

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SCRANTON CITY COUNCIL MEETING

HELD:

Tuesday, December 2, 2008

LOCATION:

Council Chambers
Scranton City Hall
340 North Washington Avenue
Scranton, Pennsylvania

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR - OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY OF SCRANTON COUNCIL:

MR. ROBERT MCGOFF, PRESIDENT

MS. JUDY GATELLI, VICE-PRESIDENT

MS. JANET E. EVANS

MS. SHERRY FANUCCI

MR. WILLIAM COURTRIGHT

MS. KAY GARVEY, CITY CLERK

MR. NEIL COOLICAN, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK

MR. AMIL MINORA, SOLICITOR

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and moment of
2 reflection observed.)

3 MR. MCGOFF: Roll call, please?

4 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Evans.

5 MS. EVANS: Here.

6 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Gatelli.

7 MS. GATELLI. Here.

8 MR. COOLICAN: Ms. Fanucci.

9 MS. FANUCCI: Here.

10 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. Courtright.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Here.

12 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. McGoff.

13 MR. MCGOFF: Here. Dispense with
14 the reading of the minutes.

15 MS. GARVEY: THIRD ORDER. 3-A.

16 MINUTES OF THE SCRANTON-LACKAWANNA HEALTH
17 AND WELFARE AUTHORITY REGULAR BOARD MEETING
18 HELD ON OCTOBER 186, 2008.

19 MR. MCGOFF: Are there any comments?

20 If not, received and filed.

21 MS. GARVEY: That's it for Third
22 Order.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Prior to citizen's
24 participation and any announcements, there
25 was mention last week or at one of the prior

1 meetings about the census that is going to
2 be taking place and Mr. Spano has asked if
3 he could just speak briefly about
4 opportunities or how it's going to be done
5 and I have asked him if he would do that at
6 this time. Welcome, Mr. Spano.

7 MR. SPANO: Thank you, Mr. McGoff,
8 and thank everybody for your indulgence in
9 allowing me to take this time at this point
10 in the agenda. My name is Charlie Spano and
11 now I am the assistant manager for
12 recruiting in the Scranton office of the
13 United States Census. The Census is
14 required by the constitution to occur every
15 ten years. What we are doing right now is
16 asking individuals who may be interested in
17 taking a simple test of basic skills, math
18 English, analysis and alternatives, to
19 schedule themselves for that test in our
20 area by calling this 1-866 number. An
21 individual who takes the test and qualifies
22 through a background check will be added to
23 a list. The jobs that will be coming
24 available now and in the very near future
25 include office clerical-type work that will

1 be in our office on the fifth floor of the
2 Oppenheim building as well as supervisory
3 positions in the office.

4 The vast majority of jobs will be
5 out in the field. People commonly think of
6 the census that someone knocks on your door
7 and collects information. That is true, but
8 that will come about a year and a half from
9 now in 2010. Those people are called
10 enumerators. We need enumerators, we need
11 people to manage them who are called crew
12 leaders. We need office supervisory staff.
13 We have a test scheduled in Scranton on
14 December 6. We have tests scheduled
15 throughout Northeastern, Pennsylvania.
16 Again, the number is 1-866-861-2010, for
17 anyone who is interested in applying for a
18 census job. Now, these jobs are by and
19 large part-time, they are temporary, and
20 they can carry no benefits. Some jobs can
21 last as short as three or four weeks, others
22 can last several months, so I would
23 encourage everyone and anyone who may be
24 interested in getting a great part-time job
25 that pays between \$11 and \$14 an hour to

1 call this number, take the test, and you
2 will be contacted by the US Census and at
3 some future point by the folks in our
4 office. Thank you for the opportunity for
5 this time and I appreciate your attention.
6 Good night.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr. Spano.
8 Any questions for Mr. Spano? Thank you very
9 much. Any announcements from council?

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: I have just one.
11 Nan Wendelowski asked me if I could read
12 this. It's a Wonderful Live, the radio
13 version, performed by the Actor's Circle,
14 it's going to be December 4, 5, 6, and 7,
15 and then again December 12, 13, and 14.
16 That's Thursday, Fridays and Saturday
17 evenings at 8:00, and Sunday afternoon at
18 2:00 and the prices range from 8 to 12
19 dollars and that will be at the Providence
20 Playhouse on 1256 Providence Road, so they
21 would appreciate if you would think about
22 attending this. Again, Wonderful Life, the
23 radio version. Thank you.

24 MS. EVANS: And I just have one
25 thing, I would like to acknowledge Good

1 Fellows and Mr. Hasham, who I understand

2 donated quite a bit of nonperishable food
3 items to the Lackawanna-Scranton Taxpayers'
4 Association food drive, so thank you very
5 much to Mr. Hasham.

6 MS. GATELLI: I would just like to
7 announce once again the 30th anniversary of
8 the Scranton Public Theatre. Agnus Cummings
9 is providing three, one-act plays, Friday,
10 December 5 at 8:15; Saturday, December 6 at
11 2:00 and 8:15; and Sunday, December 7 at
12 8:15. Cost is 10 dollars.

13 The lights at Nay Aug Park open
14 every night. And Friday evening, December
15 5, at 7:00 at the Cultural Center is the
16 Northeastern, Pennsylvania, Philharmonic
17 holiday show.

18 I just have one piece of
19 correspondence concerning the audit from
20 Mr. Grassi, "We anticipate providing a draft
21 of the audit report to the BA either Friday
22 of this week or Monday of next week to begin
23 working on the city's management and
24 discussion analysis cyst section of the
25 audit. The report will be tentative and

1 preliminary subject to receipt of response

2 from attorneys regarding the potential
3 liabilities, claims for litigation.

4 After receipt of the city's MDNA and
5 attorney letters, an exit conference will be
6 scheduled to review the audit report. And
7 that's all I have. Thank you.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else? Fourth
9 order. Citizens' participation. Les
10 Spindler.

11 MR. SPINDLER: Good evening, Council.
12 Les Spindler, city resident and homeowner.
13 Mr. McGoff, last week you said people have
14 come up to you and said how they liked the
15 program on CDTV, well, they must be Chicago
16 White Sox and Betty Boop fans. To expound
17 on that, Mrs. Evans, last you weren't here,
18 a coworker came up to me and said they had
19 tuned into 61 a few weeks ago and there was
20 a Betty Boop cartoon on. That's the kind of
21 programming we are getting on CDTV, shows
22 about the Chicago White Soxs, winning the
23 world series and Betty Boop commercials. I
24 guess Chris Doherty is getting just what he
25 wants because people have come up to me, Mr.

9

1 McGoff, and said they don't watch 61
2 anymore. Are you writing a novel,

3 Mr. McGoff, or are you paying attention?
4 People have come up to me and stated they
5 won't watch 61 anymore because these
6 meetings are not live and they read in the
7 paper the next day what happens, so Chris
8 Doherty got just what he wants, for people
9 not to watch these meetings and find out the
10 truth come election time.

11 Next thing, Saturday the 29, in the
12 Doherty newsletter it states, "Police labor
13 discord hurts," and it talks about three
14 police officers leaving the police force in
15 2007, and three more this year, and if
16 there's one person to blame, it's Chris
17 Doherty. He wants to give \$10,000 raises to
18 people in his administration, but he won't
19 give raises to the police department and
20 fire department, and that goes to say what
21 you said last week, Mrs. Gatelli, I agree
22 with you. You said maybe if we raised the
23 salary of the mayor we'll get people of
24 better quality, because for the last seven
25 years we haven't had anybody of good

10

1 quality.

2 Moving on, Mrs. Fanucci, last week

3 you are complaining that the Carl Greco
4 spent \$25,000 of taxpayer money to fight the
5 Right-to-Know letters. Well, if people
6 can't get their information voluntarily they
7 have every right in the world to write a
8 Right-to-Know letter, why is Carl Greco
9 fighting them? You know, does he have
10 something to hide? Is there information he
11 doesn't want people to know?

12 MS. FANUCCI: Les, you misunderstood.
13 I didn't say he was fighting the
14 Right-to-Know, he was doing the
15 Right-to-Know. He was giving them the
16 information. It was that that was costing
17 the money. He wasn't fighting them, he was
18 providing the information for the
19 Right-to-Know.

20 MR. SPINDLER: Okay, well, you are
21 complaining about your tax dollars being
22 used for that --

23 MS. FANUCCI: I'm complaining about
24 two people doing it, yes.

25 MR. SPINDLER: Okay.

11

1 MS. FANUCCI: Over and over again who
2 actually sued again this week, yes.

3 MR. SPINDLER: Okay, well, why don't

4 you complain about Mayor Doherty appealing
5 arbitration losses all the time costing us
6 taxpayers over a \$1 million. You never say
7 a word about that, do you, Mrs. Fanucci? A
8 million and \$25,000, I don't think that's
9 even. You don't say a word about the
10 million dollars that he has wasted. \$25,000
11 is a drop in the bucket. He is costing the
12 taxpayers over a million dollars, but God
13 forbid you say something about the mayor
14 because you wouldn't say it because he won't
15 pull your strings to make you say that.
16 Thank you.

17 MS. FANUCCI: Who is pulling your
18 strings, Les?

19 MR. SPINDLER: No one. I say what I
20 want. I have a mind of my own.

21 MS. FANUCCI: If there something that
22 you have learned about me by now you should
23 know no one is pulling my strings.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Please. Pleas.

25 MS. FANUCCI: Don't stop me from

12

1 saying it though.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Please. Dave Gervasi.

3 MR. GERVASI: Good evening, City

4 Council. Dave Gervasi, firefighter and
5 resident of Scranton. I haven't been here
6 in awhile, but after watching the caucus I
7 think some of you still had some questions
8 about, you know, what you could do about
9 this situation and, you know, sometimes I
10 take it a little farther than most.

11 A couple of points I think could be
12 made, I do not believe, my understanding of
13 Act 47, I have read that allowed numerous
14 times, I don't think there is anything
15 legally the state can do to stop the city
16 from, you know, ratifying that agreement we
17 had. I know if the state gets mad they can
18 sanction the city, but, you know, I don't
19 know how well that's going to go over if
20 they tried that again because they did it
21 last time and it delayed the Market Street
22 bridge, I think they'd probably refold this
23 time if they tried to sanction the city any
24 liquids fuels money. Other than that, it's
25 hard for me to stand here and say that I

13

1 truly believe the mayor wants to cut a deal,
2 but I actually believe that. I mean, after
3 seven years for whatever reason, political
4 reasons, I don't know, whatever they're

5 thinking, but this was actually the first
6 time that the city initiated talks with us.
7 It was always us going in and things would
8 fall apart after awhile for the last seven
9 years, but I must say that the negotiating
10 team for the city, which was mostly Dick
11 Goldberg and Attorney Patterson, the city
12 solicitor, they seem like they this were
13 sincere in what they were doing and that's
14 what kept us at the table for two long days.
15 The ironic part of this whole thing to me is
16 why the state is so hung on these management
17 right clauses because it has nothing to do
18 with money. I mean, the agreement literally
19 came back with, you know, any changes in
20 health care and our copays were going to up
21 and things like that, and we agreed to, and
22 when this thing came back from the state
23 there wasn't one penny in difference.
24 Everything that was there and everything
25 that was negotiated upon was approved.

14

1 So, I mean, I hate to -- I'm going
2 to tell you my opinion. I mean, we have
3 been saying this for years and years and
4 years since 1992, long before I started

5 coming here and long before I was involved
6 on the board of our union, Scranton is
7 Pennsylvania Economy League's biggest client
8 under DCED, and frankly, they have made
9 recovery plans that were false. They made
10 claims here about borrowing \$44 million that
11 were false. Mrs. Gatelli, you called them
12 on it and I think it ended up \$10 million
13 instead of 44 and we didn't go bankrupt.
14 So, honest to God, I think that they don't
15 want us to have an agreement, I don't think
16 they want us to settle because if the city
17 recovers and this deal we cut saves the city
18 money, you know, and they raise the
19 distressed status they are out of a job. I
20 honestly believe that. I mean, I think the
21 state is -- I don't know why they are doing
22 this at this point, and again, you can't
23 push this. You can probably push the mayor
24 into it, you are probably not going to make
25 him happy, but you definitely are not going

15

1 to make the state happy apparently, but
2 again, this is just a shame.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: Can I ask you one
4 question, Mr. Gervasi?

5 MR. GERVASI: Absolutely.

6 MR. COURTRIGHT: Is that all right?
7 Am I hearing you correctly in your opinion,
8 and I know you are pretty well-versed in Act
9 47, in your opinion even if the city were to
10 agree what they shook hands on in that
11 agreement, right, that you feel the worst
12 care scenario what could happen to us would
13 be the state would be sanctioned by the
14 liquid fuels money.

15 MR. GERVASI: That's all they can
16 do. That's all they can do. That's the
17 most they can do.

18 MR. COURTRIGHT: In my opinion, that
19 would be a small price to pay. I just
20 wanted to get straight that that's what you
21 were saying. Thank you.

22 MR. GERVASI: Thank you.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Thanks for
24 indulging me there.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr. Gervasi.

16

1 Ozzie Quinn.

2 MR. QUINN: Ozzie Quinn, Taxpayers'
3 Association. I want to speak on 7-A
4 regarding the budget. Last year Mrs. Evans
5 she did a budget as finance chairperson for

6 the city council and they scoffed at it.
7 This year Mrs. Gatelli, who is the finance
8 chairperson, failed to do a budget. So, you
9 know, as the Taxpayers' Association we got
10 to look at the big picture and we think if
11 you did a budget, Mrs. Gatelli, to try to
12 lower what it is than it is right now, we
13 could have used that money to pay off some
14 of this debt, and you didn't do it. You
15 failed to do it. I believe you and
16 Mr. Doherty are part of the Peter principal,
17 incompetent as you go up. It's ashame that
18 you didn't do it as a representative of the
19 people.

20 The other thing is this year here,
21 on 7-C, I got the to know the people pretty
22 well that are into these food lines that
23 Mrs. Evans spoke about before about the food
24 drives between her and the Taxpayers'
25 Association and there is no doubt about it

17

1 that that OECD money that's going to be used
2 for Mr. Greco, Attorney Greco, again and
3 again and again every year, I understand
4 it's \$150,000 you are going to raise it? Is
5 that right, or is it \$100,000? What's the--

6 MS. GATELLI: It's \$150 in the

7 legislation.

8 MR. QUINN: Last week I was told it
9 was 100, but -- okay, so somebody wants to
10 raise it from 100 to \$150,000?

11 MS. GATELLI: Um-hum.

12 MR. QUINN: Well, you know, I did
13 send a letter under the Right-to-Know and I
14 didn't do it this week, but I sent one
15 September 7 and he still hasn't answered it,
16 so I don't know. I can't believe that. So,
17 the fact is that -- and we also know the
18 fact that he has contributed \$20,000 to
19 Mr. Doherty's election campaign and this is
20 again, it's pay to play. There is no doubt
21 about it. It's just -- it's just
22 perpetuating corruption in the City of
23 Scranton and while these people wait out
24 there, they want to give away \$150,000 to
25 Carl Greco who supports the mayor

18

1 financially, and yet poor people are walking
2 around trying to repair their roofs, trying
3 to do -- or trying to prepare their meeting
4 systems and we don't have the money to do
5 it. It's ashamed, and it's not only ashamed
6 it's obscene, but the fact that we again, we

7 have a situation where nobody cares and
8 nobody cares what happens and I don't care
9 what the mayor says about, you know, we are
10 going to do this for the neighborhood and
11 this for the neighborhood, it's all a lot of
12 talk. It's just the same as tonight we are
13 talking about the fire and the police union,
14 my thoughts on that are that Mr. Doherty
15 will agree to anything this year. It's
16 election year, and what he does as soon as
17 he shakes hands and says, yes, he goes and
18 calls Rendell who calls DCED and says, "Make
19 sure you stop there."

20 You know, I've been around a long
21 time, I know how this works. There is no
22 doubt about it. This man doesn't want this
23 because in the Recovery Plan in 2002 the
24 main argument with the firemen and the
25 police was the managerial rights and that's

19

1 what PEL is putting into the language right
2 now. It's ashamed and it should be stopped.
3 These men have not been paid for seven years
4 and Mr. Doherty wants to do everything but
5 leave the people out there remember what he
6 done \$150,000 contract and now an
7 opportunity to do something with the budget

8 and he gets Mrs. Gatelli not to enter a
9 budget. Thank you.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Bob Bolus.

11 MR. BOLUS: good evening, Council.
12 Bob Bolus, Scranton. Boy, some things just
13 never change. You can stay away here for
14 awhile and guess what, it's still the --

15 MS. FANUCCI: Groundhog Day.

16 MR. BOLUS -- same when you come in.

17 MS. FANUCCI: It's Groundhog Day,
18 Bob.

19 MR. BOLUS: You know, I think we need
20 to deal with the issues more than the
21 insults.

22 MS. FANUCCI: We'll be okay.

23 MR. BOLUS: It's the way it should
24 be, it's the way it used to be anyway.

25 MS. FANUCCI: I know.

20

1 MR. BOLUS: I guess we are all big
2 boys and girls here. Number one, I think we
3 need to start with 7-A. I don't think there
4 should be any raises in this budget for
5 Hayes or Moran, but I do agree that the
6 mayor should receive a raise, maybe we will
7 get a competent mayor in here that when you

8 get a handshake you won't get the knife in
9 your back as the fire department and
10 everybody else in the city gets while we are
11 doing it. So, yeah, I do think we need to
12 change that around a bit and there should be
13 definitely more money for the mayor here.

14 I think we need to stop the issues
15 here with Carl Greco, and. 7-C this is an
16 absolutely joke, it's been going on and on
17 and, the guy has made God knows how much
18 money, you know, there is other lawyers in
19 the city. There is one sitting over there.
20 I'm sure he would like to make \$150,000 this
21 year. They should all be given the
22 opportunity. They pay taxes here. They are
23 part of the community and it should be
24 spread around, you know, the pie shouldn't
25 go to just one person. I think Carl Grecos

21

1 eating a good share of the pie in this city,
2 he and the mayor and his associates, so I
3 think you need to look at it and vote it
4 down and make changes that start here. The
5 mayor can't do it without you, remember
6 that.

7 You know, another thing we look at
8 with the fire department and everything

9 else, past councils, then we read in the
10 paper an article where Kevin Murphy sat here
11 and said, "Geez, I was tricked, "when he
12 threw the fire department and the police
13 department under the bus when he voted for
14 Recovery Plan. Is that going to happen
15 again now? Then they are going to run for
16 another office and say, geez, we are going
17 to come back mea culpa, you know, I didn't
18 mean to throw you under the bus? Vote for
19 me and let me change the city when they are
20 only part of the city. You are not even
21 downtown. So, you know, I think we need to
22 stop it. We need to stop the politics. We
23 need to pay attention why we are all here
24 and that's about the people in the City of
25 Scranton.

22

1 We don't have to run for office on a
2 daily basis or a weekly basis here, what
3 runs for office is the job people do here,
4 and that's for the people in this city and
5 it's ashame. We want to build a library,
6 \$18 million. Bail out a bank over in South
7 Side, an old building that we are going to
8 buy and renovate and spend money on, what

9 are we going to do with the library over
10 here? Who has got the deal cut to buy out
11 the Scranton Public Library down there? Is
12 there a deal in the works that when that's
13 vacated for \$18 million? Come on, open our
14 eyes here.

