanes at least are
24 completed and drivable without great fear of
25 accident or injury. I hope now that perhaps

1 we can start to look at perhaps the traffic
2 light at the corner of River Street and
3 Meadow Avenue which is long, long overdue, a
4 very dangerous intersection and one that
5 needs -- that desperately needs a traffic
6 light, and I know we have spoken about it
7 for years, but now that the one project is
8 complete perhaps we can move on to the
9 second project.

10 And lastly, Veteran's Day I would
11 like to my father and all World War II
12 veterans especially, they are a dwindling
13 national treasure and I think that it's
14 something that we really need to say thank
15 you to. I know that they have been
16 described as the greatest generation and
17 they are slowly leaving us, and I think we
18 should do something to really commemorate
19 those people, and to all veterans thank you
20 for what you have done for us and that's
21 all.

22 MS. EVANS: Mr. McGoff, I just
23 wanted to add that I think the PennDOT
24 signalization program is going to begin in
25 2011 so maybe that light will be addressed

1 somehow through that?

2 MR. MCGOFF: I'm not sure that
3 that's included.

4 MS. SCHUMACHER: It is.

5 MR. MCGOFF: It is.

6 Mrs. Schumacher --

7 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

8 MR. MCGOFF: -- has been on top of
9 this for awhile. Hopefully it is. I was
10 under the impression that most of the
11 signalization was for -- limited to the
12 pretty much the downtown area, but
13 hopefully --

14 MS. EVANS: Yes.

15 MR. MCGOFF: -- something can be done
16 at that intersection in the near future.

17 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Mr. Rogan,
18 any comments or motions?

19 MR. ROGAN: Yes. Thank you. First,
20 I would like to thank all of the veterans in
21 our community. I have family members and
22 friends who are veterans and without them we
23 wouldn't be here today with the rights that
24 we have to say what we want to say and we
25 thank them.

1 Secondly, I would like to thank
2 everyone who ran in the election. There
3 were a lot of good candidates that ran,
4 fortunately, the elections were a little
5 more negative than they normal are, but we
6 are glad that's behind us and I would like
7 to congratulate our new congressman, Lou
8 Barletta. I'm sure he will do a great job
9 for our community.

10 While at the polls on election day a
11 few residents brought some different
12 concerns to me and one of them that one of
13 my neighbors brought up, and I know it was
14 in the paper maybe about three weeks ago,
15 about a proposed new park and, you know, in
16 the state that we are in especially after
17 listening to Mr. Martin today when, you
18 know, the mayor is considering cutting
19 police and fire, DPW, but yet at the same
20 time he wants to build a new park in North
21 Scranton to me it just doesn't seem to make
22 any sense. We need it to have our
23 priorities straight and we need to watch
24 every penny and we need to spend the tax
25 dollars wisely. Public safety is the most

1 important job of government just like I
2 mentioned before, and we need to keep our
3 neighborhoods safe and we need to have a
4 strong fire department with good equipment
5 to protect the residents and to protect the
6 firefighters.

7 But moving on from that, I have a
8 few requests for residents and one a couple
9 of people actually asked me, Mr. Sbaraglia
10 brought this up earlier, Mrs. Krake, could
11 we please send a letter to Mr. Renda asking
12 how much money Chief Elliott's comment about
13 the two female police officers is going to
14 cost the city?

15 I received a letter, an e-mail today
16 actually, and I know that it's been an
17 ongoing issue where people will be parked
18 the wrong way on many streets, but the
19 person who sent this today alone he had two
20 cars pull out of a parking spot going
21 against the correct flow of traffic that
22 nearly hit him while driving and he said on
23 Lafayette Street from Main Avenue to Van
24 Buren there were 27 cars parked going
25 against the direct flow of traffic, and I

1 know that in the past a lot of times people
2 will call the police and nothing will be
3 done because I know you can't just -- the
4 police won't just ticket one car they have
5 to go all of the way up and down the street
6 and ticket each one, but could we please
7 forward that to Chief Duffy.

8 As well as while we are at it
9 similar with cars parked on the sidewalks as
10 well, and I believe it was on Moosic Street
11 and by Scranton Prep.

12 And finally, once again the Crisp
13 Avenue bridge seems to be held up again. I
14 received a letter, an e-mail from another
15 resident who said he talked to Tom Tell at
16 Mr. Murphy's Office and from the information
17 he received that it's in the hands of Paul
18 Kelly, assistant solicitor for the city, and
19 they are just sitting on it. So could we
20 please see anything we can find out about
21 that and, you know, this -- he concludes his
22 e-mail by saying, "So close, yet so far,"
23 and that's really how it feels. It feels
24 like every week, you know, something --
25 something of good news comes to us about the

1 Crisp Avenue project and then the next week
2 another bit of bad news that seems there is
3 another setback, and I will hold my comments
4 on the audit for seventh order.

5 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

6 Mr. Loscombe, any comments or motions?

7 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes, a couple. Thank
8 you. Mr. Rogan, I just happen to notice in
9 the paper this week in the legals an
10 advisement on the Crisp Avenue bridge I
11 guess an impact statement which allows
12 people a certain amount of time, too. I
13 mean, I believe that could have been done
14 far prior to now, but I don't know if that's
15 a hold-up or what, but if we can again
16 checkup on that, also, for the Crisp Avenue
17 bridge.

18 I, too, would like to honor all our
19 veterans. As the son of a veteran,
20 son-in-law of veterans, a lot of veterans in
21 my family, again, we wouldn't be here
22 speaking to you if it wasn't for our
23 veterans that put their lives on the line
24 for us past and present, so from the bottom
25 of my heart I thank you all.

1 This morning's paper there was an
2 article regarding our city audit, late
3 nearly six months, just a couple of
4 statements from here. "The annual
5 independent audit for Scranton is nearly six
6 months past due drawing the ire of some city
7 officials. The Home Rule Charter says the
8 City must have it's audit which is being
9 completed by Robert Rossi & Company
10 completed by May 31, but the audit has not
11 been completed as of Monday business
12 administrator Stu Renda said."

13 "There is no one to blame, Mr. Renda
14 said, explaining that an audit is a
15 time-consuming process."

16 They have had nine years to practice
17 this process and it just seems this year
18 it's even extended a little bit longer. I
19 mean, each department should be prepared,
20 should know by this time when the
21 information is requested to have it
22 available. It's nothing new. They have
23 been doing the same thing for the last nine
24 years. If it was a new administration I
25 could see. To say it's somebody ire, it's

1 us up here and probably more so than anybody
2 Mrs. Krake who through her staff has to send
3 countless letters out. I do have to say the
4 Rossi Company has been sending us updates
5 continuously on information as requested.

6 This was one of the letters we sent
7 out on October 27, Mr. Stu Renda, business
8 administrator, third request, "Dear
9 Mr. Renda, has the information requested by
10 Robert Rossi & Company to complete the audit
11 been forwarded to them, and if not when do
12 you anticipate having your department
13 provide the auditors with the necessary
14 information so that the audit can be
15 completed? According to the Home Rule
16 Charter, the audit is to be done by May 31,
17 the audit is now over four months overdue.
18 Please give this request your immediate
19 attention and please provide council with a
20 written response on or before November 5,
21 2010."

22 I received a letter from Rossi & and
23 Company, which is a pretty regular
24 occurrence here, if they charged us just for
25 the paper they used it would cost a lot,

1 but, "Dear Stu, this is an updated list as
2 of November 8, 2010, of open items needed to
3 complete the audit for the year ending
4 December 31, 2009. We are still awaiting
5 for responses from the three attorney
6 letters. After receipt of attorney letters,
7 we will issue a draft of the audit report
8 for preparation of the city's management and
9 discussion and analysis section of the audit
10 report and scheduling an exit conference."

11 I can imagine the frustration for
12 any company that has to deal with us, first
13 of all, but again, us trying to work with
14 budgets and stuff like that, it's bringing
15 our frustration level up, also, but the
16 blame is not to be placed on the auditor,
17 the blame is not to be placed here. We have
18 been doing our due diligence and trying to
19 pursue this information, the blame comes
20 from downstairs, that's all I can say. And
21 I'm disappointed, I mean, I have seen
22 several letters already just requesting the
23 attorney letters.

24 MS. EVANS: Yes, I think there was a
25 letter that we received November 3

1 requesting those letters, so our updates are
2 very, very regular and it's quite clear that
3 the cooperation is lacking.

4 MR. LOSCOMBE: Correct. And I
5 believe in the paper he mentioned that there
6 were two letters they are awaiting for, but
7 this is dated the 8th from Rossi and it
8 states three letters. So it is frustrating
9 and I don't know what the consequences are
10 going to be.

11 And also the last item I just wanted
12 to update on the flooding issues and stuff
13 like that, I did speak to Gene Skeleton from
14 the Sewer Authority, they have been working
15 diligently at the 15th Street and Luzerne
16 Street intersection to prevent the flooding
17 there. They have done quite a bit of work,
18 replacing pipes underground, they have
19 actually run a drainage ditch across the
20 road because it's a flat road and everything
21 was running down the hill. They figured
22 that will resolve most of the problems
23 there, but there is lot of extensive work
24 there and Gene did tell me he had gotten the
25 maps for the Keyser Avenue renovations from

1 the state and we are going to reconvene a
2 meeting with Kevin Murphy's office and
3 hopefully Jeff Brazil, our city engineer,
4 also, and get going on that because before
5 they start to project there have to be some
6 things that are done to prevent the flooding
7 in the Keyser Valley area, otherwise, you
8 would be tearing up the good -- the new
9 stuff to replace it, so we have to
10 coordinate that and it was Gene that did
11 contact me and told me he had the maps and
12 we'll get on that very shortly because the
13 state will be bidding that out next month.

14 And again, we do have other pockets
15 of areas that they are working on, but we
16 are taking them one step at a time and
17 eventually hopefully we will solve all of
18 the problems as far as water runoff due to
19 storm, and that's all I have to say.

20 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Loscombe.
21 Mr. Rogan asked if he might speak once again
22 because he neglected to mention something
23 very important.

24 MR. ROGAN: I apologize, I had this
25 tucked to the side. We received from the

1 energy audit from Pure Energy Consultants
2 about two weeks ago and I just wanted to
3 list some of the items that were on there.
4 These are the -- I'm going to list the
5 upgrade, the cost, the savings and how many
6 years it will take for the investment to pay
7 it back.

8 The first item is the lighting
9 upgrade, the projected cost will be
10 \$135,000. We will save around \$17,000 a
11 year and it will be paid back in 7.9 years.

12 Weatherization, \$14,000 cost, the
13 savings will be around \$2,800 and it will be
14 paid back at 5.1 years.

15 Steam trap replacement, the cost
16 will be \$4,320, annual savings will be
17 \$1,341 and the improvement will pay for
18 itself in around 3.2 years.

19 Domestic hot water loop control at
20 \$4,200. Annual savings \$1,300. It will be
21 paid back in 3.3 years.

22 Vending machine controls, \$1,520 is
23 the cost, the annual savings is \$1,084 so we
24 will receive a return on our investment in
25 1.4 years.

1 some good ideas in here, I think that
2 \$220,000 could be spent much better than
3 that though, and that's all.

4 MR. LOSCOMBE: We'll still be paying
5 our current debt at that time, too.

6 MR. ROGAN: Yeah, unfortunately.

7 MS. EVANS: Mr. Joyce, do you have
8 any comments or motions at this time?

9 MR. JOYCE: Yes, a few. First thing
10 I wanted to mention, as you know Veteran's
11 Day is approaching and I just wanted to take
12 the time to thank all of the veterans out
13 there for the service that they have
14 provided to us and what all of my council
15 colleagues have mentioned, the basic rights
16 of the Americans as well as us sitting up
17 here it wouldn't be possibly to if it
18 weren't for you.

19 Secondly, tonight we will be voting
20 on the selection of Rossi & Rossi as the
21 independent auditor. As everyone knows
22 there were three bids that were submitted
23 for the four-year contract. Also, as
24 everyone knows the firms that bid on the
25 audit were Jones and Kohanski, Bonita &

1 Rainey and Rossi & Rossi.

2 Last week when I spoke, I spoke
3 about the pros and cons of each firm. After
4 speaking I felt as though there was a
5 consensus amongst everyone that choosing
6 Jones & Kohanski was a very risky decision
7 as in their bid row proposal they stated the
8 fees proposed by this auditor assumes that
9 no unexpected circumstances will not be
10 encountered during the audit and that if
11 additional time is necessary the auditor
12 will discuss it with us and provide a new
13 fee estimate.

14 After voting last week after this
15 occurred though I felt there was a consensus
16 that Jones & Kohanski wasn't necessarily the
17 best choice, I did not feel that there was a
18 consensus that Rossi & Rossi was the best
19 choice judging by the dissenting votes of
20 Councilman McGoff and Councilman Rogan.
21 Councilman Rogan felt that Bonita & Rainey
22 was the best choice.

23 With this in mind, let's just look
24 at some of the facts that were indicated in
25 Bonita & Rainey's bid. Number one, in their

1 bid package they did not indicate that they
2 had performed an audit for a municipality
3 the size of Scranton in their prior work.

4 Number two, their timeline states
5 that their work is to begin on May 15 of
6 each year. With this in mind, if they were
7 selected that would mean that they are
8 already six months behind schedule according
9 to their work plan.

10 Number three, they submitted their
11 bid a month after their work plan was set to
12 be begin. If there were truly a responsible
13 bidder, they would not submit a bid
14 suggesting their starting date for the
15 upcoming audit begin on a date that was in
16 the past.

17 Also, from their work plan Bonita &
18 Rainey indicated that it takes a year to
19 complete each audit. If Bonita & Rainey
20 were selected, after indicating that they
21 will have a one-year work plan to complete
22 the audit, essentially we may be voting to
23 violate the Home Rule Charter if it does, in
24 fact, take them one year being that the
25 audit is supposed to be done by May 31.

1 And fifth, if Bonita & Rainey take
2 one year to complete the audit as indicated
3 by their work plan does this mean that their
4 work plan for the next year will begin later
5 than May 15? For instance, if the BA's
6 Office is late in providing them information
7 as they are with Rossi & Rossi, our current
8 auditor, would they be starting next year
9 later than their work plan or would they be
10 working on two audits simultaneously and if
11 that would be the case we run the risk for
12 quality control issues.

13 When push comes to shove, Bonita &
14 Rainey's bid is not exactly purely
15 responsibility. How can one deem that their
16 bid is responsible when they are submitting
17 a plan to complete a job that was supposed
18 to start even before they had the job that
19 they would have the job in the first place?

20 We have already seen that Jones &
21 Kohanski could present the possibility of
22 additional costs if the city is late in
23 providing the information. Now, from what I
24 previously stated we could see that Bonita &
25 Rainey did not exactly present a responsible

1 bid being that they stated that they were
2 going to start their work plan at a date
3 that occurred prior to even submitting the
4 bid.

5 It is shocking that one could choose
6 this auditor being that it's irresponsible
7 in my eyes. Submitting a plan that would
8 begin prior to the date that you have
9 actually submitted the plan and would even
10 have the possibility to get the job is just
11 an irresponsible bid to me. And though
12 Bonita & Rainey's bid is \$3,000 per year
13 lower than Rossi & Rossi, and that's
14 approximately .00338 percent of the city's
15 annual operating budget, we must ask
16 ourselves would voting for them be worth the
17 risk? Would it be worth the risk of voting
18 to essentially violate the Home Rule Charter
19 if, in fact, it does take them one year to
20 complete the audit as indicated in the time
21 plan?

22 Should we take the risk of voting
23 for a bidder who submitted a bid that we
24 should question whether or not it's
25 responsible since their work plan was

1 scheduled to start prior to the date that
2 was even submitted in their bid?

3 Is it worth the risk of running into
4 quality control issues if they are working
5 on the 2010 audit that is not completed on
6 time and we begin working on an audit for
7 2011 on May 15 of next year before the
8 previous audit would have been submitted?

9 Is it worth the risk of risking
10 transparency which has been exemplified by
11 Rossi & Rossi and their continuous updates
12 on information that's needed from the city
13 in order to complete the audit in a timely
14 fashion? In fact, we just received another
15 one in our mailbox that they are still
16 waiting on two attorneys letters to complete
17 the audit.

18 So to sum it up, with all of the
19 points that I just made would it be worth it
20 to save .0038 percent of the city's annual
21 operating budget with taking the risk of not
22 choosing Rossi & Rossi who has been tried
23 and true, who has done an excellent job with
24 keeping us informed, and who has done an
25 excellent job of preparing our audits over

1 the past eight years.

2 To me, I'm voting Rossi & Rossi
3 because I think it's worth it to maybe spend
4 a little bit more. I know \$3,000 is a lot
5 of money to a lot of people, but in the
6 course of the city budget in order to
7 maintain the level of transparency that we
8 have and in order to receive a completed
9 audit given some of the struggles that we
10 have in the administration I think it's
11 worth it to spend that extra \$3,000.

12 And on another note, Mr. Renda in
13 the newspaper is quoted and in the Times
14 saying that there is no one to blame for
15 this audit being late for this year, and
16 that audits do take a lot of time.

17 I do agree that audits do take time,
18 but I beg to differ that there is no one
19 to blame. One, it's the business
20 administrator's responsibility to provide
21 the auditor the information needed to
22 complete the annual audit in a timely
23 fashion. In the past under the Doherty
24 administration information was provided to
25 Rossi & Rossi in a more timely manner and we

1 did not have this problem. Just from doing
2 some research, in prior years the completed
3 audit was done by an earlier date. For
4 instance, in 2002 council received a
5 completed audit on June 6th of 2003. In
6 2003, council received a completed audit on
7 July 24th of 2004. For the 2004 audit,
8 council received a completed audit on June
9 17th of 2005. So as we can see it has been
10 done where it wasn't that late in the past.

11 However, starting in 2006 it appears
12 that there -- or for the 2006 audit that
13 there has been a trend of excessive
14 lateness. For instance, the 2006 completed
15 audit report wasn't submitted until December
16 3 of '07. The 2007 audit report wasn't
17 completed and submitted until December 31st
18 of 2008, and the 2008 audit report wasn't
19 finalized and submitted until October 20th
20 of 2009.

21 For some reason in the early 2000's
22 our audit was completed on time or at least
23 no longer than a month or two late. Now,
24 for some reasons the independent audit is
25 taking longer and longer to complete due to

1 the city not providing the auditor with
2 adequate information by the projected time
3 line.

4 It is the responsibility of the BA's
5 Office with providing this information to
6 the auditor in a timely manner and Rossi &
7 Rossi continuously sends updates asking for
8 that information through the Court of the
9 year in addition to council asking numerous
10 times what is the status of some of these
11 open items, what is the time line, when do
12 we expect to have a completed audit, none of
13 these questions that we ever sent over to
14 the BA's Office were ever answered; correct,
15 Mrs. Krake? I don't believe one of our
16 requests was ever answered.

17 Therefore, the BA statement saying
18 that no one is to blame and that audits take
19 time is technically incorrect. Yes, audits
20 do take time, but the blame of the
21 information not being provided to the
22 auditor is the fault of the BA's Office and
23 not the auditor. And if department heads
24 are late on getting information to the BA as
25 specified in the Home Rule Charter, many of

1 the department heads, I believe actually
2 most of the department heads report to the
3 BA, so I do believe that the Business
4 Administrator's Office is at fault at least
5 to some extent for not getting this
6 information to the auditor in a timely
7 manner.

8 And now that that's complete I have
9 one request, Mrs. Krake. On November 1 we
10 received a memo from PEL and they sent us an
11 advisory study for Recovery Plan provision.
12 On page four they breakdown some of the jobs
13 and industry that currently exists in the
14 City of Scranton. If could please send a
15 request to Mr. Cross and ask him out of all
16 of these jobs in Scranton which totals
17 29,700 approximately how many of them are
18 jobs that are in private sector versus
19 nonprofit.

20 And my last comment that I wanted to
21 make tonight is about what Mr. Martin said
22 about public safety and, you know, we are in
23 some pretty tough financial times here and
24 we definitely have problems with crime in
25 the city. We have gang related violence, we

1 have vandalism, we could go on and on and I
2 think some of the reasons why we failed over
3 some of the past years is, you know, we did
4 put a lot of money into building and
5 renovating parks, however, our police and
6 firefighters haven't received a raise or
7 very little was offered to them in my eyes,
8 and while I think that it's necessary to
9 revitalize parks, it's necessary to
10 revitalize the downtown area, all of these
11 things are necessary. However, I think
12 there needs to be a very better balance
13 because we could build all the parks that we
14 want in the city, but what good is having a
15 park if we are going to deplete the safety
16 forces that keep us safe in those parks, and
17 that's all I have to say here tonight.

18 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Mr. Joyce.

19 MR. ROGAN: If I could just respond
20 real quick about the audit.

21 MS. EVANS: Could we -- Mr. Rogan,
22 I'm sorry, could we hold that until we get
23 to the actual vote?

24 MR. ROGAN: Sure we could.

25 MS. EVANS: Thank you. Good

1 evening. Since city council was not in
2 session on November 2 I'd like to comment on
3 the few issues that arose within the last
4 two weeks. The mayor has proposed the
5 construction of a park on Perry Avenue in
6 North Scranton. As council president I,
7 too, support this park and I'm sure my
8 honorable colleagues support it as well.
9 However, in light of the significant
10 financial problems facing our city,
11 specifically the 2011 projected deficit and
12 the recent Commonwealth Court decisions, the
13 taxpayers cannot afford to fund the park, so
14 city officials must try to find other ways
15 in which to bring the park to fruition.

16 After visiting the location on Perry
17 Avenue, I spoke with State Representative
18 Kevin Murphy to explain the city's current
19 financial problems and to seek his help.
20 Representative Murphy had fond memories of
21 playing on that property as a child and he
22 agreed that he would be very pleased to see
23 a neighborhood park on Perry Avenue. He
24 discussed the tremendous cuts that occurred
25 in the state budget to services for

1 veterans, the elderly and the poor among
2 many others. I told him that council will
3 support state and federal funding of the
4 park and we would appreciate any help he
5 would be able to offer.

6 Further, I understand that the mayor
7 has also reached out to state and federal
8 officials for funding. As much as the
9 council the mayor and the area residents
10 would like to convert this vacant lot to a
11 park, it can only occur with state and/or
12 federal assistance and private donations.

13 Next, the announcement by the
14 Lackawanna County Tax Committee to remove
15 wage tax collections from the Scranton
16 Single Tax Office was unfortunate. Although
17 the Single Tax Office had earned a poor
18 reputation in the past, under the current
19 leadership of Mr. Courtright the tax office
20 has rebounded as evidenced by the increased
21 tax revenue distributed timely and
22 efficiently to the city.

23 Mr. Courtright and his staff have
24 also provided for credit/debit card tax
25 payments and on-line electronic payments in

1 less than one year during his first term in
2 office. Because of these significant
3 improvements and the increased workload that
4 will occur in 2011 due to the transition to
5 Bernheimer, the tax office should remain
6 mostly intact for the 2011 budget year with
7 deeper staffing cuts occurring in 2012, the
8 first year in which the Single Tax office
9 will no longer collect wage taxes.

10 Mr. Courtright and his employees
11 have been doing a very good job and the city
12 can ill-afford to significantly cut tax
13 office staff in a year of financial crisis.

14 Next, the Commonwealth Court
15 decisions regarding awards from 2008 through
16 2014 for police and fire municipal unions
17 was handed down over a week ago. Everyone
18 is aware of what the mayor has done, how he
19 has treated the police and the fire unions
20 and the nine-year history of this financial
21 monster. The contracts should have been
22 settled years ago and COLAS paid to union
23 employees for the last nine years. The last
24 best offer occurred in 2008, but the mayor
25 and DCED walked away from an agreement that

1 would have cost significantly less than what
2 we now must pay.

3 I have also heard that DCED with the
4 mayor's consent will appeal these decisions
5 thereby growing these monetary awards into
6 financial titans. Let there be no mistake
7 about this, the mayor, DCED, and our 18-year
8 failed financial team the Pennsylvania
9 Economy League are responsible for this
10 financial monster and it's time to pay the
11 piper. Blame won't solve the problem,
12 however, it only creates divisiveness. The
13 people of Scranton can ill-afford division
14 at this time.

15 Generating solutions begins with the
16 acceptance of responsibility. Those who are
17 responsible must take ownership and then
18 decide how best to address the financial
19 crisis. The mayor should rely less on DCED
20 and PEL and work with city council to meet
21 the city's financial responsibilities.

22 In addition, he should sit down with
23 union representatives to determine a way to
24 mitigate the Court awards. The mayor, DCED
25 and PEL must recognize that they cannot

1 raise taxes and fees to pay for their
2 mistakes because local government is already
3 bleeding the taxpayers to death. One out of
4 every four Scrantonian lives in poverty.
5 Unemployment remains high and senior
6 citizens' fixed incomes are staggering.
7 Large nonprofits have ignored their
8 responsibilities for draining Scranton's tax
9 base. It's time to crunch government. Cuts
10 in administrative costs and spending are
11 long overdue.

12 Interestingly, I have heard that the
13 mayor intends to cut police and fire as his
14 answer to cutting government. That is not
15 the solution. The social reality on the
16 ground dictates, for example, the need for
17 more police not less. Crime is increasing
18 in Scranton, especially juvenile crime.
19 Once again postponing the problem by
20 appealing it for another three years and
21 hoping he gets away before Scranton mirrors
22 the crime rates of the city of Reading only
23 creates another monster.

24 The financial house of cards is
25 crumbling. Because he failed to plan for

1 these Court awards, the mayor should
2 immediately investigate and support
3 council's suggestion of the lease of the
4 parking garages and perhaps the mayor should
5 consider a refinancing of the Scranton
6 Housing Authority. Even if the mayor
7 appeals these Court decisions, he must at
8 the same time prepare to fund Court awards
9 by taking such measures.

10 Now, on a more positive note, real
11 estate tax revenue should see an increase in
12 2011 due to the expiration of KOZ's
13 citywide. Unfortunately, I cannot provide
14 any figures for this increased revenue
15 because Mr. Renda, business administrator,
16 said no when asked for a copy of the
17 information by Mrs. Krake.

18 In addition, the mayor will likely
19 sell delinquent taxes to the Scranton
20 Redevelopment Authority and Municipal
21 Revenue Services as he has done for the last
22 several years in order to increase revenue
23 in the budget. Council reached out to the
24 mayor on more than one occasion this year
25 regarding these constant Court cases. Even

1 during the time that the mayor sued city
2 council for cutting government costs, men
3 like Mayor Doherty and Mr. Renda are some of
4 the reasons for Scranton's financial
5 problems.

6 The mayor ignored our advice, input,
7 and actions and Mr. Renda refused to provide
8 financial information, yet council remains
9 prepared to assist the mayor if he so
10 desires. The people of Scranton don't care
11 who solves the problem and who gets the
12 credit, they want a solution not another
13 three years of procrastination and attorney
14 fees.

15 Mr. Mayor, we can't bleed the
16 taxpayers to death and we won't allow crime
17 to spike. Other solutions must be
18 implemented.

19 Like my colleagues, I also would
20 like to thank my Uncle Donald Reach, who
21 served in the Army during World War II, and
22 my late Uncle Alfred Reach who served in the
23 Navy during the Korean War.

24 And finally, I have citizens'
25 requests for the week: Residents of Depot

1 Street report that their street was milled
2 for resurfacing over three months ago, but
3 the DPW has not returned to finish the
4 project. As a result, water pools in front
5 of the homeowners' properties which will
6 cause increased problems during the winter
7 months. The DPW has been contacted numerous
8 times by a resident but he received no
9 return phone call. Please address
10 immediately.

11 Fill potholes in the following
12 locations: In the front of the Medical Arts
13 Building by the handicap parking meter, the
14 300 block of Meadow Avenue, South Washington
15 Avenue in front of the police headquarters,
16 the intersection of River Street and South
17 Washington Avenue, and Lackawanna Avenue in
18 front of Boscov's and in front of the post
19 office. Fill potholes in Smith Place
20 located behind Watson Street as soon as
21 possible.

22 A letter to Mr. Brazil: Please
23 provide city council with a complete list of
24 all streets, alleys and courts that were
25 paved in 2010.

1 And finally, I have received several
2 calls in the last week regarding leaf pickup
3 protocol. Can leaves be bagged and swept to
4 the curb as in prior years? Is there a
5 schedule for leaf pickup? I know that the
6 leaf truck has been around my neighborhood
7 on more than one occasion, for that I'm sure
8 all of my neighbors are quite grateful, but
9 I didn't notice that there was a citywide
10 schedule, I could be wrong, but I haven't
11 seen anything and as a result city residents
12 are wondering, you know, when this is going
13 to occur before the snow flies. And that's
14 it.

15 MS. KRAKE: 5-B. NO BUSINESS AT THIS
16 TIME. 6-A. READING BY TITLE - FILE OF
17 COUNCIL NO. 46 2010 - AN ORDINANCE -
18 AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE
19 CITY OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON TO
20 ACCEPT AND DISBURSE GRANT FUNDS FROM THE
21 FEDERAL EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AGENCY ("FEMA")
22 AND THE DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY
23 ("DHS").

24 MS. EVANS: You've heard reading by
25 title of Item 6-A, what is your pleasure?

1 MR. ROGAN: I move that Item 6-A
2 pass reading by title.

3 MR. JOYCE: Second.

4 MS. EVANS: On the question? All
5 those in favor signify by saying aye.

6 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

7 MR. ROGAN: Aye.

8 MR. LOSCOMBE: Aye.

9 MR. JOYCE: Aye.

10 MS. EVANS: Aye. Opposed? The ayes
11 have it and so moved.

12 MS. KRAKE: 7-A. FOR CONSIDERATION
13 BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE - FOR ADOPTION-
14 RESOLUTION NO. 45, 2010 - ACCEPTING A TWO
15 HUNDRED FIFTY (\$250.00) DOLLAR CONTRIBUTION
16 FROM MCDONALD'S/MARY JOAN CORPORATION
17 PRESENTED TO THE CITY OF SCRANTON POLICE
18 DEPARTMENT.

19 MS. EVANS: What is the
20 recommendation of the Chair for the
21 Committee on Finance?

22 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the
23 Committee on Finance, I recommend final
24 passage of Item 7-A.

25 MR. ROGAN: Second.

1 MS. EVANS: On the question? Roll
2 call, please.

3 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

5 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

6 MR. ROGAN: Yes.

7 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

8 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

9 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

10 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

11 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

12 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
13 Item 7-A legally and lawfully adopted.

14 MS. KRAKE: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION
15 BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE - FOR ADOPTION-
16 RESOLUTION NO. 46, 2010 - AUTHORIZING THE
17 MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS
18 TO EXECUTE AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT FOR
19 PROFESSIONAL SERVICES WITH THE CERTIFIED
20 PUBLIC ACCOUNTING FIRM OF ROBERT ROSSI & CO.
21 FOR THE CITY OF SCRANTON'S INDEPENDENT POST
22 AUDIT FOR THE YEARS ENDING 12-31-2010,
23 12-31-2011, 12-31-2012, AND 12-31-2013 PER
24 THE ATTACHED BID PROPOSAL AND SPECIFICATIONS
25 FOR A LUMP SUM OF \$192,000.00.

1 MS. EVANS: What is the
2 recommendation of the Chair for the
3 Committee on Finance?

4 MR. JOYCE: As Chairperson for the
5 Committee on Finance, I recommend final
6 passage of Item 7-B.

7 MR. LOSCOMBE: Second.

8 MS. EVANS: On the question?

9 MR. ROGAN: Yes, on the question.
10 After listening to Mr. Joyce you would think
11 that everything with the audit is going just
12 fine, which isn't the case. As we saw in
13 the newspaper today the audit is once again
14 months behind and where to place the blame I
15 don't know, I'm sure the administration will
16 share a large part of the blame. My reason
17 for wanting Rainey to be the auditor is more
18 based on finances than based on which
19 company is going to go -- because I'm sure
20 by reading through they both have qualified
21 staff, they both would do a good job of
22 doing the audit, but Mr. Joyce mentioned
23 that it's a very small percentage, was it
24 .0038 --

25 MR. JOYCE: Yeah.

1 MR. ROGAN: -- percent of the budget,
2 but the savings of \$12,000 between Rossi and
3 Rainey, Rossi's bid is \$192,000 and Rainey's
4 bid was \$180,000, Mr. McGoff mentioned last
5 week it's around 6 percent, so if we can
6 save 6 percent on each item in the budget
7 that would come out to the end of the year
8 to a very substantial savings.

9 Secondly, at the beginning of the
10 year myself, Mr. Loscombe and Mr. Joyce and
11 Mrs. Evans went to Court against the
12 administration to save less than 1 percent.
13 It's not about how much money it is, it's
14 because it's the right thing to do. We need
15 to save every cent of taxpayer dollars and
16 it's very easy to say, well, it's only
17 \$3,000 a year, but the fact is that the
18 difference in bids is \$12,000 which is \$500
19 less than one of our salaries for a full
20 year.

21 And I really think that, you know,
22 from hearing Mr. Martin and having PEL in
23 here and having Mr. Jennings in here for the
24 unions we are not in a situation to sneeze
25 at \$3,000 per year, \$12,000 total. It's not

1 a local lot of money to a city that's
2 spending millions of dollars, but to
3 taxpayers it is a lot of money, and when I
4 ran I pledged to watch every cent and I will
5 continue to do so. I will be voting no.

6 MR. MCGOFF: I'd also like to
7 comment, I know Mr. Joyce made a great deal
8 about the timeline presented by Bonita &
9 Rainey, Rossi & Rossi offered no timeline
10 for completing the audit and we know in the
11 past that for whatever reason the audit has
12 not been able to be completed on time, so no
13 matter which way we would vote we are
14 probably voting for a company, you know,
15 that potentially may not have the audit done
16 according to the Home Rule Charter, so this
17 whole idea of, you know, are we going to
18 risk something by voting for Bonita & Rainey
19 I think is just creating fears that really
20 don't exist.

21 And the second point that Mr. Joyce
22 made concerning -- and he said the fact that
23 Bonita & Rainey had never done an audit the
24 size of, you know, the City of Scranton,
25 that may be true. Since the formation of

1 Bonita & Rainey a number of years ago they
2 have not, but the individual members, as I
3 mentioned last week, have worked on audits
4 for the State of Delaware and the City of
5 Philadelphia, so I'm sure that they are
6 experienced with audits not only for
7 something the size of the City of Scranton,
8 but also larger, and again, I will go with
9 Mr. Rogan said I think the fiscally
10 responsible thing to do is to accept the
11 lowest responsible bid. And again, I'll
12 agree with Mr. Joyce that the lowest bid was
13 not responsible and so the next bid I think
14 would be the lowest responsible bid, the one
15 submitted by Bonita & Rainey, and therefore,
16 I, too, will be vote no against tonight's
17 motion.

18 MR. LOSCOMBE: If I could just
19 comment?

20 MR. JOYCE: You could go first.

21 MR. LOSCOMBE: Rossi & Rossi,
22 Johnson & Johnson, Smith and Wesson, the
23 name has nothing to do with it to me because
24 I don't know any of these auditing firms. I
25 trust our accountant on the board here with

1 his ideas and I have reviewed them myself,
2 but just in seeing what I have seen the
3 obstacles that have been thrown in front of
4 this auditing firm and their experience in
5 dealing with this administration I think
6 trumps the money at this point.

7 And speaking of the money at this
8 point, I think Mr. Joyce made a good case
9 here against the business administrator who
10 is probably I believe the highest paid
11 administrator in the city and at \$85,000 I
12 think that a solution may be to reduce his
13 salary by \$12,000 to pay for the offset
14 because of the trouble we have had getting
15 information from his office. I think it's
16 time to be -- we shouldn't be pennywise and
17 dollar foolish at this time.

18 Under different circumstances a
19 different administration I could see going
20 for the savings at this point, but when we
21 are dealing with two other companies that do
22 not have the experience dealing with what we
23 have to deal with on a daily basis or the
24 administration does I think that's a bigger
25 consideration to me, and I will be voting

1 for it.

2 MR. ROGAN: Mr. Loscombe, I agree
3 with you on cutting the business
4 administrator's salary, personally I think
5 it should be brought to under \$50,000 the
6 cost of the mayor, and I'm sure that's
7 something that we will agree upon come
8 budget time, but the savings on cutting the
9 business administrator on top of the \$12,000
10 saving here will be much more effective than
11 just cutting the business administrator.

12 MR. JOYCE: If I could just add my
13 two cents to this discussion. One thing
14 about Rossi & Rossi I know that Mr. McGoff
15 you said that they didn't have a timeline, I
16 believe in their audit package they did
17 provide a timeline of December to May as
18 when they would start and when they would
19 complete the audit, obviously, assuming that
20 everything would go as planned which, of
21 course, we know hasn't happened for quite
22 sometime.

23 In an ideal situation where the city
24 turned over all of the information that
25 needed to be turned over to the auditor on

1 time I would personally think that Jones &
2 Kohanski would be the lowest responsible
3 bidder if that were the situation we were
4 facing, but we are not facing that
5 situation. We are facing a situation where
6 we are excessively late, we are excessively
7 late for the past three or four years, and
8 late but maybe not excessively late for
9 three years prior to that.

10 With that being said, you know, I
11 don't agree that Bonita & Rainey is the best
12 choice in this case. Like Mr. Rogan said,
13 yes, \$3,000 is lot of money, it is a lot of
14 money to people out there. Maybe it does
15 seem small in terms of how large the city
16 budget is, but going with the firm that has
17 a year timeline and maybe select, say, if we
18 were to select them they would already be
19 six months behind schedule, so I just don't
20 think that's the most responsible thing to
21 do. I think the responsible thing to do is
22 go with who we know, go with who we know
23 will provide us updates, will be transparent
24 to let us know what needs to be turned in
25 and will keep us abreast of everything

1 that's going on in the process so we could
2 review and keep the public informed of
3 what's going on, and the negligence that has
4 been displayed by the BA's Office in
5 providing the information to the auditor on
6 time.

7 And that's just my comment on it and
8 that's the way I personally feel about it,
9 so that's why I will be voting "yes" for
10 Rossi & Rossi.

11 MS. EVANS: I'm just going to add
12 very quickly, I'm a senior member of
13 council, I have been seated here longer than
14 any of my colleagues, and I have been on
15 your side all of these years and you know
16 that. I have been on your side by myself
17 for a very long, long time until this year.

18 Now, we have a mayor, for example,
19 who tonight basically and directly stopped a
20 caucus from occurring to help a section of
21 the city and some city residents who have
22 been suffering from flooding for I don't
23 know how many years now, and I'm not talking
24 about basement flooding I'm talking about
25 their whole property floods and you are

1 wading out to your knees to try to get into
2 your car.

3 Mr. Brazil no answer, and we all
4 know for this council anyway, not the
5 previous councils with whom I have sat, but
6 this council we must have the mayor's
7 permission to speak to any department head.
8 That's wrong.

9 Then we have Mr. Renda who on Monday
10 said when asked for the KOZ information for
11 2011 can we have it? "No."

12 This is what I have been up against
13 for all of these years, but I fought on and
14 fought the good fight for you and I'm
15 telling you tonight when you are fighting
16 that kind of battle and when you look at a
17 city that is in a financial wasteland right
18 now you can't put a price of \$3,000 on the
19 financial picture and this battle. You
20 can't put a price on transparency. You have
21 got to have the information and the tools to
22 be able to do your job effectively, and I do
23 greatly fear that that is something we will
24 lose. Anyone else on the issue?

25 MR. ROGAN: Yes. One final comment.

1 I, too, am for transparency, but I don't see
2 how switching from one reputable firm to
3 another would hurt transparency in city
4 government. They would be hired to do the
5 audit for the City of Scranton. If they
6 didn't, they would be breaking the contract.

7 MS. EVANS: Oh, I'm sure they would
8 do the audit and they will do it according
9 to rules and regulations, but again, and I
10 don't want to belabor this tonight because
11 it's something I would rather wait until
12 next week to talk about further, but again,
13 it's taken years and years and years to get
14 information and some of the information that
15 I have read in the last few weeks about the
16 way in which your money is being spent would
17 disturb all of you.

18 And, as I said, I have been here
19 seven years and it took me seven years to
20 get there. But I wonder if you are
21 interested in spending tax dollars on
22 putting ads in programs. I wonder if you
23 are interested in spending tax dollars on
24 buying tables at dinners, ten seats a piece.
25 I wonder if you are interested in paying

1 ECTV with your tax dollars that you didn't
2 even know about it. There is plenty, and
3 again, all I can say is you cannot put a
4 dollar -- a price tag on what's been going
5 on over these last my seven years and these
6 nine years. We need a big broom here, a
7 very big broom to sweep this city hall clean
8 and the authorities as well.

9 MR. ROGAN: I agree we do need a
10 very big broom, but the issues of, you know,
11 you mentioned the flooding and Mr. Brazil
12 not coming and Mr. Renda not responding to
13 our requests, any members of the
14 administration not responding to our
15 requests, that doesn't have to do with which
16 firm conducts the audit. I am just upset as
17 all of us on here are that Mr. Brazil wasn't
18 in here tonight. I believe he is overpaid
19 and underworked. I believe the same for
20 half of the people that work in the city
21 with the exception of the public servants,
22 police, fire and some of the DPW, but saving
23 \$12,000, \$12,000 is \$12,000. Both auditing
24 firms, as Mr. Joyce said last week, have a
25 very professional staff and are very capable

1 of doing the job.

2 MS. EVANS: Okay. And I think the
3 only last thing we want to consider here is
4 you may have a possible violation of the
5 Home Rule Charter, but for different
6 reasons. Can we take a roll call now unless
7 someone else has something to add? Okay.

8 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. McGoff.

9 MR. MCGOFF: No.

10 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Rogan.

11 MR. ROGAN: No.

12 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Loscombe.

13 MR. LOSCOMBE: Yes.

14 MS. MARCIANO: Mr. Joyce.

15 MR. JOYCE: Yes.

16 MS. MARCIANO: Mrs. Evans.

17 MS. EVANS: Yes. I hereby declare
18 Item 7-B legally and lawfully adopted. If
19 there is no other business I will entertain
20 a motion to adjourn?

21 MR. JOYCE: Motion to adjourn.

22 MS. EVANS: This meeting is
23 adjourned.

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR
OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER