

COUNCIL FOR THE CITY OF SCRANTON

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

HELD:

Monday, November 18th, 2019

LOCATION:

Council Chambers  
Scranton City Hall  
340 North Washington Avenue  
Scranton, Pennsylvania

Maria McCool, RPR  
Official Court Reporter

1 C O U N C I L M E M B E R S :

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

- PATRICK ROGAN, PRESIDENT
- TIMOTHY PERRY, VICE PRESIDENT - absent
- WILLIAM GAUGHAN
- KYLE DONAHUE
- MARY WALSH DEMPSEY
  
- LORI REED, CITY CLERK
- KATHY CARRERA, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK
- AMIL MINORA, ESQUIRE

1 (Pledge of Allegiance recited and a  
2 moment of reflection observed.)

3

4 MR. ROGAN: Roll call, please.

5 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Perry. Mr.

6 Donahue.

7 MR. DONAHUE: Here.

8 MS. CARRERA: Attorney Dempsey.

9 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Here.

10 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.

11 MR. GAUGHAN: Here.

12 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.

13 MR. ROGAN: Here.

14 MR. GAUGHAN: I would like to make a  
15 motion to take from the table file of the  
16 Council No. 74 2019.

17 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

18 MR. ROGAN: On the question, this  
19 piece is being taken from the table previously  
20 placed in Seventh Order for a final vote. It  
21 was previously tabled to comply with a 30 day  
22 public comment period as required by HUD.  
23 Anyone who wishes to speak on this piece of  
24 legislation should do so during Citizens  
25 Participation. All those in favor signify by

1 saying aye.

2 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

3 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

4 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

5 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
6 have it and so moved.

7 MR. GAUGHAN: I would like to make a  
8 motion to take from the table Resolution Number  
9 167 2019.

10 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

11 MR. ROGAN: On the question, this  
12 piece is being taken from the table and placed  
13 n Seventh Order for a final vote. This  
14 concerns the contract with Barry Isett and  
15 Associates for the City of Scranton's Licensing  
16 and Permits Department assessment. Anyone who  
17 wishes to speak on this piece of legislation  
18 may do so in Fourth Order. All those in favor  
19 signify by saying aye.

20 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

21 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

22 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed?

23 MR. DONAHUE: No.

24 MR. ROGAN: The ayes have it and so  
25 moved.

1 MR. DONAHUE: I'd like to make a  
2 motion to table Item 7-C.

3 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

4 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
5 those in favor signify by saying aye.

6 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

7 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

8 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

9 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
10 have it and so moved. Please dispense with the  
11 reading of the minutes.

12 MS. REED: THIRD ORDER.

13 3-A. MINUTES OF THE SCRANTON  
14 REDEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY MEETING HELD  
15 OCTOBER 16, 2019.

16 3-B. TAX ASSESSOR'S RESULTS REPORTS  
17 FOR HEARING DATES HELD OCTOBER 30 AND NOVEMBER  
18 6, 2019.

19 3-C. MINUTES OF THE CIVIL SERVICE  
20 COMMISSION MEETING HELD SEPTEMBER 19, 2019.

21 3-D. CHECK RECEIVED FROM COMCAST IN  
22 THE AMOUNT OF \$252,825.42 FOR QUARTERLY  
23 FRANCHISE FEE.

24 3-E. MINUTES OF THE ETHICS BOARD  
25 REGULAR MEETING HELD OCTOBER 24, 2019.

1 MR. ROGAN: Are there any comments  
2 on the Third Order items? If not, received and  
3 filed. Do any Council members have  
4 announcements at this time?

5 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, I just have one  
6 statement I'd like to make. I usually would  
7 reserve this for Fifth Order. But I just want  
8 to take a second at the top of the meeting to  
9 mention something, something about the  
10 retirement of our City Controller Roseann  
11 Novembrino.

12 When I first got involved in  
13 politics back in 2013, Mrs. Novembrino was one  
14 of the first people that was willing to take  
15 the time and talk with me. As a City  
16 Controller, her door was always, and I mean  
17 always open. You didn't need an appointment.  
18 You didn't need to send an e-mail. And you  
19 certainly did not need to make a phone call.

20 As City Controller, she was the  
21 epitome of what a good public servant should  
22 be, always willing to take the time, answer  
23 questions and listen to people. We often talk  
24 in these chambers and across the City about how  
25 important it is for public servants to be

1 selfless.

2 Well, Mrs. Novembrino was just that.  
3 Time after time she could have received a raise  
4 in that position. But she turned it down time  
5 after time. She always looked out for every  
6 single one of her employees who held her in the  
7 highest regard.

8 And I know that from talking with  
9 some of them over the last few years and just  
10 in the last few days. And she always did what  
11 was best for the City. She was and still is  
12 revered in this building and across the City  
13 for her decades of service that she gave to  
14 Scranton. You will not find a kinder, more  
15 compassionate, dedicated person than Roseann  
16 Novembrino.

17 And I want to wish her well in her  
18 retirement. I want to wish her well with her  
19 health. And I want to thank her for all that  
20 she has done. And her family should be very  
21 proud of her service to the City. Thank you.

22 MR. ROGAN: Anyone else? A couple  
23 announcements, next Monday at 5:15 a public  
24 hearing will be held for the City's 2020  
25 operating budget. Also next week, the week of

1 November 25th through the 30th, newspapers will  
2 not be picked up.

3 DPW employees will be picking up  
4 leaves next week. Bagging of leaves is  
5 suggested. Leaf bags are free for residents  
6 and may be picked up at DPW headquarters on  
7 Poplar Street or at the Weston Firehouse on  
8 Providence Road. Again, leaves will be picked  
9 up, not newspapers the week of November 25th.

10 MS. REED: FOURTH ORDER. CITIZENS  
11 PARTICIPATION.

12  
13 (The following speakers spoke on  
14 agenda items and matters of general concern:

15 Mayor Evans

16 Less Spindler

17 John Bravo

18 Dorothy Dietrich

19 Joan Hodowanitz

20 Fay Franus

21 Dave Dobrzyn

22 Len Srebro

23 Bob Bolus

24 Lee Morgan

25 Marie Schumacher.)

1 MS. REED: FIFTH ORDER. 5-A.  
2 MOTIONS.

3 MR. ROGAN: Mr. Donahue, any motions  
4 or comments?

5 MR. DONAHUE: Just briefly. We  
6 received the budget on Friday. I just had a  
7 chance to go over it this morning. So I have  
8 as many questions as Joan has provided to us.  
9 A lot of my questions are listed in Joan's  
10 questions and I have many more.

11 But on the refuse fee, the problem  
12 with that is the way -- logistically is so it's  
13 broken down by parcel. So, for example, if  
14 there's a homeowner that has two parcels,  
15 they're going to pay double the fee. So that's  
16 one of my -- one of the issues I have with  
17 that.

18 So, for example, so I have two  
19 parcels. I have one with a -- I get two  
20 separate tax bills. I have one with -- that my  
21 house is on. And I have one that just gets a  
22 land value tax bill. So that's going to come  
23 in double the fee. And that's, you know, all  
24 over the City. It's actually going to  
25 affect -- negatively impact, I believe, the

1 land bank too.

2 The idea of the land bank was, you  
3 know, you have vacant property in between two  
4 properties. You split the property in half.  
5 There is different pin numbers. And you get  
6 billed differently. So that's one of the -- I  
7 just think it needs to be worked out.

8 But I will be putting together a  
9 list of my questions and providing them to the  
10 administration hopefully that we can get an  
11 answer on. That's all I have tonight.

12 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. Attorney  
13 Dempsey, any motions or comments?

14 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes, thank you,  
15 Mr. Rogan, I do. Good evening, everyone, and  
16 thank you for attending. I would like to thank  
17 Mayor Evans for coming to see us tonight. I as  
18 well have a dear family member struggling with  
19 cancer at the present time. And I echo his  
20 sentiments as well as those of Mr. McGoff.

21 Be a friend if and when you can to  
22 anybody struggling in any situation. I'd also  
23 like to give my accommodations to Mrs.  
24 Novembrino. While I did not know her  
25 personally, everyone I have spoken to about her

1 has held her in the highest regard and I wish  
2 her nothing but happiness and health in her  
3 retirement.

4 I'd like to make a motion at this  
5 time -- first let me preface it. I've been  
6 thinking more and more about grants for this  
7 City. And I understand we do have a full-time  
8 grant writer who does a lot of work for the  
9 police and the DPW who is really nothing but  
10 exceptional according to all accounts that I've  
11 been given.

12 But I have to think for a City  
13 coming out of financial distress as well for a  
14 City that has so much historical architecture  
15 and maybe even dire need of infrastructure  
16 repairs that there isn't more out there for us.  
17 So, well, I'm not sure I could effectuated it,  
18 ideally I'd like to see a part time or  
19 full-time grant writer written into this coming  
20 budget.

21 So I'm going to make a motion at  
22 this time that we send a letter to the Office  
23 of Economic and Community Development. What  
24 I'd like to know is over the last three years  
25 the types of grants the City has received, from

1           who we received them, and for what use they  
2           went for. And then once we received those  
3           maybe I could use that and our team up here can  
4           use that to make further determinations.

5                   MR. ROGAN: Is there a second?

6                   MR. DONAHUE: Second.

7                   MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
8           those in favor signify by saying aye.

9                   MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

10                  MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

11                  ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

12                  MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
13           have it and so moved.

14                  ATTY. DEMPSEY: Thank you. I want  
15           to update people on the payroll tax conversion.  
16           I was at a meeting on November 12th. It was a  
17           very well attended meeting in Mayor Evans's  
18           office. Mayor-elect Cagnetti was there. Mr.  
19           Bulzoni was there. Solicitor Eskra was there.  
20           Reps of PEL were there. And reps of the  
21           Scranton School District were there including  
22           their solicitor.

23                   I consider that a very productive  
24           meeting that answered many of the questions I  
25           had on that going forward. While I am not

1           sure I am going to be here to vote on that if  
2           and when the time comes, I remain convinced  
3           that this is the right way for the City to  
4           move.

5                        As it stands now relative to the  
6           Scranton School District, it does go back to  
7           their board to make further determinations and  
8           decisions. But for the time that I remain here  
9           I am going to closely monitor that. I attended  
10          an Ethics Board meeting with Joan. I think it  
11          was two weeks ago. I again want to commend  
12          them for their continuing service to this  
13          community.

14                       I heard a lot of the logistics that  
15          you have to do and they were logistics that I  
16          don't think a lot of people even thought of. I  
17          hear what you're saying about the budget. I  
18          don't know if and what we can effectuate. But  
19          I'm going to take a second look at that for  
20          you as well.

21                       This may not be a popular opinion in  
22          this room, especially to Mr. Bolus and a couple  
23          other people. But I attended a Recreational  
24          Authority meeting as well. And honestly, I was  
25          very impressed by what I saw up there. Those

1 men are a group of doers. There's people who  
2 are talkers. They get up and talk and talk and  
3 talk. These men talk and then do. And they  
4 not only do it, they do it themselves.

5 They have great ideas this year for  
6 Nay Aug Park. And I think they are really  
7 trying to create a revitalization of the park.  
8 I'm 53. I have very, very fond memories of  
9 that. This year they're going to have  
10 horse-drawn carriage rides. They're going to  
11 have a planted tree memorial.

12 They're hanging up new wreaths.  
13 They're going to have the winter lights all  
14 updated and they're going to have horse-drawn  
15 carriage lights. So it's hard to look at them  
16 and say they're not doing much in my  
17 perspective. So I want to commend and thank  
18 them as well.

19 I want to note my ongoing -- concern  
20 maybe is a strong word, my ongoing attention to  
21 the signing of the Ethics Code. I signed mine  
22 in the office this week. To me there is no  
23 question that the Collective Bargaining  
24 Agreements and the people who are members of  
25 the union do not really have a great argument

1 in this regard. I have cited it before and I  
2 will cite it again, the section that  
3 specifically states if there is any conflict,  
4 the Collective Bargaining Agreements trump.

5 So there's really not much to read  
6 through. As long as you could read the English  
7 language, I think it's very clear. It's very,  
8 very important to me that we have that code  
9 signed by all of our employees. After what  
10 this City has gone through in the course of the  
11 last six to nine months, if we can't have  
12 people working here including us five, we're  
13 going to follow the letter of the law and we're  
14 going to act in an ethical manner, we've done  
15 nothing.

16 So I'm going to ask the  
17 administration to take a somewhat strong  
18 approach to that and hopefully we're going to  
19 get all those signed as soon as possible. With  
20 my ongoing garbage fight with delinquencies,  
21 I'm aware that there was a meeting last week  
22 with our solicitor and an administrative  
23 representative -- it might have been their  
24 solicitor actually, I take that back from NRS.

25 I do not have an update on that. I

1           have certainly asked for it but has not been  
2           provided to me. If I have that next week I  
3           will advise. And I'm also asking them and I  
4           have not received an explanation or an answer  
5           yet when we're going to sending out the RFQ  
6           because ideally we don't want to lose any  
7           monthly income for the collection of  
8           delinquencies. And I'd like to have that up  
9           and running as soon as possible.

10                        Regarding the audit, Mr. Gaughan and  
11           I were speaking about that earlier -- or late  
12           last week or earlier today. And we sent an  
13           e-mail to Mr. Bulzoni. And he did get back to  
14           us just today. We're concerned that that's not  
15           ready as of yet. And I think two dates were  
16           given, maybe Mr. Donahue had gotten a date of  
17           November 1st. I had been given a date of  
18           December 1st.

19                        But the e-mail was asking very  
20           simply when will the audit be ready for review.  
21           And Mr. Bulzoni's response to us is that he's  
22           not changed his requirement to have it -- very  
23           least a draft by December 1st. I don't expect  
24           it sooner. They indicated they may need to  
25           restate a component of the 2017 audit but I do

1 not have any additional detail. We continue  
2 to monitor that.

3 If we don't have more detail I'd say  
4 by next week or definitely by our following  
5 meeting, I'm going to ask for something in  
6 writing so that -- something more detailed in  
7 writing so that we can follow up on that. Mr.  
8 Donahue brought up a good point in caucus. I  
9 would really like to see that audit before I  
10 make any strong decisions on the budget. And  
11 that's all I have. Thank you.

12 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. Mr. Gaughan,  
13 any motion or comments?

14 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, thank you.  
15 First, just on the issue of the MS4 permit and  
16 stormwater management, I would like to ask if  
17 Council can request a caucus before the end of  
18 the year with the City Engineer, the City  
19 Planner and Herbert Rowland and Grubic to give  
20 us an update on the City's MS4 permit  
21 application, pollution reduction plan and the  
22 feasibility of managing stormwater on a  
23 regional basis.

24 Back in the summer of 2019, City  
25 Council passed a contract legislation, entered

1           into a contract with HRG who would work with  
2           the City directly on its pollution reduction  
3           plan which is a key step in complying with the  
4           pollution reduction requirements imposed by the  
5           US Environmental Protection Agency.

6                     The firm at that time the way it was  
7           explained to us was to help the City determine  
8           the best management practices. It should  
9           implement and maintain its MS4 permit. So I do  
10          think, you know, the other thing that they were  
11          also going to work with the City on was  
12          exploring the feasibility and benefits of  
13          managing stormwater on a regional basis.

14                    So I think again before the end of  
15          the year I think we should have a public caucus  
16          and be briefed on that. We keep getting  
17          updates kind of piecemeal. I think it would be  
18          best if we got everybody on the same page and  
19          in the same room.

20                    As for Mr. Srebro's issue that's  
21          been ongoing now for the last few years, Mrs.  
22          Reed, if we can again send something to the DPW  
23          ask for another meeting with Mr. Srebro and all  
24          the parties involved and revisit this. I know  
25          I just can't understand at this point why --

1           what seems like a simple fix can't be taken  
2           care of. So again, Mr. Srebro, we'll try to  
3           get a meeting together and try to get that  
4           taken care of.

5                       We did receive the self-audit and  
6           all the backup to the self-audit from Police  
7           Chief -- Fire Chief DeSarno so Council will be  
8           in the process over the next few days of  
9           reviewing that.

10                      Also, I wanted to mention earlier  
11           today in our caucus we had members of the  
12           Federal Emergency Management Agency; the  
13           Pennsylvania Emergency Management Agency; DPW  
14           officials, Dennis Gallagher, the Department  
15           Director; Chris Jenkins, a foreman and some  
16           other representatives from different agencies  
17           across the state.

18                      And, Mrs. Schumacher had brought  
19           this up earlier tonight. As a result of that  
20           August 15th, 2018 storm, 11 counties and their  
21           associated political subdivisions including our  
22           County of Lackawanna were declared for the FEMA  
23           Public Assistance Program. That program is a  
24           reimbursement program that provides federal  
25           funding to help communities respond to and

1 recover from federally declared disasters.

2 Those two agencies reimbursed state  
3 and local governments and certain types of  
4 private nonprofit organizations for the cost of  
5 disaster-related debris removal, emergency  
6 protective measures to protect life and  
7 property and permanent repair work to damaged  
8 or destroyed infrastructure.

9 The City actually took in quite an  
10 amount of damage. For the removal and disposal  
11 of storm-related debris and emergency services,  
12 we're claiming a little over a million dollars  
13 worth of damage. The restoration of damage  
14 infrastructure rose, pump stations, flood  
15 control gates, we're claiming nearly 1.3  
16 million dollars.

17 So we have a total claim of nearly 2  
18 and a half million dollars and there's eligible  
19 management costs. Right now the City has  
20 received \$156,709.54. These projects over the  
21 next few months will be ongoing. As I  
22 mentioned to you earlier tonight, they are  
23 working close with the Pennsylvania Fish and  
24 Boat Commission because of some concerns with  
25 the wildlife in the water.

1                   Mr. Jenkins who was here tonight who  
2                   has done by all accounts a really, a great job  
3                   and kind of putting everybody together and  
4                   bringing all of these people together to get  
5                   this reimbursement money made a few comments  
6                   that I thought were a little concerning, one of  
7                   which I don't think we really can do anything  
8                   about.

9                   He mentioned that in cities who have  
10                  similarly size population as Scranton, they  
11                  have emergency management and emergency  
12                  response teams. And they have 20 full-time  
13                  people dedicated just to that for all of these  
14                  different things that go on, floods and other  
15                  disasters.

16                  Obviously right now we only have  
17                  Mr. Jenkins who really that's not even his job  
18                  according to him doing that. And we also have  
19                  Mr. DeSarno who we made the Emergency  
20                  Management Coordinator.

21                  Now, as I was sitting there tonight  
22                  in the caucus and Mr. Jenkins was talking about  
23                  emergency management in the City of Scranton, I  
24                  did think back to last year. The  
25                  administration granted the Fire Chief a \$12,500

1           increase in salary and that was due to the fact  
2           that we were giving him another title of or  
3           another responsibility as Emergency Management  
4           Coordinator.

5                        I had asked several questions about  
6           this and what functions and what duties he  
7           would take on with this new position or this  
8           new title. Mr. Bulzoni responded last year  
9           that the Emergency Management Coordinator will  
10          do the following:

11                       He will conduct training  
12          assessments, develop a multiyear training plan,  
13          conduct relative training for designated  
14          personnel with emergency planning response or  
15          recovery responsibilities. He'll also be  
16          responsible for developing and facilitating  
17          pertinent plan documents and exercises related  
18          to relevant hazards and threats.

19                       Mrs. Reed, if you could please  
20          request from the Fire Chief or the  
21          administration any documents related to what  
22          those responsibilities entail and what has been  
23          done in that role as Emergency Management  
24          Coordinator. Again, I would like to see what  
25          kind of progress was made.

1                   There was a substantial increase  
2                   granted in last year's budget and I think we  
3                   should see what kind of bang we got for our  
4                   buck there.

5                   Mrs. Dempsey mentioned the 2018  
6                   audit, where is it. We don't have it yet  
7                   obviously as she mentioned. Mr. Bulzoni gave a  
8                   response that he's looking for it on December  
9                   1st at least a draft by December 1st. He does  
10                  not expect it sooner.

11                  The audit company indicated they may  
12                  need to restate a component of the 2017 audit.  
13                  But he does not have additional detail. That  
14                  begs many other questions. What is that 2017  
15                  component? Why does it need to be restated?  
16                  What is the issue why we're not getting the  
17                  audit on time why we have to wait until  
18                  December 1st?

19                  As Councilwoman Dempsey and  
20                  Councilman Donahue had mentioned, it's  
21                  difficult to make a decision on a budget when  
22                  you don't have the audit from the previous year  
23                  for a number of different reasons. So I would  
24                  think that one of the things we should probably  
25                  do is -- and I felt this for quite a few years,

1 request an exit conference with the audit  
2 company so that I think they have a conference  
3 with the administration. I think we should  
4 have one with the audit company in a public  
5 caucus, number one.

6 And number two, let's just get in  
7 touch with the auditing firm and find out from  
8 them what the story is here and why this is  
9 taking so long. So maybe we want to put  
10 something in writing and draft something on  
11 that end.

12 Mrs. Schumacher asked about Police  
13 Department overtime. Again, I'm waiting on a  
14 report from Chief Graziano. That number  
15 sometimes is misleading because again, you have  
16 to see what is reimbursed from other entities  
17 who have used our Police Department for various  
18 things.

19 I had a -- went out and met with a  
20 woman who lives on Schimpf Court behind Kelly's  
21 Pub and Eatery, several concerns out there. We  
22 did send this to the DPW. I would like to see  
23 in the next round of paving if we can getting  
24 Schimpf Court paved. I know it might be  
25 frowned upon to look to pave courts and not

1 other major streets throughout the City, but  
2 there are several families who live on Schimpf  
3 Court. And this court has not been paved in  
4 decades.

5 So several people do live here.  
6 They have an awful hard time getting out,  
7 especially during the winter. Also Breck  
8 Street off of Cedar Avenue should also be  
9 placed on a potential paving list. And in the  
10 interim there are clumps of debris in Schimpf  
11 Court from runoff that needs to be removed and  
12 we did send that to the DPW.

13 Also, there was a resident who  
14 reached out to me about the Bloom Avenue bridge  
15 in North Scranton falling apart and issues  
16 there. We are waiting for an update from the  
17 City Engineer on that project. Councilwoman  
18 Dempsey mentioned the Ethics Code signing, I  
19 couldn't agree with her anymore.

20 I think that -- I don't know where  
21 the confusion lies for a few reasons. Number  
22 one, we passed the Ethics Code I think back in  
23 January of this year. So there's been more  
24 than enough time for people to read it. Number  
25 two, it should be on the department head to

1           make sure that all the employees in the  
2           department read the code, understand it, sign  
3           it and the training should be held.

4                        If there is any, you know, confusion  
5           about whether a bargaining agreement conflicts  
6           with the Ethics Code, as Councilwoman Dempsey  
7           pointed out within the last few weeks there's a  
8           clause in there that we specifically put in  
9           last year that states if the code conflicts  
10          with the bargaining agreement, the bargaining  
11          agreement will supersede it.

12                       I believe it was the police union  
13          who their union representative had sent Council  
14          a letter which our solicitor reviewed a year  
15          ago with concerns about the Ethics Code. And  
16          we addressed them before final passage. So  
17          again, I just think that we need to get going  
18          on this and then trainings can be held.

19                       I also want to thank Director  
20          Gallagher for coming to our caucus tonight and  
21          answering some unanswered questions about the  
22          gas card situation. Contrary to what Mr. Bolus  
23          said, I do think this is still important.  
24          Remember, these are taxpayer dollars. So, you  
25          know, you can't just look the other way.

1                   We have a responsibility and an  
2                   obligation as Council members and as an  
3                   oversight branch to look at these things and to  
4                   make sure that they are being done the right  
5                   way which is why we'll be voting on an audit  
6                   tonight. So I just want to say I do appreciate  
7                   him coming and giving us some more information.

8                   In regards to one of the questions  
9                   that came up about the large amount of gas that  
10                  was purchased on two different days in January,  
11                  2018 and 2019, he did provide receipts for both  
12                  of those days that showed that there were  
13                  garbage trucks that had to be filled. So I  
14                  appreciate that.

15                 The nonfuel purchase that was in  
16                 question of 2548 on January 22nd, 2018,  
17                 Mr. Gallagher did not have a receipt for that.  
18                 But again, I do appreciate it. And that's all  
19                 I have for tonight. Thank you.

20                 MR. ROGAN: Thank you. Just a  
21                 couple quick comments. Obviously we'll be  
22                 introducing the budget tonight. I don't have  
23                 a whole lot to say on it just because it is  
24                 such a large document and I don't think any of  
25                 us had a chance to fully analyze it.

1                   But one item that has come up from  
2                   the podium and I know a lot of residents have  
3                   been talking about is about the change in the  
4                   garbage fee. Just to add a little bit further  
5                   clarification, I know Councilman Donahue  
6                   touched on this as well.

7                   It does eliminate the \$300 per unit  
8                   garbage fee. And it rolls it into the taxes as  
9                   a \$250 fee that's paid per parcel or per  
10                  building or on vacant land. Also the fee is  
11                  now going to be paid on commercial buildings  
12                  that previously have not paid the fee.

13                  In my conversations with Mayor  
14                  Evans, one of the thoughts was to work on --  
15                  and we saw it this past weekend the need for  
16                  electronics recycling to be offered not only  
17                  residences but also to those commercial  
18                  properties as well that will now be paying the  
19                  fee.

20                  On the whole, I'm very supportive of  
21                  the change. It is a step in the right  
22                  direction. And the biggest reason for the  
23                  decrease is because our garbage collection  
24                  rates were bismal. I know we talked about  
25                  numerous times at these meetings about people

1           who owe hundreds of thousands of dollars in  
2           back garbage fees and other than putting a lien  
3           on the property really nothing can be done.

4                       Now, if the garbage fees are not  
5           paid as part of the taxes, the property goes to  
6           tax sale just as if you don't pay your taxes.  
7           So by increasing that collection rate from in  
8           the 60s to in the 90s, that allows the total  
9           rate to come down from \$300 to \$250. So one  
10          point in the budget that I'm fully supportive  
11          of, I think it's a step in the right direction.

12                      There are some other items that I do  
13          have concerns about some new positions, some  
14          salary increases, again, it's a very large  
15          budget. I have to look through it much closer.  
16          But I want to bring up those item two items.  
17          Licensing, Inspection and Permits came up again  
18          tonight. We're going to be voting on a piece  
19          of legislation to do a review in that  
20          department.

21                      That department does need a complete  
22          revamping. And I do agree with some of the  
23          items that were mentioned that it is too  
24          difficult to get a permit particularly for  
25          small business owners or somebody that owns a

1 four-unit rental building is considered  
2 commercial under the City ordinance.

3 I believe it comes from the state  
4 ordinance. But that's something that we can  
5 look into. Personally -- and I don't think  
6 there's much support for going as far as I  
7 would like to go, I would like to deregulate  
8 the entire department and make it a much easier  
9 process.

10 Put in for a permit online,  
11 owner/occupants can do any work they would like  
12 with the exception of safety components,  
13 electrical, things of that nature. That's what  
14 I would like to see happen. But hopefully with  
15 a review of that department that will be a step  
16 in the right direction.

17 Finally, I wanted to bring this up  
18 in caucus but if my colleagues agree I would  
19 like to send a letter to the school district to  
20 ask where they stand regarding the payroll prep  
21 tax and a conversion from the Mercantile tax  
22 now that the referendum passed by such a wide  
23 margin. So if everyone's in agreement with  
24 that, I'd like to send a letter to the school  
25 district.

1 I am fully supportive of this  
2 change. But I do think it's important that it  
3 needs to be done in conjunction with the school  
4 district. If it's not, much of the benefit  
5 goes away of changing the system. I was very  
6 happy. I think we all were pleased with the  
7 result of that referendum that it passed by  
8 such a wide margin.

9 I'll be honest. I was very  
10 surprised. Typically when there is a  
11 referendum and people see tax they tend to vote  
12 no even without knowing the full repercussions.  
13 So I'm very happy with how that turned out.  
14 And finally, I would like to congratulate all  
15 the winners of the election, Paige Cagnetti,  
16 everyone who ran.

17 It's very difficult to run for  
18 office so they all deserve to be commended. I  
19 also look forward to new colleagues on City  
20 Council come next year. That's all.

21 MR. GAUGHAN: Can I just make one  
22 statement? I'm sorry, Mr. Rogan. I would be  
23 remiss if I didn't mention as Mayor Wayne Evans  
24 who came earlier tonight, Bob McGoff. And I  
25 almost forgot that it will be four years

1            tomorrow since he's passed away. Mrs. Reed and  
2            I often think about some of things that he did  
3            when he was Council President on Council. And  
4            I was just a rookie Councilman coming in and he  
5            kind of took me under his wing. And he was  
6            such a great person.

7                            And when I think of somebody who had  
8            class, he really did have class. You can't  
9            teach that. You just have it. And he always  
10           did the right thing. And I just appreciated it  
11           sitting next to him up here. Again, he was a  
12           great person. When he was going through his  
13           battle with cancer, he really fought it.

14                           I mean, I've never seen anyone fight  
15           like that in my entire life. And I think all  
16           of us who had the pleasure to work with him  
17           learned something from him both before he was  
18           sick and then when we was going through that.  
19           So again, his wife is such a great person. His  
20           children are great people. And we're all  
21           thinking of him today. Thank you.

22                           MR. ROGAN: Couldn't agree more and  
23           since we're talking about it, what really hit  
24           the nail on the head on your comments and when  
25           I first came on Council, Mr. McGoff and myself

1           were on opposite sides of the political aisle  
2           on many issues. But by the end of our time on  
3           Council together, not only have we become  
4           friends but we found compromise.

5                        There were many times when we would  
6           be completely opposite ends on an issue and a  
7           compromise would be reached. So unfortunately,  
8           in the political arena that we live in now  
9           that's something that's very rare. Thank you.

10                      MS. REED: 5-B. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
11           AN ORDINANCE - APPROPRIATING FUNDS FOR THE  
12           EXPENSES OF THE CITY GOVERNMENT FOR THE PERIOD  
13           COMMENCING ON THE FIRST DAY OF JANUARY, 2020 TO  
14           AND INCLUDING DECEMBER 31, 2020 BY THE ADOPTION  
15           OF THE GENERAL CITY OPERATING BUDGET FOR  
16           THE YEAR 2020.

17                      MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
18           entertain a motion that Item 5-B be introduced  
19           into its proper committee.

20                      MR. GAUGHAN: Second.

21                      MR. ROGAN: On the question?

22                      MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, on the question,  
23           as my colleagues mentioned earlier we did just  
24           receive the budget on Friday. So I'm still as  
25           they all are in the process of reviewing it.



1 health insurance costs will be 15 and a half  
2 million dollars. My concern is that healthcare  
3 cost may be understated by nearly one and a  
4 half million dollars. Can you please provide  
5 your rationale for the 2019 budgeted healthcare  
6 cost and budget worksheet calculations?

7 Mr. Bulzoni did provide that and  
8 then he did give an explanation that there were  
9 two claims subject to stop loss of \$500,000,  
10 five claims approximating stop loss, four are  
11 expected to recur in 2019. Three are non  
12 recurring. He said several calculations are  
13 from the low end of the perspective data range  
14 anticipated savings exceeding \$500,000 from the  
15 Remedy Analytics Program are incorporated into  
16 the forecast. Draw your own conclusions as  
17 warranted based on the above information.

18 Mr. Bulzoni states in the 2020  
19 budget narrative that he underbudgeted the  
20 healthcare costs last year. As Miss Hodowanitz  
21 had mentioned, the City will see an increase in  
22 healthcare costs from what was budgeted in 2019  
23 to 72 percent according to my calculations. So  
24 at this time, it looks like we're going to be  
25 over budget in almost every category.

1                   So I'm going to have questions on  
2                   that because I would like to know, first of  
3                   all, what were the savings from this Remedy  
4                   Analytics Program and how could we be that off  
5                   with healthcare projections. And, you know,  
6                   when I asked this last year, I don't want to  
7                   say that I wasn't taken seriously but I felt  
8                   like I was kind of dismissed, and it wasn't  
9                   really taken seriously. But I did have a  
10                  concern about that last year.

11                  This is another budget which  
12                  unfortunately survives on one time revenue  
13                  streams. In Mr. Bulzoni's narrative it states  
14                  that the budget uses one time variable revenue  
15                  assignments through the sale of refuse  
16                  receivables and/or a refuse amnesty as well as  
17                  occurring means through the introduction of the  
18                  payroll preparation tax and the subsequent  
19                  phasing out of the current year Business  
20                  Privilege and Mercantile Tax collections.

21                  It also goes onto say that a refuse  
22                  fee may be imbedded in a real estate tax bill  
23                  beginning either in 2020 or 2021. I have a few  
24                  concerns here. And most of it is about  
25                  logistics. And I think having a public caucus

1 with Mr. Bulzoni and the Mayor and the  
2 administration will hopefully quell some of  
3 these concerns.

4 One, if it's not done until 2021,  
5 wouldn't that create a revenue shortfall? What  
6 would be the effect of not turning over the  
7 refuse fee into the real estate tax bills? So  
8 it seems like there's a variable here. It  
9 could either be done in 2020 or 2021. What  
10 does that process look like? What data do we  
11 have that points to this initiative broadening  
12 the collection universe and increasing the  
13 collection rate?

14 Mr. Bulzoni also used the term in  
15 theory which does not instill, you know, the  
16 greatest confidence in me at least. And I know  
17 Councilman Donahue had brought up some concerns  
18 again about the logistics. So I think we want  
19 to know how this whole thing's going to work  
20 out. I'm sure they put some thought into it.  
21 And I'd like to know or hopefully they put some  
22 thought into it and I'd like to know what that  
23 looks like.

24 My other question is, you know, I  
25 did have a conversation with Mr. Bulzoni a few

1 weeks ago during kind of the preliminary phase  
2 when they released the preliminary budget. And  
3 at that time he explained to me that it looked  
4 like we were going to have a deficit anywhere  
5 between 1 and a half million to 2 million  
6 dollars.

7 So if it weren't for, you know, this  
8 one time revenue stream and this sale of refuse  
9 receivables, which again, I think we need to  
10 know way more about before we approve this  
11 budget and a refuse amnesty program which  
12 again, short on details; we probably would be  
13 looking at a tax increase.

14 I would like to know what the tax  
15 increase would look like this year if that  
16 wasn't the option. And if this doesn't pan  
17 out, what is plan B -- what is their plan B? I  
18 know that they're not going -- they may not be  
19 here next year. There will be a new  
20 administration. But I do think it's incumbent  
21 upon them to explain that. And if it doesn't  
22 work out, what will the tax increase or deficit  
23 look like next year.

24 Mr. Bulzoni stated in his budget  
25 summary that the Pennsylvania Economy League

1 and the Amoroso recovery plan recommended  
2 incremental tax increases over a number of  
3 years, which it did. What I'm concerned about  
4 quite honestly is not -- is the City not  
5 advocating a tax increase. What I'm advocating  
6 is just everybody -- and I'm not saying people  
7 aren't being honest.

8 All I'm saying is if you don't raise  
9 taxes for a number of years in a row and then  
10 what I don't want to happen is next November,  
11 the November surprise comes and we're raising  
12 them double digit. And that is my fear. So I  
13 think we need to ask for further clarification  
14 on that and let's try to get a true picture of  
15 what's going on.

16 Also, I think that it's crucial that  
17 we have a caucus with the Pennsylvania Economy  
18 League. As has been discussed here many times,  
19 we are exiting from Act 47 and technically we  
20 will be shedding the distressed label. My  
21 concern though is that even though we may be  
22 shedding the title of distress, we still will  
23 technically be distressed.

24 Year after year if we don't have  
25 these one time revenue sources our expenditures

1           are exceeding our revenues. So again, I think  
2           we need to have a conversation with PEL about  
3           that. And I know that Mr. Cross from PEL was  
4           in touch with Mrs. Reed and they are going to  
5           issue as they do every year their letter to  
6           Council on the budget.

7                         Also, lowering the garbage fee from  
8           \$300 to 250, I'd like to know what data was  
9           used to make the refuse revenue projections.  
10          What is the process and timeline for  
11          transferring that refuse bill into the real  
12          estate tax bill, have all of the potential  
13          pitfalls that Mr. Donahue has mentioned have  
14          these been thought out?

15                        Did the administration consider --  
16          and I'm sure they did the current lawsuit  
17          regarding the trash fee when making this move.  
18          I think Council was told months ago that the  
19          City couldn't do really anything with the  
20          garbage fee or move it into the real estate tax  
21          bill because of the lawsuit. So what has  
22          changed in that regard and we probably need an  
23          update on the lawsuit.

24                        In regard to what Mrs. Schumacher  
25          had mentioned regarding the union contracts

1           that were renegotiated in 2015 that were  
2           claiming to save millions of dollars over the  
3           life of the contracts, I went back and looked  
4           in the archives. And on March 20th, 2016, Mr.  
5           Bulzoni had mentioned that the administration  
6           had not conducted an analysis of the new  
7           contracts and a cost benefit analysis but would  
8           at the end of the year when a full fiscal year  
9           had passed.

10                   He said at that time that it would  
11           allow for a more accurate financial picture of  
12           savings and new revenue. I would like to know  
13           if this analysis has taken place yet, if so, I  
14           think Council deserves a copy of it. And I do  
15           think that's important, especially moving  
16           forward.

17                   Also, I think we -- I think I asked  
18           this last year about the SAFER Grant for the  
19           fire department. That grant I believe expired  
20           in 2018. It was funding at least 14 firemen.  
21           I would like to ask if it's the  
22           administration's plan to keep these firemen,  
23           I'm assuming it is since it's baked into the  
24           budget and how are they going to pay for them.

25                   Are they going to absorb the

1 positions into the budget paying full cost?  
2 What does that look like? This was a concern.  
3 I know a few years ago it was in the newspaper  
4 back in 2016, the administration at that time  
5 had said their plan was possibly to lay off  
6 those positions until positions became  
7 available once the grant ran out.

8 And in April of 2016, the City  
9 claimed that the hiring of these firemen would  
10 drastically reduce overtime. So again, I think  
11 we do need some confirmation on that.

12 I requested a copy of the summary  
13 trial balance of all City accounts as of  
14 October 31st, 2019 and October 31st, 2018. I  
15 believe that we did receive those today. I  
16 haven't had a chance to look at them. I also  
17 ask what the accounts payable amount was on  
18 January 1st, 2019 and what the account was --  
19 accounts payable was as of November 15th, 2019.

20 There are quite a few employees who  
21 have received raises in the budget. I would  
22 like if Mr. Bulzoni could just detail which  
23 employees, nonunion employees receive those  
24 raises, the amount of the raise and I believe  
25 he did provide a rationale on the budget

1 narrative.

2 Also Mr. Bulzoni stated that the  
3 improvement in Mercantile and Business  
4 Privilege tax collection percentages through  
5 the use of analytics by the Single Tax Office  
6 was never fully realized. So it begs the  
7 question why that was never fully realized.

8 I also think we need to have a  
9 caucus with the City Tax Collector on this and  
10 other issues. I had a chance to speak to  
11 Mr. Fox. And he agreed that that wouldn't be a  
12 terrible idea. So I do think we should make an  
13 effort before we pass the budget to get them in  
14 here to ask them questions about that.

15 Also in the narrative it says that  
16 the Licensing and Inspections budget reflects  
17 on optimism that tax abatement legislation will  
18 have a positive effect on development. I'm not  
19 sure I necessarily agree with this statement.  
20 To date as far as I know, we have only received  
21 five applications -- five applications have  
22 been pulled for the tax abatement legislation.  
23 So I would like to know what the rationale is  
24 behind that.

25 The other thing that's mentioned in

1 the budget that I have a problem with already  
2 is the optional salary components for additions  
3 in the Mayor's office and the fire department.  
4 I don't think I have seen this done before in  
5 five years. And I think according to the  
6 narrative Mr. Bulzoni and the Mayor and his  
7 administration are putting in salary but  
8 they're not putting in the position.

9 I guess they're leaving that up to  
10 the next Mayor. They want to put an addition  
11 in the Mayor's office, the fire department, DPW  
12 a second shift mechanic. It's just my belief  
13 that it either should be in the budget or not  
14 in the budget because I think, you know,  
15 Council has to vote on that and you're kind of  
16 circumventing the checks and balances because  
17 who's to say that you can't take that other  
18 salary and create a position that's not  
19 mentioned here.

20 I don't know that there's precedent  
21 for that. And I -- off the top of my head and  
22 off of having a cursory review of this I would  
23 have an issue with that. Also, other salary is  
24 funded for the possibility that the Single Tax  
25 Office is designated as collector of payroll

1 prep tax. The office would be required to have  
2 personnel for the collection of the tax.  
3 Again, way too arbitrary. We need more  
4 information on this.

5 I don't think we should go into the  
6 2020 budget not knowing how many people they  
7 might possibly need, what those costs might  
8 look like. So again, we need more information  
9 on that. I had asked Mr. Gallagher who came to  
10 our caucus tonight about the DPW fleet manager  
11 in the budget.

12 They're calling it the DPW fleet  
13 coordinator. I'd like to know if this is a  
14 union or nonunion position. Another thing that  
15 came up in my quick look at the budget was  
16 firehouse improvement projects. We're still  
17 paying for finishing items.

18 So I'd like to know what are they.  
19 What is the total cost of this project and did  
20 we go over budget? I could be wrong, but it  
21 seems like this project has been going on now  
22 for quite a few years. This had to be at least  
23 2015 or 2016 but that was in the budget and it  
24 seems like we're still trying to finish it up.

25 I'd also like to get an update on

1 the Novembrino Project. And to piggyback on  
2 what Councilwoman Dempsey had mentioned earlier  
3 about the grants, I think as part of this  
4 process we should get an update on all projects  
5 in the City that are currently ongoing.

6 For example, the Serrenti Center  
7 which I was against a few years ago seems to be  
8 a huge cost to our budget. So I'd like to know  
9 what the amount is on that project. Again, I  
10 would like to invite the Pennsylvania Economy  
11 League to a public caucus. I think it's  
12 important to make sure, especially in light of  
13 our potential exit from Act 47 that we are in  
14 line with our exit line projections.

15 I do want to thank Mr. Bulzoni for  
16 his narratives. They are very helpful. And I  
17 do know that a lot of effort and a lot of time  
18 goes into preparing these budgets, presenting  
19 these budgets. So I do want to thank them for  
20 that. And I do look forward to Council  
21 compiling their questions or concerns,  
22 presenting them to the administration and then  
23 having the ability to have a conversation about  
24 it.

25 I would say that I know

1 Mr. Hodowanitz had delivered questions to us  
2 tonight. Any questions that the public has  
3 about the budget since this is taxpayer dollars  
4 and this is your money, I personally would take  
5 those questions and I would hope that my  
6 colleagues would and we would incorporate that  
7 into the document that we're going to send the  
8 administration.

9 So if you do have any questions in  
10 your review of the budget, if you could get  
11 them to Council so that we can include them in  
12 what we send to the administration. And those  
13 are my initial thoughts on the budget. Thank  
14 you.

15 MR. ROGAN: Anyone else?

16 MR. DONAHUE: Yes, just real quick  
17 on the question. I did bring up my  
18 reservations with my colleagues in caucus about  
19 introducing a budget without our audit. So  
20 I'll be voting against introducing the budget.

21 MR. ROGAN: Anyone else? All those  
22 in favor signify by saying aye.

23 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

24 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

25 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed?

1 MR. DONAHUE: No.

2 MR. ROGAN: The ayes have it and so  
3 moved.

4 MS. REED: 5-C. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
5 A RESOLUTION - RE-APPOINTMENT OF KATHERINE J.  
6 GILMARTIN, 1525 CAPOUSE AVENUE, SCRANTON,  
7 PENNSYLVANIA, 18509 AS A MEMBER OF THE  
8 HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURE REVIEW BOARD.  
9 KATHERINE GILMARTIN'S TERM ON THE HISTORICAL  
10 ARCHITECTURE REVIEW BOARD EXPIRED ON OCTOBER  
11 11, 2017 AND WAS HELD OVER UNTIL OCTOBER 9,  
12 2019. HER NEW TERM WILL EXPIRE ON OCTOBER 11,  
13 2022.

14 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
15 entertain a motion that Item 5-C be introduced  
16 into its proper committee.

17 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

18 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

19 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
20 those in favor signify by saying aye.

21 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

22 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

23 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

24 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
25 have it and so moved.

1 MS. REED: 5-D. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
2 A RESOLUTION - RE-APPOINTMENT OF NELL  
3 O'BOYLE, 603 ARTHUR AVENUE, SCRANTON,  
4 PENNSYLVANIA, 18510 AS A MEMBER OF THE  
5 HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURE REVIEW BOARD. NELL  
6 O'BOYLE'S TERM ON THE HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURE  
7 REVIEW BOARD EXPIRED ON OCTOBER 11, 2019. HER  
8 NEW TERM WILL EXPIRE ON OCTOBER 11, 2024.

9 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
10 entertain a motion that Item 5-D be introduced  
11 into its proper committee.

12 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

13 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

14 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
15 those in favor signify by saying aye.

16 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

17 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

18 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

19 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
20 have it and so moved.

21 MS. REED: 5-E. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
22 A RESOLUTION - APPOINTMENT OF WALTER BARRON,  
23 1016 LUKE AVENUE, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA 18510  
24 AS A MEMBER OF THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION  
25 FOR A FIVE (5) YEAR TERM. WALTER BARRON WILL

1 BE REPLACING STEPHANIE BRESSLER WHOSE TERM  
2 EXPIRED SEPTEMBER 23, 2018 AND WAS HELD OVER  
3 UNTIL AUGUST 27, 2019. WALTER BARRON'S TERM IS  
4 EFFECTIVE OCTOBER 11, 2019 AND WILL EXPIRE ON  
5 OCTOBER 11, 2024.

6 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
7 entertain a motion that Item 5-E be introduced  
8 into its proper committee.

9 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

10 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

11 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
12 those in favor signify by saying aye.

13 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

14 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

15 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

16 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
17 have it and so moved.

18 MS. REED: 5-F. FOR INTRODUCTION - A  
19 RESOLUTION - RE-APPOINTMENT OF AJA E.  
20 WENTUM, 711 HARRISON AVENUE, SCRANTON,  
21 PENNSYLVANIA, 18510 AS A MEMBER OF THE HUMAN  
22 RELATIONS COMMISSION FOR AN ADDITIONAL FIVE  
23 (5) YEAR TERM EFFECTIVE OCTOBER 9, 2019. AJA  
24 WENTUM'S TERM EXPIRED ON AUGUST 24, 2018 AND  
25 WAS HELD OVER UNTIL OCTOBER 9, 2019. HIS NEW

1 TERM WILL EXPIRE ON AUGUST 24, 2023.

2 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
3 entertain a motion that Item 5-F be introduced  
4 into its proper committee.

5 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

6 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

7 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
8 those in favor signify by saying aye.

9 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

10 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

11 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

12 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
13 have it and so moved.

14 MS. REED: 5-G. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
15 A RESOLUTION - APPOINTMENT OF JOHN J.  
16 HARRINGTON, JR., 102 LILAC LANE, SCRANTON,  
17 PENNSYLVANIA, 18505, AS A MEMBER OF THE  
18 SCRANTON PARKING AUTHORITY EFFECTIVE OCTOBER  
19 1, 2019. JOHN J. HARRINGTON, JR. WILL REPLACE  
20 SANTA (SANDY) CORBY WHO RESIGNED EFFECTIVE JULY  
21 4, 2019. JOHN J. HARRINGTON, JR. WILL FULFILL  
22 THE UNEXPIRED TERM OF SANTA (SANDY) CORBY  
23 WHOSE TERM IS SCHEDULED TO EXPIRE ON JUNE 1,  
24 2022.

25 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll

1 entertain a motion that Item 5-G be introduced  
2 into its proper committee.

3 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

4 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

5 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
6 those in favor signify by saying aye.

7 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

8 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

9 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

10 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
11 have it and so moved.

12 MS. REED: 5-H. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
13 A RESOLUTION - APPOINTMENT OF THOMAS  
14 TANSITS, 17 TERRACE DRIVE, SCRANTON,  
15 PENNSYLVANIA, 18505, AS A MEMBER OF THE  
16 SCRANTON PARKING AUTHORITY EFFECTIVE OCTOBER  
17 11, 2019. THOMAS TANSITS WILL REPLACE THOMAS  
18 BORTHWICK WHO RESIGNED EFFECTIVE MARCH 16,  
19 2019. THOMAS TANSITS WILL FULFILL  
20 THE UNEXPIRED TERM OF THOMAS BORTHWICK WHOSE  
21 TERM IS SCHEDULED TO EXPIRE ON JUNE 1, 2021.

22 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
23 entertain a motion that Item 5-H be introduced  
24 into its proper committee.

25 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

1 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

2 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
3 those in favor signify by saying aye.

4 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

5 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

6 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

7 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
8 have it and so moved.

9 MS. REED: 5-I. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
10 A RESOLUTION - APPOINTMENT OF TODD POUSLEY,  
11 1137 RUNDLE STREET, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA,  
12 18504 AS A MEMBER OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION  
13 FOR THE CITY OF SCRANTON EFFECTIVE OCTOBER 11,  
14 2019 FOR A FOUR (4) YEAR TERM. TODD POUSLEY  
15 WILL BE REPLACING MARTIN TURI WHOSE TERM  
16 EXPIRED DECEMBER 31, 2018. TODD POUSLEY'S TERM  
17 WILL EXPIRE ON DECEMBER 31, 2022.

18 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
19 entertain a motion that Item 5-I be introduced  
20 into its proper committee.

21 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

22 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

23 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
24 those in favor signify by saying aye.

25 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

1 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

2 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

3 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
4 have it and so moved.

5 MS. REED: 5-J. FOR INTRODUCTION – A  
6 RESOLUTION – APPOINTMENT OF MICHAEL S.  
7 CUMMINGS, CFMP, 809 CROWN AVENUE, SCRANTON,  
8 PENNSYLVANIA, 18505 AS A MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF  
9 THE SCRANTON REDEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY FOR A FIVE  
10 (5) YEAR TERM EFFECTIVE OCTOBER 1, 2019.  
11 MICHAEL CUMMINGS WILL BE REPLACING JOSEPH  
12 HEALEY WHOSE TERM EXPIRED MARCH 19, 2019.  
13 MICHAEL CUMMINGS TERM WILL EXPIRE OCTOBER 1,  
14 2024.

15 MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
16 entertain a motion that Item 5-J be introduced  
17 into its proper committee.

18 ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

19 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

20 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
21 those in favor signify by saying aye.

22 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

23 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

24 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

25 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes

1           have it and so moved.

2                   MS. REED: 5-K. FOR INTRODUCTION -  
3           A RESOLUTION - AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND  
4           OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS TO EXECUTE AND  
5           ENTER INTO A CONTRACT BETWEEN THE CITY OF  
6           SCRANTON AND MORETTI CPA TO PERFORM THE CITY OF  
7           SCRANTON GAS CARD AUDIT SERVICES FOR ALL  
8           GAS CARD ACTIVITY FROM APRIL 2016 THROUGH MARCH  
9           2019.

10                   MR. ROGAN: At this time I'll  
11           entertain a motion that Item 5-K be introduced  
12           into its proper committee.

13                   ATTY. DEMPSEY: So moved.

14                   MR. DONAHUE: Second.

15                   MR. ROGAN: On the question? I'd  
16           just like to mention I'm going to be voting  
17           against this, not because I don't think it  
18           needs to be done; but I do think this is the  
19           reason why we have a controller's office. It  
20           is about ten thousand dollars in spending.

21                   I would like to see it done  
22           internally. And I would also like to see it go  
23           back further than the timeframes that's  
24           allotted. All those in favor signify by saying  
25           aye.

1 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

2 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

3 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

4 MR. ROGAN: No. The ayes have it  
5 and so moved.

6 MS. REED: SIXTH ORDER. 6-A.

7 READING BY TITLE - FILE OF THE COUNCIL NO. 76,  
8 2019 - AN ORDINANCE - AMENDING FILE OF THE  
9 COUNCIL NO. 45, 1996, AS AMENDED BY FILE OF THE  
10 COUNCIL NO. 110, 2005 UPDATING THE LIST  
11 OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES IN THE CITY OF SCRANTON,  
12 BY CREATING "THE LOCAL DOWNTOWN HISTORIC  
13 DISTRICT" TO EXPAND THE LIST OF HISTORIC  
14 PROPERTIES TO INCLUDE ALL BUILDINGS LOCATED  
15 WITHIN THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT AND  
16 AMENDING THE PROCESS FOR LEGISLATIVE REVIEW OF  
17 RECOMMENDATIONS MADE BY THE HISTORICAL  
18 ARCHITECTURE REVIEW BOARD.

19 MR. ROGAN: You've heard reading by  
20 title of Item 6-A. What is your pleasure?

21 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Mr. Chairman, I move  
22 that Item 6-A pass reading by title.

23 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

24 MR. ROGAN: On the question? I  
25 spoke a little bit about this last week. And I

1 did talk to a few other downtown business  
2 owners that have some concerns. I'm against  
3 this legislation just because of the fact that  
4 I don't think we need to govern modern  
5 buildings by historical standards.

6 I do believe the purpose of the HA  
7 RB is well-intentioned for historical  
8 buildings. But somebody building a new  
9 building or a building that's 5, 10, 20 years  
10 old within this zone should not have to face  
11 the delays and the added burden of going  
12 through the HARB to have exterior improvements  
13 on their property approved. Anyone else? All  
14 those in favor signify by saying aye.

15 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

16 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

17 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

18 MR. ROGAN: Opposed? No. The ayes  
19 have it and so moved.

20 MS. REED: 6-B. READING BY TITLE -  
21 FILE OF THE COUNCIL NO. 77, 2019 -  
22 REGULATING THE OPERATION OF BYOB CLUBS,  
23 PROHIBITING THE BUSINESS OF BYOB CLUBS BETWEEN  
24 THE HOURS OF 2:00 A.M. AND 8:00 A.M., AND  
25 PROVIDING FOR ENFORCEMENT OF THESE PROVISIONS,

1 INCLUDING PENALTIES FOR VIOLATIONS.

2 MR. ROGAN: You've heard reading by  
3 title of Item 6-B. What is your pleasure?

4 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Mr. Chairman I move  
5 that Item 6-B pass reading by title.

6 MR. DONAHUE: Second.

7 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
8 those in favor signify by saying aye.

9 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

10 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

11 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

12 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
13 have it and so moved.

14 MS. REED: SEVENTH ORDER. 7-A. FOR  
15 CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES - FOR  
16 ADOPTION - RESOLUTION NO. 181, 2019 -  
17 RE-APPOINTMENT OF THOMAS J. MCLANE, 601  
18 STAFFORD AVENUE, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA, 18505  
19 AS A MEMBER OF THE SHADE TREE COMMISSION FOR AN  
20 ADDITIONAL FIVE (5) YEAR TERM. MR. MCLANE'S  
21 CURRENT TERM EXPIRES ON OCTOBER 29, 2019  
22 AND HIS NEW TERM WILL EXPIRE ON OCTOBER 29,  
23 2024.

24 MR. ROGAN: As Chairperson for the  
25 Committee on Rules I recommend final passage of

1 Item 7-A.

2 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

3 MR. ROGAN: On the question? Roll  
4 call, please.

5 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Donahue.

6 MR. DONAHUE: Yes.

7 MS. CARRERA: Attorney Dempsey.

8 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes.

9 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.

10 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.

11 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.

12 MR. ROGAN: Yes. I hereby declare  
13 Item 7-A legally and lawfully adopted.

14 MS. REED: 7-B. FOR CONSIDERATION  
15 BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES - FOR ADOPTION -  
16 RESOLUTION NO. 182, 2019 - RE-APPOINTMENT OF  
17 TERRENCE V. GALLAGHER, ESQUIRE, 1320 ORAM  
18 STREET, SCRANTON, PENNSYLVANIA, 18504, AS A  
19 MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF THE SCRANTON HOUSING  
20 AUTHORITY FOR A TERM OF FIVE (5) YEARS. MR.  
21 GALLAGHER'S PRIOR TERM EXPIRED ON SEPTEMBER 27,  
22 2013 AND WAS HELD OVER UNTIL OCTOBER 16, 2019.  
23 HIS NEW TERM WILL EXPIRE ON SEPTEMBER 27,  
24 2023.

25 MR. ROGAN: As Chairperson for the

1 Committee on Rules I recommend final passage of  
2 Item 7-B.

3 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

4 MR. ROGAN: On the question? Roll  
5 call, please.

6 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Donahue.

7 MR. DONAHUE: Yes.

8 MS. CARRERA: Attorney Dempsey.

9 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes.

10 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.

11 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.

12 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.

13 MR. ROGAN: Yes. I hereby declare  
14 Item 7-B legally and lawfully adopted.

15 MS. REED: 7-C PREVIOUSLY TABLED.

16 7-D PREVIOUSLY TABLED FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE  
17 COMMITTEE ON COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FOR ADOPTION  
18 FILED OF COUNCIL NO. 74, 2019 AMENDING FILE OF  
19 THE COUNCIL NO. 44, 2014 AND FILE OF THE  
20 COUNCIL NO. 118, 2015 ENTITLED AN ORDINANCE  
21 AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE  
22 OFFICIALS OF THE CITY OF SCRANTON TO TAKE ALL  
23 NECESSARY ACTIONS TO IMPLEMENT THE CONSOLIDATED  
24 SUBMISSION FOR COMMUNITY PLANNING AND  
25 DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS TO BE FUNDED UNDER THE

1 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM, HOME  
2 INVESTMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM AND EMERGENCY  
3 SOLUTIONS GRANTS PROGRAM FOR THE PERIOD  
4 BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2015 AND FOR THE PERIOD  
5 BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2016 BY AMENDING THE 2015  
6 ACTION PLAN AND THE 2016 ACTION PLAN BY  
7 UTILIZING \$63,831.69 FROM THE 2015 ACTION PLAN  
8 AND \$63,071.21 FROM THE 2016 ACTION PLAN IN  
9 ORDER TO PROVIDE A TOTAL OF \$126,902.90 UNDER  
10 THE HOME INVESTMENT PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM TO  
11 BUILD A TWO-UNIT RENTAL HOUSE FOR LOW INCOME  
12 FAMILIES IN THE CITY OF SCRANTON OR TO ACQUIRE  
13 AND REHAB TWO VACANT HOUSES IN THE CITY OF  
14 SCRANTON FOR LOW INCOME FAMILIES BY AND THROUGH  
15 THE SCRANTON-LACKAWANNA RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT  
16 CORPORATION A SUBSIDIARY OF THE  
17 SCRANTON-LACKAWANNA HUMAN DEVELOPMENT AGENCY.

18 MR. ROGAN: What is the  
19 recommendation of the Chairperson for the  
20 Committee on Community Development?

21 MR. DONAHUE: As Chair for the  
22 Committee on Community Development I recommend  
23 a final vote of Item 7-D.

24 MR. GAUGHAN: Second.

25 MR. ROGAN: On the question?

1 MR. DONAHUE: On the question, I'm  
2 on the Board of the Scranton-Lackawanna  
3 Redevelopment Agency. So I will be abstaining  
4 from this vote.

5 MR. ROGAN: Anyone else? Roll call,  
6 please.

7 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Donahue.

8 MR. DONAHUE: Abstain.

9 MS. CARRERA: Attorney Dempsey.

10 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes.

11 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.

12 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.

13 MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.

14 MR. ROGAN: Yes. I hereby declare  
15 Item 7-D legally and lawfully adopted.

16 MS. REED: 7-E. PREVIOUSLY TABLED  
17 FOR CONSIDERATION BY THE COMMITTEE ON RULES FOR  
18 ADOPTION RESOLUTION NUMBER 167 2019 AUTHORIZING  
19 THE MAYOR AND OTHER APPROPRIATE CITY OFFICIALS  
20 TO EXECUTE AND ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH BARRY  
21 ISETT AND ASSOCIATES INCORPORATED FOR THE CITY  
22 OF SCRANTON LICENSES AND PERMITS DEPARTMENT  
23 SERVICE ASSESSMENT.

24 MR. GAUGHAN: I make a motion to  
25 amend the term of the contract effective from

1 August 1st, 2019 to July 31st, 2021 to  
2 effective from November 19th, 2019 to November  
3 19th, 2020.

4 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Second.

5 MR. ROGAN: On the question? All  
6 those in favor signify by saying aye.

7 MR. DONAHUE: Aye.

8 MR. GAUGHAN: Aye.

9 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Aye.

10 MR. ROGAN: Aye. Opposed? The ayes  
11 have it and so moved.

12 As Chairperson for the Committee on  
13 Rules I would recommend final passage of Item  
14 7-E as amended.

15 MR. GAUGHAN: Second.

16 MR. ROGAN: On the question?

17 MR. DONAHUE: On the question, given  
18 our current budgetary predicaments we're in I  
19 believe we should have kept this on the table,  
20 therefore, I'll be voting against this  
21 legislation.

22 ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes, on the table as  
23 well. I will be voting for this legislation  
24 based on the investigations I've done and the  
25 history knowledge I've obtained of the

1 Department of Licensing and Inspection. It has  
2 been plagued by deficiencies for years. I also  
3 know this is one of Mayor Evans' main  
4 initiatives. And I want to support that and I  
5 want to support the City moving forward.

6 I also want to assist people like  
7 Mr. Bravo and Miss Dietrich who came here for  
8 the last two meetings to make this a more  
9 user-friendly bureau, something more  
10 progressive and something more forward thinking  
11 that could help this City move in and move  
12 forward. So I'll be voting for it.

13 MR. GAUGHAN: Yes, I will also be  
14 voting for this for a number of reasons. First  
15 of all, since I have been on Council one of the  
16 chief complaints is the Licensing and  
17 Inspections Department, not putting blame on  
18 any one particular person. It's just the  
19 number of complaints that we've gotten over the  
20 last five years is unbelievable, each one of  
21 us.

22 So at some point you have to ask  
23 yourself what move you're going to make to  
24 correct those deficiencies and those errors and  
25 those complaints. I think the administration's

1 plan is to bring a company in to take a look at  
2 each facet, each area of the department, work  
3 with the people who are employees in that  
4 department.

5 There's a lot of good people that  
6 work in the Licensing and Inspections  
7 Department, work with whoever the new director  
8 of the department is. I think this will  
9 actually give the new administration coming in  
10 kind of a leg up on things, a fresh set of eyes  
11 to look over the department over the next year.

12 One of the reasons I made the motion  
13 and everyone agreed with it is to amend the  
14 term of the contract because in talking with  
15 Isett and Associates, they probably don't need  
16 two years.

17 One year is a better way to go about  
18 it. And I think that one of the things that  
19 has to be done in that department is to get a  
20 good department head. But we don't know what  
21 is going to happen. So we can't take any  
22 chances and hope that someone coming in is  
23 going to be a genius and fix everything.

24 Why not get the extra help? Why not  
25 get someone who has great experience with

1           Licensing and Inspections Department? We got  
2           all of their references in, which I was  
3           impressed by from different cities and boroughs  
4           throughout the State of Pennsylvania. And is  
5           it perfect, no. But I think it's a step in the  
6           right direction and that's why I'll be voting  
7           for it. Thank you.

8                   MR. DONAHUE: I would just like to  
9           add that I do believe this does need to be done  
10          in some form or another. I just think after  
11          reviewing the budget over the weekend I think  
12          we need to leave our options open to how we go  
13          about doing it.

14                   ATTY. DEMPSEY: And if I may very  
15          quickly only because I forgot to say this at  
16          first, I also asked this group for three sets  
17          of references for three different  
18          municipalities that they had done work for.  
19          And they provided us three written references  
20          from three different municipalities.

21                   And to me that is the best indicator  
22          of future work. That is another reason that I  
23          feel like this is the right company to go  
24          forward with. Thank you.

25                   MR. ROGAN: I would just like to add

1 I think my colleagues pretty much summed it up.  
2 There is a dire need for reform in the  
3 Licensing and Inspections Department. I see it  
4 firsthand every day for my work in real estate.  
5 Developers stonewalled, homeowners having  
6 delays.

7 We've seen it particularly at our  
8 Council meetings the last month or so, some  
9 residents that are here today and I know there  
10 was an issue with a home that had a roof issue  
11 from the tornado that went through the Hill  
12 Section a few months back.

13 And obviously this isn't going to  
14 solve those problems overnight. But I think if  
15 many of these issues are identified and a more  
16 streamlined process is put in place, this will  
17 help the City move that department in the right  
18 direction. I've said this a number of times  
19 outside of potholes and road complaints, I get  
20 more calls about Licensing and Inspections than  
21 any other department.

22 And it's just been atrocious. In  
23 order for this City to grow we need to make the  
24 City more business friendly. And we need to  
25 take some of this burden off of the contractors

1           and homeowners. So I'm glad that this will  
2           pass. And I hope we see some results. Roll  
3           call, please.

4                       MS. CARRERA: Mr. Donahue.

5                       MR. DONAHUE: No.

6                       MS. CARRERA: Attorney Dempsey.

7                       ATTY. DEMPSEY: Yes.

8                       MS. CARRERA: Mr. Gaughan.

9                       MR. GAUGHAN: Yes.

10                      MS. CARRERA: Mr. Rogan.

11                      MR. ROGAN: Yes. I hereby declare  
12           Item 7-E legally and lawfully adopted. If  
13           there's no further business I'll entertain a  
14           motion to adjourn.

15                      ATTY. DEMPSEY: Motion to adjourn.

16                      MR. ROGAN: Meeting's adjourned.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1  
2  
3 I hereby certify that the proceedings and  
4 evidence are contained fully and accurately in the  
5 notes taken by me of the above-cause and that this copy  
6 is a correct transcript of the same to the best of my  
7 ability.

8  
9  
10 \_\_\_\_\_  
11 Maria McCool, RPR  
12 Official Court Reporter  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

21 (The foregoing certificate of this transcript does not  
22 apply to any reproduction of the same by any means  
23 unless under the direct control and/or supervision of  
24 the certifying reporter.)  
25