15 What happened to Southern Union? We
16 could have bought it for what, like
17 \$4 million, \$3 million and did the same
18 thing, a brand new building never used.
19 Where was the mayor? He wasn't interested
20 in taking care of the people in the City of
21 Scranton, he is worried about cutting the
22 grass at Nay Aug or doing something where
23 nobody is even going to.

24 Carl Greco, if you do give him the
25 money, let him do his job, go in with t he

23

1 man and the old Southern Union building and
2 take it for the city, take it for the people
3 in the city. We already know what the value
4 is. It's a heck of a lot less than
5 \$18 million in south side. It's not
6 convenient. Let's go back to the DPW
7 complex where we get a \$1 year, another
8 Mayor Doherty deal. We are all over the
9 city. We look like idiots because we don't

10 know how to manage our assets and it's time
11 we have to stop that.

12 You know, the fire department we are
13 arguing, we are screwing them over
14 literally, I have said from day one the
15 meetings, the negotiations should be held
16 here publically. What we heard tonight is
17 he said/she said/they said, but you are
18 asking questions of people who are in the
19 meeting who are not even in it. Let them
20 sit here. It's our dollars, not council,
21 not Doherty's, and not the fire
22 department's. It's our money being spent to
23 do this, we want to know what's going on.
24 We don't only want part of the information.
25 It needs to be done here. You know,

24

1 Scranton is Scranton. We are unique in
2 geography. We are not Reading, we are not
3 Johnstown, we are nobody else. We are who
4 we are and their contract should be on what
5 they need to do here. The risk they take,
6 the job they do for us, I don't care what
7 somebody else does elsewhere, the topography
8 of their town or how they handle their
9 issues. We need to do our own issues and

10 our housekeeping because if they know a
11 better job than they are doing there, then
12 guess what, we should all be replaced and
13 let them do our job, and that's what's wrong
14 here in Scranton.

15 We are in the limelight, we are in
16 the spotlight of the nation, and quite
17 frankly, we all look like a bunch of idiots
18 in our leadership here to see what these
19 people are going through and the
20 embarrassment to the people who are
21 taxpayers in this city that built Scranton,
22 and that's what's wrong, ladies and
23 gentlemen.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

25 MR. BOLUS: It's time to come to the

25

1 plate and do right. Thank you.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr. Bolus.
3 Doug Miller.

4 MR. MILLER: Good evening, Council,
5 Doug Miller. I'll glad to see we all still
6 love each other here. I certainly haven't
7 missed much, that's for sure. It's ashame.
8 It really is, and we wonder why the meetings
9 aren't live. Just to briefly address
10 Channel 61, you know, I am pleased to hear

11 that the meetings will be live next week. I
12 believe we all had the opportunity to view
13 our government here as and for people to
14 come up here and complain that meetings
15 aren't live, well, you are going to have
16 them next week and hopefully with Channel 9
17 and 11 it will reach more living rooms.

18 Just regarding the budget, I believe no
19 raises should be given to anyone until our
20 police and firemen are given raises. You
21 know, it's been seven long years and I don't
22 believe a raise should be given to anyone
23 else. I find it to be a total slap in the
24 face to our police and firemen and I ask
25 this council not to pass this budget unless

26

1 those raises are taken out.

2 I do agree with Mrs. Gatelli
3 regarding the pay raise for the mayor. I
4 believe this will certainly help attract
5 higher quality candidates. Running this
6 city on a daily basis is certainly not an
7 easy operation and so I hope council would
8 consider that for the future.

9 And regarding the finance chair,
10 some statements were made tonight that the

11 finance chair must submit a budget, in my
12 opinion I certainly don't feel it's the
13 requirement that they must submit a budget.
14 I mean, we have a budget submitted by the
15 mayor and I certainly believe that a finance
16 chair should city down with council and the
17 mayor and lead any amendments that should be
18 made or any other changes regarding the
19 budget and so I certainly don't believe the
20 criticism against Mrs. Gatelli is fair, you
21 know, I think you can look at the definition
22 of finance chair and it doesn't say they
23 must submit a budget. I know it's been done
24 in the past and that's great, but it
25 certainly is not a requirement. Thank you.

27

1 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr. Miller.
2 Fay Franus.

3 MS. FRANUS: Fay Franus, Scranton.
4 Although, as Mr. Miller said, the finance
5 chairman must not necessarily do a budget,
6 Mrs. Gatelli, I'd like to ask you if you
7 were representing the people why didn't you
8 make your own budget? I know you said last
9 week you were working with Stu Renda, but
10 Stu Renda, is a business administrator last
11 I checked. His title is --

12 MS. GATELLI: Yes, I worked with him
13 on what I thought the budget should look
14 like.

15 MS. FRANUS: Basically it's a
16 conflict of interest. You should be
17 representing the people, should you not?
18 Mr. Renda is representing the mayor. It's
19 like having --

20 MS. GATELLI: And I was representing
21 council.

22 MS. FRANUS: What about the people?
23 That's who you should be representing, not
24 council.

25 MS. GATELLI: That's who I was

28

1 representing.

2 MS. FRANUS: Council?

3 MS. GATELLI: When I was sitting
4 there with Mr. Renda.

5 MS. FRANUS: You should be
6 representing the people. Why did you not do
7 your own budget like Mrs. Evans has in the
8 past? Why didn't you -- you are getting
9 paid to do the budget why didn't you do it?

10 MS. GATELLI: Why can't -- I don't
11 get paid to do the budget, Mrs. Franus.

12 MS. FRANUS: You are finance chair,
13 that's part of it.

14 MS. GATELLI: No, it isn't.

15 MS. FRANUS: Oh, really, okay. It
16 isn't.

17 MS. GATELLI: It's not part of the
18 finance chair's responsibility.

19 MS. FRANUS: Okay, but why do you
20 feel as finance chair that you shouldn't do
21 the budget if are you representing the
22 people, because Stu Renda's budget is the
23 mayor's budget. I mean, all of these
24 administrative positions that the mayor
25 created, that budget includes pay for them.

29

1 I mean, you have to be paid.

2 MS. GATELLI: And there will be
3 amendments to the budget.

4 MS. FRANUS: And those people will
5 still have their positions that were
6 created, millions of dollars of positions
7 that were created that you think they should
8 stay in. You know you rang a bell last
9 year, you can't unring it. You and
10 Mrs. Fanucci and Mr. McGoff gave the city a
11 25 percent tax increase, you can't erase
12 that, that's there. That was your doing,

13 and there was a budget proposed that cut out
14 all tax increases and elimination of jobs in
15 city hall, lowering the wage tax, but you
16 ignored it. And this year you don't even
17 want to do a budget, but yet you say you are
18 representing the people. Do you say now
19 that you represent me at all? I guess
20 that's a no.

21 I mean, we come here as citizens and
22 we ask to come here and we ask questions of
23 our council members and we, out of my own
24 pocket, pay you and you won't -- you refuse
25 to answer my questions. I find that

30

1 startling.

2 MS. GATELLI: I find it startling
3 that you only harass me, Mrs. Franus. Isn't
4 that amazing?

5 MS. FRANUS: You are the finance
6 chair and the budget is now.

7 MS. GATELLI: If it wasn't the
8 finance chair it would be something else.

9 MS. FRANUS: We are talking about
10 the budget.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Franus, Mrs.
12 Gatelli gave you repeatedly --

13 MS. FRANUS: It's your responsibility

14 --

15 MS. GATELLI: Everyone knows why you
16 are here, Mrs. Franus.

17 MS. FRANUS: Mr. McGoff, I'm
18 speaking, okay? It's my --

19 MR. MCGOFF: No, you are asking
20 questions and asking for an answer and
21 Mrs. Gatelli provided that answer at least
22 three times.

23 MS. FRANUS: No, she didn't. I
24 asked if she was representing me. She
25 didn't answer that question. Where were

31

1 you? And besides, Mr. McGoff, I don't think
2 Mrs. Gatelli needs you to answer for her.
3 She can speak for herself. She is not 16.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Apparently you weren't
5 listening to her answer, so I thought maybe
6 I would help.

7 MS. FRANUS: Well, you have done
8 that many times before. I don't think I
9 need your -- if I wanted to ask you
10 something I would. Thank you.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Actually, all of the
12 questions should come through the president.
13 I'm allowed to --

14 MR. FRANUS: Well, that's fine, but
15 if I'm going to have to ask through the
16 president so would everybody else. That's
17 my point. You don't pick and choose.

18 MS. FANNUCCI: That's fine.

19 MR. MCGOFF: Well, I haven't.

20 MS. FRANUS: Well, then there is no
21 point in saying it. You should make
22 everybody else do it. I don't want to talk
23 about that. I asked Mrs. Fanucci --
24 Mrs. Gatelli rather, why she didn't do a
25 budget and she said -- I just think that it

32

1 was her position as finance chair to cut
2 positions in city hall to save the taxpayers
3 money because we will never make up for that
4 25 percent that she made us get last year.
5 She never even wanted to look at Mr. Evans'
6 budget. Nobody did except Doddy.

7 So, Billy, I think the taxpayers
8 need someone in finance that could them, not
9 the mayor. When I heard you saying you were
10 working with Stu Renda that's like going
11 down to the mayor's house and saying, "What
12 do you want me to do?"

13 MS. GATELLI: Mrs. Franus, I took

14 the finance chair because no one else wanted
15 it. That's the facts.

16 MR. FRANUS: That's not the point.

17 MS. GATELLI: Mrs. Evans resigned
18 from it.

19 MS. FRANUS: Fine. But since you
20 have it, you should do the work that should
21 be involved in it.

22 MS. GATELLI: That's not required as
23 the finance chair.

24 MS. FRANUS: Oh, so, in other words,
25 to be the finance chair you don't have to do

33

1 the work that's -- what's required as
2 finance chair then? Mrs. Evans always did
3 the work. He never said it wasn't required
4 of me.

5 MS. GATELLI: It's not worth even
6 arguing.

7 MS. FRANUS: I mean, you are the
8 finance chair. Everybody else as the chair
9 of their department does their work. If
10 someone were to ask Mr. Courtright a
11 question in his chairmanship he would
12 answer. He doesn't say, "That isn't
13 required of me."

14 I just definitely think you should

15 start representing the people instead of
16 Mayor Chris Doherty. You are finance chair.
17 Totally unbelievable.

18 MS. EVANS: Mrs. Franus?

19 MS. FRANUS: Yes.

20 MS. EVANS: As far as I know having
21 served as finance chair for several years,
22 the drafting of the budget is not a
23 requirement. In the event that all of
24 council or at least a supermajority of
25 council would not be in agreement with the

34

1 mayor's budget, then council must under
2 those circumstances draft an alternative.
3 However, I did so because I chose to do so.
4 I was not satisfied with what I saw in the
5 mayor's budget and I wanted to try to do
6 better to help the people, but it's not a
7 requirement.

8 MS. FRANUS: Okay, but you did it
9 for the people. Judy doesn't want to take
10 that extra step for the people. She wants
11 to go along with Mayor Doherty.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mrs. Franus.

13 MS. FRANUS: and one more thing,
14 Mr. McGoff, I think that you mentioned

15 earlier that you would possibly -- somebody
16 mentioned that maybe they wouldn't -- for
17 the firemen and policemen you would stop the
18 budget maybe, but I think Marie Schumacher
19 if you don't vote on a budget by December 15
20 it's automatic anyway so you can't stop the
21 budget. Is there a meeting next week?

22 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. Thank you, Mrs.
23 Franus. Marie Schumacher.

24 MS. SCHUMACHER: Marie Schumacher,
25 resident and member of the Taxpayers'

35

1 Association. The November 18 agenda, Item
2 5-C, amended an earlier resolution which
3 accepted recommendations of the Historical
4 Architectural Review Board for installation
5 of a new roof with architectural shingles,
6 pointing of a bricks, replacement of window
7 opening fillers and replacement of existing
8 signs to correct the address from 225 Vine
9 Street, a commercial building, to 802 North
10 Webster Avenue, a private home. I would
11 like to know during -- later in the
12 responses, what gives HARB the authority
13 over what improvements a resident may do to
14 their personal properties.

15 Next, I would like to make a budget

16 recommendation. Assuming Mrs. Gatelli is
17 serious about assigning the resources
18 required to implement the rental
19 registration ordinance passed in July of
20 2007, then using Mrs. Gatelli's own
21 projections of revenues, there should be
22 increased 2009 revenue not included in the
23 mayor's budget of slightly less than
24 \$1.5 million. I suggest that part of this
25 revenue be used to give bonuses of \$100 or

36

1 \$100 per month to our firefighters and
2 police who have gone seven years without an
3 increase.

4 On 7-A, I would like to know if
5 there are going to be any amendments that
6 would include the revenue from OECD moving
7 here for half a year, the rental
8 registration income, the addition of the
9 personnel to implement that, donation for
10 ECTV, etcetera, things that were discussed
11 during the budget and last week, and I hope
12 that it is not just a -- 7-A is just not a
13 mayor's budget because that would be very
14 disappointing and also elimination of the
15 two \$10,000 increases.

16 Now, with respect to tonight's
17 agenda items, 5-D, E and F, there are three
18 appointments to a Scranton Housing Appeals
19 Review Board. I have several questions. It
20 is my understanding that the purpose of this
21 board is to set minimum standards covering
22 the condition and maintenance of dwellings.
23 So my first question is why Scranton needs
24 such a board other than an opportunity to
25 the mayor to make appointments.

37

1 Mrs. Gatelli has said Scranton uses national
2 building codes so why do we need this board
3 other than an opportunity perhaps to harass
4 property owners.

5 Where are the minimum standards of
6 this board available for public review? I
7 had trouble even establishing that this is a
8 city board. What are the professions of
9 these three appointees that qualify them to
10 establish minimum standards? Do we really
11 need property police?

12 Next, today' Times-Tribune court
13 notes reviews the Impanema Grill has had a
14 federal tax lien imposed. Since council
15 approved a 10-year \$40,000 loan to this
16 establishment on January 25, 2007, will this

17 loan be called in for repayment? I do
18 believe that the loan terms require tax
19 payment currency. Back when this loan was
20 approved, there was considerable discussion
21 among Andy Sbaraglia, Mrs. Gatelli and
22 Mrs. Evans on loans in general, and the
23 city's position that resulted in
24 Mrs. Gatelli instructing Mrs. Garvey to send
25 a letter to Mr. Hailstone, then OECD

38

1 director, to require -- requesting a written
2 accounting of all loans and delinquencies as
3 well as some other loan information. I'd
4 also like to know tonight whether that
5 letter was -- a response was ever received
6 and if so where may the public access this
7 information.

8 On April 12 last year reporting on
9 the justification for the quarter a million
10 dollar Alexander Salon loan, Mrs. Fanucci
11 stated: "And here is what's happening, they
12 are actually expanding two floors. The
13 first and second floor and the third floor.
14 They believe a more realistic number of
15 positions that will be created will be 15
16 and that would be in the first year. These

17 positions will result in additional
18 professionals needed for a medical spa.
19 What they are going to do, the first floor
20 will be the salon, the second floor will be
21 a new fitness center, third floor is going
22 to be a medical spa. They are going to have
23 doctors, nurses and also they are putting in
24 an outdoor seating cafeteria on the first
25 floor. All of their collateral will be in

39

1 the new equipment."

2 I would like to know since the
3 fitness center, the medical spa and the
4 outdoor cafeteria don't exist, and that
5 equipment is used for collateral, how much
6 of that quarter of a million dollars has
7 been transferred to Alexander's without the
8 collateral? I did note in the Assessor's
9 that the Fratellis did buy the building in
10 October as reported they would do, so that
11 was good news.

12 Now, down on the site of the former
13 Holiday Manor Nursing Home -- may I finish
14 this one point?

15 MR. MCGOFF: Please.

16 MS. SCHUMACHER: There is a parcel of
17 land that's fenced off that reads: "Private

18 property. Parking for employees of
19 Tobyhanna Federal Credit Union. All others
20 will be towed."

21 According to the Assessor's records,
22 Tobyhanna Credit Union does not own this
23 property and I'd like to know how they are
24 allowed to take it over without paying any
25 taxes or fees to the city. Thank you.

40

1 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mrs.
2 Schumacher. Bill Jackowitz.

3 MR. JACKOWITZ: Salaam aleikum. In
4 memory of Jim Davis, a regular speaker at
5 city council, who passed away on Saturday.
6 Hopefully someone will take up his fight for
7 the children of the Central City of
8 Scranton. Bill Jackowitz, South Scranton,
9 member of the Taxpayers' Association.
10 Toastmaster's International, the person at
11 the podium is the speaker, everybody else
12 are the listeners. I would like to start
13 off tonight by commending Mayor Doherty and
14 the City of Scranton, elected officials and
15 appointees for their outstanding work they
16 accomplished in the construction and
17 dedication of the Hero's monument at Nay Aug

18 Park. The ceremony that was conducted on
19 26th November 2006, was awesome. Family
20 members of the falling war fighters and
21 elected officials, veterans, state troopers,
22 clergy and over 150 citizens attending.

23 Council President McGoff
24 represented Scranton City Council. Job well
25 done. The original idea came from a family

41

1 member of a fallen warfighter. Mayor
2 Doherty then picked up the ball and ran with
3 it. ECTV filmed the ceremony and has
4 replayed it several times. I hope people
5 had the opportunity to see it. Job well
6 done by everybody involved.

7 Now, getting back to the Scranton
8 budget for 2009. Cuts must be made in the
9 budget. The citizens cannot afford a
10 \$77 million plus budget. The economy in
11 Scranton and the entire world is in total
12 disarray. We cannot be talking about
13 raising any elected official or appointed
14 official's salary. Seriously, you should be
15 talking about reducing these salaries.
16 Remember, elected officials and political
17 appointees are servants of the taxpayers and
18 work for the taxpayers. Government

19 positions were never intended to be
20 lucrative, high-paying positions. \$150,000
21 for a part-time city attorney, please, let's
22 be realistic not sadistic.

23 Chief Elliott and Chief Davis should
24 return their \$15,000 raise immediately.
25 City government salaries should be reduced

42

1 until you the economy improves and the
2 firefighters and police officers get their
3 contracts signed.

4 The mayor of Scranton must not be a
5 bad job. Mayor Doherty spent \$1 million to
6 get the job, no raise there either, until
7 the contracts are signed, distressed city
8 status removed and Recovery Plan
9 implemented. The same goes for Ray Hayes,
10 Lisa Moran, Stu Renda, should also return
11 some taxpayers' money until the budget is
12 balanced. No raises until the contracts are
13 signed.

14 The Right-to-Know is just what the
15 title state, every citizen has the right to
16 know how their tax money is being spent and
17 by whom for what. Pennsylvania has one of
18 the weakest Rights to Know law in the

19 country and Scranton is worst yet. What are
20 they hiding from the public?

21 As far as \$25,000 being spent, if
22 OECD would produce the information
23 immediately upon receipt of a Right-to-Know
24 letter less money would be spent. Sounds
25 like overbilling to me. Instead, OECD and

43

1 other government agencies deny this
2 information and make it harder on themselves
3 and the taxpayer who is requesting the
4 information. Remember, fair, honest and
5 open government. That is what is required
6 for this city, county, state and nation to
7 survive. Change is needed and it will come
8 sooner than we think.

9 The days of back room politics and
10 hiding information will soon cease to exist.
11 I strongly voter taxpayers to request
12 information from the government agencies. A
13 \$500 campaign contribution does not equal a
14 \$5,000 pay raise.

15 As far as the loan to Boscov,
16 according to the national research groups
17 and economic experts, foreclosures wave to
18 malls and hotels. Both places where
19 Scranton taxpayer money has been used to

20 bail out owners and large corporations such
21 as the Hilton, Radisson and now Boscov's.
22 Some day the taxpayers of Scranton will be
23 given a break and they will start to elect
24 politicians who have the community's best
25 interest in mind, not the best interest of

44

1 family, friends and campaign contributors.
2 The 500 block of Lackawanna Avenue
3 has received over \$30 million in taxpayers'
4 money. Please, enough is enough. The
5 street is a mess and has been for over four
6 years. The taxpayers will never recoup
7 their money. No more taxpayers' money for
8 millionaires, the developers and campaign
9 contributors. Remember, the firefighters
10 and police officers. These are the city
11 workers who risk their lives every time they
12 put their uniforms on to go to work. They
13 never know what their day may bring and they
14 are always ready to put their live on the
15 line for the citizens and politicians. Just
16 like those sixth-grade warfighters did.
17 They paid the ultimate price just like
18 Captain Robeson, Scranton Fire Department
19 did. Firefighters and police officers and

20 warfighters sign a contract up to and
21 including their life to protect the citizens
22 of Scranton, Pennsylvania, and this nation.
23 Please respect them.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr.
25 Jackowitz. Tom Ungvarsky.

45

1 MR. UNGVARSKY: Good evening, city
2 council, I'm Tom Ungvarsky, and I'm also a
3 member of the Scranton/Lackawanna County
4 Taxpayers. A week ago Monday our
5 organization had a meeting, and on our
6 agenda was the loan to Boscov's. We spoke
7 on it, we asked questions, but we never did
8 reach any consensus on it. The following
9 night was the council's meeting. While I
10 heard some council members say we are going
11 to approve it, it's mainly because the mayor
12 wants it for his downtown. I think it
13 should be put on the agenda for next week
14 and you people should talk about it and show
15 us the pros and cons of this loan that
16 Mr. Boscov is getting.

17 Mr. McGoff, this will be the fourth
18 time that I'm asking about SECCAUS, LLC.
19 They got \$20,000. They were granted \$20,000
20 from the city council to educate their

21 workers. Perhaps this is the reason why I'm
22 not getting an answer as to why LLC -- or
23 SECCAUS, LLC is not coming to town.

24 I also believe, Mrs. Gatelli, that
25 the city -- that city council should have

46

1 provided an alternative budget. Just to
2 have one budget and okay it as it is, is not
3 in the interest of the taxpayers.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you,
5 Mr. Ungvarsky. Ron Ellman.

6 MR. ELLMAN: Ronnie Ellman again. I
7 look like I kangaroo over here with this
8 pouch over here if I can find something.
9 I'm almost ready. The dollar ones. I know
10 everybody is probably familiar with the
11 corner of Lackawanna and Seventh Avenue, you
12 got the U-Haul in over there and the beer
13 place, the new bridge and the \$100 million
14 bus terminal that I guess there is going to
15 be a restaurant at the produce place. Do
16 you know that I guess it would be the
17 northeast corner, that's got to be one of
18 the best pieces of property in the city, if
19 not the county, and that's KOZ. The big
20 sign out there. I'd like know, I wish Todd

21 O'Malley would come in here with his pearly
22 whites and explain why a piece of property
23 like this was made KOZ or somebody from that
24 school board. You couldn't have a better
25 piece of property to buy or rent than this

47

1 and it's eight years now. How many jobs did
2 they get out of that property? You know,
3 this is ridiculous as someone saying I had
4 an affair with Paris Hilton or something.
5 It's senseless. I'm not going to harp on
6 it. I go -- I have gone by there and seen
7 the sign, a big sign, KOZ. It's only got a
8 couple of years left, I think, but why in
9 the world would somebody allow this piece of
10 property to be KOZ, you know. I have talked
11 to some people downtown they have got KOZ
12 property and they have hired a couple of
13 waitresses at like \$3 an hour and their
14 tips, and what are they doing when the KOZ
15 is up? They won't be here. Nobody is going
16 to rent the damn things and they're just
17 history like the -- I remember somebody had
18 a KOZ that they had to tear down because of
19 the flood, they allowed them to take the KOZ
20 to a new location which I was told is
21 completely illegal to do something like

22 that. The KOZ is for the property, not the
23 person, but nobody objected. That's enough.
24 I get so mad.

25 I had a lady come up to me at the

48

1 Price Rite a few days ago, and she got a
2 relative that lives at the Midtown
3 Apartments and she sort of -- we were
4 talking for a second or two. She said she
5 wished Mrs. Simmons would forget about the
6 Obama and come back and help the people over
7 there, you know, the mayor's legacy one of
8 them is going to be the medical school and
9 he is going to get it by displacing 700
10 people in those apartments and he is
11 throwing these people under the bus. This
12 is terrible. You can see it coming and no
13 one is doing a thing to help these people.
14 They will be scattered all over the place
15 like happened with the Olive Street
16 apartments. There is no reason in the world
17 those apartments haven't been fixed. They
18 could have been fixed in a matter of weeks.
19 I'm not going to get into it, but I have
20 talked to -- I have talked to someone and
21 they told me they could have been fixed in

22 weeks if anybody cared. It's just a waiting
23 game where they will be so deteriorated they
24 are saying they are too far gone to work on.

25 This is just such a waste. This is --

49

1 it's a waste of people to -- Mr. Doherty has
2 this thing for the poor people in the city.
3 He doesn't care about the working people.
4 You can see it with what's going on all
5 around here. It just terrible. You know,
6 to me, I think that Mr. Doherty is the
7 problem with the city not the solution. He
8 is the problem. He is incapable of running
9 this city properly and he has no incentive
10 for a budget. You keep talking budget,
11 budget, budget, he has no incentive to
12 follow a budget because he keeps borrowing.
13 He is allowed to borrow and borrow and
14 borrow and it doesn't stop. I got a little
15 quick note here. I was watching last week
16 Ted Turner was on Good Morning America and I
17 know he is not at as knowledgeable and
18 successful as our esteemed mayor, but he had
19 some good words. He said, "We spent much
20 more money than we are taking in, therefore,
21 borrowing is against any successful plan of
22 success. It's useless."

23 Mayor Doherty needs to remember
24 those words. Thank you.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you, Mr. Ellman.

50

1 David Dobson.

2 MR. DOBSON: Good evening, Council.
3 Dave Dobson, resident of Scranton and member
4 of the Taxpayers. On this Right-to-Know
5 business with Mr. Greco, I'm pleased to
6 announce that we have been a new law and
7 hopefully we won't have to waste \$25,000
8 every time somebody asks for some kind of
9 legal fact or expenditure, and on my
10 Christmas wish list I hope we keep the
11 police and firemen in mind and to try and
12 get this contract settled. It's really a
13 bad mark for everybody in town. We should
14 have never, ever voted for the Recovery
15 Plan. We obviously didn't understand enough
16 about it and it's actually been too long. I
17 mean, even old Joe Stalin used to have a
18 five-year plan, we have a seven-year and
19 eight-year and ten-year plan, so it will be
20 nice to see that these people get their
21 raises and, well, we will have to deal with
22 it if there is any tax increases in the

23 future, but that's the way things are.

24 And on our library, I have one
25 concern on that, and that is this, that

51

1 central city is the hub of Scranton for all
2 Colts buses. They leave the various parts
3 of our area from all the way from up in
4 Madisonville and so forth or Daleville and
5 return to Scranton in central city and drop
6 off either in front of Oppenheim's, the old
7 Oppenheim's building or the old Globe Store,
8 and that's several blocks away from
9 anything. Now, somebody mentioned the few
10 days ago that there is a Cedar Avenue bus,
11 but I think they are wrong there. I have
12 never seen a bus on that corner. My bank
13 is, in fact, the Penn Security Bank, so I
14 have been on that corner quite a bit and to
15 my understanding there is no bus service
16 that would drop off directly in front of the
17 place.

18 And, once again, I'll mention that
19 I'm not representing anybody on public
20 access TV. I understand that it might not
21 be logical to drag everybody in the city
22 hall for a meeting, but it would be nice if
23 in the future, and I'll bring it up after

24 January possibly, that whatever could be
25 done to increase the amount of meetings it

52

1 would be greatly include public access TV
2 and the fact that these people wouldn't have
3 to travel constantly and relocate equipment
4 and so forth and go through all of this.
5 So, as far as that's concerned half of one
6 is better than none sometimes, but we
7 certainly could have a commissioner's
8 meeting in city hall. But, you know, it
9 would be interesting to see some kind of
10 attempt made to centralize some of these
11 meetings so that they could better afford
12 coverage and provide coverage and not have
13 to turn it into an all-day affair just to do
14 this. Thank you, and have a good night.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you. Andy
16 Sbaraglia? Any other speakers?

17 MR. ANCHERANI: Good evening.
18 Nelson Ancherani. Well, here we are.
19 Tonight is the third reading of the budget,
20 were any of you able to find out why the
21 percentages of the expenditures pie totals
22 101 percent instead of 100 percent? That's
23 on page five of the budget. Were any of you

24 able to find out why the percentages in the
25 expenditure pie slices on page five of the

53

1 budget are all higher or greater than the
2 actual percentages for the actual budget
3 amount listed in the budget? An example
4 being the preslice of the pie. It's listed
5 on the expenditure page five as 24 percent
6 or \$18,800,000. When the actual expenditure
7 for the police department on page 56 of the
8 budget is \$13,250,000. That's a difference
9 of 5.5 million dollars. That is how it is
10 for all of the slices of the pie. There is
11 a difference in every one of them. Anyone
12 know why? Does anyone know why the Scranton
13 Parking Authority is getting \$879,830 this
14 year for SPA citation issuers it's an
15 increase of \$76,000, and this is considering
16 the Scranton Parking Authority got a
17 \$35 million bond or loan last year that will
18 eventually cost the city over the life of
19 the loan \$94 million. Does anyone know why
20 or how many Scranton Parking Authority
21 citation issuers there are? They are listed
22 as an expenditure out of the business
23 administration office. As an expenditure on
24 page 37 of the budget.

1 know what a TAN or a tax anticipation note
2 is? Anyone know why the TANS are not
3 reflected on the revenue pie chart, page
4 four, or the expenditure pie chart on page
5 five of the budget? Does anyone know where
6 the TANS are reflected in the budget and how
7 they are addressed?

8 Does anyone know why the police and
9 fire departments are still getting the blame
10 for the city not getting out of the
11 distressed status when for the last six
12 years and more the police and fire budgets
13 are less than the year before? Has anyone
14 done their homework by checking out the
15 budget page by page, you know, the time you
16 spend besides the approximately 40 meetings
17 that you have scheduled per year?

18 Why are there administrative raises
19 when the police and fire unions aren't even
20 getting cost of living raises?

21 It's been said that the city is
22 going to appeal the firemen's award that
23 came down recently. Our own Stu Renda
24 reports that the award will cost the city

25

2.6 million through 2014, and this is from

55

1

our Stu Renda who has increased his salary
2 by 46,000 since being employed by the city.
3 He now earns \$85,000 per year. Our friend,
4 Stu, forgot about the raises and 59 new
5 hires that will ultimately cost the city at
6 least \$20 million by the end of the 2009.
7 Any takers on the questions? Okay. Then
8 I'll ask that 7-A be tabled until you do
9 your homework.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Mrs. Fanucci pushed last week for
the \$150,000 for Attorney Greco. She
criticized the serial Right-to-Know filers
for wanting to know what is it going on in
the city. She put up a loud vocal argument.
I really wish she was at vocal and
criticized the serial appealer for costing
the taxpayers millions in appealing awards
from arbitrators because the city violated
contracts. So, I guess the serial appealers
can also be called the serial contract
violator. Thank you.

MR. MCGOFF: Thank you,

Mr. Ancherani. Anyone else?

MS. KRAKE: Good evening, Council.

My name is Nancy Krake. Three contracts ago

1 I was president of the clerical union and we
2 were on our previous Recovery Plan, and that
3 was negotiated by myself, John O'Shea for
4 the police and Mike Ferke for fire, and that
5 was under Mayor Connors. All of the raises
6 that were received were the same. They were
7 the same for unions and for nonunion. We
8 had a health care committee which the
9 Pennsylvania Economy League walked out of
10 the first day of the meeting. That saved
11 the city almost \$5 million. That took us
12 out of the red and into the black before
13 Mayor Doherty became mayor.

14 The Pennsylvania Economy League was
15 not for those contracts, they were not for
16 the saving the money, yet, everything went
17 well. And it was at that time when Mayor
18 Doherty came in that the teachers had gotten
19 their last horrendous contract and they were
20 told to vote for that because that's what
21 fire and police were going to get under the
22 new Recovery Plan. Well, they never
23 accepted it.

24 My union, unfortunately, did twice.
25 The first time I was not part of the

1 negotiations, and the second time I pretty
2 much was very upset with what was going on
3 at the negotiations and the health care
4 committee was eliminated I recommended to
5 the people that they not vote for it.

6 Jumping ahead a little, two weeks
7 ago after the meeting I had gone up to
8 Mr. Fanucci and told her she had no right to
9 tell people we couldn't say what we wanted
10 at the podium and she said -- one of the
11 remarks she made to me was that my people
12 had thrown me under the bus and that I had
13 no one following me anymore, and she is
14 absolutely right. I have been under that
15 bus and glad to be there. In fact, I got in
16 front of the bus from December of 2001 when
17 at a Christmas meeting Mayor Doherty, who
18 was still on council, eliminated 20 some
19 union jobs and it appeared in my mail box on
20 January 1 a letter with the list of names
21 telling people not to report for work. So,
22 I many gladly getting under that bus time
23 and time again for the sake of all union
24 workers. My people, for whatever reasons,
25 did not vote the right way. Out of fear,

1 out of hope for something, you know, a few
2 crumbs, and that is their choice and that is
3 their right, but it's always my hope that
4 things will be better for all workers for
5 police and fire, for teachers, for everyone.
6 I was very glad to see them get the contract
7 that they deserve and I hope after what I
8 saw here tonight, the unity of this council,
9 that police and fire will get a good
10 contract in the end that benefits everybody.
11 Maybe some day my people will get their
12 management rights back.

13 Some of the things that happened
14 with those management rights are this: The
15 city has a right to change unilaterally any
16 job description. Well, one example would be
17 heating and ventilating and air conditioning
18 description. They changed it to put one
19 person in there. They took away whole
20 bunches of things that person needs to know.
21 That person left a year ago. It has since
22 to be filled, and that's by a person who is
23 getting a \$10,000 raise, the human resources
24 director. And another thing, she is the one
25 that said we had no maternity leave in our

1 contract, that she had taken that out in
2 that first contract when she scared everyone
3 and told them they better vote for it, this
4 was in 2002 when we lost the referendum,
5 well, it was still in there and we won the
6 arbitration. After we won it, she didn't
7 appeal it. It's the only one not appealed.
8 She took two retroactive maternity leaves
9 for herself and took one into the future, so
10 this is what management rights can cause.

11 Management rights are for us.
12 Well, where is the management rights that
13 hold management accountable? Supposedly
14 they are in the Home Rule Charter and the
15 Municipal Code. Every time we see those
16 trying to be enforced there is an uproar.
17 How dare they hold our city government to
18 taxing? It's really not fair and I just
19 hope that I continue to be able to come here
20 and put myself under the bus, because I
21 really don't mind, and we'll just keep
22 bringing the facts to light. Thank you.

23 MR. MORGAN: Good evening, Council.
24 The first thing I have tonight is, you know,
25 I really enjoy coming here when all of these

1 people get up and they speak their minds,
2 you know, Mr. Jackowitz remembering
3 Mr. Davis, who didn't always say things that
4 everybody agreed with, but he represented a
5 lot of people, and I'm not just talking
6 about minorities, I'm talking about all of
7 the children in central city when he was
8 concerned about their safety and the safe
9 place to I guess -- place the work and, you
10 know, their education he was involved with.
11 He really wanted to see that every child got
12 a quality education. This man was
13 multi-dimensional and, you know, even though
14 everybody may not agree with everything he
15 said, he had a lot of important things to
16 say. And when you take a look at what other
17 speakers have said here, Ozzie Quinn, Marie,
18 Nelson, you know, they are absolutely right
19 about the fiscal situation the city finds
20 itself in, and a lot of the other issues
21 that they present here every week, week
22 after week after week. We do have a lot of
23 problems here that could have been solved a
24 long time ago if all of the information the
25 city had at it's disposal was put on the

1 computer and given to the residents of this
2 city so they could be more informed. The
3 terrible crimes, in my opinion, that were
4 committed by removing the cameras and the
5 live feed, yes, soon they will be live
6 again. We have had the leadership of a very
7 poor leader for a very long time. I hope
8 that someone will run against this mayor and
9 win because we definitely need leadership in
10 this city and we don't have any.

11 Now, I think that what this council
12 really needs to do is I agree with Nelson.
13 We need to table this budget. We need to
14 come up with an interim budget, a temporary
15 budget. We need to go into the
16 neighborhoods and for once ask the residents
17 of this city what do you want because we
18 have been rough shot over by this
19 administration, and I hate to say this,
20 council has multiple times introduced
21 budgets not in the best interest of the
22 residents. You can say whatever you want to
23 say about this city, but we have got a
24 terrible bleed here. Our neighborhoods are
25 a mess. There are people that are actually

1 still abandoning their properties. The
2 amount of properties for sale in this city
3 is really a crime. It really is. This is a
4 beautiful city, there is no doubt about
5 that. Can this city come back? Absolutely.
6 But not with this leadership, okay? From
7 the America Anglican deal right down to all
8 of the borrowing and it's all been wrong and
9 we've got to change direction, so what I
10 think this council needs to do is table the
11 budget. Come up with a short period budget,
12 an interim budget to keep this thing
13 functioning, and let's go out and ask the
14 people what they want, okay?

15 And the other thing I think we need
16 to do is that we need to bring a motion to
17 -- council needs to introduce a motion and
18 remove the delinquent tax fees. We have got
19 to face the reality that this is country is
20 in a major recession. We have also got to
21 face the fact that a large percentage of
22 Scrantonians are below the poverty level.
23 We have got to finally begin to represent
24 the unheard voices of the residents of this
25 city. It's pretty simple what's going on

1 here. We can all talk politics here and we

2 can all take orders from the mayor or
3 whoever else is calling the shots here, but
4 this budget is wrong, the budget has been
5 wrong for a numerous years. It's offered us
6 nothing, we have borrowed a ton of money,
7 and you know what we have to show for it?
8 Absolutely nothing.

9 We have a municipal golf course that
10 at least used to give us money. We don't
11 even have that. We have sold everything we
12 can sell. We have done favors for everybody
13 you can imagine except for the people living
14 in the neighborhoods. They still don't even
15 have a playground program. Do we have a war
16 on drugs? Somebody needs to ask Judge
17 Barrasse if we really have a war on drugs
18 because we don't seem to have enough time or
19 money to create a program for the youth in
20 this city to try to lead them in a
21 constructive manner in the summer when they
22 need some supervision. Think about it.
23 It's your job. There is nothing funny here.
24 There is nothing humorous here, it's just a
25 crime, and this council is perpetuating it.

1 And we have a mayor who claims he is

2 a leader, and he hasn't lead. He has just
3 borrowed a ton of money. He has abused all
4 of his employees, okay, and he has misused,
5 okay, the city's building inspectors in a
6 way that I don't think any mayor has ever
7 done. I think it's a crime. I think that
8 really this man is definitely just a
9 criminal in office. Thank you.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else? Mrs.
11 Evans?

12 MS. EVANS: Good evening. First, I
13 wish to apologize for my absence from last
14 week's council meeting due to illness. I do
15 not take my duties and responsibilities
16 lightly and I know how important it is that
17 all council members are present for the
18 final vote on the mayor's 2009 budget
19 tonight.

20 Second, other significant issues
21 face council as well, such as Attorney
22 Greco's latest contract, and the 2009 tax
23 anticipation notes. I have serious concerns
24 about these issues and will discuss my
25 objections during the voting portion of

65

1 tonight's meeting.

2 Third, and most significant, I stand

3 by my word. I will not approve the mayor's
4 2009 budget until necessary cuts in spending
5 are made. In this collapsing economy, which
6 has more than doubled the number of families
7 and elderly in need of free meals and home
8 heating assistance, it is unacceptable for
9 government to make no effort to cut costs.
10 There is no tax increase for 2009, and no
11 announced borrowing for which we are
12 thankful, but gratitude does not blind us to
13 the fact that we, the taxpayers, were saved
14 by the increased wage tax collections and
15 the over \$5 million windfall from the tax
16 office.

17 Such temporary relief does not blind
18 us to the financial status quo which
19 continues through 2009. The borrowing was
20 settled less than two weeks ago on
21 November 20. The spending increases with a
22 new library and greenhouse, yet, many budget
23 cuts are absent. It seems the entire
24 country is in recession except for Scranton.
25 No matter that Boscov's, B-Moss, Steve and

66

1 casualties, those very long lines for
2 Thanksgiving meals and heating assistance

3 are figments of the imagination. Scranton's
4 high unemployment numbers must be fiction
5 because in Scranton we don't try to curb
6 borrowing, spending, and loan give-aways, we
7 are obviously immune to recession. That's
8 what some politicians would have you
9 believe. The spin and utopian present and
10 future of buy now, pay later, and you will
11 pay, my friends, hundreds of million dollars
12 and growing straight through the Year 2034.

13 The mayor just doesn't get it.
14 Perhaps the problem is that Mr. Doherty is
15 an independently wealthy fellow. He doesn't
16 have to rely entirely on his mayor's salary
17 to raise his family. He entertains former
18 presidents, Congressmen, and national
19 candidates in his home. From the mayor's
20 office, he rewards his loyal supporters,
21 contributors, family and friends generously.
22 Quid pro quo. You give, you receive. It's
23 not wrong, it's just a different life-style
24 from the majority of Scranton residents.
25 You don't live his life-style and he doesn't

67

1 live yours.

2 The absence of an alternative budget
3 is disappointing and seems to imply a

4 agreement with the Mayor's 2009 budget.
5 Mrs. Gatelli said that she conferred with
6 Mr. Renda on Mr. Doherty's budget, and also
7 supports at least two issues previously
8 discussed by council members, the
9 elimination of two raises and the additional
10 of inspectors. Some, however, are more
11 realistic and financially conservative than
12 others. Consequently, I am proposing cuts
13 and much needed additions to the mayor's
14 2009 budget. I will provide an overview now
15 and present the specific items during the
16 budget vote.

17 The overview is as follows:
18 Positions eliminated: 13; reductions in
19 salaries, 20; professional services reduced
20 in one department, eliminated in two
21 departments; dues and subscription reduced
22 in one department; travel and lodging
23 reduced in one department, eliminated in
24 four departments; training and certification
25 reduced in one department, eliminated in two

68

1 departments; capital expenditures, reduced
2 in one department, eliminated for South Side
3 library.

4 Expenditures -- oh, and before I go
5 to the expenditures, the total revenue from
6 these and a few other cuts is \$2,014,50.86.
7 On the expenditures side, in the Department
8 of Licensing, Inspection and Permits, add
9 one animal control officer; add one health
10 inspector; add one housing inspector. In
11 the law department add one administrative
12 assistant one; and in the controller's
13 office, I would like to add the cost of the
14 audit of the Scranton Tax Office.

15 I looked through the budget
16 diligently for those monies, as we all know
17 the audit of the tax office has not been
18 performed by the city control in years,
19 decades. The excuse given was that there
20 was never enough funding and there were
21 never enough individuals because of lack of
22 funding. I would like to provide in my
23 proposals \$40,000 for the costs of the tax
24 office audit for 2009. My total
25 expenditures are \$168,565 with a total

69

1 savings to the 2009 budget of \$1,845,985.86.

2 These are hard decisions that must
3 be made if we wish to begin to properly
4 manage the city finances. We must

5 demonstrate financial stability. The
6 elimination of a structural deficit. The
7 ability to cut costs, the lowering of our
8 debt, and the settlement of municipal union
9 contracts to the Pennsylvania Department of
10 Community and Economic Development in order
11 to lift our distressed status.

12 Further, we must make these hard
13 decisions to restore the financial health
14 and future of our city. Like every council
15 member here seated, I love my city, but I
16 believe any great city is it's people.
17 Scranton stands because we are a strong
18 resilient people. We are hard-working,
19 humble, generous. We know the difference
20 between wanting and needing. These are hard
21 times that require hard decisions.

22 I make my proposals for the good of
23 this city and the good of the greatest
24 number of citizens. I have not cut
25 services, rather, I cut what we can manage

70

1 without having. As a teacher, I believe a
2 library is a hallmark of civilization, yet,
3 I know that a new library will cause the
4 county to raise the library tax in order to

5 maintain and staff this new addition. The
6 city and it's residents can't afford further
7 projects in this economy. Each public
8 school houses a library, and our
9 universities boast splendid libraries. The
10 Albright is one of the most magnificent
11 libraries in this country as is the
12 children's library. And, yes, some towns in
13 our county have no libraries, but that is
14 not the right reason to forge ahead at this
15 time.

16 Further, if we have sympathy for
17 those 13 who lost political jobs then surely
18 we must have sympathy for the nearly 2,000
19 Scrantonians who have lost their jobs and
20 fallen delinquent in their mortgages,
21 utility payments and property taxes. If we
22 struggle to cut raises then should we not
23 struggle more to award and maintain those
24 raises without our union workers receiving
25 the same being forced to live without any

71

1 raises for seven years?

2 The tax dollars that can be saved
3 may be used to pay down the debt service by
4 1.8 million or to reduce the city wage tax
5 from 2.4 to 2.2 percent. This is another

6 way in which to attract business, family
7 sustaining jobs and new homeowners to
8 Scranton. Let's put aside our personal
9 desires, differences, and politics and focus
10 on what is needed for the 2009 budget year
11 and for the people of Scranton.

12 Next, the contracts with Northeast
13 Credit and Collections or NCC for the
14 collection of delinquent refuse fees and
15 delinquent real estate taxes expire on
16 December 31, 2008. However, according to
17 the terms of both agreements these contracts
18 shall automatically be renewed for an
19 additional three years term or terms unless
20 either party gives notification to the other
21 party that the contract shall be terminated
22 at least six months prior to the end of the
23 initial term or any renewal term. It
24 appears this renewal occurred without the
25 consent of city council.

72

1 In 2005, NCC's first contract
2 expired. A contract renewal was brought
3 before council as a resolution on December 5
4 and it received final approval on
5 December 12, 2005. The vote was four to

6 one. I opposed the contract renewal because
7 of the injurious mistakes that were made by
8 NCC against city taxpayers, but the contract
9 renewal did come to council for a vote. I
10 expect to see a resolution for renewal on
11 council's December 9 agenda or I will know
12 that the mayor has acted, once again,
13 without council's approval.

14 And finally, I have a few requests
15 for the last week. A letter to the
16 University of Scranton, "Please provide
17 council with an update on the renovations to
18 Mulberry Street. City inspectors were lead
19 to believe that the renovations were to have
20 been completed by Spring 2008."

21 For Mr. Brazil: Residents report
22 that catch basins on East Mountain Road are
23 in need of the streets sweeper. They are
24 very grateful that the basins were
25 previously cleared by the last rain storm

73

1 clogged them once again.

2 Also, the DPW, lead by Mr. Brazil,
3 did an outstanding job of leaf pickup and
4 cleaning over the last few weeks. More than
5 once, I saw DPW vehicles hard at work
6 throughout the various city neighborhoods.

7 And the road between the firehouse
8 and Mountain Lake has become a dumping
9 drowned. Residents report liter, a tire,
10 bags of garbage and bags of leaves are
11 collecting in this area and they request a
12 clean up.

13 And, finally, a city resident
14 reports that the beautiful Nay Aug Holiday
15 lights display lacks a Hanukkah display for
16 our Jewish community. I, for some reason,
17 thought that there was such a display at the
18 park. I could have sworn I saw it years
19 ago, but I'm not absolutely sure. So, among
20 the mayor's new purchases for the light show
21 I'm certain that he would never want to
22 disclude any part of the population of
23 Scranton and so if everyone is in agreement
24 if council could request that a Hanukkah
25 display is added to the Nay Aug lights if,

74

1 in fact, it's not there.

2 MS. GATELLI: I just have a comment,
3 Hannukah, I believe, is a religious holiday
4 for the Jewish people, and I feel that if we
5 have something that displays religious items
6 for Jewish people, then I'm going to request

7 that a manager be there for the Catholics
8 because there is no manager scene either. I
9 think that most of the lights up there are
10 not religious in nature, so I'm afraid that
11 if we get into that we are going to get into
12 all kinds of religious lighting up at the
13 park, you know, I don't know how anyone else
14 feels but.

15 MS. EVANS: No, I think you are
16 making a very good point, but I think even
17 when we say the word Christmas we are saying
18 Christ and we are saying we are professing a
19 Christian religion even by saying Merry
20 Christmas and by calling it, you know,
21 Christmas lights display, so I think -- I'm
22 really not familiar with Jewish holidays for
23 obvious reasons, but you know, maybe members
24 of the Jewish community might be able to
25 make suggestions about what would be

75

1 appropriate. That's it.

2 MS. GATELLI: Anyone else have any?
3 All right. As far as the budget, I have
4 made some amendments to the budget and they
5 will -- I put them in through Attorney
6 Minora as requested. I have added a
7 full-time zoning officer a part-time animal

8 control officer, two inspectors. All raises
9 have been removed and there were some cuts
10 in the IT department. \$120,000 in revenue
11 for the rental registration and we put that
12 low until we see what happens with
13 registering the program. I anticipate the
14 revenue will be a lot higher once everyone
15 gets registered and those will be read when
16 we get to the budget.

17 As far as various comments about
18 being a finance chair, I will repeat it
19 again. Mrs. Evans resigned as the finance
20 chair. No one else wanted it. I did not
21 get it because I wanted to be the finance
22 chair. I don't claim to be a CPA or know
23 much about financial matters other than in
24 my household where I do the checkbook and
25 pay the bills. My husband does not run the

76

1 finances in our house, so that is really the
2 only experience that I have in finances.

3 However, when we are taking these
4 committees, it does not mean that that is
5 the only thing you do, it means that that is
6 how you look it up when we are voting on
7 something, you try to have the answers if

8 someone asks you a questions as the finance
9 chair or the DPW chair or the community
10 development chair, but it does not isolate
11 you into that particular item.

12 For instance, many times I research
13 OECD things. Many times I answer those
14 questions. Mrs. Fanucci is the community
15 development chair. That does not mean that
16 the rest of us do not do any work in that
17 particular area or that we don't answer
18 questions in that area. Same with the
19 police and fire, that's Bill's committee,
20 but it doesn't mean that the rest of us
21 don't do anything and we don't vote or talk
22 about police complaints or contact the
23 police department with the COM-D problems,
24 etcetera, and the DPW is Mrs. Evans'
25 committee. Well, I talk to Jeff Brazil

77

1 probably three times a week. So, being the
2 head of a committee does not restrict you
3 from working in every other committee. It's
4 merely a title so that you can write your
5 name on the legislation under the chair of
6 that particular item. It does not restrict
7 you in any way from participating in the
8 other committees.

9 The Housing Appeal's Board, I know
10 Mr. Schumacher brought that up, and the
11 Housing Appeals Board is a board that is
12 setup so that when people have their homes
13 condemned they can appeal those decisions.
14 They can go into the appeal's board, the
15 board hears their case and makes a
16 determination. It's legal that you have to
17 have that board in place for anybody that
18 would appeal a housing decision, so that's
19 the answer to your question. At one time
20 the members did have qualifications, one was
21 an electrician, one was a plumber, etcetera,
22 but you had to be careful there that you
23 didn't have a conflict of interest with any
24 contractors, but the Housing Appeals Board
25 is a necessity in the License and

78

1 Inspection's Department.

2 I have a copy of the cell phone ban
3 from Carbondale, that is the only one in the
4 area that I know of that has a ban on cell
5 phones. A girl I work with was just in a
6 car accident because she was on the cell
7 phone while she was driving. I don't know
8 how readily it will be enforced, but I am

9 going to ask Attorney Minora to write it up
10 for us and we'll see what the rest of
11 council feels about it, but I will pass this
12 n onto Attorney Minora. That's all I have.
13 Thank you.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Fanucci?

15 MR. MINORA: I have a copy.

16 MS. FANUCCI: I'm going to be brief
17 on this because I could really go on forever
18 and I have a feeling we will anyway, but
19 just a thought, but there is a few comments
20 made by Mrs. Franus tonight about working
21 and doing something on our own against for
22 the people, I believe that was the whole
23 issue. Sitting down and doing what we did
24 with the budget this time was for the
25 people. Not just taking the mayor's budget

79

1 and using it, but to sit down and make
2 changes and to make good changes and listen
3 to what we needed, which was a new
4 health inspector, and people that we needed
5 to help the city. So, to add these people
6 was something that was for the people.

7 I don't believe that sitting here
8 week after week and putting my, you know,
9 dragging my heels into the sand and saying,

10 no, no, no, is going to be for the people.
11 In fact, it absolutely does absolutely
12 nothing. Nobody benefits from it. Saying
13 no is very easy task. Coming up with the
14 anti is very easy, but coming up with
15 solutions is the hard thing. So to sit down
16 and decide and to make the budget what we
17 needed it to be and be happy with it and
18 working together with the administration is
19 what our job is. That's what we are
20 supposed to do. To sit here week after week
21 and decide that, you know, I'm going to be
22 the no girl is a very, you know, that's the
23 easy job. So, I mean, I would rather take
24 that job actually.

25 But, as far as I'm concerned, this

80

1 is very good budget after the amendments are
2 made. I'm very happy with it. I'm happy we
3 didn't have to raise taxes this year.
4 People seem to forget that we did get a lot
5 of taxes paid after we passed the
6 legislation to have the collections
7 increased. For some reason that seems to
8 slip everybody's mind that we did have more
9 people pay their taxes because they were

10 aware that now we were going to hold people
11 accountable, which we are not doing in the
12 past. So, yeah, we did increase our tax
13 base there and also. For some reason that's
14 supposed to be a bad thing. You know,
15 paying your taxes we don't like to do it,
16 but it still is our obligation, and if you
17 are not paying them, as I said before, you
18 know, you make arrangements. People that
19 came up here a few weeks ago with their, you
20 know, that this one had to pay so much money
21 in fines, well, after I researched it, it
22 was because they never made a phone call.
23 They never picked up the phone and said,
24 "What can I do? How do we handle this?"

25 They just let it go and let it go.

81

1 So, yes, ignoring the problem does not make
2 it go away. No different than ignoring any
3 problems that we have in the city. So I'm
4 happy with this budget, I will be voting on
5 this budget. I'm a little disappointed in
6 the alternative budget being proposed here
7 and not in caucus where we could work
8 together and actually be productive, but
9 then again, being on camera is always more
10 important than what we do in the back room.

11 And that is all I have. Thank you.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Mr. Courtright?

13 MR. COURTRIGHT: Yes, I had a
14 gentleman stop at my school last night, a
15 family member of his by the name of Ron
16 Hasted passed away an untimely death and he
17 was extremely grateful to the Scranton
18 Police Department and he asked that I
19 mention it this evening. He was pretty
20 distraught. He couldn't remember all of the
21 police officers that aided them, but I did
22 the best I could to find out who they were.
23 As I said, a family member of his died an
24 untimely death and the family was amazed at
25 how considerate and professional the police

82

1 department was and they really want to say
2 thank you to them.

3 To the best of my ability, I
4 gathered each name that I could that helped
5 this family out in the police department.
6 There was Kevin Uher, Fritzy Golden, Mark
7 Miller, Rich Innunzio, David Dunn and Amy
8 Remm, and if I are left anybody out I
9 apologize, but that was the best I could
10 gather. They just -- the family wants you

11 to know how much they appreciate everything
12 that you did for them and the kind
13 consideration that you gave to the.

14 They wanted to thank a couple of
15 other people. There was a towing company, I
16 believe it was Moletski's involved in this
17 incident, and they really want to thank them
18 and then this individual had worked at the
19 prison and they wanted to thank all of the
20 people from the prison to show their
21 compassion, so I told them that I would do
22 that for them this evening and our
23 sympathies goes out to that family.

24 I didn't get an opportunity to ask
25 Mr. Bolus, but I'm sure he will come back

83

1 next week, I think myself and other people
2 here we go to his Christmas dinner and help
3 out, and I'm sure he'll make an
4 announcement, but every year, I think I have
5 gone about five or six years now, maybe
6 seven years, my daughter and I go down and
7 it just seems to be growing each and every
8 year and it's a good thing. Whether you
9 like Mr. Bolus or you dislike Mr. Bolus,
10 it's a very good thing he has done and I
11 have seen other council members down there

12 helping, so maybe we will get all of the
13 particulars from him and maybe he will come
14 in announce it next week or maybe one of us
15 could.

16 Mr. Talimini, I haven't seen you
17 here in a week or two. You asked me about
18 police vehicles on the weekend and you asked
19 me about patrol vehicles with cages in them
20 for transportation. I spoke to Carl
21 Graziano, Captain Graziano a couple of weeks
22 ago. We picked the week prior, the Friday
23 prior to when you had come here, and I have
24 that information for you if you watch the
25 replay I'll keep it for you.

84

1 I wasn't aware that Mr. Davis had
2 passed away, so my condolences to his
3 family. It came as a shock me. I don't
4 think any of us knew that he passed away.

5 And one last thing, I had hoped with
6 Mr. Martin coming here and Mr. Schreiber
7 that we could get something accomplished and
8 we could get some information out there, and
9 I think what I had hoped for had happened.
10 I think they gave us a lot of information,
11 maybe put to rest some of the rumors and

12 speculations that are out there. I think
13 it's possible to get these contracts settled
14 in the near future and I think it's even
15 more possible that this council help me. I
16 think every one of us, no matter whose side
17 you think we are on, I think every one of us
18 want to see the contracts settled. So, I
19 thank them for coming and I think council
20 did a good job on what we asked them and
21 what we understood, and let's hope before we
22 sit here next year at budget time that this
23 is dying. I feel confident that it will, so
24 we thank council and I thank for allowing
25 them to come here and I think them for

85

1 coming. I think it was very informative and
2 I believe we all got a great deal out of it,
3 and that's all I have, Mr. McGoff. Thank
4 you.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you,
6 Mr. Courtright. Just a couple of quick
7 comments. Mr. Bolus mentioned the sale of
8 the Albright Library and I think that's kind
9 of a misconception. I believe that by it's
10 charter the Albright Library cannot be sold,
11 if I'm not mistaken that that's under
12 whatever trust fund it operates.

13 Also, as far as public negotiations
14 on contracts, I believe that the National
15 Labor Relations Act prevents public
16 disclosure of negotiations, so I may be
17 mistaken, but I'm pretty sure that that's
18 true. Mr. Dobson, a letter I believe was
19 sent or is in the process of being sent to
20 various authorities and groups to request
21 meetings being held. I know that
22 Mrs. Garvey and I talked about it and if it
23 hasn't been sent it will be in the near
24 future. But, again, it's only a request and
25 as far as in response to some speakers

86

1 that's all I have, and I have a feeling that
2 our discussion on legislation is going to be
3 lengthy, and so I think maybe we should get
4 to it immediately.

5 MS. FANUCCI: I have one question,
6 do you all have a copy of Mrs. Evans'
7 proposal in the back room?

8 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans has --

9 MS. FANUCCI: No, but do they have
10 one in the back room?

11 MS. EVANS: In the back room?

12 MS. FANUCCI: Yes, in the back of the

13 room. Do you already have a copy of that
14 proposal?

15 MS. EVANS: Yes. I just had Neil
16 make copies.

17 MS. FANUCCI: Oh, so they got it
18 before us. I just wanted all of us --

19 MS. EVANS: I was waiting for the
20 vote to come up, so I could pass it to you,
21 but, you know, assuredly you'll get them,
22 but they obviously won't be voting on it,
23 you will.

24 MS. FANUCCI: I know. That's why I
25 thought it would prudent that we had it

87

1 first, but I'm glad the reporter got it
2 before us. That's all I need to say much.

3 MS. EVANS: Everyone was still
4 talking, so --

5 MS. FANUCCI: You could have passed
6 them out.

7 UNKNOWN AUDIENCE MEMBER: He doesn't
8 have one.

9 MS. FANUCCI: You didn't just hand
10 him that one?

11 MR. MCGOFF: You know, wether they
12 were distributed or not let's please go to
13 the --

14 MR. JACKOWITZ: So again you're
15 mistaken again.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Excuse me --

17 MS. FANUCCI: No, you actually all
18 have it and we don't.

19 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Fanucci --

20 MR. JACKOWITZ: The reporter doesn't.

21 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Fanucci, could we
22 -- I'd really prefer that we get to the
23 legislation. It is going to be lengthy.
24 Thank you.

25 MS. GARVEY: 5-B. FOR INTRODUCTION -

88

1 AN ORDINANCE - AUTHORIZING THE ISSUANCE AND
2 SALE OF A FIVE MILLION (\$5,000,000.00)
3 DOLLAR PRINCIPAL AMOUNT, TAX AND REVENUE
4 ANTICIPATION NOTE OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON
5 KNOWN AS TAN SERIES A, AWARDED TO COMMUNITY
6 BANK & TRUST CO; DETERMINING THE FORM AND
7 TERM OF SAID NOTE; AWARDING SAID NOTE;
8 AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE FILING OF
9 CERTAIN DOCUMENTS; AND DIRECTING THE PROPER
10 OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE
11 ANY AND ALL OTHER ACTIONS AS MAY BE REQUIRED
12 IN CONNECTION WITH THE
13 ISSUANCE OF SAID NOTE.

14 MR. MCGOFF: At this time I'll
15 entertain a motion that Item 5-B be
16 introduced into it's proper committee.

17 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

18 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

19 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

20 MS. EVANS: TAN Series A is used to
21 pay city bills at the beginning of the each
22 year until tax revenues can be collected.
23 It is paid in July of each year. It is
24 necessary.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else on the

89

1 question? All those in favor signify by
2 saying aye.

3 MS. EVANS: Aye.

4 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

5 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

6 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
8 ayes have it and so moved.

9 MS. GARVEY: 5-C. FOR INTRODUCTION -
10 AN ORDINANCE - AUTHORIZING THE ISSUANCE AND
11 SALE OF A NINE AND ONE HALF MILLION
12 (\$9,500,000.00) DOLLAR PRINCIPAL AMOUNT, TAX
13 AND REVENUE ANTICIPATION NOTE OF THE CITY OF
14 SCRANTON KNOWN AS TAN SERIES B, AWARDED TO

15 COMMUNITY BANK AND TRUST COMPANY;
16 DETERMINING THE FORM AND TERM OF SAID NOTE;
17 AWARDING SAID NOTE; AUTHORIZING AND
18 DIRECTING THE FILING OF CERTAIN DOCUMENTS;
19 AND DIRECTING THE PROPER OFFICIALS OF THE
20 CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE ANY AND ALL OTHER
21 ACTIONS AS MAY BE REQUIRED IN CONNECTION
22 WITH THE ISSUANCE OF SAID NOTE.

23 MR. MCGOFF: At this time I will
24 entertain a motion that 5-C be introduced
25 into it's proper committee.

90

1 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

2 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

3 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
5 Mr. McGoff, every year that I have been here
6 I believe -- I think I'm correct, I believe
7 I voted for TANS Series B, this time around
8 I'm not going to be voting in favor of it,
9 and I did a little research, and I have more
10 to go, but I remember Mrs. Gatelli had
11 mentioned last week or the week prior to
12 that, you know, TANS were necessary to keep
13 the city moving until the money came in and
14 I agree with that, but what I have been

15 looking at and what I have been discovering
16 is that TAN Series A should do the job in
17 the beginning of the year, so I'm not going
18 to be voting in favor of TAN Series B at
19 this time.

20 MS. EVANS: Also, TAN Series B is not
21 repaid until the end of each fiscal year in
22 December. As of October 31, 2008, TAN
23 Series B in the amount of \$10,050,000
24 remained in Account No. 01401152404299 in
25 full according to the controller's report

91

1 dated November 18, 2008. The city has no
2 need to borrow this amount of money,
3 particularly in light of the tax office
4 windfall for 2009, and the projected wage
5 tax increases.

6 MR. COURTRIGHT: Well, could I just
7 one more time, Mr. McGoff? That's the
8 information that I had been looking at, what
9 Mrs. Evans just stated. You know, I kept
10 going from month to month in Mrs.
11 Novembrino's report and seeing it was never
12 utilized.

13 MS. EVANS: That's been the case each
14 year which is why I have kept -- I
15 repeatedly voted against it.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: So that's my reason
17 for now unless I could -- somebody can come
18 to me and tell me why it's necessary I will
19 be voting against it.

20 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else on the
21 question? All those in favor signify by
22 saying aye?

23 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

24 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

25 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

92

1 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed?

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: No. I'm sorry. I
3 apologize. I voted in the affirmative and I
4 meant to vote in the negative.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Mr. Courtright's vote is
6 no.

7 MR. COURTRIGHT: Thank you.

8 MS. GARVEY: That's just introducing;
9 right?

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: Yes.

11 MR. MINORA: Item 5-D needs to be
12 amended. I'm prepared to give you the
13 language of the amendment as prepared.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Please.

15 MR. MINORA: 5-D. FOR INTRODUCTION -

16 A RESOLUTION - THE APPOINTMENT OF GENE P.
17 TESEROVITCH, 1541 THACKERY STREET, SCRANTON,
18 PENNSYLVANIA, 18504, AS A MEMBER OF THE
19 SCRANTON HOUSING APPEALS REVIEW BOARD FOR A
20 TERM OF FIVE (5) YEARS EFFECTIVE NOVEMBER
21 24, 2008. MR. TESEROVITCH'S WILL BE
22 REPLACING FRANK STEVENS WHOSE TERM EXPIRED
23 ON OCTOBER 18, 2008. MR. TESEROVITCH'S TERM
24 WILL EXPIRE ON NOVEMBER 24, 2013.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you. At this time

93

1 I'll entertain a motion that Item 5-D, as
2 amended, be introduced into it's proper
3 committee.

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

5 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
7 those in favor signify by saying aye.

8 MS. EVANS: Aye.

9 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

10 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
13 ayes have it and so moved. Do we need to
14 amend 5-E and F as well?

15 MR. MINORA: Yes. Each one needs an
16 amendment and we actually need a motion to

17 amend and then introducing it as amended.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Okay.

19 MS. GATELLI: I'll make a motion that
20 we amend 5-D.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Second.

22 MS. GATELLI: We didn't do D.

23 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
24 saying aye.

25 MS. EVANS: Aye.

94

1 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

2 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
5 ayes have it and so moved.

6 MS. GATELLI: Now I'll make a motion
7 that we amend 5-E.

8 MS. EVANS: Second.

9 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
10 saying aye?

11 MS. EVANS: Aye.

12 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

13 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

14 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
16 ayes have it and so moved.

17 MR. MINORA: The amendment would
18 read: FOR INTRODUCTION - A RESOLUTION -
19 APPOINTMENT OF JOSEPH KAYES, 629 BIRCH
20 STREET, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA 18505, AS
21 ALTERNATE NO. 1, A MEMBER OF THE SCRANTON
22 HOUSING APPEALS REVIEW BOARD, FOR A TERM OF
23 FIVE (5) YEARS EFFECTIVE NOVEMBER 24, 2008.
24 MR. KAYES TERM WILL EXPIRE ON NOVEMBER 24,
25 2013.

95

1 MR. MCGOFF: At this time I'll
2 entertain a motion that 5-E, as amended, be
3 introduced into it's proper committee.

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

5 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
7 in favor signify by saying aye.

8 MS. EVANS: Aye.

9 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

10 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
13 ayes have it and so moved.

14 MS. GATELLI: I'll make a motion that
15 we amend Item 5-F.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: Second.

17 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in

18 favor signify by saying aye.

19 MS. EVANS: Aye.

20 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

21 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

22 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
24 ayes have it and so moved.

25 MR. MINORA: The amended language

96

1 would be: FOR INTRODUCTION A RESOLUTION
2 APPOINTMENT OF ROBERT JENSEN, 401
3 WINTERMANTLE AVENUE, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA
4 18505, AS ALTERNATE NO. 2, MEMBER OF THE
5 SCRANTON HOUSING APPEALS REVIEW BOARD, FOR A
6 TERM OF FIVE (5) YEARS EFFECTIVE NOVEMBER
7 24, 2008. MR. JENSEN'S TERM WILL EXPIRE ON
8 NOVEMBER 24, 2013.

9 MR. MCGOFF: At this time I'll
10 entertain a motion that Item 5-F be
11 introduce into it's proper committee.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

13 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

14 THE COURT: On the question? All in
15 favor signify by saying aye.

16 MS. EVANS: Aye.

17 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

18 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

20 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
21 ayes have it and so moved.

22 MS. GARVEY: Five G. FOR INTRODUCTION
23 - A RESOLUTION - AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND
24 OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS FOR THE
25 CITY OF SCRANTON TO ENTER INTO A COOPERATION

97

1 AGREEMENT, A SUBORDINATION AGREEMENT AND A
2 DISBURSEMENT AGREEMENT IN CONNECTION WITH
3 THE REHABILITATION BY NORTH SCRANTON
4 PARTNERSHIP, L.P. OF THE FORMER NORTH
5 SCRANTON JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL LOCATED AT 1539
6 N. MAIN AVENUE, SCRANTON, PA.

7 MR. MCGOFF: At this time I'll
8 entertain a motion that Item 5-G be
9 introduced into it's proper committee.

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

11 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

12 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
13 those in favor signify by saying aye.

14 MS. EVANS: Aye.

15 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

16 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

17 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The

19 ayes have it and so moved.

20 MS. GARVEY: SIXTH ORDER. NO
21 BUSINESS AT THIS TIME.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Could I just -- excuse
23 me one moment. Just for clarification sake,
24 the three appointments, the reason for the
25 amendments were that the original

98

1 legislation did not indicate the alternates
2 and the replacements and so we needed to
3 amend the wording so that it would
4 adequately reflect who was being appointed
5 as a full-time member and an alternate
6 member. I'm sorry.

7 MS. GARVEY: SIXTH ORDER. NO
8 BUSINESS AT THIS TIME. SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A.

9 MR. MCGOFF: As we enter 7-A I
10 believe that there are going to be a number
11 of amendments. I realize that it may take a
12 prolonged period of time, but I believe that
13 in the interest of -- in the interest of
14 council and doing justice to the amendments
15 that we would consider each one
16 individually.

17 MS. EVANS: That's fine.

18 MR. MCGOFF: I know it's going to

19 take a much longer period of time, but I
20 just think that it --

21 MS. GATELLI: Well, I thought that we
22 had decided the amendments would go through
23 Amil so that they would be done legally.

24 MS. FANUCCI: We did.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Yes, we did.

99

1 MS. EVANS: I never spoke on that, so
2 I never gave my agreement to it, but --

3 MS. FANUCCI: That's because you
4 weren't at the meeting.

5 MS. EVANS: But beyond that, I have
6 been very ill and I haven't been in touch
7 with anyone and I did my own work and just
8 brought it here and just had Neil copy it
9 recently.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else?

11 MS. GATELLI: Tonight is the final
12 reading; right?

13 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. Is that okay with
14 everyone that we do them individually?

15 MR. COURTRIGHT: That's fine by me.

16 MS. EVANS: Yes.

17 MS. GATELLI: Fine with me.

18 MS. FANUCCI: I say you have Mrs.
19 Evans do hers. I mean, how are you going to

20 do -- it's going to be a debacle. I mean --

21 MS. EVANS: No, what I would do is

22 just --

23 MS. FANUCCI: Read yours.

24 MR. COURTRIGHT: I don't think we can

25 do all of these one by one. This is going

100

1 to be tough.

2 MS. EVANS: No, it's --

3 MR. MCGOFF: There is 40 some of

4 them.

5 MS. EVANS: I'm not moving it right
6 now, I'm saying hypothetically. I would
7 move it to include the following amendments
8 to the budget and only those amendments
9 approved by the majority vote of council
10 would be included in the mayor's 2009. So,
11 it wouldn't be a matter of I move, I move I
12 move, it would have already been said. Each
13 item is just read. If there are three votes
14 for it, it stays. If there are not, it
15 goes.

16 MS. GATELLI: Well, I would like to
17 do my amendments first since I went through
18 the law department, you know, through the
19 solicitor and we'll see how that works. If

20 that gets three votes there is no necessity
21 to go through all of this.

22 MS. EVANS: And why not? There is
23 much more in mine beyond yours. So why
24 would there not be a necessity? If we want
25 save the taxpayers money we are going to

101

1 look at everything we possibly can to make
2 that happen.

3 MS. GATELLI: Well, I personally
4 looked at it for the last three weeks and I
5 came up with my amendments.

6 MS. EVANS: As did I.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Procedurally we do --
8 it's -- we must consider each amendment that
9 is proposed. There is -- each of us has the
10 legal right to do that. Since Mrs. Gatelli
11 is the Finance Chairman, I'm going to make
12 an arbitrary decision that we consider those
13 amendments first and then we can move to the
14 other amendments.

15 MS. EVANS: I agree.

16 MS. FANUCCI: That's fine.

17 MR. MCGOFF: Acceptable?

18 MR. COURTRIGHT: Yes.

19 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

20 MR. MINORA: Would you like me to --

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Do we have a copy of
22 your changes somewhere in here?

23 MS. EVANS: It's in with your agenda.

24 MR. COURTRIGHT: I guess this is it
25 here. All right.

102

1 MR. MINORA: Shall I?

2 MR. MCGOFF: Please, Mr. Minora.

3 MS. GATELLI: I think I have to make
4 a motion to amend 7-A.

5 MR. MINORA: These would be
6 Mrs. Gatelli's --

7 MS. FANUCCI: I'll second that.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Second.

9 MR. MINORA: This is Mrs. Gatelli's
10 amendments to Item 7-A, the 2009 budget
11 amending Account No. 01.320.32430, housing
12 rental license from \$18,967 to \$120,000 for
13 net increase of \$101,033.

14 Are you going to vote on those
15 individuals, is that what you meant or did
16 you want her whole amendment as one? I'm
17 not sure what --

18 MS. EVANS: One at a time, don't you
19 think?

20 MR. MCGOFF: I think that's what we

21 should do.

22 MR. MINORA: Well, that's the first
23 one.

24 MS. EVANS: And could I just ask how
25 the \$120,000 was arrived at, too? Do you

103

1 have a certain number of houses in mind?

2 MS. GATELLI: Yes, I do. I think
3 there was 800 -- or 8,000, sorry.

4 MS. EVANS: Eight thousand.

5 MR. MCGOFF: We are on the question
6 on that first item.

7 MR. MINORA: Excuse me, is there an
8 amendment and then a second already on that
9 one?

10 MS. GATELLI: Yes.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Mr. McGoff, for the
12 sake of expediency I'm looking at
13 Mrs. Gatelli's amendments and --

14 MS. GATELLI: It was just what I
15 said.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: I don't think -- is
17 there any -- would anybody here have an
18 objection to any of these changes she has
19 made here?

20 MS. FANUCCI: No.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: And if not, maybe we

22 could do it as a package.

23 MS. EVANS: I don't know what some
24 them are though, like, say standard salary.
25 Whose?

104

1 MR. MINORA: I can explain -- it was
2 my intent when I -- I didn't know I was
3 going do it this way, but it was my intent
4 to explain those as part of the amendment
5 because I have done the research as to what
6 accounts are what and when.

7 MS. EVANS: We can look that up in
8 the budget, but it's faster if you can just
9 give it to us.

10 MR. MINORA: Yeah, exactly, and some
11 of it is a little more obtuse than just
12 looking it up honestly.

13 MR. COURTRIGHT: Then we can vote on
14 these as a package, Mr. Minora?

15 MR. MINORA: Beg your pardon?

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: Once you explain all
17 of them, either vote on them as a package,
18 is that acceptable to do that?

19 MR. MINORA: I'll do it any way you
20 want.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: The ones that she

22 made here.

23 MS. EVANS: I'd rather go one by one.

24 MR. COURTRIGHT: You want to go one
25 by one?

105

1 MS. EVANS: Yes.

2 MR. MCGOFF: I tried to indicate
3 that I thought it was more expedient to do
4 them one at a time because there may be
5 things that we agree to and, you know, some
6 that we disagree with. Rather than doing an
7 entire package and voting yes or no when
8 there are things that are there that are
9 individual.

10 MS. GATELLI: Yeah, but these things
11 should be done in caucus. They shouldn't be
12 done on the floor. We are going to be here
13 until 2:00 in the morning.

14 MS. FANUCCI: This is the whole
15 problem. This is what happens because we
16 are always --

17 MR. MCGOFF: I understand that, but
18 we are here now.

19 MS. FANUCCI: -- motions on the floor
20 because we not in caucus. We have been
21 working on this, I sat down with Stu and we
22 have been working on this forever.

23 MS. GATELLI: Yeah.

24 MS. FANUCCI: And now today is the
25 day we are going to come out with the big

106

1 surprise on the camera.

2 MS. EVANS: It's not a big surprise
3 because this is it the fourth time now that
4 I have done the budget work.

5 MS. FANUCCI: Yeah --

6 MS. EVANS: So it's certainly no
7 surprise. Secondly, I find it surprising,
8 but also maybe a little bit offensive that
9 we wouldn't be willing to stay here and work
10 as long as it takes --

11 MS. FANUCCI: We have been working.

12 MS. EVANS: -- on a budget, because I
13 remember nights that I have sat here, and so
14 does Mr. Courtright, until midnight or after
15 working on things, and really of everyone
16 that's sitting here this will be, you know,
17 the most difficult for me to do, but I'm
18 willing to do this because I care enough to
19 do it.

20 MS. FANUCCI: Yeah, we did, too, and
21 that's why we have been siting working with
22 the administration to get a budget that we

23 were happy with.

24 MS. EVANS: Can someone please stop
25 turning my mic on and off? I don't know

107

1 whose doing it, but I have no hands on it,
2 but anyway -- yes, that's great to work with
3 the administration. It is. And Mr. Renda
4 is employed by the administration, he works
5 for the mayor, so you have worked with the
6 administration and the mayor on the mayor's
7 budget.

8 MS. FANUCCI: To make amendments. To
9 make amendments to the budget, yes.

10 MS. EVANS: So I think maybe we
11 shouldn't be so adverse to saving the
12 taxpayers money and taking an independent
13 approach rather than that of the people who
14 are employed by the mayor. There are more
15 than one, you know, point of view, in all of
16 this.

17 MS. FANUCCI: Who did you work on the
18 budget with this year?

19 MS. EVANS: No one ever does,
20 Mrs. Fanucci.

21 MS. FANUCCI: Actually, the last two
22 years I was told that you received the
23 budget from other people, so let's not go

24 there.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Please. We have gotten

108

1 off the pass here anyway.

2 MS. GATELLI: Well, that's the idea
3 to get off task. That's what it's all
4 about. That's what this is all about.

5 MS. EVANS: What is it about?

6 MS. GATELLI: It's all about getting
7 off task.

8 MS. FANUCCI: No doubt.

9 MS. EVANS: I believe so. I have
10 been on task and Mrs. Fanucci repeatedly
11 wants to take us down a trail of
12 personalities and attitude of all
13 differences.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Excuse me, that's not
15 necessary. Please let's stay to the budget
16 and if we have something to say concerning
17 each line item I would please discuss it --

18 MS. EVANS: Agreed.

19 MR. MCGOFF: -- and then we will
20 vote.

21 MS. FANUCCI: The first one is in.

22 MR. MINORA: At the present there is
23 a motion to amend, I have read in the first

24 item on Mrs. Gatelli's, that's on the floor
25 for discussion, I don't know if it's ready

109

1 for a vote or not.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else on the first
3 part? Please read the second amendment.

4 MR. MINORA: I thought you were
5 going to vote on them individually?

6 MR. MCGOFF: All those in favor
7 signify by saying aye.

8 MS. EVANS: Aye.

9 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

10 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
13 ayes have it and so moved.

14 MR. MINORA: The second amendment is
15 to Account No. 01.030.00000.4010, standard
16 salary is the account description, from
17 \$269,860 to \$264,560, and that's a net
18 decrease of \$5,300 which represents the
19 proposed increase in salary for the deputy
20 controller, so that's a reduction of that
21 proposed increase.

22 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
23 those in favor signify by saying aye.

24 MS. EVANS: Aye.

25

MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

110

1

MS. GATELLI: Aye.

2

MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

3

MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The

4

ayes have it and so moved.

5

MS. EVANS: Actually, I would be --

6

I'm going to vote no, too, that because I

7

have a decrease in here, too, but for 59

8

rather than 53.

9

MR. MCGOFF: I'm sorry. The vote was

10

four to one. Thank you.

11

MR. MINORA: The next item is Account

12

No. 01.040.00000.4116, health insurance from

13

\$1,007,578 to \$1,025,046, which represents

14

an increase of \$17,468, which is the health

15

insurance for the new hires that she is

16

proposing for the assistant zoning officer,

17

animal control and housing inspectors.

18

MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All

19

those in favor signify by saying aye.

20

MS. EVANS: Aye.

21

MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

22

MS. GATELLI: Aye.

23

MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

24

MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The

ayes have it and so moved.

1 MR. MINORA: Next item is
2 01.040.00041.4010, standard salary, from
3 \$190,211 to \$180,211 representing a decrease
4 of \$10,000 which is the proposed increase to
5 the director Lisa Moran.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? On the
7 question, I personally feel that the raise
8 is warranted. I do believe that the raise
9 should be on the contingency that it not
10 become effective until contracts are settled
11 and because it's being eliminated I am going
12 to vote no on this particular item.

13 MS. EVANS: I'll also be voting no
14 because the reduction in salary that I'm
15 proposing is higher.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Anybody else? All those
17 in favor signify by saying aye?

18 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

19 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

20 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

21 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

22 MS. EVANS: No.

23 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
24 moved.

25 MR. MINORA: The next item is

1 01.040.00042.4390, materials and supplies
2 miscellaneous, from \$180,000 to \$140,000
3 that's a reduction of \$40,000 for those
4 items.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Was that --

6 MR. MINORA: That's the IT
7 department.

8 MR. MCGOFF: That was the IT
9 department? On the question? All those in
10 favor signify by saying aye.

11 MS. EVANS: Aye.

12 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

13 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

14 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
16 ayes have it and so moved.

17 MR. MINORA: The next item is
18 01.051.00051.4201, professional services
19 increase from \$2,000 to \$14,000 representing
20 an increase of \$12,000.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: What is hat for,
22 Mr. Minora? Mr. Minora, what does that
23 represent?

24 MR. MINORA: Give me a moment. I
25 have to look at my note on that one.

1 MS. GATELLI: Was that for the
2 training, Amil?

3 MS. GARVEY: That's supposed to be as
4 far as I know it is for a fee for whoever
5 would get an RFP, that would be --

6 MS. GATELLI: Oh, okay. That's for
7 the rental.

8 MS. GARVEY: For the rental program.

9 MS. GATELLI: Okay, yes.

10 MS. EVANS: The rental of what?

11 MS. GATELLI: We took a 10
12 percent -- 10 percent fee to register the
13 rental units from RFP to do that privately.

14 MS. EVANS: Okay.

15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
16 those in favor signify by saying aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Aye.

18 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

19 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

20 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

21 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
22 ayes have it and so moved.

23 MR. MINORA: The next item is Account
24 No. 01.051.00051.4010, standard salaries
25 from \$388,245 to \$434,100, that's an

1 increase of \$45,085, which represents an
2 increase for assistant zoning officer and an
3 animal control officer. I guess I should
4 probably include those as, so they make
5 sense, and vote the money in without voting
6 them in. The amendment would include then
7 an additional assistant zoning officer at a
8 salary of \$32,855 and an animal control
9 officer part-time for \$13,000 which
10 represents that increase that I just
11 mentioned before of \$45,855. That's on the
12 motion.

13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

14 MS. EVANS: I have included an animal
15 control officer, also, but as a full-time
16 position as I believe that is required due
17 to the number of complaints that we receive
18 continually about skunks, woodchucks,
19 squirrels, dogs, cats, and etcetera.

20 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else on the
21 question? All in favor signify by saying
22 aye?

23 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

24 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

25 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed?

2 MS. EVANS: No.

3 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
4 moved.

5 MR. MINORA: The next item is Account
6 No. 01.011.00011.4010, standard salary from
7 \$320,640 to \$376,350, which represents an
8 increase of \$55,710. That is comprised of
9 reducing the Director Ray Hayes' proposed
10 salary from 75 back to his current level of
11 \$65,000 and adding two housing inspectors
12 for a total amount of \$65,710.

13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? Once
14 again, I feel that the raise to the Public
15 Safety Director is somewhat warranted,
16 again, with the belief that it should not
17 become effective until such time as contacts
18 would be settled. I believe that what we
19 are -- that the raises go to the position
20 and the job that is being done and not
21 necessarily -- and not to the persons
22 themselves, and again, I would vote, no.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
24 Mr. McGoff, this is getting really confusing
25 a little bit here, but I think I got it, I

1 think what I have to do here, I mean, I'm
2 anticipating what Mrs. Evans is going to do,
3 I think -- we only got two more on your list
4 here, but I'm anticipating she is wiping out
5 all of public safety in hers?

6 MS. EVANS: Well, the three positions
7 and then the three others that had been
8 transferred into public safety from LIPS, I
9 believe, I'm removing from public safety and
10 transferring back to LIPS.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Right, and my fear
12 is this, you will be voting no on this
13 change, he will be voting no. If I vote no,
14 then Mr. Hayes gets a raise and Mrs. Moran
15 doesn't. I don't think that's fair, so I
16 will be voting yes. If the public could
17 follow what I'm doing there because you will
18 be voting no, because you are going to make
19 your changes, he is going to be voting no.
20 If I vote no to Mr. Hayes his \$10,000 raise
21 because I think you and I all -- I think
22 everybody up here that knows that nobody is
23 going to vote yes for your proposal on that
24 particular one, let's be realistic, so I
25 don't know if the public can understand

1 that, why I'm doing what I'm doing. I think
2 people up here understand, do you not?

3 MS. EVANS: I think I do, yes.

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: This is crazy. All
5 right.

6 MR. MCGOFF: All those in favor
7 signify by saying aye?

8 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

9 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed?

12 MS. EVANS: No.

13 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
14 moved.

15 MR. MINORA: Then the last item is
16 Account No. 01.401.13090.4299 contingency
17 fund increased from \$1 million to
18 \$1,025,300.

19 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

20 MS. EVANS: I think one housing
21 inspector is necessary, two I'd love to see
22 it, I don't think we can afford both at this
23 point, so I would rather that the second
24 position go to an additional health officer.

25 MR. MCGOFF: We were on the

1 contingency.

2 MS. EVANS: Oh, I'm sorry, I thought
3 we are splitting -- never mind. I thought
4 Mr. Hayes was separate from the inspectors.

5 MS. GATELLI: They're all together.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the contingency. Any
7 one else? All in favor signify by saying
8 aye.

9 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

10 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed?

13 MS. EVANS: No.

14 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
15 moved. Anything else, Mrs. Gatelli?

16 MS. GATELLI: No.

17 MR. MCGOFF: We are still on 7-A if
18 there any other amendments.

19 MS. EVANS: I'm going to begin with
20 the office of the Mayor, a confidential
21 secretary salary reduction in the amount of
22 \$6,688.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Are we voting on
24 this or how are we doing this?

25 MS. GATELLI: She made a motion;

1 right? Did you make a motion or no?

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: So we are going to
3 make a motion for every one of these.

4 MS. EVANS: A motion that these be
5 included and whatever is approved is what's
6 actually going to be included if there is
7 anything that you will approve at all, is
8 that okay?

9 MR. COURTRIGHT: Yeah.

10 MS. EVANS: That way I don't have to
11 keep saying, "I move, I move, I move."

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: I don't understand
13 here.

14 MS. FANUCCI: Does it have to be
15 seconded?

16 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. No. Okay.

17 MS. EVANS: Do you see what I'm
18 saying?

19 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans is making a
20 motion to include these amendments.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: All of these? We
22 are not going to make a motion for every
23 single one.

24 MR. MCGOFF: No, just as we did with
25 Mrs. Gatelli's, but we are going to consider

1 each one.

2 MS. EVANS: Right, but I don't have
3 to say I move to move each one.

4 MS. FANUCCI: Right, but it has to
5 be seconded.

6 MR. MINORA: You will need a second
7 for each one.

8 MS. FANUCCI: Exactly. That's what
9 I'm saying.

10 MR. MCGOFF: We need -- what we did
11 with Mrs. Gatelli's was we seconded the
12 proposal and then voted individually on each
13 one. I think we follow the same.

14 MR. COURTRIGHT: We are going to
15 second your entire proposal and then if we
16 get -- and then if you get enough people to
17 go along with your proposal then you will
18 read each one. If you don't get enough
19 people to go along with your proposal you
20 are not going to be able to read each one;
21 correct?

22 MS. EVANS: No, each one is going to
23 be read individually.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Just as we did with Mrs.
25 Gatelli's.

121

1 MR. COURTRIGHT: All right.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Please make the motion

3 again, Mrs. Evans.

4 MS. EVANS: Okay. In the Office of
5 the Mayor --

6 MR. MCGOFF: Well, make a motion.

7 MS. EVANS: Oh, the original? At
8 this time I move to include the following
9 amendments to the 2009 budget, only those
10 amendments approved by a majority vote of
11 council will be included in the mayor's 2009
12 budget.

13 MR. COURTRIGHT: Second.

14 MR. MCGOFF: On the question, and we
15 will address them.

16 MS. EVANS: Okay. In the Office of
17 the Mayor, confidential secretary salary
18 reduction, \$6,688.

19 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? I'm
20 going to respond that I will vote no on
21 most -- well, this isn't an elimination, but
22 I'm sorry, I'll save it for the next one.

23 MS. EVANS: I just wanted to explain,
24 however, that the increases that were
25 awarded to the employees do not affect -- or

122

1 rather than the increases that were awarded
2 for the 2009 budget because of the increased

3 work hours each day, those increases have
4 not been eliminated.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you. On the
6 question, number one? All in favor signify
7 by saying aye.

8 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

9 MS. EVANS: Aye.

10 MR. MCGOFF: No?

11 MS. FANUCCI: No.

12 MS. GATELLI: No.

13 MR. MCGOFF: No. The motion is --
14 that section is defeated.

15 MS. EVANS: Public safety: Eliminate
16 the department, return three transferred
17 positions to Department of Licenses and
18 Inspections and Permits for a savings of
19 \$159,740. Note: Figure does not include
20 cost savings for health care.

21 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

22 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question, I'm
23 going to vote no on this because I'm for
24 half of what you are doing there, Mrs.
25 Evans, and one part I'm not so that's why I

123

1 will be voting no.

2 MS. EVANS: I see this position as a
3 duplication of services. We have -- or at

4 least one would hope we have a strong and
5 competent fire chief and police chief who
6 require no oversight, however, if we insist
7 on the Public Safety Department, which I'm
8 sure everyone is aware was cut by PEL then,
9 in fact, are we saying that we employ a
10 incompetent police chief and an incompetent
11 fire chief who need the oversight of a
12 public safety director?

13 MS. GATELLI: Well, I don't know. I
14 wouldn't say that's why Jimmy Klee was there
15 and he was a public safety director. I
16 don't think he was there because, you know,
17 Murphy and Richie Piegle were incompetent.

18 MS. EVANS: But that position was
19 removed and then we put it back in.

20 MS. GATELLI: Against strong
21 objections. I objected to them getting rid
22 of Jimmy Klee's position.

23 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
24 saying aye.

25 MS. EVANS: Aye.

124

1 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

2 MS. FANUCCI: No.

3 MS. GATELLI: No.

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: No. Motion
5 defeated.

6 MS. EVANS: Number three: Police
7 department, reduce dues and subscriptions
8 \$500.

9 MR. MCGOFF: What is it currently at?

10 MS. EVANS: I don't know. It may
11 actually be \$500. I'm just trying to find
12 it. It's on page 56. It should be anyway.

13 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

14 MS. GATELLI: It's 56, but there is
15 \$3,500 and that must be it. It has to be
16 that.

17 MR. MCGOFF: 3,500 and you wish to
18 reduce it \$3,000?

19 MS. EVANS: Um-hum.

20 MS. GATELLI: What do they use that
21 for, Bill, do you know?

22 MR. COURTRIGHT: I'm looking at 550.
23 Where are you guys looking?

24 MS. GATELLI: What page are you on?

25 MR. COURTRIGHT: 53.

125

1 MS. EVANS: What page?

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: Dues and
3 subscriptions. Are we on -- that's in
4 public safety. 56 was the police. I got to

5 be honest with you, I don't know what they
6 contain in there.

7 MS. EVANS: Oh, just vote on it.

8 MR. COURTRIGHT: I know there are
9 certain things they have to belong to, but I
10 don't think \$500 is going to hurt them one
11 way or the other. I'll go along with it.

12 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
13 saying aye.

14 MS. EVANS: Aye.

15 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

16 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

17 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
19 ayes have it and so moved.

20 MS. EVANS: Police department, chief
21 of police salary reduction, \$14,145.66.

22 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Was that the salary
24 before the increase?

25 MS. EVANS: This takes it down to

126

1 2002 levels. In other words, I'm taking
2 these positions back to a level playing
3 field with the union employees, yet, when
4 they are under contract for the prolonged

5 workday they would still receive the
6 increases that would be awarded in 2009 for
7 the additional hour they work per day.

8 MR. COURTRIGHT: Right.

9 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
10 saying aye.

11 MS. EVANS: Aye.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

13 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

14 MS. FANUCCI: No.

15 MS. GATELLI: No.

16 MR. MCGOFF: No. Motion defeated.

17 MS. EVANS: Police department,
18 eliminate assistant grants manager, \$15,000.

19 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

20 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
21 who -- I'm not quite sure who that is and
22 what they did. Did they replace somebody?

23 MS. EVANS: No, that was in last
24 year's -- well, this is a part-time position
25 for \$15,000 and we have a grant's manager

127

1 with the police department.

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: Okay.

3 MR. MCGOFF: All those in favor
4 signify by saying aye.

5 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

6 MS. EVANS: Aye.
7 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No. I'm sorry?
8 MS. FANUCCI: No.
9 MS. GATELLI: No.
10 MR. MCGOFF: Motion defeated.
11 MS. EVANS: Fire department, fire
12 chief salary reduction, \$12,830.90.
13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in
14 favor signify by saying aye.
15 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.
16 MS. EVANS: Aye.
17 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
18 MS. FANUCCI: No.
19 MS. GATELLI: No.
20 MR. MCGOFF: Motion defeated.
21 MS. EVANS: City clerk, eliminate
22 travel and lodging, \$800.
23 MR. MCGOFF: You don't get to go
24 anywhere, Mrs. Garvey.
25 MS. GATELLI: No, I don't. That's

128

1 for me not to go the League of Cities,
2 that's what that's about.
3 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in
4 favor signify by saying aye.
5 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. EVANS: Aye.

MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

MS. FANUCCI: No.

MS. GATELLI: No.

MR. MCGOFF: No. Motion defeated.

MS. EVANS: City Clerk, City Clerk
salary reduction, \$4,000.

MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

MS. EVANS: Yes, this affects Kay
Garvey, our employee, and I know how hard
she works, I know how hard Neil works and
how hard Sue works, but I don't believe in
rewarding some and not rewarding others. I
think there should be equal justice under
God. Everybody gets a raise or they don't.

MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else?

MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question, I
had thought back as far as when Jay Saunders
was there that the city's clerk position,
way back when I first got here, was less --

129

1
2
3
4
5
6

the department head, there is five of us
here that they got to handle and I thought
that the other department heads were making
more and I actually thought that that was --
they were being lowballed back then so that
was my opinion and I still have that

7 opinion.

8 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
9 saying aye.

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye. Oh, no.

11 MS. EVANS: Aye.

12 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

13 MS. FANUCCI: No.

14 MS. GATELLI: No.

15 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

16 MR. MCGOFF: No.

17 MS. EVANS: City clerk solicitor
18 salary, \$20,000.

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
20 again, I was very upset when I came onto
21 council and the mayor reduced our
22 solicitor's salary by \$18,000 right out of
23 shoot, and I believed that and I believe now
24 it was for no other reason other than the
25 fact that it was political, and somebody had

130

1 made a comment, you know, he was a new
2 solicitor coming in, who happened to be Mark
3 Walsh at the time, and he had been a lawyer
4 for a long time, and I think the solicitor
5 job in our office entails an awful lot.

6 MS. EVANS: I would agree with that

7 these days particularly with the number of
8 lawsuits that are being filed against
9 council, but again, I'm trying to utilize a
10 level playing field here and not play
11 favours. That's all.

12 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
13 saying aye?

14 MS. EVANS: Aye.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

17 MS. FANUCCI: No.

18 MS. GATELLI: No.

19 MR. MCGOFF: No. Motion defeated.

20 MS. EVANS: Controllor's Office,
21 solicitor's salary reduction \$5,200.

22 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question, did
24 he get an increase or when would that take
25 place?

131

1 MS. EVANS: This is beyond the --

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: Oh, we are going
3 back to 2008.

4 MS. EVANS: But not this year.

5 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
6 saying aye.

7 MS. EVANS: Aye.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?
9 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
10 MS. FANUCCI: No.
11 MS. GATELLI: No.
12 MR. MCGOFF: No. Motion defeated.
13 MS. EVANS: Controller's Office,
14 confidential secretary, \$5,749.
15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?
16 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question, is
17 this a nonunionized employee? Is this the
18 salary that -- would you bring it back you
19 said would include the increase the
20 unionized employees got or not.
21 MS. EVANS: Yes, because everyone is
22 working that additional time, not just
23 these --
24 MR. COURTRIGHT: So even with this
25 taken out they are still getting the raise

132

1 the union employees got?
2 MS. EVANS: Yes.
3 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in
4 favor say aye.
5 MS. EVANS: Aye.
6 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?
7 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

8 MS. FANUCCI: No.

9 MS. GATELLI: No.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Motion defeated.

11 MS. EVANS: Controller's Office,
12 deputy controller salary reduction, \$5,900.

13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
14 those in favor signify by saying aye.

15 MS. EVANS: Aye.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

17 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

18 MS. FANUCCI: No.

19 MS. GATELLI: No.

20 MR. MCGOFF: No.

21 MS. GATELLI: Wait a minute, that was
22 taken out in mine for \$5,300 and we all
23 three of us passed it so this with one
24 should be removed. You can't vote on the
25 same thing again.

133

1 MS. EVANS: Well, it's different in
2 that it was more money. Okay, Controller's
3 Office, program monitor salary reduction,
4 \$900.

5 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in
6 favor signify by saying aye.

7 MS. EVANS: Aye.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

9 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

10 MS. FANUCCI: No.

11 MS. GATELLI: No.

12 MR. MCGOFF: No.

13 MS. EVANS: Controller's Office,
14 perform auditor's salary reduction, 5,900.

15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
16 those in favor signify by saying aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Aye.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

20 MS. FANUCCI: No.

21 MS. GATELLI: No.

22 MR. MCGOFF: No.

23 MS. EVANS: The Department of
24 Business Administration, travel and lodging
25 reduction, \$1,500.

134

1 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? Does
2 anyone know what it's at by any chance?

3 MS. GATELLI: I don't know.

4 MS. EVANS: 1,500. It's on page 37.

5 MR. MCGOFF: It's at 1,500 now.

6 MS. EVANS: Yes, it is.

7 MR. MCGOFF: It would be eliminated
8 then.

9 MS. EVANS: Yes, it would.

10 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by

11 saying aye.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

13 MS. EVANS: Aye.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

15 MS. FANUCCI: No.

16 MS. GATELLI: No.

17 MR. MCGOFF: Motion defeated.

18 MS. EVANS: Business administration,

19 training and certification reduction, 1,000.

20 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All

21 those in favor signify by saying aye.

22 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

23 MS. EVANS: Aye.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

25 MS. FANUCCI: No.

135

1 MS. GATELLI: No.

2 MS. EVANS: Business Administration,

3 SPA citation issuers \$670,664. According to

4 the agreement between the city and SPA only

5 10 percent of the revenues are to be paid to

6 the SPA. Now, I doubt very much that the

7 city is bringing in close to \$7 million from

8 parking meters. In addition to that, last

9 year, at least, there were only five

10 citation issuers employed at the Scranton
11 Parking Authority, so why we are paying the
12 Parking Authority close to \$1 million every
13 year and growing I don't know and no one has
14 ever provided that answer suitably or
15 responsibly.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question, I
17 don't know the answer to the question
18 Mrs. Evans stated, also, so I'll be agreeing
19 to this one.

20 MR. MCGOFF: All those in favor
21 signify by saying aye.

22 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

23 MS. EVANS: Aye.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

25 MS. FANUCCI: No.

136

1 MS. GATELLI: No.

2 MS. FANUCCI: Can I make some type of
3 motion here, as much fun as this is, can we
4 figure out maybe what you and Mrs. Evans
5 will decide on and then we will put it to a
6 vote and then see if maybe there is other
7 agreements, instead of going down the next
8 42 pages of fun. I mean, we did this in the
9 back room, we have all been working on this

10 and the fact that we didn't get to do this
11 or I would just a make a motion now to --
12 and I will do that, I make a motion that we
13 accept the amendments that was made in the
14 budget with Mrs. Evans --

15 MR. MCGOFF: There is already a
16 motion on the floor.

17 MS. FANUCCI: Well, then why don't we
18 make that motion and finish it so that we
19 can move on with this. This is nothing but
20 another hit list from last year.

21 MS. EVANS: Excuse me, this is what?
22 Excuse me, this is what?

23 MS. FANUCCI: Excuse me? No, we are
24 going to finish voting on it.

25 MS. EVANS: Oh, I know, but what was

137

1 the comment prior to that?

2 MS. FANUCCI: It's another one of
3 your hit lists the same as last year.

4 MS. EVANS: Actually, no, it's not
5 the same as last year, but if you ever cared
6 to really look at this --

7 MS. FANUCCI: Oh, I do.

8 MS. EVANS: You would know that, but
9 I think maybe more than looking at this.
10 Maybe you ought to look at this, okay? (Mrs.

11 Evans holds up newspaper.) Why don't you
12 take a good look at the lines of people
13 waiting for food this year all the way down
14 North Washington Avenue and all the way up
15 this street to the children's library.

16 MR. MCGOFF: Please. Please.

17 MS. EVANS: Next to that is a
18 headline, "Reports depict a battered
19 economy, joblessness, helplessness, spending
20 and orders to --"

21 MR. MCGOFF: Mrs. Evans, please, we
22 are on your amendments.

23 MS. EVANS: Yes, we are.

24 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

25 MS. EVANS: And it's ashame, isn't

138

1 it, that there isn't anybody who is
2 interested in saving money for the taxpayers
3 because I guess these people they just don't
4 matter.

5 MS. FANUCCI: That's not true.

6 MS. EVANS: The political appointees
7 we should all be very sorry for.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Excuse me, we have been
9 going through everything that you have --

10 MS. EVANS: Yes, we have, and I thank

12 added to that office when the mayor came on
13 board.

14 MR. COURTRIGHT: Right.

15 MS. EVANS: Management positions.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: I don't know if
17 this is right to say, because I know they
18 took out some union positions and replaced
19 it with nonunion positions, that's what I'm
20 trying to figure out what job that is? Do
21 you know whose job that is, Kay?

22 MS. GARVEY: I believe I do.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Would you mind
24 telling me?

25 MS. GARVEY: Mary Lou Murray.

140

1 MR. COURTRIGHT: Okay.

2 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
3 saying aye.

4 MS. EVANS: Aye.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

6 MS. FANUCCI: No.

7 MS. GATELLI: No.

8 MR. MCGOFF: No.

9 MS. EVANS: Business administration,
10 eliminate financial analyst, \$35,000. No,
11 figure doe not including cost savings from

12 health care.

13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

14 MR. COURTRIGHT: Kay, would you mind
15 telling me who that is? I apologize, but
16 the title doesn't allow me to know what they
17 do. I know the person.

18 MS. EVANS: They still have quite a
19 number employed in the office.

20 MR. COURTRIGHT: Who is that, Kay.

21 MS. GARVEY: There are two people,
22 I'm not sure who holds what that position
23 there. Mary Maroon is one, and Sal Catarino
24 is the other one.

25 MR. COURTRIGHT: All right.

141

1 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
2 saying aye.

3 MS. EVANS: Aye.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

5 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

6 MS. FANUCCI: No.

7 MS. GATELLI: No.

8 MR. MCGOFF: No.

9 MS. EVANS: Human Resources, reduce
10 professional services, eliminate ADP,
11 \$41,000. And note, the city employees two
12 payroll clerks and utilize an in-house

13 parole department until the mayor hired ADP.
14 Also, no dates are contained in the ADP
15 contract, however, the mayor's budget
16 indicates that there has been an increase in
17 that contract for 2009.

18 MR. MCGOFF: On the question.

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
20 this one I'm for.

21 MR. MCGOFF: All those in favor
22 signify by saying aye.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

24 MS. EVANS: Aye.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

142

1 MS. FANUCCI: No.

2 MS. GATELLI: No.

3 MR. MCGOFF: No.

4 MS. EVANS: Human resources,
5 eliminate travel and lodging, \$1,500.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
7 in favor signify by saying aye.

8 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

9 MS. EVANS: Aye.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

11 MS. FANUCCI: No.

12 MS. GATELLI: No.

13 MR. MCGOFF: While you're looking
14 that up or if you wanted to, I was just
15 going to mention that I started to say
16 earlier that I was going to vote no against
17 any elimination of position, perhaps that
18 some of it could be expedited. We could
19 read through them, does anyone else feel the
20 same way that we are not going to --

21 MS. FANUCCI: I'm certainly not going
22 to vote for any elimination of positions.

23 MS. GATELLI: No.

24 MR. MCGOFF: I don't know that we
25 can -- can we make a vote that any

143

1 elimination of positions would, you know --

2 MS. EVANS: That's fine.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: Make a motion and
4 second it.

5 MS. EVANS: Go ahead.

6 MR. MCGOFF: Well, all those in
7 favor of elimination of any positions in the
8 budget signify by saying aye?

9 MS. EVANS: Aye.

10 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Those opposed? No.

12 MS. GATELLI: No.

13 MS. FANUCCI: No.

14 MS. EVANS: We'll eliminate those
15 now.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: So you won't have to
17 read those.

18 MS. FANUCCI: Right.

19 MS. GATELLI: But I wanted to go one
20 by one with them.

21 MS. EVANS: Well, now it's too late.

22 MR. MCGOFF: I was trying to expedite
23 things here.

24 MS. COURTRIGHT: This is going to go
25 down in history.

144

1 MS. EVANS: Director's salary
2 reduction \$22,000.

3 MR. MCGOFF: On the question.

4 MS. EVANS: Again, I'm taking this
5 back to that level initially --

6 MS. GATELLI: Whoever is going to be
7 watching this is going to have it turned off
8 by now.

9 MS. EVANS: I don't care. I'm
10 talking about human resources.

11 MS. GATELLI: Are you on 22?

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: Twenty-three right
13 now.

14 MS. EVANS: And the salary I believe
15 initially, well, actually if you read the
16 note, "Figure includes current \$10,000 raise
17 and \$12,000 of a prior \$17,100 raise.
18 \$5,100 is retained for PEL director duties.

19 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
20 in favor signify by saying aye.

21 MS. EVANS: Aye.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

23 MS. FANUCCI: No.

24 MS. GATELLI: No.

25 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

145

1 MS. EVANS: And we'll skip 24.
2 Actually, I have 24 twice, so anyway, the IT
3 we'll skip that and go to the next page.
4 Information technology, computer support
5 specialist's salary reduction \$5,000.

6 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
7 in favor say aye.

8 MS. EVANS: Aye.

9 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

10 MR. MCGOFF: No.

11 MS. FANUCCI: No.

12 MS. GATELLI: No.

13 MS. EVANS: IT, eliminate
14 professional services, \$40,000.

15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

16 MS. EVANS: I have noticed in the
17 last two years even, you know, we have had a
18 tremendous amount of money placed in that
19 department and we also have a tremendous
20 amount of budget transfers taking that money
21 out of that department and putting it
22 elsewhere so much so that I noticed even in
23 the mayor's budget he is has whittled down
24 some of what he has normally done all of
25 these years by placing money in there only

146

1 to be pumping it out into some other place.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else on the
3 question? All in favor signify by saying
4 aye.

5 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

6 MS. EVANS: Aye.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?

8 MS. FANUCCI: No.

9 MS. GATELLI: No.

10 MR. MCGOFF: No.

11 MS. EVANS: Information technology,
12 eliminate travel and lodging, \$1,500.

13 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
14 in favor signify by saying aye.

15 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.
16 MS. EVANS: Aye.
17 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?
18 MS. FANUCCI: No.
19 MS. GATELLI: No.
20 MR. MCGOFF: No.
21 MS. EVANS: Information technology,
22 eliminate training and certification,
23 \$2,000.
24 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
25 in favor signify by saying aye.

147

1 MS. EVANS: Aye.
2 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?
3 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
4 MS. FANUCCI: No.
5 MS. GATELLI: No.
6 MR. MCGOFF: No.
7 MS. EVANS: Twenty-nine, city
8 treasury, treasurer's salary reduction
9 \$14,433.
10 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
11 in favor signify by saying aye.
12 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.
13 MS. EVANS: Aye.
14 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed?
15 MS. FANUCCI: No.

16 MS. GATELLI: No.

17 MR. MCGOFF: No.

18 MS. EVANS: Thirty does not require a
19 vote because it does not effect the general
20 fund, it involves OECD salaries that could
21 be increased -- or decrease rather and then
22 it comes to \$164,884.50 that could be cut
23 from OECD expenses freeing those monies to
24 be included in CDBG or ESG allocations, but
25 that figure has no bearing on the general

148

1 budget.

2 Thirty-one. LIPS, eliminate deputy
3 director, safety and conservation, 34,000.
4 Oh, sorry, I'm not supposed to read that, so
5 we'll skip to 32.

6 MS. GATELLI: Read them, read them.
7 I want to hear the vote.

8 MS. EVANS: Well, I don't understand,
9 go back to 31?

10 MS. GATELLI: No.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Thirty-two. LIPS Zoning
12 Officer salary reduction, return to union
13 position \$40, 012.

14 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
15 those in favor signify by saying aye.

16 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Aye.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

19 MS. GATELLI: No.

20 MR. MCGOFF: What was your vote,
21 Mrs. Fanucci.

22 MS. FANUCCI: I'm sorry. Go ahead.
23 I was trying to figure out who went after.
24 No. I'm going to vote no.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

149

1 MS. EVANS: The law department,
2 eliminate professional services, \$200,000.

3 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

4 MR. COURTRIGHT: Could I get a
5 clarification on that, what that is and
6 where that's coming from the \$200,000.

7 MS. EVANS: Professional services.
8 Those would be basically the attorneys --
9 the law firms that are hired, for example,
10 to handle the union negotiations, there is
11 one. Worker's compensation cases, there is
12 another. You know, we have got -- and
13 people that are not on the payroll whose
14 names I see attached to everything like Sean
15 McDonough and the Doherty Law Firm and, you
16 know, what's his name, Dick Goldberg and his

17 firm, and so I'm sure that's where this
18 money is going.

19 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
20 saying aye.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

22 MS. EVANS: Aye.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

24 MS. FANUCCI: No.

25 MS. GATELLI: No.

150

1 MS. EVANS: Law department,
2 eliminate training and certification,
3 \$1,500.

4 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
5 in favor signify by saying aye.

6 MS. EVANS: Aye.

7 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

8 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

9 MS. FANUCCI: No.

10 MS. GATELLI: No.

11 MS. EVANS: Law Department,
12 eliminate first assistant city solicitor,
13 \$40,000. No job creation in 2004.

14 MS. GATELLI: That's Gene Hickey;
15 right?

16 MS. EVANS: Um-hum.

17 MR. MCGOFF: All in favor signify by
18 saying aye.

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

20 MS. EVANS: Aye.

21 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

22 MS. FANUCCI: No.

23 MS. GATELLI: No.

24 MS. EVANS: Law department, eliminate
25 assistant city solicitor? I'm sorry. Skip

151

1 it. Skip it; right?

2 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

3 MS. EVANS: And we skip 37.

4 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

5 MS. EVANS: Okay, 38, traffic
6 maintenance, foreman's salary reduction
7 \$6,200.

8 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
9 in favor signify by saying aye.

10 MS. EVANS: Aye.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

13 MS. FANUCCI: No.

14 MS. GATELLI: No.

15 MS. EVANS: DPW director's salary
16 reduction, twenty-five two.

17 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

18 MS. EVANS: Yes, I know that
19 Mr. Brazil does a wonderful job, but
20 basically he is earning the same amount of
21 money that Mr. Parker did for serving as an
22 engineer and director of DPW.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else? All in
24 favor signify by saying aye.

25 MS. EVANS: Aye.

152

1 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

3 MS. FANUCCI: No.

4 MS. GATELLI: No.

5 MS. EVANS: DPW Highways, foreman
6 salary reduction \$6,200.

7 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
8 in favor signify by saying aye.

9 MS. EVANS: Aye.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

12 MS. FANUCCI: No.

13 MS. GATELLI: No.

14 MS. EVANS: DPW refuse workmen's
15 salary reduction, \$6,200.

16 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
17 in favor signify by saying aye.

18 MS. EVANS: Aye.
19 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
20 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
21 MS. FANUCCI: No.
22 MS. GATELLI: No.
23 MS. EVANS: DPW refuse, recycling
24 coordinator's salary reduction \$6,200.
25 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All

153

1 in favor signify by saying aye.
2 MS. EVANS: Aye.
3 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
4 MS. FANUCCI: No.
5 MS. EVANS: Well, gee that was --
6 three people voted. So we'll just assume
7 you are with the majority.
8 DPW garages --
9 MS. GATELLI: Who didn't vote? Me and
10 Bill didn't vote.
11 MR. COURTRIGHT: I thought I did.
12 MS. EVANS: DPW garages, eliminate--
13 MS. GATELLI: I hope they don't do
14 this up the street tonight and eliminate the
15 nurse at West Scranton High School.
16 MS. EVANS: DPW garages, manager's
17 salary reduction, \$3,200.
18 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All

19 in favor signify by saying aye.

20 MS. EVANS: Aye.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

23 MS. FANUCCI: No.

24 MS. GATELLI: No.

25 MS. EVANS: Single Tax Office, tax

154

1 collector's salary reduction \$4,150.02 and
2 that comes only from the city's portion of
3 the salary as we know the other 50 percent
4 is paid by the school district.

5 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
6 in favor signify by saying aye.

7 MS. EVANS: Aye.

8 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

9 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

10 MS. FANUCCI: No.

11 MS. GATELLI: No.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: I abstain.

13 MS. EVANS: Single Tax Office, chief
14 clerk's salary reduction \$4,896.28.

15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
16 in favor signify by saying aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Aye.

18 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

19 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
20 MS. FANUCCI: No.
21 MS. GATELLI: No.
22 MS. EVANS: Parks and Rec, eliminate
23 travel and lodging, \$1,000.
24 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
25 in favor signify by saying aye.

155

1 MS. EVANS: Aye.
2 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.
3 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
4 MS. FANUCCI: No.
5 MS. GATELLI: No.
6 MS. EVANS: Parks and Recs, eliminate
7 performing acts, \$12,500.
8 MR. MCGOFF: That's just a budget
9 item, that's not a person?
10 MS. EVANS: That's not a person, no,
11 and there are budget categories towards the
12 very end where, for example, the funding is
13 for the Everhart Museums.
14 MR. MCGOFF: Understood. I just
15 wanted to make sure.
16 MS. GATELLI: It's for different
17 programs.
18 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
19 in favor signify by saying aye.

20 MS. EVANS: Aye.
21 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
22 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
23 MS. FANUCCI: No.
24 MS. GATELLI: No.
25 MS. EVANS: Parks and Rec, capital

156

1 expenditures reduction, \$175,000?
2 MR. COURTRIGHT: What capital
3 expenditures do we have in here? Do you
4 know what they are?
5 MS. EVANS: Pardon?
6 MR. COURTRIGHT: Capital
7 expenditures.
8 MS. EVANS: Included in that is the
9 greenhouse.
10 MR. COURTRIGHT: Okay.
11 MR. MCGOFF: Anyone else? All in
12 favor signify by saying aye.
13 MS. EVANS: Aye.
14 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.
15 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.
16 MS. FANUCCI: No.
17 MS. GATELLI: No.
18 MS. EVANS: Parks and Rec, director
19 salary reduction, \$10,200.

20 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
21 in favor signify by saying aye.

22 MS. EVANS: Aye.

23 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

24 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

25 MS. FANUCCI: No.

157

1 MS. GATELLI: No.

2 MS. EVANS: I'm going to skip the
3 next three because they were job
4 eliminations in parks and recs, but I do
5 want to say they were management positions,
6 and it does seem a bit absurd to have five
7 managers who oversee eight workers and one
8 secretary.

9 Fifty-three, an operating transfer
10 to debt service South Side library,
11 eliminate \$100,000.

12 MR. MCGOFF: On the question. On
13 this one I'm personally in favor of the
14 South Scranton library and would like to see
15 it, the building transformed. All in favor
16 signify by saying aye.

17 MS. EVANS: Aye.

18 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

19 MR. MCGOFF: Opposed? No.

20 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

21 MS. FANUCCI: No.

22 MS. GATELLI: No.

23 MS. EVANS: Then if you would go to
24 the next page, LIPS, add one animal control
25 officer for \$32,855.

158

1 MR. MCGOFF: I think that --

2 MS. GATELLI: We added a part-time.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: The part-time covers
4 it.

5 MS. EVANS: So you are not
6 interested in a full-time person?

7 MR. MCGOFF: I think part-time --
8 personally I voted for that because I
9 thought part-time was sufficient.

10 MS. EVANS: Okay. What about a
11 health inspector at \$32,855?

12 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All
13 in favor signify by saying aye.

14 MS. EVANS: Aye.

15 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

16 THE COURT: Opposed?

17 MR. MCGOFF: No.

18 MS. FANUCCI: No.

19 MS. GATELLI: No.

20 MS. EVANS: Add one housing

21 inspector. Well, we already have two, so
22 forget that. We don't need the
23 administrative assistant in the law
24 departments because we prefer to keep all of
25 the attorneys plus all of the outside law

159

1 firms. Here's an interesting one, like I
2 said, there is no money in that budget to do
3 an audit of the tax office, which is
4 required by law of the controller's office,
5 so you might want to think about providing
6 some money for that since the mayor forgot
7 about it.

8 MR. MCGOFF: That's an interesting
9 item. Where would \$40,000 come from? I
10 remember guess, you know, from what we have
11 done so far --

12 MS. EVANS: Well, I don't know, I
13 guess contingency because you didn't really
14 make any cuts, so you would have to take it
15 from contingency, otherwise, you know, you
16 can't go along and just not do an audit
17 again for another year.

18 MR. MCGOFF: I would believe that
19 this is something that should be done.
20 There should be an audit done on the
21 controller's office and if we need to add

22 costs to do that I believe that's necessary.
23 All in favor -- or anyone else on the
24 question? All in favor signify by saying
25 aye.

160

1 MS. EVANS: Aye.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Aye.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

4 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

5 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

6 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
7 moved.

8 MS. EVANS: Thank you all for your
9 indulgence.

10 MR. MCGOFF: Now that we have done
11 the -- I'm sorry, did you have --

12 MS. EVANS: No, I was just going to
13 say that what was it maybe one out of 54.
14 That's quite an average.

15 MR. MCGOFF: You wouldn't make the
16 major leagues on that batting average.

17 MS. EVANS: No, I certainly wouldn't.
18 That must be why I'm not wealthy.

19 MR. MCGOFF: I believe now we are
20 reading 7-A as amended.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Read 7-A as amended,

22 Kay.

23 MS. GARVEY: I'm still catching up
24 on the amendments, you'll have to wait.

25 MS. EVANS: They were all no so you

161

1 don't have to catchup.

2 MS. GARVEY: No, there were two yeses
3 that I have on here that all council have
4 agreed to.

5 MR. MCGOFF: Yes.

6 MS. GARVEY: One was for dues and
7 subscriptions on page 56 from \$3,500 to
8 \$3,000 and the other one was for \$40,000
9 from I guess contingency for the
10 Controller's Office to do an audit of the
11 Single Tax Office. They are the two that I
12 have that were --

13 MR. MCGOFF: Thank you.

14 MS. GARVEY: 7-A. A. FOR
15 CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON FINANCE -
16 FOR ADOPTION - FILE OF COUNCIL NO. 49, 2008
17 APPROPRIATING FUNDS FOR THE EXPENSES OF THE
18 CITY GOVERNMENT FOR THE PERIOD COMMENCING ON
19 THE FIRST DAY OF JANUARY 2009 TO AND
20 INCLUDING DECEMBER 31, 2009 BY THE ADOPTION
21 OF THE GENERAL CITY OPERATING BUDGET FOR THE
22 YEAR 2009.

23 MR. MCGOFF: What is the
24 recommendation for the Chairperson for the
25 Committee on Finance?

162

1 MS. GATELLI: As Chair for the
2 Committee on Finance, I recommend final
3 passage of 7-A.

4 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

5 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

6 MS. EVANS: Yes. Just briefly, once
7 again the majority has spoken and the
8 winners or losers tonight are not the
9 members of city council, rather, it is you,
10 the taxpayers.

11 MS. GATELLI: I would just like to
12 make one comment, that I'm very pleased that
13 we did not raise the taxes and there was no
14 borrowing, so I'm very happy about that.

15 MR. MCGOFF: Roll call, please.

16 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Evans.

17 MS. EVANS: No.

18 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Gatelli.

19 MS. GATELLI: Yes.

20 MR. COOLICAN: Ms. Fanucci.

21 MS. FANUCCI: Yes.

22 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. Courtright.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.
24 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. McGoff.
25 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. I hereby declare

163

1 Item 7-A legally and lawfully adopted.

2 MS. GARVEY: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION -
3 BY THE COMMITTEE ON COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT -
4 FOR ADOPTION - RESOLUTION NO. 85, 2008 -
5 AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE
6 CITY OFFICIALS TO EXECUTE AND APPLY FOR A
7 GRANT THROUGH THE COMMONWEALTH OF
8 PENNSYLVANIA, DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY AND
9 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (DCED) FOR A GROWING
10 GREENER II MAIN STREET AND DOWNTOWN
11 REDEVELOPMENT GRANT IN THE AMOUNT OF
12 \$250,000.00. IF THE GRANT APPLICATION IS
13 SUCCESSFUL, THE GRANT FUNDS WILL BE
14 DISTRIBUTED TO THE 500 LACKAWANNA
15 DEVELOPMENT COMPANY FOR THE PROJECT TO BE
16 NAMED AS "500 LACKAWANNA AVENUE
17 REDEVELOPMENT PROJECT" TO BE USED FOR
18 BUILDING RENOVATIONS.

19 MR. MCGOFF: You have heard Reading
20 by title of Item 7 -- what is the
21 recommendation of the Chairperson for the
22 Committee on Community Development.

23 MS. FANUCCI: As Chairperson for the

24 Committee on Community Development, I
25 recommend final passage of Item 7-B.

164

1 MR. COURTRIGHT: Second.

2 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

3 MS. EVANS: Buona Pizza continues to
4 fight in court to keep it's business on
5 Lackawanna Avenue while Coney Island is
6 paying for it's own renovations. These are
7 two anchor businesses that have paid taxes
8 for decades. This development company has
9 already received excessive financial
10 assistance from the state and the city,
11 meanwhile, our government is struggling to
12 cut the state budget to avoid deficit
13 problems. Therefore, I will be voting, no.

14 MR. MCGOFF: Roll call, please? Roll
15 call, please.

16 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Evans.

17 MS. EVANS: No.

18 MR. COOLICAN: Mrs. Gatelli.

19 MS. GATELLI. Yes.

20 MR. COOLICAN: Ms. Fanucci.

21 MS. FANUCCI: Yes.

22 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. Courtright.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: Yes.

24 MR. COOLICAN: Mr. McGoff.

25 MR. MCGOFF: Yes. I hereby declare

165

1 Item 7-B legally and lawfully adopted.

2 MS. GARVEY: 7-C. FOR CONSIDERATION
3 BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES - FOR ADOPTION -
4 RESOLUTION NO. 86, 2008 - AUTHORIZING THE
5 MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS
6 TO EXECUTE AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT FOR
7 PROFESSIONAL SERVICES WITH THE LAW FIRM OF
8 CARL J. GRECO, P.C. FOR LEGAL SERVICES
9 INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO GENERAL COUNSEL
10 TO THE OFFICE OF ECONOMIC AND COMMUNITY
11 DEVELOPMENT ("OECD"), URBAN RENEWAL PROCESS
12 AND PROCEDURE, EMINENT DOMAIN
13 AND RELATED LITIGATION, DISPOSITION OF
14 SURPLUS URBAN RENEWAL LANDS, TITLE SEARCHES
15 AND DEED PREPARATION.

16 MR. MCGOFF: As Chairperson for the
17 Committee on Rules, I recommend final
18 passage of Item 7-C.

19 MS. FANUCCI: Second.

20 MR. MCGOFF: On the question?

21 MS. EVANS: Am I to assume that this
22 contract covers the Scranton Redevelopment
23 Authority as well as OECD or am I going to
24 see another \$150,000 contract coming down

25 the pipeline soon? This is for both? Okay.

166

1 MS. GATELLI: And before -- are you
2 done?

3 MS. EVANS: No, but that's okay, I'll
4 return to it.

5 MS. GATELLI: I don't know if now is
6 the time, but I would like to amend it to
7 \$125,000.

8 MS. FANUCCI: I'll second that.

9 MR. MCGOFF: On the motion to amend
10 the amount to \$125,000?

11 MS. GATELLI: My reason is -- for
12 increasing it at all is because there have
13 been many Right-to-Know requests which have
14 caused the contract to exceed what we
15 normally do. I think that we should
16 appropriate that money. I think that the
17 people do have a right for their, you know,
18 items to be answered, but by the same token
19 the attorney has to review them all and I
20 think that, you know, he should be
21 compensated. I have a list, and even though
22 we didn't -- I don't know if everybody got a
23 copy, I just got a copy of it and I
24 certainly will leave it here to share with

25

all of you, but as of October Mr. Greco had

167

1

already used \$117,690. I do recall that one
2 time his contract was not brought up at city
3 council, he went to court and he got paid.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So even if we don't want to pay
him, you know, if he goes to court and
proves that he did the work he is going to
get paid. Maybe we don't like Carl Greco,
maybe you don't like him because he
contributes to the mayor's campaign, but
OECD has always had an attorney and his fee
is not -- I don't know, it might be \$5
higher now than it was when I was there many
moons ago, so the fee is really not that
high considering the work and I do have all
of the Right-to-Know requests and what they
have costed since the beginning of the year
if anyone cares to look at it, but I do
think \$150 is beyond, and I'm stretching it
with \$125,000. I really would like to keep
it at a hundred, but with the amounts of
work that I have seen I think that it's
justified to take him to a hundred and a one
quarter.

MR. MCGOFF: I'm just going add in

that there is also the possibility with a

1 new Right-to-Know law coming into effect in
2 January that those costs could increase and
3 whether you question, I guess some people
4 question why an attorney has to look at
5 every Right-to-Know request, I believe that
6 it's necessary at least at OECD because
7 should something be divulged that is
8 improper then OECD and the city is subject
9 to lawsuits, and so on the side of caution
10 an attorney -- I believe that we need a
11 solicitor there to review every request.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: On the question,
13 Mr. McGoff. I was ready to vote yes when I
14 thought it was \$100,000. I was kind of
15 shocked when I saw \$150,000. Mrs. Gatelli
16 had passed down -- I read that as she passed
17 that down, I just had seen it today when we
18 were sitting up here, she passed it down and
19 I see there is about \$20,000 in
20 Right-to-Know letters. I do see that some
21 of the names are repeatedly on there, people
22 asking Right-to-Know. I don't deprive
23 anybody of their right to know. I don't
24 know exactly what it is that he does when he
25 gets a Right-to-Know letter that can cost

1 all of this money, and I said I saw there
2 was a total of \$20,000. I'm not willing to
3 go \$125,000. If this council would be
4 willing to wait and table this and they
5 could enlighten, maybe Mr. Greco's office.
6 I have nothing against Mr. Greco, I don't
7 even know the man, maybe just to talk to me
8 one or twice in my life, you know, and then
9 maybe he could scale it back a little bit if
10 he they were willing, you know, to scale it
11 back 110 or 115,000 I would go along with
12 that probably.

13 Also, what Mr. McGoff said, there is
14 a potential with the new Right-to-Know laws
15 that would be increased work for him. If
16 that were the case, you know, and he could
17 prove to me throughout the year that, hey,
18 we got a whole more much in here then I
19 would be willing to vote to give him an
20 increase at that time, but for right now I
21 can't vote yes on \$125,000.

22 MR. MCGOFF: We are on the motion to
23 reduce the amount from \$150,000 to \$125,000.
24 All in favor signify by saying aye.

25 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

1 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

2 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

3 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed?

4 MS. EVANS: No.

5 MR. COURTRIGHT: No.

6 MR. MCGOFF: The ayes have it and so
7 moved. Thank you. And now I guess we are
8 back on the question.

9 MS. GATELLI: If anyone would like
10 to see this on council, I'll share it.

11 MR. COURTRIGHT: Before I even try to
12 make a motion, is there anybody willing to
13 hold onto this and table this until one time
14 we get a little bit more information or is
15 everybody satisfied they don't need any -- -
16 no? If you are satisfied and you don't need
17 anymore information I'm not going to make a
18 motion that I know it's not going to pass.
19 I just -- I don't doubt the costs go up each
20 year, I don't doubt that, and I know, no
21 offense, Amil, lawyers are expensive, you
22 know, but I just, I don't know, \$25,000
23 increase because of Right-to-Know, that
24 doesn't set well with me.

25 MS. GATELLI: Yeah, that's fine.

1 MR. MCGOFF: Make a motion to table
2 and we will investigate that.

3 MR. COURTRIGHT: What I would do is I
4 don't think he would be opposed to speaking
5 to me, I'll ask to speak to Mr. Greco
6 personally or his staff or somebody to
7 explain to me and then I'll bring that
8 information back or if anyone wants to go
9 with me --

10 MS. GATELLI: You can investigate
11 that.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: I make a motion to
13 table Item 7-C.

14 MS. GATELLI: I'll second that.

15 MR. MCGOFF: On the question? All in
16 favor of tabling Item 7-C signify by saying
17 aye.

18 MS. EVANS: Aye.

19 MS. FANUCCI: Aye.

20 MS. GATELLI: Aye.

21 MR. COURTRIGHT: Aye.

22 MR. MCGOFF: Aye. Opposed? The
23 ayes have it and so moved.

24 MS. EVANS: And I have something that
25 I have been trying to talk about on the

1 question during all of the questions.

2 MR. MCGOFF: Go ahead.

3 MS. EVANS: You know, I think what
4 bothers me most about all of this because I
5 don't know Mr. Greco either other than that
6 I drive by his lovely home on the way to and
7 from work everyday, but there really appears
8 to be -- or shall I say Mr. Greco appears to
9 be the predetermined recipient of this
10 contract for eight years now, and in what
11 will be eight years of his part-time
12 employment by the city he will have earned a
13 minimum of \$860,000, so I think he can
14 easily join the millionaire's circles of
15 attorneys and vendors and landscapers and
16 everyone else who has amassed their fortune
17 under this administration.

18 Now, it seems that Attorney Greco
19 earns tens of thousands for handling
20 Right-to-Know and Freedom of Information Act
21 requests, yet, state law protects those
22 requests and rarely now can they be denied.

23 Also, I believe that those requests
24 were reviewed by the law department and when
25 approved for release the task was assigned

1 to the appropriate department head and
2 clerical staff to retrieve and copy.
3 Perhaps, it would be even more beneficial
4 and cost effective if city government made
5 the information available to citizens
6 without having to file all of these
7 requests, and I know and maybe someone on
8 this council will concur with this, that it
9 is often very difficult to obtain
10 information from the departments of this
11 administration and that I could bring to you
12 next week probably a stack of a minimum of
13 100 requests for information from this
14 council that have gone unanswered.

15 MR. COURTRIGHT: Mrs. Evans, can I
16 interrupt you for one second, I am going to
17 agree that it's difficult to get
18 information. I think there is some
19 department heads that want to give me the
20 information, but --

21 MS. EVANS: And they are not allowed
22 to.

23 MR. COURTRIGHT: -- or afraid to,
24 afraid that maybe it would jeopardize their
25 employment. I can't prove that, that's just

1 a feeling that I have. So in that respect
2 I'm going to agree with you. I think there
3 is instances where it's difficult.

4 MS. EVANS: Well, I'll tell you what,
5 I just can't see anybody paying this to an
6 attorney for such an easy task. You know,
7 this is almost like highway robbery because
8 this is a task that can be performed by a
9 clerk. A lawyer looks at it and says, yes
10 or no, and it gets passed along to someone
11 else. I had no idea that he was going out
12 and digging for the information and making
13 all of the copies and spending, oh, an hour
14 to five hours per request, you know, come on
15 now. Who is fooling who here?

16 It seems to me that Mr. Greco's
17 services are used inappropriately and if
18 Mrs. Fanucci's claims are true that, you
19 know, this is -- this is very inappropriate
20 use of an intelligent man's time and if --

21 MS. FANUCCI: Well, my belief is that
22 he does pay -- doesn't he pay his people?

23 MS. EVANS: How does this get turned
24 on and off all the time?

25 MR. MCGOFF: It may be the wire

1 because it's not being --

2 MS. EVANS: You are down there, but
3 someone else obviously has to unless we have
4 a ghost. Anyway, I think, as I said, there
5 is very little information that the public
6 can't have and if Mr. Greco or any attorney
7 wastes such time on information requests it
8 seems there is a concerted effort to control
9 the information that the public receives and
10 for all of these reasons I'll be voting no.

11 MR. MCGOFF: Motion to adjourn.

12 MR. COURTRIGHT: So moved.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately in the notes of testimony taken by me at the hearing of the above-captioned matter and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the same to the best of my ability.

CATHENE S. NARDOZZI, RPR
OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER